



FOR INFORMATION

PUBLIC

OPEN SESSION

TO: Committee on Academic Policy and Programs

SPONSOR: Susan McCahan, Vice-Provost, Academic Programs
CONTACT INFO: (416) 978-0490, vp.academicprograms@utoronto.ca

PRESENTER: See Sponsor
CONTACT INFO:

DATE: April 27, 2023 for May 4, 2023

AGENDA ITEM: 6

ITEM IDENTIFICATION:

Annual Report on the Reviews of Graduate Collaborative Specializations: 2022-23

JURISDICTIONAL INFORMATION:

The Committee on Academic Policy and Programs (AP&P) [Terms of Reference](#) (Sections 3 and 4.9) states that “The Committee...has general responsibility...for monitoring, the quality of education and the research activities of the University. In fulfilling this responsibility, the Committee works to ensure the excellent quality of academic programs by...monitoring reviews of existing programs...The Committee receives annual reports or such more frequent regular reports as it may determine, on matters within its purview, including reports on the ...[r]eviews of academic units and programs.”

GOVERNANCE PATH:

1. Committee on Academic Policy and Programs [For Information] (May 4, 2023)

PREVIOUS ACTION TAKEN:

Governing Council approved *the [Policy for Approval and Review of Academic Programs and Units](#)* in 2010. The *Policy* outlines University-wide principles for the approval of proposed new academic programs and review of existing programs and units. Its goal is to align the University’s quality assurance processes with the Province’s Quality Assurance Framework (QAF) through establishing the authority of the *University of Toronto Quality Assurance Process (UTQAP)*.

The scope of the UTQAP includes collaborative specializations (see 6.2.2). In line with the [QAF](#) definition, the University understands a collaborative specialization to be “an intra-university graduate field of study that provides an additional multidisciplinary experience for students enrolled in and completing the degree requirements of one of a number of approved masters and/or PhD programs. Students meet the admission requirements of and register in the participating (or ‘home’) program but complete, in addition to the degree requirements of that program, the additional requirements specified by the Collaborative Specialization. The degree conferred is that of the home program. The completion of the Collaborative Specialization is indicated by a transcript notation indicating the additional specialization.” The learning outcomes of a collaborative specialization are in addition to those supported by the home program.

In the fall of 2015 the [Guidelines](#) governing these offerings were revised, establishing the lead Dean of the collaborative specialization as the review Commissioning Officer; previously the Vice-Provost, Graduate Research and Education and Dean of the School of Graduate Studies commissioned collaborative program reviews. Because of the unique nature of collaborative specializations, their review process focuses on the quality of the “additional multidisciplinary experience” that collaborative specializations provide, over and above the experience associated with the home program. Reviews emphasize elements that are critical to determining ongoing quality of collaborative specializations at the University of Toronto, including:

1. Clarity and appropriateness of requirements
2. Evidence of successful attainment of learning outcomes
3. Evidence of ongoing need and demand
4. Continuing support of participating programs and supporting units (e.g., renewal of the Memorandum of Agreement (MOA))

The Annual Report on the Reviews of Graduate Collaborative Specializations was previously submitted to AP&P on May 5, 2022.

HIGHLIGHTS:

Five external reviews of collaborative specializations commissioned by their lead Dean were conducted in 2022-23. These were the reviews of the Collaborative Specialization in Contemporary East & Southeast Asian Studies, the Collaborative Specialization in Environmental Studies, the Collaborative Specialization in Ethnic, Immigration and Pluralism Studies, the Collaborative Specialization in Sexual Diversity Studies, all led by the Faculty of Arts and Science, as well as the Collaborative Specialization in Workplace Learning and Social Change, led by the Ontario Institute for Studies in Education. The submission to AP&P consists of a table containing a summary of the review outcomes.

