

UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO
THE GOVERNING COUNCIL

Thursday, September 20, 2001

MINUTES OF THE GOVERNING COUNCIL meeting held on Thursday,
September 20, 2001 at 4:00 p.m. in the Council Chamber, Simcoe Hall.

Present:

Ms Wendy M. Cecil-Cockwell (In the Chair)	Professor Ian R. McDonald
Mr. Thomas H. Simpson, Vice-Chair	Professor Heather Munroe-Blum
Dr. Robert J. Birgeneau, President	Dr. John P. Nestor
Professor Mary Beattie	Ms Jacqueline C. Orange
Dr. Robert Bennett	The Honourable David R. Peterson
Professor Philip Byer	Mr. Kashif Pirzada
Professor Jack Carr	Ms Patricia Ricci
Ms Mary Anne V. Chambers	Mrs. Susan M. Scace
Professor Brian Corman	Professor Adel S. Sedra
Professor W. Raymond Cummins	Mr. Amir Shalaby
Mr. Brian Davis	Ms Carol Stephenson
Dr. Claude Davis	Ms Wendy Swinton
The Honourable William G. Davis	Professor Donna Wells
Professor Sherwin Desser	Ms Geeta Yadav
Dr. Alice Dong	
Dr. Inez Elliston	Mr. Louis R. Charpentier, Secretary of the Governing Council
Dr. Shari Graham Fell	
Professor Luigi Girolametto	<u>Secretariat:</u>
Professor David Jenkins	Mr. Neil Dobbs
Ms Françoise Ko	Ms Cristina Oke
Professor Brian Langille	
Ms Karen Lewis	
Mr. Gerald A. Lokash	
Mr. Andrew Morgan	

Absent:

Ms Susan Eng	The Honourable Robert K. Rae
Mr. Paul V. Godfrey	Dr. Joseph L. Rotman
Ms Shirley Hoy	Ms Heather Schramm
The Honourable Henry N. R. Jackman	Mr. John H. Tory
Ms Rose M. Patten	Mr. Robert S. Weiss

In Attendance:

Professor Angela Hildyard, Vice-President, Human Resources
Dr. Sheldon Levy, Vice-President, Government and Institutional Relations, and Interim Vice-President, Business Affairs
Professor Carolyn Tuohy, Vice-President, Policy Development and Associate Provost
Professor Vivek Goel, Vice-Provost, Faculty
Professor Derek McCammond, Vice-Provost, Planning and Budget
Professor Ian Orchard, Vice-Provost, Students
Professor Ronald Venter, Vice-Provost, Space and Facilities Planning

In Attendance (cont'd):

Professor Rona Abramovitch, Acting Principal, Woodsworth College and Provost's Advisor on Pro-Active Faculty Recruitment
Mr. Martin England, Assistant Vice-Provost, Strategic Planning
Ms Rivi Frankle, Assistant Vice-President, Alumni and Development *
Dr. Beata FitzPatrick, Director of the Office of the President and Assistant Vice-President
Ms Susan Girard, Assistant Secretary of the Governing Council
Mr. Paul Holmes, Judicial Affairs Officer, Office of the Governing Council
Ms Lesley Lewis, Assistant Vice-Provost, Professional Faculties
Professor Rhonda Love, President, University of Toronto Faculty Association
Mr. Jorge Sousa, President, Graduate Students' Union
Mrs. Beverley Stefureak, Assistant Secretary of the Governing Council

Opening Remarks(a) September 11, 2001

The Chairman stated that the meeting was being held in the shadow of some tragic events on the world scene - both those that had taken place and those that might yet come. She commented that some members of the University community had been affected personally by those events. She noted that the services held at Hart House, at Scarborough and at Mississauga expressed so well the deep regret of members of the University of Toronto at the senseless loss of life and brought together individuals from all across the community. The Chairman asserted that, in the face of this loss, it was, however, important that the University and its Governing Council carry on. The university as an institution in many ways represented the best of what civilization is: the quest for truth unfettered by any bound of ideology or dogma, and the evaluation of human beings solely by their achievements in the search for truth and the betterment of humanity.

The Chairman indicated that she had learned with great sadness that some individuals had expressed fears for their personal safety because they happen to share the religion and the ethnicity of those accused of the attacks on New York and on Washington. While the events that caused those fears had taken place mostly or entirely off campus, they were of no less concern. She expressed her pride in efforts of the President and the University community to make it clear that people were to be valued for their achievements and not derided for their beliefs or for the colour of their skin.

The President remarked that he had sent a message of condolence to alumni in the United States, and had received hundreds of replies expressing thanks at being remembered.

A minute of silence was observed in memory of those affected by the events of September 11.

(b) Dr. John H. Sword

The Chairman then recalled the death of Dr. Jack Sword in July. Dr. Sword had been one of the founding fathers of the Governing Council. He had served as Acting President in 1967-68, and in 1971-72, as well as in several other leadership roles in the University. A minute of silence was observed in honour of his memory.

