

UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO  
THE GOVERNING COUNCIL  
**REPORT NUMBER 367 OF  
THE EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE**

**Monday, October 20, 2003**

To the Governing Council,  
University of Toronto.

Your Committee reports that it held a meeting on Monday, October 20, 2003 at 5:00 p.m. in the Boardroom, Simcoe Hall, with the following members present:

Dr. Thomas Simpson (In the Chair)  
Professor Robert J. Birgeneau, President  
Dr. Robert Bennett  
Professor Philip H. Byer  
Ms Susan Eng  
Mr. Michael Foderick  
Ms Françoise Ko  
Ms Karen Lewis  
Professor Ian McDonald  
Professor Michael Marrus  
Mr. John F. (Jack) Petch  
Ms Rose Patten

Dr. Joseph Rotman  
Mrs. Susan M. Scace

**Non-Voting Member:**

Mr. Louis R. Charpentier

**Secretariat:**

Ms Cristina Oke

**In Attendance:**

Professor W. Raymond Cummins, Chair, Academic Board  
Ms Jacqueline Orange, Chair, Business Board  
Dr. Beata FitzPatrick, Assistant Vice-President and Director, Office of the President  
Professor Vivek Goel, Deputy Provost and Vice-Provost, Faculty

The Chair welcomed Ms Françoise Ko to the Executive Committee.

**1. Reports of the Previous Meetings**

Report Number 365 of the Executive Committee meeting held on September 5, 2003 and Report Number 366 of the Executive Committee meeting held on September 18, 2003 were approved.

**2. Business Arising from the Reports of the Previous Meetings**

There were no items of business arising from the previous meetings.

**3. Minutes of the Governing Council Meeting held on September 18, 2003**

Members received for information the minutes of the Governing Council meeting held on September 18, 2003.

#### **4. Business Arising from the Governing Council Meeting**

There were no items of business arising from the Governing Council meeting.

THE COMMITTEE MOVED *IN CAMERA*.

#### **5. President's Report**

The President reported on a personnel matter and briefed members on matters related to the transition to the new provincial government.

THE COMMITTEE RETURNED TO CLOSED SESSION.

#### **6. Vice-President, Human Resources: Change in Title**

The President reminded members of the unrelenting commitment of his administration to inclusion at the University of Toronto. He explained that he was recommending a change in title to the position of Vice-President, Human Resources, to indicate the administrative focal point of the responsibility for equity initiatives. He proposed that the position be named Vice-President, Human Resources and Equity.

A member asked whether all equity officers in the University would then report to the Vice-President, Human Resources and Equity. The President replied that a review of the University's equity infrastructure across the three campuses would be initiated immediately by Professor Hildyard and Professor Goel. This review was intended to determine whether the optimal structures and reporting arrangements were in place to support the University's objectives.

A member suggested that the discussion of equity matters at the University should include a 'forum' informed by academic scholarship and research.

On motion duly moved and seconded,

YOUR COMMITTEE ENDORSED AND FORWARDED

to the Governing Council for consideration the recommendation

THAT the position of Vice-President, Human Resources be renamed Vice-President, Human Resources and Equity, effective November 1, 2003.

#### **7. University Ombudsperson: Annual Report and Administrative Response**

The Vice-Chair noted that the report of the Ombudsperson and the Administrative Response were presented annually to the Governing Council for information and for comment. The Executive Committee was asked to place the Report and Administrative Response on the agenda of the next meeting of the Governing Council. Ms Mary Ward, Ombudsperson, would be invited to attend the October 30 Council meeting to respond to questions on her Report.

A member asked whether it would be possible for the Ombudsperson to provide, in the future, a synopsis of the Report. Another member asked for clarification of the difference between the positions of 'Study Abroad Advisor' referred to on page 11 on the Report of

**7. University Ombudsperson: Annual Report and Administrative Response (cont'd)**

the University Ombudsperson, and the 'Safety Abroad Advisor' referred to in paragraph 6 of the Administrative Response to the Report of the University Ombudsperson. The Deputy Provost undertook to provide the information for the Governing Council meeting.

A member suggested that, at the Governing Council meeting, the University Ombudsperson provide an historical context for this year's report, comparing it in general terms to reports of previous years. The Secretary of the Governing Council undertook to follow-up with the University Ombudsperson on the points that had been raised during the discussion.

On motion duly moved and seconded,

YOUR COMMITTEE APPROVED

THAT the Annual Report of the Ombudsperson and the Administrative Response be placed on the agenda of the October 30, 2003 meeting of the Governing Council.