The reviews confirmed all five collaborative specializations’ vitality, the appropriateness of their program requirements, and that the learning outcomes are in addition to those supported by the students’ home programs. The MOAs for the Collaborative Specializations in Contemporary East & Southeast Asian Studies, the Collaborative Specialization in Environmental Studies, the Collaborative Specialization in Ethnic, Immigration and Pluralism Studies, and the Collaborative Specialization in Sexual Diversity Studies were all recommended for renewal. The MOA for the

Collaborative Specialization in Workplace Learning and Social Change is also recommended for renewal following required minor modifications to update admissions requirements and to update its list of participating programs.

FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS:

There are no financial implications.

RECOMMENDATION:

For information.

DOCUMENTATION PROVIDED:

- Annual Report on the Reviews of Graduate Collaborative Specializations: 2022-2023.

University of Toronto
Annual Report on Graduate Collaborative Specialization Reviews, Cycle 6, 2022-23
 Collaborative Specializations Reviews are Commissioned by the Dean of the Lead Faculty

Collaborative Specialization (CS) Definition: "an intra-university graduate field of study that provides an additional multidisciplinary experience for students enrolled in and completing the degree requirements of one of a number of approved masters and/or PhD programs. Students meet the admission requirements of and register in the participating (or 'home') program but complete, in addition to the degree requirements of that program, the additional requirements specified by the Collaborative Specialization. The degree conferred is that of the home program. The completion of the Collaborative Specialization is indicated by a transcript notation indicating the additional specialization." ([Quality Assurance Framework](#))

The learning outcomes of a collaborative specialization are in addition to those supported by the home program.

Collaborative Specialization & Lead Faculty	Participating Programs & Degrees	Appropriateness of Collaborative Specialization Requirements	Vitality of Collaborative Specialization	Other Strengths or Challenges Identified	Review Outcome
Contemporary East & Southeast Asian Studies Lead Faculty: Faculty of Arts and Science (FAS) Date of Summary Assessment Report: March 31, 2023	Anthropology — MA East Asian Studies — MA Geography — MA Global Affairs — MGA History — MA Management — MBA Planning — MScPI Political Science — MA Public Policy — MPP Social Work — MSW Sociology — MA Women and Gender Studies — MA	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> This Collaborative Specialization meets the requirement that 30% of the courses taken are in the area of the Specialization. Graduate students in this Specialization participate in a common learning experience through the required 1.0 FCE course ASI1000Y. This course draws on the specialized fields of faculty instructors and encourages students to bring their varied disciplinary perspectives to the seminar discussion. Students also complete a 0.5 FCE elective on East or Southeast Asia by taking a course from a pre-approved list of elective courses. Students also pursue their own research interests using approaches appropriate to their discipline through a Major Research Paper. The requirements appear to be fully appropriate to support the learning outcomes of the Specialization. Most students are able to meet the requirements of the Specialization. The program notes that a variety of factors can account for the limited number of cases in which students do not complete the specialization, but note that the majority of students do not find it difficult to complete the requirements in conjunction with those of their home department. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> This Collaborative Specialization has demonstrated vitality, as graduate enrollments have remained steady and approaching the cap (20 students per year) over the past few years, despite a dip in enrollments from 2016-2018. Specifically, enrollments were between 14-17 in 2014-15, dropping to 7-9 in 2016-18 and then returning to 13-14 in 2019-20. The program has graduated 53 Masters-level students between 2013-14 and 2020-21. A total of 14 units from multiple divisions within the university are affiliated with the Specialization. While many affiliated units have contributed participating students, there has been an unevenness in the level of engagement. For instance, there are 9 units from which either no students or 1-2 students have participated in the Specialization since the last review in 2014. Some possible reasons for the lower rates of participation from some member units might include factors such as a) a lack of student awareness from some member units when they apply to their home unit's Master's program, b) a lack of coordination with member units regarding admissions, or c) not considering post-admission enrollment. Whether the lack of participation from some member units is due 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Regarding OSTOF awards, the Specialization is encouraged to contact the Vice-Dean Graduate Education to learn more about carry forwards and allocations to non-Ontario students to ensure the maximum benefit / payout from these awards The Specialization might also consider opening the Specialization to doctoral-level students as another means to maintain enrollments and the vitality of the program. 	MOA is recommended for renewal.

