

UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO
THE GOVERNING COUNCIL
REPORT NUMBER 369 OF
THE EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE

Tuesday, December 2, 2003

To the Governing Council,
University of Toronto.

Your Committee reports that it held a meeting on Tuesday, December 2, 2003 at 4:00 p.m. in the Boardroom, Simcoe Hall, with the following members present:

Dr. Thomas Simpson (In the Chair)
Professor Robert J. Birgeneau, President
Dr. Robert Bennett
Professor Philip H. Byer
Ms Susan Eng
Ms Françoise Ko
Professor Ian McDonald
Professor Michael Marrus
Ms Rose Patten (via telephone)
Dr. Joseph Rotman
Mrs. Susan M. Scace

Regrets:

Mr. Michael Foderick
Ms Karen Lewis
Mr. John F. (Jack) Petch

Non-Voting Member:

Mr. Louis R. Charpentier

Secretariat:

Ms Cristina Oke

In Attendance:

Professor W. Raymond Cummins, Chair, Academic Board
Professor Shirley Neuman, Vice-President and Provost and member of the Governing Council
Dr. Beata FitzPatrick, Assistant Vice-President and Director, Office of the President

On motion duly moved and seconded,

IT WAS RESOLVED

THAT, pursuant to sections 28 (e) and (f) of By-Law Number 2, consideration of agenda items 1, 2, and 3 take place *in camera*, with the Board Chair, Professor Neuman, and Dr. FitzPatrick admitted to the meeting to facilitate the work of the Committee.

1. Committee for Honorary Degrees: Report

On motion duly moved and seconded,

YOUR COMMITTEE ENDORSED AND FORWARDED

to the Governing Council for consideration the recommendations contained in Report Number 46 of the Committee for Honorary Degrees.

1. Committee for Honorary Degrees: Report (cont'd)

On motion duly moved and seconded,

YOUR COMMITTEE APPROVED

THAT pursuant to Section 38 and 40 of By-Law Number 2, the recommendations be considered by the Governing Council *in camera*.

2. External Appointments

(a) Innovations Foundation

On motion duly moved and seconded,

YOUR COMMITTEE APPROVED

THAT the following individuals be appointed as Directors of the Innovations Foundation until the next annual meeting:

Mr. George Adams
President, Innovations Foundation

Professor Peter Lewis
Vice-Dean, Research, Faculty of
Medicine

Mr. Felix Chee
Vice-President, Business Affairs

Dr. John Mendlein
Chairman & CEO,
Affinium Pharmaceuticals

Mr. David Crane
Columnist, Toronto Star

Professor Richard Owens
Executive Director, Centre for
Innovation Law and Policy

Professor Maryann Feldman
Joseph L. Rotman School of
Management

Dr. Jane Pagel
Vice-President, Corporate &
Government Affairs
Jacques Whitford Environment
Limited

Mr. Gary Goldberg
President, Gadango Inc.

Dr. Henri Rothschild
President, Canada-Israel Industrial
R&D Foundation

Mr. Jay A. Lefton
Partner, Aird & Berlis LLP

Professor Pekka Sinervo
Interim Dean, Faculty of Arts and
Science

2. External Appointments (cont'd)

(b) University of Toronto Press

On motion duly moved and seconded,

YOUR COMMITTEE APPROVED

THAT the following voting members and directors be appointed to the University of Toronto Press Inc. for 2003-04:

Mr. Felix Chee	Professor Shirley Neuman ¹
Mr. Kendall Cork	Mr. Martin Offman
University Professor Emeritus	Mr. Roger Parkinson
Martin L. Friedland	Mr. Andrew Ritchie
Mr. George Meadows	Mr. Robert Steacy
Ms Carole Moore	Mr. Robert White
Professor Heather Murray	Mr. David Wilson

(c) University of Toronto Schools

On motion duly moved and seconded,

YOUR COMMITTEE APPROVED

(a) THAT the following individuals be approved and nominated as University appointed members of the Board of the University of Toronto Schools:

Professor Jane Gaskell, Dean, OISE/UT (Jan. 1, 2004 – Dec. 31, 2004)
 Professor Vivek Goel, Deputy Provost and Vice-Provost, Faculty
 (Jan. 1, 2004 – Dec. 31, 2006)

(b) THAT the following individuals be approved and nominated as members of the Board of the University of Toronto Schools:

Name	Constituency	Term
Mr. Doug Bradley	Parent	Jan. 1, 2004 –Dec. 31, 2004
Ms Leslie Dunlop	Alumna	Jan. 1, 2004 –Dec. 31, 2004
Mr. David Gurin	Parent	Jan. 1, 2004 –Dec. 31, 2006
Ms Pauline Laing	Unaffiliated	Jan. 1, 2004 –Dec. 31, 2005
Mr. Robert E. Lord	Alumnus	Jan. 1, 2004 –Dec. 31, 2006
Mr. Tom Magyarody	Parent	Jan. 1, 2004 –Dec. 31, 2005
Mr. F. David Roundthwaite	Alumnus	Jan. 1, 2004 –Dec. 31, 2005

¹ Professor Neuman was not present for discussion of this item.

3. Mid-Term Review of the Office of the Ombudsperson

At the invitation of the Chair, Mr. Charpentier reminded members that, in February 2001, the Governing Council had undertaken a review of the Office of the Ombudsperson, coincidental to the end of the Ombudsperson's term of office. One of the recommendations of that review was that the Office should be reviewed in the middle of the incumbent's term in a manner determined by the Executive Committee. Unlike an end-of-term review, this review was intended to be limited to measuring the extent to which the recommendations of the 2001 review were being carried out and, if necessary, suggest mid-term changes that would not fundamentally alter the direction of the Office.

On motion duly moved and seconded,

YOUR COMMITTEE APPROVED

THAT the Executive Committee approve the terms of reference for a Mid-Term Review Committee of the Office of the Ombudsperson, as set out in Appendix "A" attached hereto.

THE COMMITTEE MOVED INTO CLOSED SESSION.

4. Reports of the Previous Meetings

Report Number 367 of the Executive Committee meeting held on October 20, 2003 and Report Number 368 of the Executive Committee meeting held on November 13, 2003 were approved.

A member noted that Report Number 367 had not been included in his agenda package. The Secretary reminded members that only one copy of a Board or Committee report was distributed to members. Report Number 367 of the Executive Committee had been included in the agenda package for the October 30 meeting of the Governing Council, and had therefore not been included with the agenda package for this meeting of the Executive Committee.

5. Business Arising from the Reports of the Previous Meetings

There were no items of business arising from the previous meetings.

6. Minutes of the Governing Council Meetings held on October 30, 2003 and November 13, 2003

Members received for information the minutes of the Governing Council meetings held on October 30, 2003 and November 13, 2003. A member asked that the attendance for the November 13 meeting be revised to show that he was present.

7. Business Arising from the Governing Council Meeting

There were no items of business arising from the Governing Council meetings.

8. President's Report

(a) The Al Awda Student Conference

The President informed members that a conference to discuss the Palestinian Right of Return had taken place uneventfully on Sunday, November 30. The conference had originally been scheduled for November 22 and 23 on University premises, but had been cancelled by the University because participants had been required to agree to a six-point Basis of Unity pact which would have had the effect of excluding persons with dissenting views, thus violating the University's Policy on Recognition of Campus Groups and Statement on Freedom of Speech.

The President acknowledged especially the excellent work of the staff in Student Affairs under the leadership of the Vice-Provost, Students in handling the situation. He also congratulated the students involved for their responsible behaviour in working with the University and finding a workable resolution.

The President stated that the University's response reflected an absolute commitment to a clear set of principles, approved by the Governing Council, and set out in the Statement on Freedom of Speech and policies concerning the use of university space, the recognition of campus groups and the disruption of meetings.

The conference had proceeded with participants signing a statement saying that they would abide by the University's Policy on the Disruption of Meetings and the University's Statement on Freedom of Speech. Additionally, a note had been added to the principles to which the organizers subscribed, stating, "*Conference organizers do not advocate the use of violence against civilian populations.*"

Student volunteers from the Students' Administrative Council (SAC) and from the Al Awda campus group had acted as monitors during the event. There had been no need for intervention from the University administration or University police.

