

## UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

### COLLEGE OF ELECTORS

Minutes of the College of Electors meeting held on Wednesday, November 24, 2010 at 5:30 p.m. in the Council Chamber, Simcoe Hall, at which the following were present:

Dr. Françoise Ko (UTAA) (Chair)	Dr. Claire Mallette (Nursing)
Mr. Doug Allen (Architecture, Landscape, and Design)	Mr. Jason Marin (New)
Dr. Alexandra Berezowskyj (Medicine)	Mr. Michael Meth (Information)
Mr. Corwin Cambray (SGS)	Mr. Paul Morrison (Law)
Ms Tiffany Chow (Engineering)	Mr. Peter Murchison (Social Work)
Dr. Zoë Coull (SGS)	Ms Florence Newman (Victoria)
Ms L. Diane Dyer (Victoria)	Mr. Devin S. Ragwen (Scarborough)
Ms Sue Graham-Nutter (Scarborough)	Mr. John Richardson (Victoria)
Mr. Aran Hamilton (Rotman)	Professor Peter Russell (Trinity)
Mr. Norm Hann (Engineering)	Ms Barbara Salmon (Physiotherapy and Occupational Therapy)
Rev. David Harrison (SGS)	Mr. Al Smith (Mississauga)
Ms Erica Henderson	Dr. Mahadeo Sukhai (SGS)
Ms Victoria Hurlihay	Ms Ann Sullivan (St. Michael's)
Dr. Sema Kenan (OISE)	Ms Anne Venton (OISE)
Ms Diane Luty (Woodsworth)	Ms Susan Wilson (Music)
Mr. Scott MacKendrick (Engineering)	Ms Natalie Yeadon (Mississauga)
Ms Sadia Mahmood (Public Health)	

#### Regrets:

Ms Carol Bisnath (Mississauga)	Mr. Craig Hegins (New)
Dr. Pauline Blendick (OISE)	Ms Paula Paunic (Physical Education and Health)
Ms Sadia Butt (Forestry)	Ms Linda Prytula (Pharmacy)
Dr. Vic Chiasson (Innis)	Dr. Valerie Stavro (Dentistry)
Ms Celeste Francis (Woodsworth)	Mr. Todd Will (OISE)
	Mr. Jason Wong (UC)

Secretary: Ms Mae-Yu Tan

Guests: Mr. Richard Nunn, Vice-Chair, Governing Council  
Ms Cathy Riggall, Acting President, University of Toronto  
Mr. Carl Mitchell, President, University of Toronto Alumni Association (UTAA)  
Mr. Nykolaj Kuryluk, member of the Governing Council  
Mr. Tim Reid, member of the Governing Council  
Ms Maureen Somerville, member of the Governing Council  
Mr. John Switzer, member of the Governing Council  
Ms Elizabeth Vosburgh, member of the Governing Council  
Mr. Louis Charpentier, Secretary of the Governing Council  
Members of the Council of Presidents and the UTAA  
Alumni Development and Senior Development Officers

## **1. Chair's Remarks**

The Chair welcomed members of the College, the guest speakers, the alumni governors, the Council of Presidents (COP), the development officers, and other guests in attendance. She thanked members of the University of Toronto Alumni Association (UTAA) and the COP for their commitment and contributions to the University. The Chair also expressed her thanks to the alumni members of Governing Council for their valuable service to the University.

The Chair explained that annual, formal consultation on the general requirements for the alumni governor positions to be filled was a requirement contained in the College of Electors' Constitution. The College was also obliged to seek guidance on the requirements (the knowledge and skill mix) most in need in a particular year. For many years, that consultation had taken the form of a joint meeting between the College and the COP.

The Chair noted that the President was unable to attend the meeting that evening, but she was pleased that Ms Cathy Riggall, Acting President, was able to speak on the President's behalf. Mr. Richard Nunn, Vice-Chair of the Governing Council was also in attendance, on behalf of the Chair, Mr. John F. Jack Petch, as was Mr. Carl Mitchell, the President of the UTAA. Each of the guests would address the College.

