



FOR INFORMATION PUBLIC OPEN SESSION

TO: Committee on Academic Policy and Programs

SPONSOR: Susan McCahan, Vice-Provost, Academic Programs CONTACT INFO: (416) 978-0490, <u>vp.academicprograms@utoronto.ca</u>

PRESENTER: See Sponsor

CONTACT INFO:

DATE: April 27, 2023 for May 4, 2023

AGENDA ITEM: 8

ITEM IDENTIFICATION:

Report on the Review of Clinical Departments 2020-21, 2021-22, 2022-23

JURISDICTIONAL INFORMATION:

"The Committee...has general responsibility...for monitoring the quality of education and the research activities of the University.... The Committee receives annual reports or such more frequent regular reports as it may determine, on matters within its purview, including reports on the ...[r]eviews of academic units and programs."

GOVERNANCE PATH:

1. Committee on Academic Policy and Programs [For Information] (May 4, 2023)

PREVIOUS ACTION TAKEN:

The Governing Council approved the <u>Policy for Approval and Review of Academic Programs</u> and <u>Units</u> in 2010. The <u>Policy</u> outlines University-wide principles for the approval of proposed new academic programs and review of existing programs and units. Its goal is to align the University's quality assurance processes with the Province's Quality Assurance Framework (QAF) through establishing the authority of the <u>University of Toronto Quality Assurance Process</u> (UTQAP), which outlines the process for reviewing academic programs and the units that offer them.

The Dean of the Temerty Faculty of Medicine commissions reviews of the Faculty's clinical departments, modeled on but outside of the scope of the UTQAP review process, and prepares an

Committee on Academic Policy and Programs – Report on the Review of Clinical Departments 2020-21, 2021-22, 2022-23

annual report on their outcomes and implementation plans. Because of the unique contribution clinical departments make to the Faculty's education programs, this report is brought forward for information to the Committee on Academic Policy and Programs (AP&P). These reviews are intended to help assess and improve quality. The *Policy for Approval and Review of Academic Programs and Units* states that "...the quality of the scholarship of the faculty, and the degree to which that scholarship is brought to bear in teaching are the foundations of academic excellence. More generally, all of the factors that contribute to collegial and scholarly life —academic and administrative complement, research and scholarly activity, infrastructure, governance, etc.—bear on the quality of academic programs and the broad educational experience of students."

The annual Report on the Review of Clinical Departments was previously submitted to the AP&P on January 12, 2021.

HIGHLIGHTS:

Eight external reviews of clinical departments were completed as follows:

In 2020-21: the Department of Family and Community Medicine and the Department of Surgery

In 2021-22: the Department of Anesthesiology & Pain Medicine; the Department of Medical Imaging; the Department of Ophthalmology & Vision Sciences; the Department of Otolaryngology – Head & Neck Surgery; the Department of Radiation Oncology

In 2022-23: the Department of Obstetrics and Gynaecology

A table that summarizes the review outcomes and decanal response/implementation plan is provided.

The overall assessment of the quality of the eight clinical departments is very high. Reviewers commented on their strong research productivity, the excellence of their residency programs, and identified the clinical departments as being amongst the highest ranked in Canada and internationally. The decanal administrative responses/implementation plans addressed the reviewers' recommendations.

FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS:

There are no financial implications.

RECOMMENDATION:

For Information.

DOCUMENTATION PROVIDED:

