To the Governing Council,
University of Toronto

Your Board reports that it met on Thursday, November 22, 2018, at 4:10 p.m. in the Council Chamber, Simcoe Hall with the following members present:

PRESENT:

Andrea Sass-Kortsak, Chair
Steven Thorpe, Vice-Chair
Donald Ainslie
Catherine Amara
Laura Anderson
Heather Boon
Harvey Botting
Markus Bussmann
Caryl Clark
Emily Chu
Emilie (Yi Yi) Guo
Richard Hegele
Edsel Ing
Mallory Jackan
Ira Jacobs
Linda Johnston
Allan Kaplan
Mala Kashyap
Jeannie Kim
Anil Kishen
Angela B. Lange
Richard Hegele
Edsel Ing
Mallory Jackan
Ira Jacobs
Linda Johnston
Allan Kaplan
Mala Kashyap
Jeannie Kim
Anil Kishen
Angela B. Lange
David Palmer
Michele Peterson-Badali
Mary Pugh
Jennifer Purtle
Reinhart Reithmeier
Tian Renton
Catherine Riddell
Suzan Schneeweiss
Boaz F. Schuman
Said Sidani
Salvatore Spadafora
Bodgan Stovba
Eric Stubbs
Tom Sutherland
Wisdom J. Tettey
W. Keith Thomas
Jessie Tong
Truc Tran
Njoki Wane
Trevor Young
Rachel Zand
REGRETS:
Cheryl Regehr
Donald C. Ainslie
Aarthi Ashok
Larry Alford
Cristina Amon
Ryan Balot
Glen Bandiera
Dwayne Benjamin
Randy Boyagoda
Shauna Brail
Adalsteinn (Steini) I. D. Brown
Christine Burke
Andrea Chiappetta
George Christakis
Kenneth Corts
Maria Christina Cuervo
Gilbert Delgado
Raisa Deber
Sheree Drummond
Vivek Goel
Tara Goldstein
William A. Gough
Daniel A. Haas
Kelly
Hannah-Moffat
Thomas M. Hurka
Edward Iacobucci
Glen Jones
Charlie Keil
Sally Krystin
Ronald H. Kluger
Ulrich J. Krull
Ron Levi
Fei Fei Liu
Ben Liu
Scott Mabury
Tiff Macklem
Bonnie S. McElhinny
Faye Mishna
Nicholas Moroz
David Palmer
Lacra Pavel
Reinhart Reithmeier
Trevor Rodgers
Edward (Ted) Sargent
Hugh Segal
Anne Harriet
Simmonds
Markus Stock
Richard Sommer
Andrew Spence
Robert M. Wright

NON-VOTING ASSESSORS:
Heather Boon, Vice-Provost, Faculty and Academic Life

SECRETARIAT:
Joan Griffin, Secretary, Academic Board

IN ATTENDANCE:
Althea Blackburn-Evans, University of Toronto Communications
Bob Boeckner, Member, Business Board
Tad Brown, Counsel, Business Affairs and Advancement
Jennifer Francisco, Office of the Vice-Provost, Academic Programs
Tracey Gameiro, Associate Director, Appeals, Discipline and Faculty Grievances
Justine Garrett, Office of the Vice-Provost, Academic Programs
Erin Lemon, University of Toronto Communications
Daniella Mallinick, Director, Academic Programs, Planning & Quality Assurance, Office of the Vice-Provost, Academic Programs
Karen McCarthy, University of Toronto Communications
Helen Miliotis, Faculty of Medicine,
Krista Osbourne, Administrative Clerk & Hearing Secretary, Appeals, Discipline and Faculty Grievances
Andrea Russell, Director, Academic Affairs
Archana Sridhar, Assistant Provost, Office of the Vice-President and Provost
ITEMS 4 AND 5 ARE REPORTED FOR APPROVAL AND ALL OTHER ITEMS ARE FOR INFORMATION

1. Report of the Vice-President and Provost

Professor Heather Boon, Vice-Provost, Faculty and Academic Faculty Life, brought remarks on behalf of the Provost and reported as per the Framework Agreement with the federated universities that Professor Michael Ratcliffe had been re-appointed as Dean of Arts and Vice-Provost of Trinity College, effective July 1, 2018, for a second five-year term.