Several members congratulated the President and his administration on their handling of this situation.

(b) Government Relations

The President informed members that members of the senior administration were contacting and meeting as many members of the new government as possible. He had attended the Throne Speech and had had an opportunity at that event to talk to David Miller, the newly-elected mayor of Toronto. The Mayor had suggested that he and the President meet to discuss cooperation between the city and the University.

The President briefed members on a proposal on the implementation of the tuition freeze offset funding that had been developed by the Council of Ontario Universities (COU) at the request of the Minister of Training, Colleges and Universities. The President also distributed to members a copy of the editorial which had appeared in *the newspaper* on November 27, 2003 on the topic of the tuition freeze and its adverse affect on the quality of education.

A member asked how the designation of 30 per cent of tuition fee increases to student financial assistance would be addressed in light of the proposed tuition freeze. The President replied that the provincial government had not yet indicated how that would be

8. President's Report (cont'd)

(b) Government Relations (cont'd)

addressed. A member asked whether the provincial government was considering the recommendations for the reform of the Ontario Student Assistance Program (OSAP) that the University had submitted earlier this year. The President replied that a review of OSAP would be part of the study of post-secondary education that the provincial government would be undertaking during the 2004 calendar year.

(c) Macleans Rankings

The President reminded members that the University of Toronto was number one for the tenth year in a row in the *Macleans* rankings in the Medical-Doctoral category. In addition, for the first time the University had been ranked as number one in the "Best Overall" category for **all** Canadian universities in the national reputational rankings. Members expressed their thanks to all those in the University who collected the data necessary for *Macleans'* annual survey.

9. Item for Endorsement and Forwarding to the Governing Council

(a) University of Toronto Schools: Proposed Restructuring

With the agreement of members, the agenda was varied to consider the restructuring of the University of Toronto Schools (UTS).

Professor Cummins indicated that this item had received a full discussion at the Planning and Budget Committee meeting. Discussion at the Academic Board had focused on the status of the administrative staff, retention of the current name and availability of student financial aid.

A member asked why UTS was no longer considered intrinsic to the mission of the University. Professor Neuman explained that UTS was a highly regarded school but it was currently being used neither as a research site nor as a practicum site for teachers by the Ontario Institute for Studies in Education of the University of Toronto (OISE/UT). UTS had an annual deficit of approximately \$216,000, in spite of support from the University for space, utilities, and human resources services.

The member asked about the use of the 'University of Toronto' name. Professor Neuman replied that UTS wished to retain its name, and that, in order to permit that, some form of affiliation with the University would be necessary.

On motion duly moved and seconded,

YOUR COMMITTEE ENDORSED AND FORWARDED

to the Governing Council for consideration the recommendation

1. THAT the University of Toronto Schools be disestablished as an organization unit of OISE/UT;
2. THAT the University of Toronto Schools be incorporated as a separate legal entity within the University community; and

9. Item for Endorsement and Forwarding to the Governing Council (cont'd)

(a) University of Toronto Schools: Proposed Restructuring (cont'd)

3. The University enter into an interim affiliation, services and premises agreement substantially the same as the agreement attached to Professor Goel's memorandum of October 3, 2003, a copy of which is attached to Report Number 123 of the Academic Board as Appendix "D".

The Chair informed members that Mr. Robin Breon, Vice-President of Local 1998 of the United Steelworkers of America (USWA), had asked to speak to this agenda item at the Governing Council meeting on December 15, 2003. After discussion, it was decided not to grant the request, as Mr. Breon had addressed the Academic Board on November 13, 2003, and his remarks were included in Report Number 123 of the Academic Board.² It was also noted that the matters that had been raised by Mr. Breon were the subject of negotiations between the union and the University.

10. Items for Confirmation by the Executive Committee

Professor Cummins reported that the two items for confirmation had engendered no discussion at the Academic Board.