• Summary Table of 2020-21, 2021-22, 2022-23 Clinical Department Reviews





CLINICAL DEPARTMENT	Dept. of Family & Community Medicine (DFCM)
EXTERNAL REVIEWERS	Dr. Kevin Grumbach – Dept. of Family and Community Medicine, University of California, San Francisco Dr. Ruth Wilson – Dept. of Family Medicine, Queen's University
DATES OF REVIEW	March 2-3, 2021
STRENGTHS	 "Outstanding department, functioning well, with good morale" with "clear commitment to equity, diversity, and inclusion" "Nationally known for its innovations, generosity in sharing and leading in family medicine venuesInternationally it is known for its academic fellowship programs, its program in Ethiopia, and its contributions to the WHO and WONCA" "Outstanding" research productivity—grant funding, citations, impact factor—with "excellent performance against the selected national and international comparators;" DFCM administration provides valuable research support, including biostatistical and methodological assistance "Impressed by the ability of UTOPIAN [University of Toronto Practice-Based Research Network] to successfully integrated electronic medical record data on primary care services from [DFCM's] diverse practice sitesUTOPIAN is well-positioned to be a leader in the evolving [field of practice-based] research" Office of Educational Scholarship is a strength not seen in other Canadian family medicine departments "Physician assistant program is a well-managed one which makes a contribution to health human resource needs"
RECOMMENDATIONS	 Consolidate strengths and articulate which communities DFCM seeks to serve Explore additional opportunities for funded PGY3 positions and expanding the integrated 3-year programs Address the perceived inequity in distribution of financial support across all sites Consider using future philanthropic gifts to have a flexible pool of funds for research projects Conduct a systematic review and develop a strategic plan for UTOPIAN's next 3-5 years Develop a more structured approach for early career and adjunct faculty toward career advancement
DECANAL RESPONSE Implementation Plan	 DFCM's new strategic plan emphasizes the community, including a commitment to growing research impact at community sites through central supports College of Family Physicians of Canada is moving forward with curriculum renewal and planning for a 3-year residency program; PGY3 programming will need to be aligned with the new requirements Following a 2022 external review of UTOPIAN DFCM leadership is reviewing its structure and goals for the next 3-5 years Temerty Medicine Advancement is working with the Chair to pursue strategic philanthropic gifts that will benefit community sites Indigenous Health and community-based research and education, including endowed chairs DFCM has initiated projects to strengthen support of graduates and early career faculty through the new Office of Health System Partnership





CLINICAL DEPARTMENT	Dept. of Surgery
EXTERNAL REVIEWERS	Dr. Nita Ahuja – Dept. of Surgery, Yale University Dr. Susan Reid – Dept. of Surgery, McMaster University
DATES OF REVIEW	February 25-26, 2021
STRENGTHS	 Department "enjoys a global reputation and is ranked fourth in the world" (US News and World Report) Department continues "to thrive with a significant expansion of its academic footprint across multiple hospitalsgrowth of its research programand a significant educational portfolio" and "remains an extraordinary academic institution" "Unique Surgical Curiosity Program;" "faculty engagement in Undergraduate [Medical] Education is excellent" "Academic development opportunities for residents [are] outstanding;" "highest number of fellows in the country" "Exemplary" Surgeon Scientist Training Program "can and should be a role model or other academic surgical programs" "Strengthened by its strong collaboration with the Hospital Research Institutes [the Department] is a leading research powerhouse providing impactful publications yearly" "Responsibility to vulnerable populations [is] taken very seriouslymembers have a strong presence in Global Surgery"
RECOMMENDATIONS	 Continue demonstrating the Department's importance and relevance through further developing strong partnerships between the Chair and the Surgeons-in-Chief at each hospital and through common branding to display unity Create a centralized Research Ethics Board (REB) to facilitate research Develop action plans for EDI and wellness for review by the Chair and the Surgical Executive Ensure that there is representation from all Divisions on the Finance Committee Create a report on new revenue opportunities including alumni engagement and new advanced degree programming
DECANAL RESPONSE Implementation Plan	 Common branding initiatives have expanded between the Department and the Hospitals (e.g., Surgical Skills Centre at Mount Sinai Hospital, joint endowed Chairs, citywide Brain Tumour Bank, citywide Trauma Program, etc.) TAHSN institutions have agreed to a single member REB EDI Co-Directors provided an action plan to the Chair and are serving on the Diversity Advisory Council which collaborates across Temerty Medicine, TAHSN and UofT to develop and coordinate EDI programs across the system Stress and burnout are being addressed by holding regular Wellness Rounds with key speakers in the fields of wellness, mindfulness and resilience; scheduling informal evenings for discussion; creating a Coach the Coaches program; and creating a peer-support program that helps with response to adverse professional events Finance Committee composition now includes representation from all Divisions Chair is working with the Senior Development Officer and Temerty Medicine's Alumni Engagement Program to create a Board of Directors opportunity for our surgeon innovator/entrepreneur program