University of Toronto
Annual Report on Graduate Collaborative Specialization Reviews, Cycle 6, 2022-23
Collaborative Specializations Reviews are Commissioned by the Dean of the Lead Faculty

Collaborative Specialization & Lead Faculty	Participating Programs & Degrees	Appropriateness of Collaborative Specialization Requirements	Vitality of Collaborative Specialization	Other Strengths or Challenges Identified	Review Outcome
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The core course (ASI1000Y) is taught by two faculty with guest speakers participating across the two semesters. One direction that the Specialization could take with the core course is to broaden the content to include more policy-related topics, which would better align with the scholarly backgrounds of students from the most frequently participating partner units. The Specialization is encouraged to find sustainable ways of teaching the core course to avoid an overreliance on voluntary teaching and to ensure there is a stable, longer-term solution for finding instructors for the course. 	<p>to one of the possible reasons indicated above or to some other reason, it would be prudent for the Specialization to assess ways to facilitate breadth of participation from partner units. If some partnerships cannot be strengthened, then the Specialization may wish to dissolve partnerships with units that do not appear to be engaged.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Additional strengths of the Specialization come from the fact it is housed in the Asian Institute, which means students have access to a number of resources that benefit their learning experience, including providing a scholarly community and gathering place. The Specialization has the resources to provide scholarships, teaching stipends, and travel funds, which makes it an attractive option for students and faculty to participate. 		
Environmental Studies Lead Faculty: Faculty of Arts and Science (FAS) Date of Summary Assessment Report: March 31, 2023	Adult Education and Community Development — MA, MEd, PhD Anthropology — MA, MSc, PhD Architecture, Landscape, and Design — PhD Chemical Engineering and Applied Chemistry — MSc, MEng, PhD Chemistry — MSc, PhD Civil Engineering — MSc, MEng, MEngCEM, PhD Earth Sciences — MSc, MSc, PhD	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> This Collaborative Specialization meets the requirement that 30% of the courses taken are in the area of the Specialization. Graduate students in this specialization participate in a common learning experience through the required seminar ENV1001H, “Environmental Decision Making”. The core course gives students a unique opportunity to engage with faculty and peers coming from a range of academic backgrounds and perspectives. In most cases, students also complete one elective course and a research paper/thesis on an environment-related topic. Students enrolled in course-based degrees in their home unit complete an off-campus environmentally focused internship. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> This collaborative specialization has demonstrated tremendous vitality, as graduate enrollments have grown significantly since the last review in 2014. Enrolment has grown from 50 students in 2014 to 180 in 2020. The program has graduated 271 Masters and PhD students between 2014-20. A total of 22 units from multiple divisions within the university are affiliated with the specialization. While many affiliated units have contributed participating students, there has been an unevenness in the level of engagement. For instance, there are 8 units from which no students have participated in the specialization since the last review in 2014. Whether this is due to the difficulties in meeting both the specialization and home unit requirements (as noted above), or to some 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> It is commendable that the Specialization plans to expand experiential learning through the implementation of an Experiential Learning Coordinator. The Faculty encourages the Specialization Director to also connect with the Arts & Science Office of Experiential Learning & Outreach Support (ELOS). As noted in the self-study, the Specialization needs to improve the tracking of student progress in meeting the Specialization requirements and also in communicating with students. If the Specialization is interested in working along with other specializations in Arts & Science in developing a tracking tool, they are encouraged to contact the Vice-Dean for Graduate Education. 	MOA is recommended for renewal.