## **2. General Requirements for Alumni Members of the Governing Council**

### **Remarks of the Acting President of the University of Toronto**

Ms Riggall conveyed the President's regrets at being unable to attend the joint meeting. He was in Hong Kong presiding over a biennial convocation ceremony and meeting with a number of leaders in business and education. However, he sent his warm wishes to Dr. Ko, Mr. Mitchell, Mr. Nunn, the members of the COP and the College, and all of the guests. Ms Riggall then delivered a statement on behalf of the President.

Ms Riggall said that the President considered the roles of the College and the COP to be vitally important to the University, and he looked forward to working with members for the betterment of the University. The alumni of the University were its greatest ambassadors; that had never been more evident or more important than it was today. On behalf of the University, the President thanked the alumni for all that they had done and all that they continued to do in service to the University.

Ms Riggall then outlined some of the challenges and opportunities facing the University over the next several years. She stated that *Towards 2030*, the University's first long-term planning initiative since 1987, had been launched approximately three years ago to respond to the question "As we look to and beyond our second centennial, how can we ensure that our institution reaches new levels of excellence?" The process had been fascinating and had involved scores of consultations and submissions, Task Forces, and reports. The *Towards 2030: A Long-term Planning Framework for the University of Toronto*, which had been approved by the Governing Council, outlined broad strategic directions to help guide University planning over the next two decades. Both the final *Synthesis Report* and the distilled *Framework* had been made available to members that evening.

## 2. General Requirements for Alumni Members of the Governing Council (cont'd)

### Remarks of the Acting President of the University of Toronto (cont'd)

Ms Riggall stated that the alumni had played an obvious and vital role throughout the *Towards 2030* process, providing feedback, ideas, and suggestions from their unique perspective. The alumni would again be asked to draw on their unique perspective and to join the University in advocacy for its planned campaign. The focus of the advocacy work would include at least four central points.

#### The unique mission and role of the University of Toronto not just within Ontario, but within Canada more generally.

The University had extraordinary strengths in research and scholarship and held an acknowledged leadership position in graduate and second-entry professional education provincially and nationally. Within Ontario, the University educated approximately one-third of the doctoral students, one quarter of the master's students, 20% of the engineers, all of the Province's pharmacists, and 15% (62,000 Full-Time Equivalents (FTEs) of the undergraduate students. In addition, the University had a remarkable record of research and scholarship: its faculty published more than every University in North America save Harvard, and it consistently ranked alongside the top five American universities in citation rates by researchers around the world. That mix of undergraduate and graduate pedagogical excellence with internationally recognized and influential scholarship was critical to both the province's and the country's success.

#### The relevance and importance of investing in higher education and advanced research.

Data consistently showed Canada near the top of the Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD) countries in the proportion of population aged 24-35 with a post-secondary education. However, a closer look at the data revealed Canada's performance on that metric was largely driven by OECD-leading participation in college-level education. In university-level participation, Canada performed at the OECD average or slightly below, and in advanced research, Canada performed well below the OECD average - the University of Toronto produced half of the master's degrees and a third fewer doctoral degrees per capita than the U.S.A. In funding for advanced research, the United States invested more than three times as much per capita in health research as Canada. In the sciences more generally, per capita investments from American and Canadian national granting agencies were similar, but Canada lacked the additional huge network of national laboratories and other government funding mechanisms. As well, Canada was further disadvantaged by a weak and even punitive approach to covering the institutional costs of research. Given the importance of University education to success in the innovation and knowledge economy and the well-established connection between participation, productivity, and prosperity, Canada needed to invest more in higher education and advanced research, not less.

#### The grave resource situation and its consequences.

The *Synthesis Report* described a state of chronic and acute underfunding in the province of Ontario that existed two years ago. The situation was even worse today. The present funding situation was unsustainable and had been for some time. For years, the Canadian higher education system, particularly in Ontario, had been struggling to balance quality, accessibility, and sustainability. With its tightly constrained funding model, the University had been increasingly paying for growth by compromising quality. Remarkably, its academic standards were not falling; if anything they were rising. The University's recruitment and hiring standards were high, and it offered a rigorous, first-class education with continuing strengths in research and scholarship. However, increasingly, it was the soft side of quality that was suffering. The "grace, pace, and space" that students, staff, and faculty needed to thrive was disappearing. Classes were too large, services were stretched, the faculty and staff numbers were low, and the student experience in some divisions was suffering.