* not present for Item 1

Opening Remarks (cont'd)

(c) Introductions

The Chairman welcomed members to the first regular Governing Council meeting of the year and invited members to introduce themselves and to state their constituencies and Board and Committee assignments. Members of the senior administration and of the Governing Council Office were also introduced.

IN ACCORDANCE WITH A DETERMINATION BY THE EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE PURSUANT TO SECTION 38 OF *BY-LAW NUMBER 2*, THE GOVERNING COUNCIL CONSIDERED ITEMS 1 and 2 *IN CAMERA*.

1. Senior Appointment

On motion duly moved and seconded,

It was RESOLVED

THAT the creation of the position of Assistant Vice-President, Alumni and Development, be approved and

THAT Ms Rivi Frankle be appointed Assistant Vice-President, Alumni and Development, effective immediately.

2. Board and Committee Assignments – Executive Committee

On motion duly moved and seconded,

It was RESOLVED

THAT Ms Heather Schramm be appointed to the part-time undergraduate/graduate student seat on the Executive Committee for the 2001-02 academic year, effective immediately.

THE GOVERNING COUNCIL RETURNED TO OPEN SESSION.

3. Chairman's Remarks

(a) Overview

The Chairman noted that most members had participated in either the formal orientation session held on September 6, or an informal session held with the Secretary. She encouraged members to contact the Office of the Governing Council if they had any questions.

(b) In Camera Resolutions

The Chairman announced the appointment of Ms Rivi Frankle as Assistant Vice-President, Alumni and Development.

She also announced the appointment of Ms Heather Schramm to the Executive Committee, and noted that Ms Schramm was not at the meeting as she had received a UNESCO scholarship

3. Chairman's Remarks (cont'd)**(b) In Camera Resolutions** (cont'd)

to attend the International Sociological Association workshop for PhD students which was currently being held in Milan.

(c) December 20 meeting of the Governing Council

The Chairman announced that the December 20, 2001 meeting of the Governing Council would be held at the University of Toronto at Mississauga (UTM), with a reception to follow at Lislehurst, the residence of the Principal.

4. Minutes of the Previous Meeting

The minutes of the previous meeting held on June 28, 2001 were approved.

5. Business Arising from the Minutes of the Previous Meeting

There was no business arising from the previous meeting.

6. Report of the President**(a) Priorities for the Coming Year****(i) Making the Case for the Public Research University**

The President reported that he had a number of speaking engagements related to making the case for the public research university.

(ii) Moving the University to the First Rank of Public Research Universities

The President indicated that work was being done on several fronts to move the University of Toronto up to the first rank of public research universities. He noted that the main issue was funding. Invited to comment, Professor Munroe-Blum expressed optimism that the federal government would begin a phased approach to funding indirect research costs, starting at 20% and moving to 40%.

The President also emphasized the need to develop appropriate benchmarks to compare the University of Toronto to peer institutions. He observed that a number of opportunities to recruit outstanding faculty had arisen as a result of the Canada Research Chairs program and the establishment of the Jackman Chairs. Of the 1,700 tenure-stream faculty at the University, approximately 1,000 would be replaced in the next ten years.

(iii) Expansion (Enrolment and Capital)

The President stated that the University's senior leadership team was engaged with planning for expansion. He noted that it was crucial that inflation protection be built into the operating funding announced by the provincial government in the Spring. Invited to comment, Dr. Levy said that he would welcome advice from members of the Governing Council with respect to strategies for gaining the support of municipal governments for the University's expansion plans. The President stressed the importance of support from the municipal government, especially because the University of Toronto was currently the second largest builder in the Greater Toronto Area (GTA), after the airport.

6. Report of the President (cont'd)**(a) Priorities for the Coming Year (cont'd)****(iv) Enhancing Student Financial Support**

The President reported that the University of Toronto's announcement of a minimum funding package for all graduate students was a breakthrough for Canada. He acknowledged that most students at the Ontario Institute for Studies in Education of the University of Toronto (OISE/UT) had not yet reaped the benefits of the package, but would do so within three years. Invited to comment, Professor Orchard noted that progress in implementing the funding pledge had been faster than the Task Force on Graduate Student Financial Support had anticipated. Professor Orchard observed that the shortfall in graduate student funding at OISE/UT had been inherited at the time of the merger in July 1996, and indicated that the funds for student support had increased from \$2.7 million in 1996 to \$6 million this year.

(v) Equity

The President repeated his commitment to equity as one of the hallmarks of his presidency. He referred to the supplementary payment to pensioners that had been approved in June 2001 as an equity-driven decision.

(vi) Negotiations with Employee Groups

The President noted that negotiations with all employee groups would take place in the coming year. Invited to comment, Professor Hildyard indicated that negotiations with the Teaching Assistants and with the University of Toronto Faculty Association (UTFA) were underway. She also noted that the United Steelworkers of America (USWA) would be negotiating the first renewal of their collective agreement in the spring 2002.

The President expressed his hope that a forum on pensions jointly sponsored by the administration and UTFA would provide factual information on possible revisions to the pension plan. He noted that enhancements to the pension plan were dependent upon a substantial surplus in the plan, and that recent developments in the financial markets had significantly reduced the surplus.

