



TO: Planning and Budget Committee

SPONSOR: Elizabeth Sisam, Assistant Vice-President, Campus and Facilities Planning

CONTACT INFORMATION: 416-978-5515; avp.space@utoronto.ca

DATE: April 23, 2010 for May 5, 2010

AGENDA ITEM: 6

ITEM IDENTIFICATION:

Interim Project Planning Report for an Oral Health Science Complex

JURISDICTIONAL INFORMATION:

Under the Policy on Capital Planning and Capital Projects, the Planning & Budget Committee reviews Project Planning Reports prepared for a capital project and recommends to the Academic Board approval in principle of the project.

BACKGROUND:

The Faculty of Dentistry, founded in 1875, is the largest, oldest and academically strongest professional dental school in Canada.

Along with providing education at the undergraduate, graduate and PhD levels, the Faculty of Dentistry provides excellent oral care for a largely under-served population through the offering of public clinics. It operates an oral health care facility that maintains a patient base of approximately 20,000 active cases providing both general practice and specialty care, mainly to those who would not be able to afford dental care elsewhere.

All of these functions and activities, plus the Dental Research Institute, the University of Toronto Centre for the Study of Pain and the Dentistry Museum are accommodated within an aging building at 124 Edward Street. The building was constructed in 1959, with an addition built in the 1970's and its last significant renovation occurred in 1985. Over time, this building has experienced significant deterioration of its physical plant and its general layout and infrastructure have proven inadequate in satisfying the Faculty's current needs, let alone those of the future. This building and a small research satellite in the Fitzgerald Building cannot meet the challenges or initiatives of the Faculty of Dentistry for the coming decades.

Despite an aging and inadequate physical plant, the Faculty of Dentistry has managed to maintain its international reputation for excellence in education, clinical services and research. However, the present facility at 124 Edward Street does not meet the standard necessary for

educational innovation or growth. Clinical teaching methodology is limited by an inflexible and constrained environment. The development and application of innovative and modern electronic and other teaching methods available is limited by the current design of the clinics, teaching laboratories, seminar rooms and lecture theatres which severely compromises the student experience. International, national and provincial demands for expansion of some of the specialty programs cannot be met without improved, modernized and enlarged teaching clinics. In addition, there is government pressure and increasing demand for more positions in the International Dentist Advanced Placement Program for foreign trained dentists.

Consistent with the Faculty of Dentistry's academic plan and the University of Toronto's goal of providing the best learning experience for its students, it is proposed that a new Oral Health Science Complex be created to include modern facilities for both classrooms and teaching labs, a fiscally sound tertiary clinical facility, and appropriate facilities for the Dental Research Institute, all of which would allow the accredited programs in Dentistry to continue to grow and maintain their internationally recognized leadership role. It would also include a Dental Museum and provide for a future physical relationship with an expanded and improved University of Toronto Centre for the Study of Pain. The Faculty of Dentistry aims to be the leading Dental Education Institute in Canada. The Faculty believes it can achieve its goals through the creation of modern, functional space which is able to support cutting edge teaching techniques and practicalities.

HIGHLIGHTS

A detailed utilization analysis of the Faculty's space requirements was undertaken and it was determined that a facility of 19,600 nasm (39,200 gross square meters) would be required to accommodate the Faculty of Dentistry. Based on the size and complexity of the space program, the committee reviewed all possible options to provide the required space for the Faculty of Dentistry.

Three options were studied in detail:

Renovations to 124 Edward Street

While the basic academic and research programmes of the Faculty could possibly fit into the building with a storey and a half addition and extensive renovation to the existing building, there would still not be space to accommodate the intramural practice, any enrolment expansion or a contiguous physical presence for the Centre for the Study of Pain. Importantly, the Faculty would remain isolated from the rest of the campus. In order to build the additional storey and a half, the site would require zoning permissions that would entail a change to the medical helicopter flight path to the Hospital for Sick Children.

To be functional and effective, the space in the building would need to be significantly reorganized. Aside from the cost and disruption that this would involve, given the limitations of an existing building, an existing addition and a new addition that will come encumbered with restrictions on its use, it is extremely unlikely that the result would be optimal for the Faculty. Finally, raising funds to achieve a sub-optimal solution could be difficult. Consequently, the renovation and re-use of the existing Dentistry building proved to be unworkable, and costing was not pursued for this option.

Construction of a New Building at 88-112 College Street (Site 14)

Site 14 is an available site, well situated to house the faculty of Dentistry. The close proximity to the other health science disciplines at the University and the teaching hospitals would provide opportunities to strengthen collaboration. The Faculty's research strengths are also compatible with initiatives at MaRS, located across the street. Access to public transportation (necessary for the clinical service) is readily available and more direct. However, this option would be a long term, high cost option. At 39,200 gross sq metres, the proposed building would be the largest constructed by the University since the 1960's.

The rough order of magnitude Total Project Cost for a new building for the Faculty of Dentistry constructed on Site 14 in 2010 dollars is estimated to be in the area of \$325M. The Faculty of Medicine has plans to relocate many of the current occupants and decommission most of the space currently occupied on Site 14, however, these are not yet complete. Additional funding will be required for these secondary effects.

The operating budget for a new building, if the Donnelly Centre for Cellular and Biomolecular Research at \$3.25M is taken as a model, could be expected to almost be doubled in a building of double the size, or about \$6.0M, an increase of \$3.1M for the Faculty of Dentistry. Due to the estimated costs of this option it is not being recommended.

Purchase an Existing Building and Renovate

Given the high costs of developing a site for a new building for the Oral Health Centre, the Committee also considered purchasing an existing building that could be modified, renovated and modestly expanded to meet the programmatic needs of the Faculty of Dentistry. Although there may be a few options close to the health sciences precinct of the University, there have yet to be any negotiations regarding such a site.

The operating costs in a renovated building as described above with a modern vivarium could be expected to double to at least \$4.5M, an increase of \$1.6M annually in current dollars, for the Faculty of Dentistry.

In a scenario in which a building of adequate size is available, it is assumed that significant renovations will still be required, and that some unique program elements such as the large clinics and the Vivarium facilities will require new construction. If the university were to purchase a site with an existing building which could be modified to meet the needs of the Faculty of Dentistry the range of total project cost in 2010 dollars might be \$150M to \$165M and depending on the characteristics of the building. This range assumes approximately 6,800 GSM of new construction for clinics and Vivarium, and approximately 24,500 GSM of moderate to extensive renovation. Acquisition costs would be additional.

SCHEDULE

This Interim Report is being brought forward for approval in principle of the increased space needs for the Faculty of Dentistry and to initiate fundraising for this purpose. Further refinement of the space requirements, site analysis and costs will be necessary to finalize the project committee report. A final report is expected to come forward for consideration once a site and a plan for acquisition meeting the requirements of the Faculty have been identified.

FUNDING SOURCES

The estimated costs for the project being recommended as described in renovated space for the Faculty of Dentistry are in the \$150M - \$165M range exclusive of the cost to purchase the site. Funding for this project will be from external sources which will be identified in the final report.

RECOMMENDATIONS

Recommendations:

That the Planning and Budget Committee recommend to the Academic Board:

1. THAT the Interim Project Planning Report for an Oral Health Science Complex be approved in principle to accommodate the activities and functions as described and to facilitate the necessary fundraising related to the proposed project.