(a) Policy on Diploma and Certificate Programs: Revised

On motion duly moved and seconded,

YOUR COMMITTEE CONFIRMED THE DECISION OF THE
ACADEMIC BOARD

THAT the amendments to the Policy on Diploma and Certificate Programs, as described in the memorandum from Professor Tuohy dated October 6, 2003, be approved.

A member suggested that some of the terms used in the Policy could be tidied. Professor Neuman replied that the language in the policy was the most accurate possible, given the different definitions of 'diploma' and 'certificate' used in universities and in community colleges.

(b) Ontario Institute for Studies in Education of the University of Toronto (OISE/UT): Constitution – Amendment

On motion duly moved and seconded,

YOUR COMMITTEE CONFIRMED THE DECISION OF THE
ACADEMIC BOARD

THAT the Constitution of the OISE/UT Faculty Council, as amended, dated September 19, 2003, be approved.

² Report Number 123 of the Academic Board is available at
<http://www.utoronto.ca/govcncl/bac/details/ab/2003-04/abr20031113.pdf>

11. Items for Endorsement and Forwarding to the Governing Council

(a) School of Graduate Studies: Proposed New PhD Program in Rehabilitation Science

Professor Cummins explained that this program would enrol about 4 students a year, for a total steady-state enrolment of 16. There had been no questions at the Academic Board.

On motion duly moved and seconded,

YOUR COMMITTEE ENDORSED AND FORWARDED

to the Governing Council for consideration the recommendations

THAT the proposal for a new PhD program in Rehabilitation Science, as described in the submission from the School of Graduate Studies, dated May 29, 2003, the executive summary of which is attached to Report Number 123 of the Academic Board as Appendix “A”, be approved, effective 2004.

(b) Faculty of Dentistry: Proposal for a Joint Bachelor of Dental Hygiene (BDH) / Diploma in Dental Hygiene with George Brown College

Professor Cummins informed members that graduates from this joint program would receive both a degree and a diploma. Discussion at the Committee level had focused on the details involved in offering such a program. At the Academic Board, a question had been asked about the fees.

A member commented that, in his view, this joint program was inappropriate for the Faculty of Dentistry, and that dental hygiene should remain a training program in the community college system.

On motion duly moved and seconded,

YOUR COMMITTEE ENDORSED AND FORWARDED

to the Governing Council for consideration the recommendation

THAT the proposal for a joint Bachelor of Dental Hygiene/Diploma in Dental Hygiene program, offered by the Faculty of Dentistry in collaboration with George Brown College, as described in the submission from the Faculty of Dentistry, dated September 19, 2003, the executive summary of which is attached to Report Number 123 of the Academic Board as Appendix “B”, be approved, effective September 1, 2004.

(c) Canada Research Chairs Fund: Allocation

Professor Cummins noted that there had been no questions at the Board arising from this item. At the Planning and Budget Committee meeting, there had been an extensive discussion about the under-representation of women holding Chairs.

11. Items for Endorsement and Forwarding to the Governing Council (cont'd)

(c) Canada Research Chairs Fund: Allocation (cont'd)

On motion duly moved and seconded,

YOUR COMMITTEE ENDORSED AND FORWARDED

to the Governing Council for consideration the recommendation

1. THAT \$4.4 million be allocated from the Canada Research Chairs Fund to cover the salaries, benefits, research allowances and cluster support for twenty-four Chairholders approved in the April 2002 competitions.
2. THAT \$.7 million (\$.8 million less \$91,428 indirect cost of 16% of salaries and benefits) be allocated to the Faculty of Medicine in support of seven campus based Chairholders that were awarded in 2003.
3. THAT \$2.2 million (\$2.3 million less \$98,571 indirect cost of 6% of salaries and benefits) be allocated to the Faculty of Medicine in support of nine Chairholders based in Hospital and Research Institutes that were awarded in 2003.

(d) Capital Project: Woodsworth College Residence: Basement Facilities for the Commerce Program and for Audio/Visual Storage for the University Library – Project Planning Report

Professor Cummins reported that the members of the Academic Board had had no questions on this item, although statements of concerns had been made at Planning and Budget by members of the Association of Part-time Undergraduate Students (APUS).