University of Toronto
Annual Report on Graduate Collaborative Specialization Reviews, Cycle 6, 2022-23
 Collaborative Specializations Reviews are Commissioned by the Dean of the Lead Faculty

Collaborative Specialization & Lead Faculty	Participating Programs & Degrees	Appropriateness of Collaborative Specialization Requirements	Vitality of Collaborative Specialization	Other Strengths or Challenges Identified	Review Outcome
	Ecology and Evolutionary Biology – PhD Environmental Science – MEnvSc, PhD Forest Conservation – MFC Forestry – MScF, PhD Geography – MA, MSc, PhD Global Affairs – MGA Information – MI, PhD Landscape Architecture – MLA Management – MBA, PhD Music – MA, PhD Physics – MSc, PhD Planning – MScPI, PhD Political Science – MA, PhD Public Policy – MPP Religion – MA, PhD Social Justice Education – MA, MEd, EdD, PhD Sociology – MA, PhD Sustainability Management – MScSM Women and Gender Studies – MA, PhD	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> •The CS requirements appear to be fully appropriate to support the learning outcomes of the specialization. • While graduate students from many partner units are able to meet the requirements of the specialization, students from some partner units have found it difficult to do so. It may be the case that the 30% rule makes it almost impossible for students from some partner units to meet the specialization requirements, given the degree requirements within their own units. Thus, a reassessment and possible dissolution of some partnerships may be necessary so that the focus is on partnerships with units whose requirements make it feasible for students to complete the specialization. •A need and desire for more humanities content, and content reflecting equity, diversity, and inclusion (EDI) were indicated in the self-study. Seeking partnerships with additional humanities units may be a possible solution to both goals given that sector is deeply invested in EDI already. 	<p>other reason, it would be prudent for the specialization to assess and either strengthen or dissolve partnerships with units that do not appear to be engaged.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Although not mentioned in the self-study, the new Master’s in Environmental Studies (School of the Environment) may have implications for the uptake of this Collaborative Specialization in the future. The two programs might tap into the same pool of applicants as well as the faculty teaching resources needed to support each. The Specialization is strongly encouraged to determine the nature of the relationship between these two programs in order to both differentiate and ensure vitality for both. • While the self-study notes an interest in opening new relationships with entities such as the Toronto School of Theology, the specialization should be cautious in seeking partnerships with non-University of Toronto institutes. The specialization would need to develop a rationale and identify a pathway for establishing such an external-facing partnership. 		

University of Toronto
Annual Report on Graduate Collaborative Specialization Reviews, Cycle 6, 2022-23
 Collaborative Specializations Reviews are Commissioned by the Dean of the Lead Faculty