## 2. General Requirements for Alumni Members of the Governing Council (cont'd)

### Remarks of the Acting President of the University of Toronto (cont'd)

#### Student recruitment and experience (cont'd)

The University still had a way to go to meet its ambitions despite many recent successes in recruitment and improvements in the student experience. It still remained too much of a local-global university, drawing a majority of students from the Toronto Region and a small but growing proportion of top scholars from outside Canada. The University recognized its obligation to Ontarians and argued that aspiring to be Canada's destination of choice for post-secondary education was the best way to serve them. The more the University was successful, the better it would be for Ontario and for its students. In addition, the University continued to build an enriching, dynamic, and extraordinary small-school experience from the vast array of opportunities that accompanied studying at Canada's largest research-intensive university. It was critical for the University's success story to be promoted widely.

Ms Riggall emphasized that, against such a background, the roles of the alumni, particularly the alumni governors, would be increasingly vital to the success of the University. In order to meet these challenges and the responsibilities under the *University of Toronto Act*, it was essential for the University to have excellent, experienced, and dedicated people filling the significant roles of alumni governors. One of the University's strengths was its pool of almost 500,000 alumni from around the world. With so many extraordinary candidates, the College of Electors faced a daunting and crucial, but exciting task.

Ms Riggall closed by wishing the College every success and expressed appreciation for the alumni's contributions to the University, on behalf of the President.

A member commented on the Globe and Mail's 2011 Canadian University Report – Undergraduate Survey<sup>1</sup>, which provided rankings of universities on a range of factors. In his view, the University of Toronto's rankings in some categories, such as undergraduate student satisfaction (B), quality of education (B+), and quality of teaching (B+), were not outstanding. In response to the member's question of how new governors might help the University to address such issues, Ms Riggall noted the efforts that the University was making in some of the areas the member had cited, and she spoke of the importance of having governors who could serve as strong advocates for the University. In particular, they could play an essential role in highlighting the need for sufficient funding for the University so that, among other things, it could provide improved services for students.

The Chair thanked Ms Riggall for delivering the President's remarks. She then invited Mr. Nunn to speak.

### Remarks of the Vice-Chair of the Governing Council

Mr. Nunn thanked the alumni for the critical role they played at the University and acknowledged the work that they had done over the past year. He also thanked the alumni members of Governing Council for their dedication and support.

Mr. Nunn stated that the Governing Council had recently approved in principle the *Report of the Task Force on Governance*. He said that three foundational recommendations - *Principles of Good Governance*, *Mandate of Governance*, and *Expectations and Attributes of Governors and Key Principles of Ethical Conduct* - provided the basis for the bulk of the recommendations. An Implementation Committee, which he was chairing, had been established and had begun to work on an implementation plan. Some matters could be

---

<sup>1</sup> [http://v1.theglobeandmail.com/partners/free/cur\\_2010/CUR\\_Oct\\_2010.pdf](http://v1.theglobeandmail.com/partners/free/cur_2010/CUR_Oct_2010.pdf)

## 2. General Requirements for Alumni Members of the Governing Council (cont'd)

### Remarks of the Vice-Chair of the Governing Council (cont'd)

addressed immediately and others would be considered in the near and medium term, such as the revision of terms of reference and policies, and improved practices in a variety of areas. Mr. Nunn said that the University's governance practices would most certainly be strengthened as a result of the carefully considered framework that had been provided by the Task Force and the directions in which it would move in the future.

Mr. Nunn noted that the Governing Council was composed of fifty members, half of whom were considered internal (administrative staff, teaching staff, and students), and half of whom were considered external (alumni and government appointees). Almost half of the external members were in their second or third three-year term. For that reason, succession planning and renewal were crucial to ensure the continued strength of the Governing Council. While continuity on the Governing Council was important, some governors might serve only one or two terms as a planned approach with the Chair of the Governing Council. Nonetheless, it was important to keep in mind that candidates might potentially serve for nine years, and the College might be making a long-term commitment when electing members.