CLINICAL DEPARTMENT	Dept. of Anesthesiology & Pain Medicine (APM)
EXTERNAL REVIEWERS	Dr. Oluwaseun (Seun) Johnson-Akeju – Dept. of Anesthesia, Harvard Medical School Dr. Mateen Raazi – Provincial Dept. of Anesthesiology, University of Saskatchewan College of Medicine
DATES OF REVIEW	April 5-6, 2022
STRENGTHS	 APM "compares very favourably with national and international comparatorsfaculty, learners and staff are committed to the vision and highly invested in the department" "Research is a major strength of [APM] with excellent researchers at all levels;" faculty includes "internationally renowned [researchers] in Critical Care and Pain Medicine;" and "the Clinician Investigator Program is highly regarded and well supported" "Pain Program is a major strategic success and focushugely positive public perception, success at fundraising, and [faculty involvement] speaks to its [n]ational and international prestige and standing" While under-resourced, APM benefits from "dedicated, efficient and fully invested" administrative staff "Family Practice Anesthesia (FPA) program is a recognized strengthtraining selective rotation in Nunavut being the highlight" A collaborative force with "multiple shared initiatives and linkages in research, education, and environmental sustainability, etc." APM is "a 'great' partner" for Temerty Medicine's fundraising initiatives—"leading by personal example"
RECOMMENDATIONS	 Seek enhanced funding from the University for academic initiatives to offset reliance on hospital foundations and other sources Focus on sustaining the progress of EDI initiatives, particularly at hospital sites where considerable challenges are needed Standardize orientation for new hospital Chiefs, harmonize mandates, provide meeting forums and identify resources Continue addressing PGME concerns raised at RCPSC Accreditation and increase administrative support Standardize research support from different funders and facilitate interdisciplinary research by recruiting more PhD researchers Allow Pain Program input on how its generated funds are utilized and higher-level representation in APM's leadership
DECANAL RESPONSE Implementation Plan	 APM has implemented a merit award program to match department and hospital practice plan funds to support faculty research EDIIA has been prioritized and a Director of Equity & Diversity appointed to catalyze efforts in the department Standardized orientation and training of new hospital chiefs will help address local variations and build a sense of community APM will review its undergraduate, residency and fellowship programs to optimize the learning experience and will recruit additional administrative team members dedicated to its training programs APM's Research Committee will survey current practices to support research at various TAHSN hospital sites and the Department will undertake targeted recruitment of PhD investigators Continue working with Pain Program leaders to ensure integration with APM's broader activities and strategic plan





CLINICAL DEPARTMENT	Dept. of Medical Imaging (MI)
EXTERNAL REVIEWERS	Dr. Gilles Soulez – Dept. of Radiology, Radiation Oncology and Nuclear Medicine, University of Montreal Dr. Judy Yee – Dept. of Radiology, Albert Einstein College of Medicine
DATES OF REVIEW	October 28-29, 2021
STRENGTHS	 "Medical Imaging is a well-respected program, nationally and internationally renowned;" in November 2021 "named within the top Global Universities for Radiology, Nuclear Medicine and Medical Imaging, landing at #9 [US News & World Report]" "Residency programs are clearly ranked among the first in Canada and among the top in North America;" "fellowship program is clearly the best in Canada in size and quality, and probably among the top 3 in North America" "[MI] is probably the first in Canada in term[s] of publications" Restructuring of leadership "highlights strengths of the department across hospital sites, including education, diversity, equity and inclusion, clinical practice improvement, research and continuous professional development" [MI] invested \$1M for the recruitment of two AI research chairs over 5 years "Significant strides" made to include women in leadership roles: 50% of these positions are now filled by women
RECOMMENDATIONS	 Implement a mandatory rotation in imaging for undergraduate students Create a 5-year strategic plan to advance recruitment and support basic and clinical scientists and the Catapult program Increase efforts towards securing investigator-driven research and peer-reviewed grants Continue building on excellent research and AI training with investment in the Royal College clinical scientist training path Increase funding support for new vice chairs, new programs (such as CPI and EDI) and the AI research program Advocate with Temerty Medicine to support the recruitment of scientists and clinical scientists and "instead of continuing with historical budgets" adjust investment to reflect performance Continue to address the issues resulting from the differing goals of hospitals and MI; standardize MI and hospital rules toward the equitable performance evaluation of the protected time of faculty
DECANAL RESPONSE Implementation Plan	 Explore expansion of learning opportunities in medical imaging in partnership with the MD program curriculum directors Catapult program provides training for engineering students in areas between fundamental science and clinical applications Ml's impressive research program around AI should explore research and education expansion through the Temerty Centre for AI Research & Education in Medicine (T-CAIREM) Improve alignment and transparency of departmental budget allocation and finances; Finance Committee will "review budget policies and principles including inter-department/unit budget allocation matters;" Temerty Medicine will work with MI on financial planning to fulfil MI's priorities and aspirations Affiliation agreements between hospitals and Temerty Medicine provide the opportunity to operationalize the academic mandate of the department