Collaborative Specialization & Lead Faculty	Participating Programs & Degrees	Appropriateness of Collaborative Specialization Requirements	Vitality of Collaborative Specialization	Other Strengths or Challenges Identified	Review Outcome
<p>Ethnic, Immigration and Pluralism Studies</p> <p>Lead Faculty: Faculty of Arts and Science (FAS)</p> <p>Date of Summary Assessment Report: March 31, 2023</p>	<p>Anthropology – MA, PhD Educational Leadership and Policy – MA, MEd, EdD, PhD European and Russian Affairs – MA Geography – MA, PhD Global Affairs – MGA History – MA, PhD Industrial Relations and Human Resources – MIRHR, PhD Language and Literacies Education – MA, MEd, PhD Political Science – MA, PhD Public Policy – MPP Religion – MA, PhD Social Justice Education – MA, MEd, EdD, PhD Social Work – MSW, PhD Sociology – MA, PhD Women and Gender Studies – MA, PhD</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • This Collaborative Specialization meets the requirement that 30% of the courses taken are in the area of the Specialization. • Both Master’s and Doctoral students participate in this Collaborative Specialization. All students must take a 0.5 FCE in ethnicity, immigration, or pluralism which can be taken as an option within the students’ home graduate unit and within the completion requirements of their participating program (not as an additional course). As well, all students must complete the common learning activity, a 0.5 FCE coordinating seminar (EIP3000H) taught by the Director, which serves as a place to discuss, compare, and bring together various approaches to the study of ethnicity, immigration, and pluralism. • Attendance is required at the Harney Lecture Series (2 lectures per year for Master’s, 4 lectures per year for Doctoral). Doctoral students must also present their own research output in a work-in-progress session and submit a 4-5,000-word integrative essay reflecting on how materials in the coordinating seminar (EIP3000H) and in the program can be integrated into their dissertation topic. • The CS requirements appear to be fully appropriate to support the learning outcomes of the Specialization. • From the prior review in 2013-14 to 2020-21, completion rates were low when compared to the number of annual enrollments. Recognizing this problem, the Specialization completed minor modifications of its program to align it with the requirements of other Collaborative Specializations and to ensure it met the 30% requirement. While it is too soon to determine 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Specialization has taken steps to bolster its vitality. The self-study reports that enrollments per year decreased over time since the last review in 2013-14 (27 and 24, respectively) to 2020-21 (15 and 13, respectively). However, some promising early data suggests an uptick in enrollments in the wake of the program modifications, with 19 students enrolled for 2022. • Although enrollments appear to be increasing since the modifications to the Specialization, it is still the case that there has been an unevenness in the level of student engagement across partner units. For instance, there are 19 units/degree programs from which either no students or 1-2 students have participated in the Specialization since the last review in 2014. It is thus commendable that the Director is considering how the Specialization might either strengthen or dissolve partnerships with units that do not appear to be engaged. Focusing on a smaller, more engaged set of member units would likely bolster the vitality of the Specialization. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A strength of the Specialization is the quality of the speakers that are being brought into the Harney Lecture series that students are required to attend. This speaks to the attractiveness of the program both within and outside the University and is a promising sign for its future vitality. • One recommendation that the Collaborative Specialization could consider is its communications about the Specialization. For example, it was unclear in the self study the reasons why the Specialization moved from the Department of Sociology to the Munk School. • More information could be provided regarding student stipends and funding supports. • It is also somewhat unclear which students are eligible for Harney fellowships and what role Harney Fellows play in the Collaborative Specialization. The Specialization should make sure strengths like the fellowship are communicated clearly to member units and more broadly. Overall, if there are aspects of the Specialization that could be clearer, then it would be advisable to improve those descriptions for future use in communications about the Specialization. • The self-study notes that there are 15 participating units and 2 supporting units. The distinction between the two types of member units is unclear, and it might be useful to clarify and perhaps strengthen the relationship with the 2 supporting units (Economics and Law) if those units are contributing and engaged. 	<p>MOA is recommended for renewal.</p>

University of Toronto
Annual Report on Graduate Collaborative Specialization Reviews, Cycle 6, 2022-23
 Collaborative Specializations Reviews are Commissioned by the Dean of the Lead Faculty