**8. Items for Endorsement and Forwarding to the Governing Council**

- (a) Policy and Procedures on Academic Appointments: Revisions**
- (b) Policy on the Appointment of Academic Administrators: Revisions**

Professor Cummins reported that the need for changes to the two policies on appointments had been occasioned by the new structure for academic administration on the three campuses. A role for the tri-campus graduate chairs in the appointments processes had been added. Since the policies were frozen under the *Memorandum of Agreement* with the Faculty Association, the administration and the University of Toronto Faculty Association (UTFA) had worked together to draft the changes. The changes were fully endorsed by UTFA.

On motion duly moved and seconded,

YOUR COMMITTEE ENDORSED AND FORWARDED

to the Governing Council for consideration the recommendations

THAT the *Policy and Procedures on Academic Appointments*, revised dated September 10, 2003, a copy of which is attached to Report Number 122 of the Academic Board as Appendix "E", be approved;

and

THAT the *Policy on the Appointment of Academic Administrators*, revised dated September 10, 2003, a copy of which is attached to Report Number 122 of the Academic Board as Appendix "F", be approved.

**(c) Ontarians with Disabilities Act: University of Toronto Accessibility Plan, 2003-04**

Professor Cummins informed members that each Ontario university had been required to develop annual accessibility plans under the new *Ontarians with Disabilities Act*. The plan for 2003-04 had been due on September 30, 2003. There had been very good discussions of the plan at both

**8. Items for Endorsement and Forwarding to the Governing Council (cont'd)**

**(c) *Ontarians with Disabilities Act: University of Toronto Accessibility Plan, 2003-04***  
(cont'd)

the Planning and Budget Committee meeting as well as at the Board. It had been noted that the initiatives proposed for 2003-04 could be undertaken using current resources.

Ms Orange reported that a presentation on the *Act* had been given by Professor Hildyard to the Business Board, as that Board had responsibility for human resources matters.

A member expressed concern that the plan did not address the trade-offs that the University faced in order to comply with the requirements of the *Act*. In the member's view, the University had limited resources, and, if those resources were directed towards accessibility projects, other significant projects could not be undertaken.

It was noted that, during the discussion of this item at the Academic Board, questions had been raised about the attitudinal barriers identified in the Plan. There was some confusion about what was required by the *Act*. Professor Goel indicated that it might be necessary to change University policies as appropriate to conform to the requirements of the *Act*. These matters would be addressed by the Vice-President, Human Resources

On motion duly moved and seconded,

YOUR COMMITTEE ENDORSED AND FORWARDED

to the Governing Council for consideration the recommendation

THAT the University of Toronto *Ontarians with Disabilities Act* Accessibility Plan 2003-2004, a copy of which is attached to Report Number 122 of the Academic Board as Appendix "D", be approved in principle.

With the Committee's agreement, the Chair indicated that there would be a power-point presentation on this item at the October 30 meeting of the Governing Council.

**(d) Capital Project: Change in Funding Sources**  
**University of Toronto at Scarborough (UTSC) – Management Building**  
**University of Toronto at Scarborough – Academic Resource Centre**

Professor Cummins reported that the University had received funding through the SuperBuild 2002 competition. The SuperBuild funding, when applied to the two UTSC capital projects, replaced enrolment growth funding which could then be directed to other projects. There had been no questions at the Board.

On motion duly moved and seconded,

YOUR COMMITTEE ENDORSED AND FORWARDED

to the Governing Council for consideration the recommendation

**8. Items for Endorsement and Forwarding to the Governing Council (cont'd)**

**(d) Capital Project: Change in Funding Sources**

**University of Toronto at Scarborough (UTSC) – Management Building**

**University of Toronto at Scarborough – Academic Resource Centre (cont'd)**

1. THAT the funding for the Academic Resource Centre at UTSC and the Management Building at UTSC be adjusted, as recorded below, to allow for a contribution from the SuperBuild 2002 funding to the University of Toronto in support of these two capital projects.
  - (i) Replace \$4.66 million of the Enrolment Growth Fund allocation to the Academic Resource Centre at UTSC with \$4.66 million from the SuperBuild 2002 funds to be received by the University of Toronto.
  - (ii) Replace \$9.8 million of the Enrolment Growth Fund allocation to the Management Building at UTSC with \$9.8 million from the SuperBuild 2002 funds to be received by the University of Toronto.
2. THAT the Enrolment Growth Fund allocations now unencumbered as a result of the SuperBuild 2002 fund allocation to these projects are to be directed to the three additional SuperBuild 2002 projects, namely the Arts Classroom at UTSC, the Academic Learning Centre at UTM and the Science Laboratory Upgrades at UTSC.