CLINICAL DEPARTMENT	Dept. of Otolaryngology – Head & Neck Surgery (OHNS)
EXTERNAL REVIEWERS	Dr. Kevin Fung – Dept. of Otolaryngology - Head and Neck Surgery, Western University Dr. Maie St. John – Dept. of Head and Neck Surgery, University of California, Los Angeles
DATES OF REVIEW	September 30 - October 1, 2021
STRENGTHS	 OHNS "continues to thrive, evolve and be recognized internationally as a global leader" "Outstanding" undergraduate experience—"strong footprint across all years of the UME curriculum, amongst strongest in Canada" "World-class residency training program" and "internationally renowned fellowship program" with strong mentorship "Outstanding quantity and quality of [CPD] offerings that are nationally recognized and valued" "Strong culture of research across all domains" experiencing "a renaissance period of strong growth in publications grants and research" in all areas of the specialty "Faculty, residents and staff are to be commended for their citizenship and contributions to the community"
RECOMMENDATIONS	 Consider increasing departmental administrative support for UME, PGME and events planning Increase diversity of faculty (only 5 faculty are female) Competency by Design represents a potential source of burn out—there needs to be greater engagement and EPA completion amongst all faculty Strengthen engagement and support for community faculty and their invaluable support of the UME and PGME programs Provide equitable support for all divisions and subspecialties Obtain more substantial research support for early and mid-career faculty
DECANAL RESPONSE Implementation Plan	 The Chair has increased administrative support with an Events Planner, UME Coordinator and Competency Lead The Chair will take advantage of all recruitment opportunities to advance diversity An EDI committee has been formalized and a more inclusive and diverse executive structure has been established New divisions of General Otolaryngology, Otology-Neurotology and Laryngology have been established providing all subspecialties representation on the executive and promoting greater faculty engagement To promote greater collaboration, new research awards have been established that will require PIs from at least two hospital departments Funding of faculty and resident development and research will require continued philanthropic support and the generation of additional funds through a renewed post-pandemic focus on CPD and course offerings The Chair is supporting two faculty members to take the New & Evolving Academic Leaders Program





CLINICAL DEPARTMENT	Dept. of Ophthalmology (DOVS)
EXTERNAL REVIEWERS	Dr. Eve Higginbotham – Dept. of Ophthalmology, University of Pennsylvania Dr. Martin ten Hove – Dept. of Ophthalmology, Queen's University
DATES OF REVIEW	January 24-25, 2022
STRENGTHS	 "Long considered as one of the premier departments of ophthalmology in Canada, the DOVS continues to evolve, leading the country in a number of notable dimensions, particularly in the areas of education, training, clinical practice, and research" UME "evaluation of the one-week block is impressively high and the experience is unsurpassed by any Canadian Medical School" Residency program "may be the most comprehensive and well-designed program in the country;" "excellence in clinical and didactic teaching in all subspecialities" "Largest numberof clinical and research fellowships in the country;" fellows "widely recognized for their excellence" "Highly productive faculty with significant growth in research funding and publications;" "output is impressive" "DOVS has the potential to lead the country out of this critical growing gap of eye care"
RECOMMENDATIONS	 Develop a strategic research plan that engages key stakeholders including subspecialities, hospitals and research institutes Explore the availability of research space, providing access to core laboratories and a critical mass of senior scientists Strengthen the internal review board processes for pre- and post-award reviews Consider strategies to recruit and develop additional clinician scientists with funding not dependent upon practice plans Strategize to increase patient care opportunities; consider expanding to a site on north of Toronto Enhance the gender representation of leadership in the DOVS; consider gender when choosing the next Chair Support faculty retention and professional development and guide the transition of faculty at all stages of their career Review staff portfolios to ensure that there is adequate administrative support particularly related to UME and GME
DECANAL RESPONSE Implementation Plan	 The incoming Chair will align strategic objectives with those of Temerty Medicine, enhancing leadership diversity and developing terms of reference to codify strategies for subspecialties DOVS will continue building research partnerships and collaborations across UofT, TAHSN and the research institutes Temerty Medicine has developed an internal grant review program to ensure higher success rates DOVS will work with UofT and hospital partners to recruit clinician scientists supported by alternative revenue opportunities The additional academic full-time appointments required to create satellite clinic spaces north of Toronto will be explored DOVS is committed to enhancing the gender representation of leadership at the department and hospital levels by ensuring that more women receive the appropriate leadership training to assume leadership and mentorship roles DOVS will develop a communications strategy with a multistakeholder perspective for collaborative decision-making DOVS will address the administrative resources required to have a fully supported team in place to ensure future success