Collaborative Specialization & Lead Faculty	Participating Programs & Degrees	Appropriateness of Collaborative Specialization Requirements	Vitality of Collaborative Specialization	Other Strengths or Challenges Identified	Review Outcome
		<p>the impact of these changes on completion rates, the Director is optimistic that the rates will improve.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The EIP Collaborative Specialization should be commended on the curricular changes it enacted. The modifications that were recently implemented in 2021-22 will likely boost not only enrollment numbers, but completion rates as well. In addition to the work-in-progress session, the integrative essay that doctoral students must now complete represents an excellent synthesis between the Specialization and students' research foci in their home units. 			
<p>Sexual Diversity Studies</p> <p>Lead Faculty: Faculty of Arts and Science (FAS)</p> <p>Date of Summary Assessment Report: March 31, 2023</p>	<p>Adult Education and Community Development – MA, MEd, PhD</p> <p>Anthropology – MA, MSc, PhD</p> <p>Art History – MA, PhD</p> <p>Cinema Studies – MA</p> <p>Classics – MA, PhD</p> <p>Comparative Literature – MA, PhD</p> <p>Counselling and Clinical Psychology – MA, PhD</p> <p>Counselling Psychology – MEd, EdD</p> <p>Criminology and Sociolegal Studies – MA, PhD</p> <p>Curriculum and Pedagogy – MA, MEd, PhD</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> This collaborative specialization meets the requirement that 30% of the courses taken are in the area of the specialization. Both Master's and Doctoral students participate in this collaborative specialization. All SDS students in the Collaborative Specialization must take the core course SDS1000H: "Theories and Methods in Sexual Diversity Studies", which introduces scholarly approaches to the field. This core course requirement must be supplemented by at least another 0.5 FCE in the area of sexuality (1.0 FCE for students in coursework only programs with no thesis or master's research paper requirement). Students are encouraged to fulfill the additional requirement of 0.5 FCE in the area of sexuality with SDS1999H: "Special Topics in Sexual Diversity Studies", though other courses focused on sexuality in their own or other home units may be substituted with approval from the director All students in the program will pursue a dissertation topic (or MA thesis where required) in queer, trans, and sexual diversity studies and 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> This collaborative specialization has demonstrated vitality, as graduate enrollments have remained steady with an average of 50 enrolled students per year and an average of 15 new enrollments per year. It should be noted that the core course SDS1000H is capped at 15 to ensure the rigorous engagement and community-based approach of a small seminar. Over the 8-year period from 2014 to 2021 enrollments have ranged from 49 to 53, indicating a healthy and stable degree of interest in the specialization. In terms of completion rates, the numbers have ranged from 6 to 18 (with a total of 97 completions) across the 8-year period since the previous review. A total of 40 participating programs from multiple divisions within the university are affiliated with the specialization. While many affiliated units have contributed participating students, there has been an unevenness in the level of engagement. For instance, there are 11 units from which either no students or 1-2 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The SDS specialization should be commended for the variety of ways in which they endeavor to enrich students' experiences and amplify their learning. SDS specialization students are expected to participate in a variety of activities programmed by the Bonham Centre, including the Student Research Colloquium, the Sex Salon Speakers Series, and other public events. These activities provide a number of professional development opportunities for graduate students. For example, the Student Research Colloquium offers valuable research presentation, scholarship, and mentoring opportunities The Research Colloquium is designed to showcase the scholarship of both SDS graduate and undergraduate students. All SDS collaborative graduate students in SDS1000H and SDS undergraduate students taking the year-long course SDS460H: "Advanced Research in Sexual Diversity Studies" seminar are included in the colloquium. SDS460H is a year-long capstone experience for majors and specialists in the SDS undergraduate program who work closely over the year with SDS faculty to develop their own research projects while learning about key debates, methodologies, and ethical issues in conducting research. They are then paired with graduate student mentors from 	<p>MOA is recommended for renewal.</p>

University of Toronto
Annual Report on Graduate Collaborative Specialization Reviews, Cycle 6, 2022-23
 Collaborative Specializations Reviews are Commissioned by the Dean of the Lead Faculty