Mr. Nunn stated that it was essential for members of the College to be familiar with the mission and priorities of the University and the work of the Governing Council in supporting that mission, and he urged members to gain an understanding and appreciation of the role of the University locally, provincially, nationally, and internationally. He pointed to the responsibility of the alumni leadership to identify, recruit, support, and encourage individuals to become involved in the University community and said that there was a need to identify a larger candidate pool. Mr. Nunn noted that the recruitment process must be characterized by transparency and appropriate consultation such as the call for nominations and input from the Chair of the Governing Council at critical points.

Turning to the matter of incumbents' contributions, Mr. Nunn said that each member possessed a unique set of competencies, expertise, and personal relationships that could serve to strengthen the Governing Council. He suggested that a review of the contributions of incumbents seeking re-election should occur within the context of the *Principles of Good Governance*, the *Mandate of Governance*, and the *Expectations and Attributes of Governors* contained in the *Report of the Task Force on Governance*. That should include a range of considerations, such as demonstrated insight into the University community and culture, and the involvement of incumbents in University work, in addition to attending Council and Board and Committee meetings.

Mr. Nunn then highlighted some required attributes that members of the College could keep in mind when considering candidates for alumni governors including the following.

#### Postsecondary Education, Interest, and Experience

- Knowledge of University organization.
- Interest in being an advocate for post-secondary education in general and for the University in particular.
- Interest in the academic side of the University – respect and share the vision.
- Experienced external representation from across a number of sectors including the following.
  - Financial oversight in the private- or public- sector, in particular with expertise in investment and pension fund oversight.
  - Entrepreneurship - individuals whose successful track records and integrative thinking would bring added value to the work of the Council.
  - Growth industries in the private sector such as information technology, and green technologies.
  - Risk management.
  - International experience.

## 2. General Requirements for Alumni Members of the Governing Council (cont'd)

### Remarks of the Vice-Chair of the Governing Council (cont'd)

#### Diversity

- More recent as well as less recent graduates who might reflect new and emerging areas of business and/or community service were needed.
- Diversity of alumni from across campuses and divisions of the University should be considered, including:
  - Graduates from the University of Toronto Mississauga (UTM), the University of Toronto at Scarborough (UTSC), as well as the St. George campus, who would bring varied experiences, perspectives, and ideas with them.
  - Graduates of humanities and social sciences programs whose career paths would enable them to offer valuable insights.
  - Graduates of innovative programs and alumni who had expertise in emerging disciplines who could also offer unique perspectives among members of the Governing Council.
- When evaluating candidates, the College should take into account the experience and diversity of LGIC appointees, consider their complementary viewpoints, and endeavour to strengthen the overall mix of skills available.

#### Leadership Potential

- Potential to rise to positions of leadership:
  - As chairs and vice-chairs of Governing Council's Boards and Committees.
  - As mentors to new governors from all constituencies.
  - As leaders elsewhere in the University, such as on advisory groups, committees, and within divisions.
  - International exposure and experience would be an asset when assuming a leadership role.

#### Broad Skills

- Should possess strong community connections or a strong interest in building such connections.
- Willingness to invest a significant amount of time to activities in support of the University.
- Ability to serve as a skilled ambassador, representing the University and its mission.

Mr. Nunn emphasized that members of the Governing Council were accountable for assuming a stewardship role of overseeing the business and affairs of the University. While they were responsible for making sure the University was managed well; they were not responsible for managing the University. Mr. Nunn suggested that the College ask well-constructed questions during the interview that would reveal whether the candidate had the qualities to be an effective trustee, such as the following.

- An understanding of the role of oversight with a focus on strategic matters.
- An understanding of governors' fiduciary responsibilities.
- Awareness of and respect for the distinct and separate roles of governance and administration.
- The ability to support passionately the mission of the University.
- The ability to exercise informed judgment and to become knowledgeable about the University.

In closing, Mr. Nunn urged the College to elect capable and effective alumni governors who would be tireless in their support of the University, and he offered his support and that of the Chair of the Governing Council to members as they undertook their task.