A member expressed concern that it was becoming more commonplace for academic units to pay for space. Professor Neuman indicated that when units were required to pay for space, their requests tended to be more carefully considered than requests made without an associated cost.

On motion duly moved and seconded,

YOUR COMMITTEE ENDORSED AND FORWARDED

to the Governing Council for consideration the recommendation

1. THAT the Project Planning Report for the outfitting of the Woodsworth College Residence basement and first floor, a copy of which is attached to Report Number 123 of the Academic Board as Appendix "F, be approved in principle;
2. THAT the project scope identified in the Project Planning Report, to establish the four classrooms, the A/V storage facility and the Commerce Career and Student Aid Centre within the defined shelled space of the Woodsworth College Residence, be approved at a cost of \$3,696,433 with the funding sources as follows:

11. Items for Endorsement and Forwarding to the Governing Council (cont'd)

(d) Capital Project: Woodsworth College Residence: Basement Facilities for the Commerce Program and for Audio/Visual Storage for the University Library – Project Planning Report (cont'd)

Commerce Program	\$ 1,294,376
Rotman School of Management	\$ 571,589
Arts and Science	\$ 711,468
University of Toronto Library	\$ 1,019,000
Coopers PriceWaterhouse Donation	\$ 100,000

3. THAT the project scope will include the re-establishment of the Computer Room, currently located within the Rotman Building, RT117, to Woodsworth College to accommodate the needs of students enrolled in the Commerce program.

The Committee agreed with the suggestion of the Chair that, in light of the time required for the consideration of the Report of the Committee for Honorary Degrees, and the President's Report, all items other than the restructuring of the University of Toronto Schools would be consent items.

12. Items for Information

The Committee received for information the following reports:

- Report Number 123 of the Academic Board (November 13, 2003)
- Report Number 124 of the Academic Board (November 24, 2003)
- Report Number 129 of the Business Board (November 10, 2003)
- Report Number 117 of the University Affairs Board (October 28, 2003)
- Draft Excerpt of Report Number 118 of the University Affairs Board (November 26, 2003)

13. Date of the Next Meeting

The Chair reminded members that the next meeting of the Executive Committee was scheduled for Monday February 2, 2004 at 5:00 p.m.

14. Other Business

The Chair reminded members that nominations for administrative staff, teaching staff and student members of the Governing Council and for teaching staff and librarian members of the Academic Board would open in January 2004. He asked members to encourage their colleagues to become involved in governance.

The meeting adjourned at 5:30 p.m.

Secretary
December 5, 2003

Chair

Mid-Term Review of the Office of the Ombudsperson

Background

In February 2001, the Governing Council undertook a review of the Office of the Ombudsperson, coincidental to the end of the Ombudsperson’s term of office, as required by the Terms of Reference for the Office of the Ombudsperson. One of the recommendations of the review was that the Office should be reviewed in the middle of the incumbent’s term. The Governing Council is now responsible for undertaking a mid-term review of the Office in a manner determined by the Executive Committee.

Mandate

The Mid-Term Review of the Office of the Ombudsperson is asked to:

1. Determine the degree to which the recommendations of the *Report of the Committee on the Office of the Ombudsperson (April 2001)* have been implemented, and, if they have not, to examine the reasons, re-examine the recommendations and, if necessary, formulate new recommendations.
2. Ensure that the effectiveness of the Office’s operations is maintained or increased.
3. Provide advice to the staff of the Office that would result in improved methods of fulfilling the Office’s mandate.

The intent of the mid-term review is to fulfill a monitorial role on behalf of Governing Council.

In fulfilling the review’s mandate, the Reviewers will consult appropriately within the University community and beyond.

The reviewers will submit their report by March 31, 2004.

Membership

Two lay members of Governing Council, Dr. Claude Davis and Dr. Alice Dong, will constitute the review committee. Secretariat support will be provided by Mr. Andrew Drummond, Special Projects Officer in the Office of the Governing Council.