Collaborative Specialization & Lead Faculty	Participating Programs & Degrees	Appropriateness of Collaborative Specialization Requirements	Vitality of Collaborative Specialization	Other Strengths or Challenges Identified	Review Outcome
	Drama, Theatre and Performance Studies – MA, PhD East Asian Studies – MA, PhD Educational Leadership and Policy – MA, MEd, EdD, PhD English – MA, PhD French Language and Literature – MA, PhD Geography – MA, PhD Higher Education – MA, MEd, EdD, PhD History – MA, PhD History and Philosophy of Science and Technology – MA, PhD Immunology — PhD Information — MI, PhD Italian Studies — MA, PhD Kinesiology — MSc, PhD Law — LL.M., MSL, SJD Linguistics — MA, PhD Medieval Studies — MA, PhD Museum Studies — MMSt Music — MA, PhD Near and Middle Eastern Civilizations — MA, PhD Philosophy — MA, PhD	include on the thesis committee at least one faculty member affiliated with SDS. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> As stated above, students in coursework only programs with no thesis or master’s research paper requirement must supplement the core course requirement with an additional 1.0 FCE in the area of sexuality. They may do this with a course in their home unit, or, where a course in sexuality studies is not available, they may design an independent study with one of our affiliated faculty members. Requirements appear to be fully appropriate to support the learning outcomes of the specialization. As detailed further in the Other Strengths section below, Collaborative Specialization students are expected to participate in a variety of activities programmed by the Bonham Centre, including the Student Research Colloquium, the Sex Salon Speakers Series, and other public events. The SDS collaborative specialization should be commended on the curricular changes it enacted to address previous recommendations from the 2013-14 review regarding offering a doctoral-level course. In 2018, SDS added SDS1999H which builds on the strengths of the core course (SDS1000H). SDS1999H provides students the opportunity to take an advanced class in which queer, trans, and sexual diversity studies frameworks are the lens through which a specific discipline or topic can be understood. The course has become increasingly important for students, who continue to express the need to supplement the core requirement of SDS1000H with another course offering both because: 1) such a course 	students have participated in the specialization since the last review in 2014. Thus, it would be prudent for the specialization to assess ways to facilitate breadth of participation from partner units. If some partnerships cannot be strengthened, then the specialization may wish to dissolve partnerships with units that do not appear to be engaged. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Additional strengths of the specialization come from the fact it has the resources to provide bursaries, travel funds, and teaching assistantship to graduate students which makes it an attractive option for students to participate. SDS also offers the Hallam Awards of Excellence and there are Queer and Trans Research Lab Grad Research Assistantships and Dissertation completion funds. In terms of challenges, because they do not have sufficient funding to teach two sections of the required core course SDS1000H, the specialization must cap their enrollments, even when they have more applications in a given year. Currently, the specialization lacks a stable roster of affiliated graduate faculty who could be part of a rotation of instructors to offer SDS1000H and SDS1999H. This creates instability in the teaching roster because planning often occurs on an ad hoc basis. Because of a lack of funding, SDS has been unable to regularly cover teaching releases at the home units of affiliated faculty, which would help ensure their availability to teach the two graduate SDS courses. The Faculty of Arts and Science is seeking to institutionalise and regularise the funds necessary to meet the unit’s teaching needs using existing budgetary 	the SDS Collaborative Specialization to develop their work for the Research Colloquium. Graduate mentors help the undergraduates develop their research proposals/projects, prepare abstracts, and work with the students on their presentation skills. The Student Research Colloquium is a one-day event, held at the end of Winter term, where SDS collaborative graduate and SDS undergraduate students have the unique opportunity to present their research, and to critically engage with other students’ research in an interdisciplinary and intellectually rigorous environment. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Additional professional development opportunities that SDS offers its specialization students include the chance to serve as a Co-Chair of the Research Colloquium and to serve on the Program Committee for the Sex Salon speakers’ series. In both cases, graduate students learn leadership and organizational skills. In the case of the Co-Chairs of the Research Colloquium, two graduate students are selected each year. They work with the faculty leads of SDS1000H, SDS460H, and the SDS Undergraduate Coordinator to organize the event. These are (modestly) funded roles in which graduate students are empowered to act as leads in a significant SDS event, and in which they gain skills in conference organizing and planning: they work with all conference presenters beforehand to help them develop their complex research findings into a manageable 7-to-10-minute presentation, organize the themes and presenters of individual panels, and create and organize the program. As for the Program Committee of the Sex Salon speakers’ series, the committee (comprised of graduate students) organizes and hosts the monthly speaker series in which scholars, artists, and community leaders present new and in-process work. The event features three to four presentations organized around a central theme that relates to sexual diversity studies, followed by a Q&A based discussion led by a member of the Sex Salon programming committee. This monthly event thus also affords unique 	