(vii) The Campaign

The President commented that there would be a reformulation of campaign strategy to address the needs for capital funding and for financial support for graduate students. He expressed his gratitude to alumni and friends of the University who had generously supported the University's campaign to date. Of the \$1 billion goal, over \$800 million had been raised to date.

(b) Predominately Need-Based Student Aid

The President referred to his "President's Message" which had just appeared in the University of Toronto Magazine, in which he confirmed his commitment to need-based student aid for undergraduate students. He reported that a number of leading universities in the United States had recently committed to admission on the basis of merit and student funding on the basis of need. In response to his urging that the Ontario universities move towards a predominately need-based system, the matter will be discussed at the next meeting of the Executive Heads of the Council of Ontario Universities (COU). He noted

6. Report of the President (cont'd)**(b) Predominately Need-Based Student Aid** (cont'd)

that Queen's University had made a formal commitment to move towards need-based student financial aid.

(c) Review of Provost's Office and Advisory Committee on the Appointment of a Vice-President and Provost

The President announced that the Review of the Provost's Office would begin in mid-October, and that he would be announcing the members of an Advisory Committee in the next few weeks. He stated that the search would be international in scope, and noted that the three recent international searches for Deans resulted in two internal and one external appointment. Even for the internal appointments, the international nature of the searches had "raised the bar" for the appointments.

The Chairman expressed support and encouragement on behalf of members of the Governing Council for conducting a broad-based search for this position.

(d) Celebration of the 100th Anniversary of the Nobel Prize at the University of Toronto

The President announced that the University of Toronto in partnership with the Swedish Embassy would host on November 16, 2001 a celebration of the 100th Anniversary of the Nobel Prize. A number of Nobel Prize winners with connections to Canada were expected to attend.

7. Performance Indicators

Professor Tuohy explained that the presentation of the fourth annual report to the Governing Council on performance indicators would not restate the highlights of the report, but would emphasize the performance of the University of Toronto in the context of its peer institutions. Professor Tuohy thanked the staff from all of the Vice-Presidential portfolios who worked on the report, and acknowledged in particular the efforts of Mr. England and Ms Michelle Broderick. A copy of the presentation is attached hereto as "Appendix A".

The following points were raised in discussion:

- How could the measurement of visible minorities among faculty be improved? Professor Tuohy replied that the self-report and the survey of chairs were the best available measures, and noted that the discrepancy in the two sources was primarily in the data on new hires.
- Would the number of citations of faculty members' research in leading scientific and scholarly publications be an appropriate measure of performance? Mr. England replied that work was being done in that area and the resulting data would be assessed next year.

7. Performance Indicators (cont'd)

- Why were entering averages lower at the Mississauga and Scarborough campuses and how can this be improved? Professor Tuohy replied that a working group was looking at this issue. Programs in which these divisions have a critical mass of faculty and students, programs unique to the divisions, and enhanced facilities for students would result in increased demand and higher entering averages.
- What policies could help retain doctoral students? Professor Tuohy replied that improved supervisory practices were being encouraged by the School of Graduate Studies (SGS) and that improved funding packages would also help retain graduate students.
- What measures of student satisfaction were possible? Professor Tuohy explained that the annual survey on student financial aid would be augmented this year with questions on the quality of student life.

At the invitation of the Chairman, Mr. Jorge Sousa, President of the Graduate Students' Union (GSU), addressed members of the Governing Council. Mr. Sousa welcomed members on behalf of the GSU, and congratulated Professor Tuohy for an excellent report.

Mr. Sousa expressed concern about several factors that were contributing to graduate student attrition, including the phasing in of funding packages, supervisory practices, administrative processes, academic program in some areas, and faculty workload. Mr. Sousa called on the University to review these areas of concern.

The Chairman thanked Mr. Sousa for his remarks.

8. Calendar of Business for 2001-02

The Chairman noted that an updated version of the Calendar of Business had been placed on the table.

9. Reports for Information

The Governing Council received the items reported for information in the following Reports:

Report Number 337 of the Executive Committee – June 28, 2001

Report Number 338 of the Executive Committee – September 10, 2001

The Chairman noted that Ms Karen Lewis' name had been inadvertently omitted from the attendance list in Report Number 338.

10. Date of the Next Meeting

The Chairman reminded members of the Council's next meeting, scheduled for Thursday, October 25, 2001 at 4:00 p.m. She also reminded members that the December 20 meeting would be held at the University of Toronto at Mississauga.

11. Question Period

There were no questions raised.

12. Other Business

A member noted that a memorial service for Dr. Jack Sword would be held on September 29, 2001. The Secretary undertook to circulate details of the service to members of the Governing Council.

A member expressed appreciation to the administration on behalf of minority groups in the University community for the University's response to the events of September 11, and the ongoing emphasis on respect for diversity within the University community.

The meeting adjourned at 6:00 p.m.

Secretary

September 24, 2001

Chairman