

UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

THE GOVERNING COUNCIL

APRIL 8, 2014

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE GOVERNING COUNCIL held on April 8, 2014 at 4:30 p.m. in the Council Chamber, Simcoe Hall, University of Toronto.

Present:

Ms Judy Goldring (Chair)
Ms Shirley Hoy (Vice-Chair)
Professor Meric S. Gertler (President)
Ms Alexis Archbold
Professor John Bland
Mr. Harvey Botting
Mr. Jeff Collins
Professor Elizabeth Cowper
Mr. Adrian De Leon
Mr. Aidan Fishman
Mr. Andrew Girgis
Mr. Gary D. Goldberg
Professor Avrum I. Gotlieb
Professor Hugh P. Gunz
Ms Alexandra Harris
Ms Zabeen Hirji
Professor Ellen Hodnett
Professor Edward Iacobucci
Mr. Asad J. Jamal
Mr. R. Mark Krembil
Mr. Nykolaj Kuryluk
Mr. Brian Lawson
Ms Nancy Carolyn Lee
Mr. John Paul Morgan
Ms N. Jane Pepino
Ms Mainawati Rambali
Professor Cheryl Regehr
Ms Catherine Riddell
Professor Andrea Sass-Kortsak
Professor Elizabeth M. Smyth

Professor Salvatore M. Spadafora
Professor Janice Gross Stein
Mr. Andrew Szende
Mr. W. Keith Thomas
Professor Steven J. Thorpe
Ms Rita Tsang
Ms B. Elizabeth Vosburgh

Mr. Louis R. Charpentier, Secretary of the
Governing Council

Secretariat:

Mr. Jim Delaney
Ms Sheree Drummond
Mr. Anwar Kazimi
Mr. Henry Mulhall
Ms Rena Parson
Ms Amorell Saunders N'Daw
Mr. David Walders

Absent:

Mr. Yuan Chung
Mr. Rastko Cvekic
Professor William A. Gough
Ms Claire M.C. Kennedy
Ms Paulette L. Kennedy
Dr. Gary P. Mooney
Ms Melinda M. Rogers
Professor Hargurdeep (Deep) Saini
Mr. Howard Shearer
Mr. W. John Switzer

In Attendance:

Ms Caitlin Campisi, Governor-Elect
Mr. Ben Coleman, Governor-Elect
Ms Susan Froom, Governor-Elect, and President, Association of Part-time Undergraduate Students (APUS)

Mr. David Windross, College of Electors
Mr. Bob Boedkner, College of Electors

Professor Angela Hildyard, Vice-President, Human Resources & Equity

Professor Scott Mabury, Vice-President, University Operations

Mr. David Palmer, Vice-President, Advancement

Ms Judith Wolfson, Vice-President, University Relations

Professor Jill Matus, Vice-Provost, Students and First-Entry Divisions

Ms Sheila Brown, Chief Financial Officer

Mr. David Curtin, Director, Communications Services, Office of the President

Mr. Ken DeBaeremaeker, Manager, Enrolment Planning and Modeling

Ms Kim Derrick, Executive Assistant (Interim), Office of the President

Ms Sally Garner, Executive Director, Planning and Budget

Ms Catherine Gagne, Senior Manager, Budget Administration and Institutional Planning

Ms Bryn MacPherson, Executive Director, Office of the President

Mr. Richard Levin, Executive Director, Enrolment Services and University Registrar

Ms Gail Milgrom, Director, Space and Facilities Planning

Ms Mila Miller, Director, Prospect Management

Mr. Steve Moate, Senior Legal Counsel, Office of the President

Mr. David Newman, Director, Office of Student Life

Ms Archana Sridhar, Assistant Provost

Ms Meredith Strong, Director, Office of the Vice-Provost, Students and Student Policy Advisor

Mr. Andy Torr, Special Projects Officer, Office of the Vice-President, Research and Innovation

Ms Donna Wall, Director of Financial Aid and Awards, Enrollment Services

Ms Kimberly Yeh, Director, Office of the Vice-President, University Relations

Ms Agita Wijaya, International Student Affairs Coordinator, University of Toronto Mississauga Students Union

Mr. Aman Gebru, Finance and University Governance Commissioner of the Graduate Students' Union

IN ACCORDANCE WITH A DETERMINATION BY THE EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE, PURSUANT TO SECTION 38 OF BY-LAW NUMBER 2 OF THE GOVERNING COUNCIL, ITEMS 11 AND 12 ON THE AGENDA WERE CONSIDERED BY THE GOVERNING COUNCIL *IN CAMERA*.