**(e) Capital Project: University of Toronto at Scarborough (UTSC) – Arts Classroom Building – Project Planning Report  
Enrolment Growth Fund: Allocation**

Professor Cummins explained that this capital project at UTSC had been delayed due to insufficient funding. With the SuperBuild funding and some of the unencumbered enrolment growth funding, this project could now proceed. It was noted that as a result of enrolment growth, UTSC was in need of new space and this project was needed to help address that problem.

On motion duly moved and seconded,

YOUR COMMITTEE ENDORSED AND FORWARDED

to the Governing Council for consideration the recommendation

1. THAT Project Planning Report for the Arts Classroom Building, be approved in principle (a copy of the Executive Summary is attached to Report Number 122 of the Academic Board as Appendix “B”).
2. THAT the project scope, totaling some 5130 gross square meters, be approved allowing for the construction of the Arts Classroom Building with linkages to the Student Centre, Bladen Building and the Science Wing.
3. THAT the funding arrangements, including furnishings and finance costs, for the Arts Classroom Building be approved at an estimated cost of \$20,380,000 with the funding as follows:
  - i. \$12,620,000 from the SuperBuild 2002 funding to be received by the University of Toronto, and
  - ii. \$7,760,000 from the Enrolment Growth Fund.

**8. Items for Endorsement and Forwarding to the Governing Council (cont'd)**

**(f) Capital Project: University of Toronto at Mississauga (UTM) –  
Academic Learning Centre – Project Planning Report  
Enrolment Growth Fund: Allocation**

Professor Cummins explained that the proposed new facility would increase the Library's space allocation by 28% and increase the study stations by 70%. Again, the funding sources for this project would be SuperBuild 2002 and enrolment growth funds. Particular note was made of the students' financial support of this project. Again, no questions were asked at the Academic Board.

On motion duly moved and seconded,

YOUR COMMITTEE ENDORSED AND FORWARDED

to the Governing Council for consideration the recommendation

1. THAT the Project Planning Report for the Academic Learning Centre at the University of Toronto at Mississauga be approved in principle (a copy of the Executive Summary is attached to Report Number 122 of the Academic Board as Appendix "C");
2. THAT the project scope identified in the Project Planning Report, with new construction of approximately 5,317 net assignable square metres or to a maximum of 9,173 gross square metres, be approved at a total project cost of \$34,000,000. Funding sources for the project are as follows:

|                                    |                  |
|------------------------------------|------------------|
| SuperBuild 2002                    | \$26.610 million |
| Enrolment Growth Fund              | \$ 7.176 million |
| Students' Library Enhancement Fund | \$ 0.214 million |
3. THAT the site for the Academic Learning Centre be to the north of the Communication, Culture and Information Technology Building as identified in the UTM Campus Master Plan 2000.

The Committee agreed with the suggestion of the Chair that, in light of the discussion at the Academic Board, items (a), (b), (d), (e), and (f) would be consent items.

**9. Items for Information**

The Committee received for information the following reports:

Report Number 122 of the Academic Board (September 25, 2003)  
Report Number 128 of the Business Board (September 29, 2003)  
Report Number 116 of the University Affairs Board (September 23, 2003).

**10. Date of the Next Meeting**

The Chair reminded members that the next meeting of the Executive Committee was scheduled for Tuesday December 2, 2003 at 5:00 p.m.

## 11. Other Business

Members received for information a memorandum from the President explaining the process for approval of namings without benefaction. A member reiterated a concern that naming opportunities not be given away too soon. Another member stated the importance of maintaining flexibility, though, to continue to honour individuals without having money attached to the recognition.

THE COMMITTEE MOVED *IN CAMERA*.

## 12. Board/Committee Assignment 2003-04

On motion duly moved and seconded,

YOUR COMMITTEE APPROVED

THAT Ms Murphy Browne be assigned to the University Affairs Board and the Planning and Budget Committee, effective immediately.

## 13. External Appointments

The Chair noted that the Executive Committee acted for the Governing Council in making external appointments. The President presented the following external appointments for approval, drawing members' attention to the supporting documentation provided.