She also shared that the Provost’s Office had committed to writing to all divisions to remind them that explicit advice regarding students’ further rights of appeal in academic appeal matters should be included in all decisions. This planned communication arose from a recent report of the Academic Appeals Committee. In that report, the Senior Chair had noted that a student had not been appropriately informed of the right to appeal a divisional academic appeals decision to the Academic Appeals Committee of Governing Council.

An education session led by Professor Luc De Nil, Acting Dean, School of Graduate Studies and Vice-Provost, Graduate Research and Education, followed Professor Boon’s comments. Professor De Nil presented on the “10,000 PhDs Project”, a research project that tracked U of T PhD graduates since 2000 via publically available data sources such as LinkedIn to attempt to discern where U of T PhD graduates are employed.

He noted that U of T PhD graduates are highly employable and find jobs in all sectors of the economy, including within higher education; that they advanced research and teaching domestically and abroad; and fuelled global innovation and change across the private and public sectors. Professor De Nil shared how members of the Board could obtain data relevant to their own divisions and noted several divisions had extended the project concept to new areas, such as the Faculty of Arts and Science’s initiative to track Master-level graduates in a similar manner.

In response to members’ questions, Professor De Nil explained that several pilot projects were underway and the outcome of those would help shape next steps. He also commented on the University’s participation in the TRACE project based at McGill University which collects ethnographic data on graduates.
2. Reviews of Academic Programs and Units – Follow-up Reports

The Board received a summary report by Professor Ernest Lam, Chair of the Committee on Academic Policy and Programs (AP&P) regarding two follow-up reports from previous academic program and unit reviews that had been considered by AP&P at its meeting on November 1, 2018. The following reports were received for information:

i. Department of Historical Studies, and its Programs (University of Toronto Mississauga)

ii. Department of Chemical and Physical Sciences and its Programs (University of Toronto Mississauga)

Professor Lam confirmed the Committee was satisfied with the follow-up reports and determined that there were no specific issues of concern to be brought forward to the Academic Board.

3. Semi-Annual Reports on the Reviews of Academic Units and Program, April – September 2018

Professor Lam reported on the Semi-Annual Report of Academic Units and Programs noting that 14 decanal reviews had been considered by AP&P at its meeting on November 1, 2018. Reports were reviewed from the following:

**Faculty of Arts and Science:**
Centre for Criminology and Sociolegal Studies
Department of Chemistry
Department of Ecology and Evolutionary Biology
Department of Spanish and Portuguese
Latin American Studies Program
Pharmaceutical Chemistry Program [offered in association with the Leslie Dan Faculty of Pharmacy]
School of the Environment

**Faculty of Medicine:**
Physician Assistant Program

**University of Toronto Mississauga:**
Department of Anthropology
Forensic Science Programs

**University of Toronto Scarborough:**
Department of Arts, Culture and Media
Department of Historical and Cultural Studies
Department of Physical and Environmental Sciences
Department of Psychology

He stated that the Committee confirmed the reviews were conducted in line with University policy and guidelines, that the Provost’s Office had managed the process appropriately, and that plans were in place to address any quality issues. He offered thanks to the Reading Groups for their thoughtful and careful work.

Seven follow-up reports were requested for Department of Chemistry, Pharmaceutical Chemistry Program, Department of Ecology and Evolutionary Biology, Department of Spanish and Portuguese, Latin American Studies Program, Forensic Science Program, and Arts, Culture and Media.

Professor McCahan commented that the Committee had raised the question of how program reviews were conducted in a tri-campus context, specifically whether, in the case of reviews of units that offer only undergraduate programs, reviewers met with the cognate graduate Chairs. Professor McCahan indicated that the Tri-Campus Review consultations had raised similar questions, and she expected that the recommendations from the review would address the conduct of reviews.

4. **New Graduate Program Proposal: Master of Health Science in Medical Physiology (M.H.Sc.), Faculty of Medicine (for recommendation)** (Arising from Report Number 193 of the Committee on Academic Policy and Programs)

Professor McCahan introduced the new program and Professor Helen Miliotis from the Faculty of Medicine Department of Physiology, explained how the program differed from others available. In her remarks, Professor Miliotis noted that it would be the Faculty of Medicine’s first one-year degree program and filled a gap in the professional landscape. Professor Ernest Lam, Chair of the Committee on Academic Programs and Policy, reported that AP&P received a similar presentation from Professor Miliotis at its meeting on November 1 and gave unanimous support to the proposal.