## **2. General Requirements for Alumni Members of the Governing Council (cont'd)**

### **Remarks of the Vice-Chair of the Governing Council (cont'd)**

A member asked for clarification of the green technology skill sets to which Mr. Nunn had referred. Mr. Nunn explained that it would be helpful to have members on Governing Council who possessed knowledge of energy efficiency technology. Such individuals could provide guidance as the University considered ways of meeting its energy needs, for example, with respect to capital projects. In response to a question, Mr. Nunn emphasized the importance this year of recruiting governors who could contribute to the Governing Council's role of financial oversight, particularly in light of the establishment of Governing Council's new Pension Committee. Mr. Nunn also spoke of the need for continuity within the Governing Council, while balancing new perspectives that would be added by new governors.

The Chair thanked Mr. Nunn for his comments.

### **Remarks of the President of the University of Toronto Alumni Association (UTAA)**

Mr. Mitchell expressed his delight at having the opportunity to meet with the College of Electors. On behalf of the UTAA Board, he thanked members of the College for the work they did to support the University and the governance process. He assured the College that members of the UTAA viewed themselves as sharing in the collective responsibility for bringing forward the best candidates for alumni members of Governing Council. The UTAA was committed to supporting the strongest possible College of Electors and the identification and selection of the best and broadest slate of candidates for alumni governors. Inclusion of alumni on Governing Council was both a privilege and a responsibility. That responsibility included stewardship of all aspects of the University's business and aspirations and extended beyond the focused interests of the alumni. The contribution that the UTAA could make to the important process of governance was its knowledge of the breadth and depth of alumni talent, accomplishment and influence, and the resources to assist in identifying a pool of potential candidates.

Mr. Mitchell noted that the University was responsible for educating a significant proportion of the city's and the province's professionals, civic and corporate leaders, educators, artists and volunteers – individuals who were making a difference in their chosen field. The diversity of alumni success stories was breathtaking in its scope and scale. That diversity was also reflected in alumni involvement within the University. Such involvement ranged from participating on Dean's advisory committees, to serving as entrepreneurs in residence, to engaging previously unrecognized groups of alumni. The University's graduates were deeply and directly involved in helping achieve its aspirations as an academic institution.

Mr. Mitchell encouraged the College to consider candidates from the perspective of the current needs of the University, while also balancing the need for outstanding alumni who reflected the increasing diversity of the University's student body. He closed by restating UTAA's commitment to the College to do its best to contribute to developing a rich and varied pool of candidates for the College's consideration.

The Chair thanked Mr. Mitchell for his remarks. She also thanked all of the guests for having attended the joint meeting.

### 3. Remarks from Alumni Members of the Governing Council

The Chair introduced the alumni members of Governing Council who were in attendance:

- Nykolaj Kuryluk
- Tim Reid
- Maureen Somerville
- John Switzer
- Elizabeth Vosburgh

She noted that Bill Crothers had been unable to attend the meeting and that Michael Marrus had sent his regrets, as he was out of the country.

Invited by the Chair to address the College, Mr. Tim Reid spoke of the activities and roles of alumni governors from his perspective. His remarks included the following points.

- Alumni governors contributed to the effective governance of the University through both formal and less formal activities.
  - Their involvement included service as voting members on the Boards and Committees of the Governing Council. The alumni governors were able to draw on their perspectives from diverse careers and experiences in the broader Canadian community when participating as active members of the governance bodies.
  - Alumni governors also served on various presidential and decanal search committees; faculty and student awards committees; the Design Review Committee for capital projects; Hart House governance bodies; the nominating committee for the UTAA Executive Committee; and various *ad hoc* bodies that were struck – most recently, the *Towards 2030* Task Forces and the Implementation Committee.
  - Less formal activities included involvement in various fund-raising initiatives, serving on occasion as informal advisors to members of the University’s senior administration; participating in ceremonial activities such as convocation and official openings of new buildings; and supporting events such as the recent “Run for the Cure” in which the University had been a leading participant.
  - Alumni governors also met regularly as a group with members of the senior administration and current and incoming student governors.
  - In addition to these varied activities, individual alumni governors continued to serve as volunteers in their respective divisions, such as at UTM, UTSC, and on the St. George campus.
- Alumni governors were expected to be well-informed, active, involved, and passionate about the University. Governors provided constructive input as members of governance bodies; some provided leadership by chairing a governance body.
  - The role of governors was not to manage the University. That was the responsibility of the President and the administration. However, governors could contribute to the management of the University by supporting and providing input on the search processes for senior administrative positions.
  - Alumni governors were directly involved in strategic planning for the University, as evidenced by their membership on each of the five *Towards 2030* Task Forces.
  - Alumni governors provided valuable external perspectives.
- Essential qualities of an alumni governor included the following.
  - Passion for the University and for education.
  - The ability to absorb large amounts of information contained in documentation and to critically evaluate the material.
  - Experience as an alumni volunteer within the University.
  - Sector-specific expertise and experience.