1. Chair's Remarks

The Chair welcomed members and guests to the meeting. She reported that the following individuals had been elected, re-elected, or appointed to the Governing Council: Professor Hugh Gunz, Professor Ed Iacobucci, Professor Liz Smyth, Professor Nicholas Terpstra, Professor Elizabeth Peter, Mr. Nabil Arif, Mr. Ben Coleman, Mr. Andrew Girgis, Ms Padraigin Murphy, Ms Susan Froom, Ms Susan Murray, Ms Caitlin Campisi, Ms Alexandra Harris, Mr. Gary Goldberg, Mr. Keith Thomas, Mr. David Bowden, Mr. John Paul Morgan, and Ms Janet Ecker has been appointed as an LGIC member for a three-year term effective March 19, 2014. The Chair congratulated and welcomed both new and returning Governors.

2. Report of the President

The Chair reported that President Gertler was recently recognized by one of his *alma maters*, the University of California, Berkeley, with its distinguished alumni award for his outstanding academic and professional accomplishments. The Chair congratulated the President and invited him to provide his report.

The President provided a summary of a recent successful visit to California during which he spoke to approximately one hundred alumni about the University's remarkable global stature in innovation and entrepreneurship. He also noted that he had hosted a roundtable meeting with alumni and friends, including, including industry leaders, to discuss the University's strategic priorities.

The President indicated that he was delighted to read into the record that further to his report at the previous meeting, two additional people had accepted offers of honorary degrees from the University of Toronto, Mr. Roberto Benigni and Ms Nicoletta Braschi, in recognition of their exceptional contributions to the arts.

Professor Gertler also reported that the University had signed the Strategic Mandate Agreement with the Province. He indicated that since negotiations are continuing with some sister institutions, details could not yet be discussed. However, the President indicated that the administration was satisfied with the outcome which recognized U of T's special strengths, unique mission, and differentiated excellence. The President acknowledged the work of many towards a successful outcome.

President Gertler noted the recent appointments in the federal cabinet and his optimistic outlook on the potential impact for the University.

Finally, the President stated that the U15 Group of Canadian Research Universities had become a signatory to the "Hefei Statement On The Ten Characteristics Of Contemporary Research Universities," and as such, the U15 joined the pre-eminent global network of leading research universities: The Association of American Universities (AAU), The League of European Research Universities (LERU), The Russell Group in the United Kingdom, The China 9 group of leading Chinese universities (C9), and The Australian Group of Eight research-intensive universities (Go8). Being a part of this network, the President reported, would provide important opportunities for increased partnership and collaboration on an international scale, and would give Canada a voice on matters one might describe as "global research university governance."

3. Tuition Fees and Budget

The Chair indicated that items 3 (a.), (b.), (c.) and (d.) would be introduced by way of a combined presentation by Professor Scott Mabury, Vice-President, University Operations, which would provide highlights of the very thorough presentations given at the Planning and Budget Committee, the Academic Board, and the Business Board meetings, and at an information session for Governors.¹

Professor Mabury's presentation covered a number of topics including: 1) the overall context (i.e., the current tuition framework and its impact; declining public investment, etc.); 2) a balanced budget; 3) approximately \$2 billion in expenditures; 4) leveraging options to optimize the budget; 5) enrolment (including graduate and tri-campus undergraduate); 6) declining operating grant revenues; 7) the 3% limit on tuition overall; 8) sources of incremental revenue; 9) \$164 million in student assistance; 10) "effective" tuition (i.e., after awards and grants); 11) declining student debt; 12) the University Fund and priorities in academic divisions; 13) shared services, University-wide costs; and 14) year-over-year projections.

¹ Academic Board Presentation: <http://uoft.me/ABprestin20Mar2014> / Business Board Presentation: <http://uoft.me/BBprestin2014Mar03> / Meeting Reports: <http://uoft.me/PB2014Feb26>; <http://uoft.me/AB2014Mar20>; <http://uoft.me/BB2014Mar03>

With respect to the University Fund (UF), Professor Cheryl Regehr, Vice-President and Provost, indicated that there was increased interest in the Fund, a redistribution mechanism that ensured that the priorities of the University can continue. Professor Regehr reported that \$53 million had been allocated since it had been created. The first priority, she added, had been rebalancing, followed by faculty hiring, budget assistance, interdivisional teaching, and enrolment growth. This year, she concluded, \$4.5 million had been allocated to UTM and UTSC for capital projects, \$1 million to Arts and Science for tuition framework relief, some funding to Music for instruction and Dentistry for an important community program, and some funding to Applied Science and Engineering for graduate expansion.