### (a) Centre for Addiction and Mental Health

On motion duly moved and seconded,

YOUR COMMITTEE APPROVED

THAT Professor Don Wasylenki be appointed as the University of Toronto representative to the Board of Trustees of the Centre for Addiction and Mental Health, for a three-year term effective immediately until October 20, 2006, with the completion of the term contingent upon the renewal of Professor Wasylenki's term as Chair of the Department of Psychiatry, and until his successor is appointed.

### (b) McLaughlin Committee

On motion duly moved and seconded,

YOUR COMMITTEE APPROVED

THAT Mr. J. Christopher Wansbrough and Mr. Allan L. Beattie, Q.C. be reappointed to the McLaughlin Committee for a three-year term, effective October 25, 2003 until October 24, 2006 and until their successors are appointed.

**13. External Appointments****(c) University Health Network**

On motion duly moved and seconded,

YOUR COMMITTEE APPROVED

THAT Professor David Naylor, Dean, Faculty of Medicine, and Professor Dyanne Affonso, Dean, Faculty of Nursing, be appointed to the Board of the University Health Network for a three-year term, effective October 21, 2003 and continuing until October 20, 2006, and until their successors are appointed.

**(d) Wellesley Central Health Corporation**

On motion duly moved and seconded,

YOUR COMMITTEE APPROVED

THAT Professor Cam Mustard and Professor Vivek Goel be appointed to the Wellesley Central Health Corporation for a one-year term, effective October 19, 2003, to continue until the 2004 Annual General Meeting and until their successors are appointed.

**(e) West Park Healthcare Centre**

On motion duly moved and seconded,

YOUR COMMITTEE APPROVED

THAT Professor Ann Tourangeau be reappointed to the West Park Healthcare Centre Board for a one-year term, her appointment to continue until the 2004 Annual Meeting and until her successor is appointed.

**14. Special Committee to Review the Election Process for Alumni Governors and the Chancellor**

The Chair reminded members that the *University of Toronto Act* stated that the Governing Council would include eight alumni members elected by and from among the alumni. The *Act* also required that the Chancellor be elected by the alumni in a manner determined by the Governing Council. The College of Electors had been established in 1971 for the purpose of electing the alumni members of the Governing Council and the Chancellor of the University.

The only comprehensive external review of the College of Electors had occurred in 1986-87. Recommendations from that review included the creation of an Executive Committee, and the provision that the Chair of the Governing Council, the President of the University and the President of the University of Toronto Alumni Association would



**14. Special Committee to Review the Election Process for Alumni Governors and the Chancellor (cont'd)**

address the College each year, prior to the election of alumni governors, on the needs of the Governing Council.

The Chair stated that it was timely to assess the process that was being used for the elections of the alumni governors and the Chancellor, and to ensure that the process was serving well the University and its governance. Since a Chancellor had been elected in December 2002, a review this year placed as much time as possible between any revisions that might be contemplated in the process and the next election of a Chancellor. As well, the election process for teaching staff, administrative staff and students was reviewed and revised annually in the fall. It was therefore appropriate to review periodically the election process for the remaining elected constituency, the alumni.

The Chair explained that the committee membership was intended to provide a balance among individuals who were familiar with the current election process, those who had an understanding of the ongoing needs of the Governing Council, and those who had broadly-based governance expertise. The review was intended to be an external professional review rather than a self-assessment, and would build on previous reviews, not replicate them. The terms of reference required that the Committee seek input from the University community, including the College of Electors and the UTAA.

A member commented that he would like the Committee membership to include one member who had served on the College of Electors for at least one full year. The Chair replied that the Chair of the College was a member of the Committee, and that submissions would be invited from the University community, including members of the College. It could be difficult for the Committee to have frankly critical discussions if a former or current member of the College were part of the process.

On motion duly moved and seconded,

YOUR COMMITTEE APPROVED

THAT the Executive Committee establish a Special Committee to Review the Election Process for alumni Governors and the Chancellor, with the mandate and membership as described in Appendix "A" dated October 20, 2003, attached hereto.

The meeting adjourned at 6:55 p.m.

Secretary  
October 22, 2003

Chair

## Terms of Reference for a Special Committee to Review the Election Process for Alumni Governors and the Chancellor

### Purpose of Review

The College of Electors was established for the purpose of electing the alumni members of the Governing Council and the Chancellor of the University. Its composition and terms of reference are set out in a Constitution that was approved by Governing Council in 1973, and amended on several occasions thereafter, most recently in 1999. Although the College has produced internal reports about the election process in general for the alumni members and for the Chancellor<sup>1</sup>, the election process has not been reviewed by a body external to the College since 1986.<sup>2</sup> It is timely to assess the process and ensure that it is serving well the University and its governance.