### 3. **Remarks from Alumni Members of the Governing Council (cont'd)**

- Independence in terms of “liberty of thought” as well as in terms of “not depending on another”.
- Willingness to question largely accepted views, when necessary.
- There was no “typical” week of an alumni governor, and a significant time commitment was made by all governors.

The Chair thanked Mr. Reid for his remarks.

Among the matters that arose in discussion were the following.

- Alumni governors had learned over time whom to approach within the administration when they had questions and comments about governance matters. One governor stated that he had found the administration to be extremely accessible, and he had been satisfied with information provided to him upon his request and as part of the regular meeting documentation.
- Governors had been able to draw on experience gained from their careers and from previous service on other Boards to assist them in carrying out their roles on the Governing Council.
  - They had found specific qualities such as intellectual curiosity and listening and communication skills to be particularly valuable to them. As external members of the Governing Council, alumni were able to examine proposals from a different viewpoint than that of internal members.
  - Both current and prospective governors needed to assess carefully the amount of time they could dedicate to their role on Governing Council; in particular, new governors often needed to spend a significant amount of time in their first year in order to become oriented to the University’s processes.
- Many alumni governors had been deeply engaged at the University prior to serving on the Governing Council. A passion for the University and for education typically motivated such individuals to seek to make an even greater contribution to the University.
- The alumni governors suggested that greater diversity among members and with respect to academic backgrounds should also be sought.

The Chair thanked the alumni governors for having shared their experiences with the College. The guests then withdrew from the meeting.

The Chair welcomed one new member to the College - Mr. Jason Marin (New College). She then apologized for having been absent from the previous meeting of the College due to illness and thanked the Vice-Chair, Mr. Mahadeo Sukhai, and Ms Celeste Francis for having graciously agreed on very short notice to chair the meeting on her behalf.

### 4. **Minutes of the Previous Meeting – November 3, 2010**

The minutes of the meeting of November 3, 2010 were approved.

### 5. **Business Arising from the Minutes of the Previous Meeting**

There was no business arising from the minutes of the previous meeting.

The College moved *in camera*.

**6. Election of Alumni Members of the Governing Council**

**Alumni Members' Remarks**

Members discussed the remarks that had been made by the alumni members of Governing Council.

**a) Process**

The Chair outlined the 2011 election process.

**b) Recruitment Strategy**

The College discussed means of strengthening its advertising and recruitment strategy in order to attract excellent candidates for the three alumni governor positions.

**c) Application Form**

The College reviewed the draft 2011 Application Form for Alumni Members of Governing Council. The Chair asked members to send any additional suggestions for revisions to the application form to the Secretary by Wednesday, December 1, 2010.

The College returned to open session.

**7. Date of Next Meeting**

The Chair informed members that the next meeting of the College was scheduled for Wednesday, February 23, 2011 at 5:30 p.m. in the Council Chamber, Simcoe Hall.

**8. Other Business**

The Chair drew members' attention to the document highlighting upcoming Governing Council items of business that had been included in the agenda package. She reminded members that they were welcome to attend meetings where items of interest to them would be discussed. As well, members could view documentation for the items on the Governing Council website.

A member encouraged the other members to begin the recruitment process for their replacements on the College, if their terms ended as of June 30, 2011.

A member suggested that, in the future, it would be helpful if meetings of the College were not scheduled during the week that corresponded with the Family Day holiday in February.

The Chair offered members best wishes for a safe and happy holiday season and a Happy New Year.

The meeting adjourned at 8:30 p.m.

---

Secretary  
December 14, 2010

---

Chair