In summary, Professor Mabury highlighted the need to address declining provincial support and protect the University, while advancing the institutional mission and expanding the campuses. At the same time, he stated, the province had indicated a desire to open new campuses and to differentiate universities. Professor Mabury indicated that the U of T was poised to even further differentiate itself as the graduate and research intensive university in Ontario. Accordingly, the University must make it a priority to increase its graduate student numbers. International student enrolment carried some risks, but it was an academic imperative. Therefore, increasing international student numbers must be managed while also ensuring that these students have exceptional experiences. Professor Mabury indicated that the key question for the institution was related to mitigation of its structural budget deficit. He continued, commenting that he believed that through the University's budget model, there was more efficiency, productivity, and higher performance, through the administrative leadership, in the advancement of its institutional mission.

The Chair thanked Professor Mabury and Ms Sally Garner, Executive Director, Planning and Budget, for all of the presentations throughout governance in advance of the meeting.

Mr. Jeff Collins reported that the Business Board discussion of the Tuition Fee Schedules and the Budget Report, members had been actively engaged throughout the presentation provided by Ms Garner and Professor Mabury. The comments and questions from members covered a number of topics including: international student enrolment, countries of origin of international students; graduate student enrolment; enrolment plans; tuition fee levels; the impact of potential further drop in provincial support; the pension program (including special payments, pension contribution strategy, temporary solvency relief program); student aid (including reserves, availability for international students); divisional reserves; the student access guarantee; shared services; and administrative cost structures. Mr. Collins added that there had been one external speaker, a representative of the GSU, who had focused his comments on a perceived need for a post-residency fee for doctoral students. He concluded by indicating that all the resolutions had been approved by the Business Board with no negative votes.

Professor Ellen Hodnett reported that at the meeting of the Academic Board, Professor Mabury and Professor Regehr had given a very thorough presentation on the Budget to the Board. She indicated that Professor Regehr had informed members that the recently announced Federal budget would have a significant impact on the University, particularly the new funding commitments to post-secondary research. The Board had been advised that the balanced budget for 2014-2015 was being presented despite the continuing economic uncertainty in the Province. Professor Hodnett indicated that the Board had been informed that in terms of enrollment in 2013, there had been an increase in both the raw number of undergraduate students and in the quality (as defined by entering averages) of these students. International student enrollment had been almost 5% above the 2013 target and the quality of these students had been also higher. Overall, Professor Hodnett concluded, Academic Board members had been very impressed by both the presentation on the Budget and on the Report itself.

The Chair invited Mr. Aman Gebru, Finance and University Governance Commissioner of the Graduate Students' Union (GSU) to address the Council. Referring to his letter dated April 8, 2014, and the Report of the Provostial Committee on Graduate Student Financial Support dated January 30, 2014, Mr. Gebru spoke about accessibility to graduate education and the GSU's view that post-program fee reductions should be reinstated at the University of Toronto.

Invited to address members, Ms Agita Wijaya, International Student Affairs Coordinator of the UTM Students Union, expressed concerns on behalf of UTMSU with respect to increases to international student fees, indicating that it was her student society's view that such increases limited access to only those who could afford it.

In response to a member's question, the Vice-President and Provost reported that she had begun working with Deans with respect to the possible implementation of the recommendations of the Provostial Committee. She added, however, that graduate student funding was administered at the divisional level and sources varied across disciplines. Therefore, the involvement of the Deans was essential.

Professor Regehr also indicated that she understood the concerns in respect of international student fees. However, she noted that the University benchmarked its international fees against other leading and comparable universities, adding that the vast majority of tuition fees was subject to the provincial government's tuition framework.

Responding to a member's comment, Professor Regehr clarified that the government grant funded the University for five years of a graduate student's participation. The post-program period was the time following these five years, when the division did not receive any funding from the government. The Provost added that a review of the School of Graduate Studies had recently been completed and that one of the priorities coming out of the review was to examine graduate students' time to degree completion.

a) Annual Report on Student Financial Support: Report of the Vice-Provost, Students 2012-13

The report was received.

b) Tuition Fee Schedule for Publicly Funded Programs, 2014-15

On a motion duly made, seconded, and carried,

IT WAS RESOLVED

THAT the Tuition-Fee Schedule For Publicly Funded Programs in 2014-15, as described in *Tuition Fee Schedule for Publicly-Funded Programs 2014-15* (February 14, 2014), and the tuition fees in 2014-15 and 2015-16 for the special programs identified in Tables B2 and C2 of Appendices B and C of the aforementioned report be approved.

c) Tuition Fee Schedule for Self-Funded Programs, 2014-15

On a motion duly made, seconded, and carried,

IT WAS RESOLVED

THAT the Tuition Fee Schedule for Self-Funded Programs, 2014-15 be approved.

d) Budget Report, 2014-15 and Long Range Budget Guidelines, 2014-15 to 2018-19

On a motion duly made, seconded, and carried,

IT WAS RESOLVED

THAT the Long Range Budget Guidelines, 2014-15 to 2018-19 be approved in principle.