For several reasons, it is appropriate that the election process for alumni governors and the Chancellor be reviewed. The regulations concerning the election of teaching staff, administrative staff and students are reviewed and revised annually in the fall. It is therefore appropriate to review periodically the election process for the remaining elected constituency, the alumni. Since a Chancellor was elected in December 2002, a review this year places as much time as possible between any revisions that might be contemplated in the process and the next election of a Chancellor. In addition, there have been significant changes in the communications and technology fields over the past two decades. It is now possible to contact alumni of the University using the world-wide web, and it is also possible to conduct web-based elections.

### Terms of Reference

A Special Committee to Review the Election Process for Alumni Governors and the Chancellor will be established by the Executive Committee of the Governing Council in October 2003, and will complete its report by March 2004. The report will be received by the University Affairs Board, which will consider any recommendations arising from the report. Final decisions will be made by the Governing Council on the advice of the University Affairs Board.

---

<sup>1</sup> February 1991: Report on the Procedures for Election of Alumni Governors  
October 1993: Interim Report on the Review of the Chancellor Election Process  
April 1994: Review of the Alumni Governors Election Process; Review of College of Electors' Role and Procedures; Review of the Chancellor Election Process, Part II.

<sup>2</sup> At that time, it was agreed that the College of Electors should meet the following criteria:

- (1) be broadly representative of the alumni of the University;
- (2) possess knowledge of and experience with the requirements and demands of service on the University's Governing Council and its Chancellor;
- (3) ensure that the best qualified candidates are elected as alumni governors and Chancellor; and
- (4) consider candidates on a confidential basis.

**Terms of Reference (cont'd)**

In doing its work, the Committee will seek input from the University community, including the College of Electors and the University of Toronto Alumni Association. It may also engage external consultants to provide it with advice.

The Special Committee to Review the Election Process for Alumni Governors and the Chancellor will have the mandate described below.

**(a) Election of Alumni Governors**

1. Identify strategies for defining, expanding and strengthening a broad pool of candidates for alumni governor each year.
2. Recommend strategies for recruiting and fostering excellent candidates for the long term.
3. Recommend an appropriate method for determining the attributes necessary for alumni governors each year.
4. Review best practice for election of alumni representatives at other universities, both nationally and internationally as appropriate.
5. Consider various methods of nomination and election for alumni governors, and recommend the processes and guidelines that will ensure the election of the best possible candidates. This may include current processes, modified as appropriate, or new processes. The role of information technology in each process will be examined. Among other elements, the Committee will consider processes for election and for ongoing evaluation of the participation and fulfillment of the trusteeship role of incumbent alumni governors.
6. Recommend policies, structures, and processes as necessary to implement the Committee's recommendations

**(b) Election of the Chancellor**

1. Review best practice for election of the Chancellor at other universities, both nationally and internationally.
2. Propose nomination, selection, interview and election processes and guidelines that will ensure an appropriate candidate pool and the election of the best possible candidates for the position of Chancellor. This may include current processes, modified as appropriate, or new processes. The role of information technology in each process will be examined.
3. Recommend policies, structures, and processes as necessary to implement the Committee's recommendations.

## Membership of Committee

The membership of the Committee will be:

Ms Rose Patten, Vice-Chair of the Governing Council – *Chair*  
Professor David Beatty, Chairman and Conway Director of the Clarkson Centre for  
Business Ethics and Board Effectiveness of the Rotman School of Management  
Mr. Brian Burchell, President, University of Toronto Alumni Association (UTAA) and  
Former Alumni Member of the Governing Council  
Mr. Paul Cadario, Former Alumni Member of the Governing Council  
Mr. Michael Deck, Chair, College of Electors  
Professor Glen Jones, Associate Dean, Graduate Studies, Ontario Institute for  
Studies in Education and Professor, Higher Education Group, Department of  
Theory and Policy Studies in Education  
Dr. Thomas H. Simpson, Chair of the Governing Council and Former Alumni  
Member of the Governing Council  
Dr. Rose Wolfe, Chancellor Emerita of the University of Toronto  
Mr. Andrew Drummond, Committee Secretary

### Assessors:

Mr. Louis R. Charpentier, Secretary of the Governing Council  
Ms Rivi Frankle, Assistant Vice-President, Alumni and Development  
Ms Cristina Oke, Secretary of the College of Electors