CLINICAL DEPARTMENT	Dept. of Radiation Oncology (UTDRO)
EXTERNAL REVIEWERS	Dr. Ross Halperin – Dept. of Surgery, University of British Columbia Dr. Albert Koong – Dept. of Radiation Oncology, The University of Texas MD Anderson Cancer Center
DATES OF REVIEW	November 18-19, 2021
STRENGTHS	 "UTDRO is one of the leading radiation oncology departments in the world" "A jewel in the crown of undergraduate education contributions is the UTDRO supported Cancer week" "Visionary objectives of the [BSc] Medical Radiation Sciences Program are laudable and signal the UTDRO is committed to building capacity in research and professional expertise among all radiation medicine professional groups" Resident alumni "serving in medical leadership positions within and beyond Ontarioprogram is influential anda source of pride" Radiation Oncology residents present "exceptionally well at national and international scientific meetings [raising UTDRO's profile] with demonstrated pedagogical and research excellence" "Medical Physics Residency graduates are employed across Canada and internationally, signaling the high esteem the program enjoys" Fellowship program is "internationally renowned for excellence;" shown by publications, awards and high number of applicants Strong research productivity and numerous awards in radiation oncology, physics and radiation therapy
RECOMMENDATIONS	 Review of MD foundation program to ensure cancer learning is strategically emphasized as a core component of curriculum Have Radiation Oncology and Medical Physics residency leaders collaborate in trainee co-learning curricula and explore possibility of Medical Physics residents training at other UTDRO sites Develop mandatory training on unconscious bias/equity, diversity, inclusion, professionalism for all faculty Build a tool to regularly measure and thereby mitigate unprofessional behaviour Engage organizational development support to ensure a respectful, safe work and learning environment Build a model for long-term financial sustainability in collaboration with the Dean and executive leadership
DECANAL RESPONSE Implementation Plan	 Increased UTDRO activities MD program cancer week; faculty encouraged to volunteer for medical student practical and clinical teaching sessions; continued efforts to expand radiation oncology didactic lectures Established UTDRO taskforce with diverse faculty to improve upon culture, professionalism and EDI Radiation Oncology and Medical Physics residency program leads are investigating collaborative co-learning curricular activities Medical Physics residency program created journal clubs for multi-site collaborations and developed shared teaching to harmonize learning opportunities Completing an organizational structure review, promoting collaboration and building relationships between UTDRO and its hospital affiliate sites; UTDRO sharing goals with hospital affiliate sites leads UTDRO is collaborating with Temerty Medicine's leadership and advancement office to develop a sustainable financial model





CLINICAL DEPARTMENT	Dept. of Obstetrics & Gynaecology
EXTERNAL REVIEWERS	Dr. Margaret Morris – Dept. of Obstetrics, Gynecology, and Reproductive Sciences, University of Manitoba Dr. Nawal Nour – Dept. of Obstetrics, Gynecology, and Reproductive Biology, Harvard Medical School
DATES OF REVIEW	November 2-3, 2022
STRENGTHS	 Department's "ranking is congruent with a ranking amongst the top 5 U.S. schools" "[MD program] is soundly based on best educational practice and evidenced by its success in attracting postgrad trainees Faculty [are] enthusiastic and well supported" Residents feel supported and "well prepared for future practice and for future fellowship training" "Range of fellowship programs for postgraduate training is impressive and reflects the talent that has been brought together" "Training and opportunities related to equity deserve praisewoven into the culture of the department" "Tremendous number of resources for research" and "high praise" for the Vice Chair Research, Dr. Kellie Murphy International connections established via the global health program a highlight Chair "has fostered collaboration and not competitionbroken down silos;" Executive is "inclusive, bringing in stakeholders from across the city" Chair "has handled the budget magnificently"—balanced budget, protected resources, fair allocation
RECOMMENDATIONS	 Improve uniformity of informal teaching by faculty across sites in the MD program Explore US ACGME accreditation of fellowship programs, especially in Urogynaecology Strengthen CPD activities through centralization with Temerty Medicine and provide additional administrative support Advocate strongly for hospitals to implement Physician Assistant hirings to improve the postgraduate learner experience Implement a robust EDIIA lens for the selected recipients of annual Chair's Summer Student awards Continue efforts to improve clinical care for Indigenous populations via partnership with Northern Ontario School of Medicine
DECANAL RESPONSE Implementation Plan	 Continue to address variability in formal teaching and of site to ensure well-rounded experience in the MD program curriculum Explore feasibility of obtaining US accreditation (ACGME) for our fellowship training programs Plan for administrative expansion to further support the Business Manager in fundraising and CPD opportunities Improve operational policies through an EDIIA lens in the selection of annual Chair's Summer student awards