4. Other Items for Approval

a) Capital Project: University of Toronto Libraries High-Density Library Storage Facility Expansion at the Downsview Campus - Change in Space Program, Budget and Sources of Funding (*Arising from Report Number 190 of the Academic Board (March 20, 2014)*)

Professor Hodnett reported that this capital project had been presented to the Academic Board at its meeting of March 20, 2014. She indicated that several productivity improvements and cost-savings would be realized by the expansion and had been highlighted at the meeting including: reduced storage costs accruing from an off-site, high-density environment; improvements in access to high-use materials; freed-up library space re-purposed for study and collaboration; and secure and shared 'last copy of record' for important but lesser-used scholarly works. Professor Hodnett concluded by stating the proposal had received strong support from the Board.

On a motion duly made, seconded, and carried,

IT WAS RESOLVED

THAT the University of Toronto Libraries High-Density Library Storage Facility Expansion at the Downsview Campus (three bay project) with a scope of 2,435 net assignable square meters (2,675 gross square metres) be approved in principle to be funded by the following sources:

- University of Toronto Operating Budget
- University of Toronto Libraries
- Productivity and Innovation Fund, Ministry of Training, Colleges, and Universities
- Graduate Expansion Funds University Wide.

CONSENT AGENDA

The Chair noted that of the items listed on the Consent Agenda, one required approval, the report of the previous meeting (item 5), and that the others were for information only.

On a motion duly made, seconded, and carried,

IT WAS RESOLVED,

THAT the consent agenda be adopted.

5. Minutes of the Previous Meeting

6. Business Arising from the Report of the Previous Meeting

7. Reports for Information

- a) Report Number 190 of the Academic Board (March 20, 2014)
- b) Report Number 210 of the Business Board (March 3, 2014)
- c) Report Number 180 of the University Affairs Board (March 18, 2014)
- d) Report Number 4 of the University of Toronto Mississauga Campus Council (March 5, 2014)
- e) Report Number 4 of the University of Toronto Scarborough Campus Council (March 4, 2014)
- f) Report Number 462 of the Executive Committee (March 27, 2014)

8. Date of Next Meeting – Thursday, May 22, 2014 from 4:30 to 6:30 p.m. at the University of Toronto Scarborough

END OF CONSENT AGENDA

9. Question Period

A member noted that there had been a number of allegations made about the fairness of the recent elections for the Students' Administrative Council (operating as the University of Toronto Students' Union, UTSU) and that he had become aware of a request made by the Vice-Provost, Students and First-Entry Division to UTSU with respect to preserving ballots and sealing ballot boxes. Professor Jill Matus indicated that University policy provided that, with respect to the fees collected from students by the University on behalf of student societies, the Provost had an obligation to ensure that societies function in an open, accessible, and democratic manner. Before the Provost's office would investigate a complaint, however, all internal procedures within societies should be exhausted. Regarding the request made to UTSU, this had not been an intervention in proper complaint procedures, but a means of preserving potential evidence should it be required for a subsequent investigation. In response to the member's question about whether UTSU had responded positively to the request, Professor Matus indicated that she had not received an undertaking to that effect.

10. Other Business

The Chair drew members' attention to a recently produced video on Student Financial Support at the University of Toronto. Short and long versions of the video are available at <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=KGzzL4mt6vY> and <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=mgrWqarXcho>.

THE GOVERNING COUNCIL MOVED *IN CAMERA*.

11. Capital Project: University of Toronto Libraries High-Density Library Storage Facility Expansion at the Downsview Campus - Change in Space Program, Budget and Sources of Funding

On a motion duly made, seconded, and carried,

IT WAS RESOLVED,

THAT the University of Toronto Libraries High-Density Library Storage Facility Expansion at the Downsview Campus (three bay project) with a scope of 2,435 net assignable square meters (2,675 gross square metres) be approved in principle with a total project cost and as funded from the sources and in the amounts delineated in the memorandum from the Vice-President, University Operations dated February 14, 2014.

12. Appointments: Members of the Governing Council to Governance Bodies, 2014-2015

On a motion duly made, seconded, and carried,

IT WAS RESOLVED,

THAT the proposed Assignments of members of the Governing Council to Board and Committees for 2014-15, be approved.

Meeting adjourned at 5:59 p.m.

Secretary

Chair

May 2, 2014