Academic Board members engaged in discussion on the proposal, with questions regarding pathways for graduates and the anticipated ease of transition into research-based doctoral programs post-graduation. In response, Professor Trevor Young, Dean of the Faculty of Medicine, indicated that he anticipated students in this program would be eligible to proceed to other studies but that many would be looking to pursue careers immediately after graduation. It was also noted that the list of potential feeder programs did not include the Bachelor of Kinesiology, despite the likelihood of the M.H.Sc. being an attractive second degree for BKin graduates. The Dean of Medicine assured the Dean of the Faculty of Kinesiology and Physical Education and the Board that further conversations at the Council of Health Sciences Deans’ table were forthcoming.
On a motion duly moved, seconded and carried

YOUR BOARD APPROVED

THAT, subject to confirmation by the Executive Committee

THAT the proposed degree program, Master of Health Science in Medical Physiology (M.H.Sc.), as described in the proposal from the Faculty of Medicine dated September 21, 2018 be approved effective September 1, 2019.

OPEN SESSION CONSENT AGENDA

The Chair notified the Board that the Secretary had received a request to remove three items of business from the Consent Agenda: Item 7a Provost’s Annual Report on Cases of Academic Discipline, 2017-2018, Item 7b Semi-Annual Report: Academic Appeals, Committee, Individual Cases, Fall 2018, and Item 7c Semi-Annual Report: University of Tribunal, Individual Cases, Fall 2018 to be discussed as part of the regular agenda. Professor Boon, Vice-Provost, Faculty and Academic Life was invited to provide comments as sponsor.

Professor Boon noted that the cases of academic discipline are reported retrospectively to the Board on an annual basis and contain divisional and institutional statistical information. She further noted that a presentation on the educational efforts regarding Academic Integrity from across the University would be given to the Executive Committee on December 4, 2018 and offered to give a similar presentation to Academic Board at a future meeting. The Chair invited discussion from members.

The members noted concern regarding plagiarism and academic integrity in general, with specific comments received regarding the perceived pervasiveness of cheating by undergraduates; the suggestion that education efforts focus on the harm done to fellow students when other students decided to cheat; and the challenges students faced in knowing how and when to report suspected academic dishonesty and promotion on campus by essay mills. Further questions were received on whether cheating occurs more frequently in a particular year of study, such as first year or final year, or whether this was more generalized. Professor Boon noted that instances of cheating occurred in every year without noticeable patterns apart from individuals’ poor decision-making. Professor Boon also noted the many tools used by instructors to identify plagiarism and other academic offenses, including new technologies. The Chair thanked members for the robust conversation and Professor Boon reiterated her offer to bring a presentation to the next meeting.

The Board proceeded with the Consent Agenda.
On a motion duly moved, seconded, and carried

YOUR BOARD APPROVED THAT

the consent agenda be adopted.

5. Approval of the Report of the Previous Meeting – Report Number 217 – October 4, 2018

6. Business Arising from the Report of the Previous Meeting

7. Items for Information:

   a) Provost’s Annual Report on Cases of Academic Discipline 2017-2018*
   b) Semi-Annual Report: Academic Appeals Committee, Individual Cases, Fall 2018*
   c) Semi-Annual Report: University Tribunal, Individual Cases, Fall 2018*
   d) Report Number 247 of Agenda Committee – November 13, 2018*
   e) Report Number 193 of the Committee on Academic Policy and Programs – November 1, 2018*
   f) Advisory Committee on the University of Toronto Library System for 2018-19*

8. Date of the Next Meeting – Thursday, January 31, 2019 @ 4:10 to 6:10 p.m.

END OF CONSENT AGENDA
9. **Other Business**

The Chair notified the Board that a new Status Change Report from the Office of the Vice-President and Provost had been posted on the Academic Board website and encouraged members to review the Report and submit any questions to the Secretary, at least 14 days prior to the next meeting.

**THE BOARD MOVED IN CAMERA.**

10. **Quarterly Report on Donations: August 1 to October 31, 2018**

   The Board received for information the Quarterly Reports on Donations for the period May 1 to July 31, 2018.

**THE BOARD RETURNED TO OPEN SESSION.**

   The meeting adjourned at 5:40 p.m.

_________________________________________  ______________________________________
Secretary                                                                 Chair

November 22, 2018