University of Toronto
Annual Report on Graduate Collaborative Specialization Reviews, Cycle 6, 2022-23
 Collaborative Specializations Reviews are Commissioned by the Dean of the Lead Faculty

Collaborative Specialization & Lead Faculty	Participating Programs & Degrees	Appropriateness of Collaborative Specialization Requirements	Vitality of Collaborative Specialization	Other Strengths or Challenges Identified	Review Outcome
	Political Science — MA, PhD Psychology — MA, PhD Public Health Sciences — MPH, MSc, PhD Public Policy — MPP Religion — MA, PhD Slavic Languages and Literatures — MA, PhD Social Justice Education — MA, MEd, EdD, PhD Social Work — MSW, PhD Sociology — MA, PhD Sustainability Management - MScSM Visual Studies — MVS Women and Gender Studies — MA, PhD	doesn't exist in their home units and 2) it provides the crucial opportunity for graduate students with research interests in sexual diversity studies to continue to meet with one another across disciplinary lines. SDS' responsiveness to student needs has helped ensure students will be able to meet the program requirements and to continue building an interdisciplinary community for graduate students.	mechanisms, following discussions with the FAS Vice-Dean of Graduate Education, as well as with the FAS Director, Faculty Budget and Finance. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> In the current environment of steady-state and limited graduate student intake across the university, any discussion of a possible new graduate program would have to proceed with due consideration for how this would affect the entire division. In addition, the unit would need to consider carefully how this might impact the health of the currently flourishing collaborative specialization. 	research, community engagement, and community-building opportunities for graduate students. Taken together, the Student Research Colloquium, the Sex Salon Speakers Series, and other public events create a number of enriching experiences that offer invaluable opportunities for graduate students' professional development. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> One recommendation that the collaborative specialization should consider regards its communications about its program with its partner units. The specialization acknowledges that more regularized communication is needed. For example, partner units have indicated that they would like materials about the specialization that they could distribute during their orientation weeks, as well as annual updates about student enrollments and specialization degree requirements. 	
Workplace Learning and Social Change Lead Faculty: Ontario Institute for Studies in Education (OISE)	Adult Education and Community Development — MA, MEd, PhD Industrial Relations and Human Resources — MIRHR, PhD Rehabilitation Science — MSc, PhD Social Justice Education — MA, MEd, PhD, EdD	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> All students admitted to the WLSC Collaborative Specialization (CS) are required to satisfy the requirements of their home degree programs, as well as the WLSC SC requirements as follows: <i>Master's students in the thesis-based programs:</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 0.5 FCE WPL1131H Introduction to Workplace Learning and Social Change 0.5 elective FCE in the area of workplace learning and social change A master's thesis which incorporates issues of workplace learning and social change supervised by a WLSC CS core 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The WLSC CS' academic focus remains relevant i.e., the continued prevalence and importance of issues related to workplace learning in societies and economies generally. The CS experienced steady growth in enrolment between 2014 and 2018, with a slight decline in enrolment between 2019 to 2021, which could be due to the pandemic and related drop in enrolments in participating programs. Moreover, between 2014-2021, 124 students graduated with the WLSC designation, averaging 15.5 students per year. Most of these graduates (101) were in the MEd program in 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Strengths: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The core faculty members associated with the WLSC Collaborative Specialization continue to demonstrate both research and teaching expertise in issues related to workplace learning, which has served to support demand for the CS. Additionally, individual WLSC participating faculty and faculty affiliated with OISE's Centre for Learning, Social Economy and Work, continue to attract competitive research funding in the theme areas of the CS. The surveyed students and alumni find the courses, and the WLSC Collaborative Specialization 	Memorandum of Agreement (MOA) is recommended for renewal following required minor modifications to update admissions requirements, and to update list of participating programs

University of Toronto
Annual Report on Graduate Collaborative Specialization Reviews, Cycle 6, 2022-23
 Collaborative Specializations Reviews are Commissioned by the Dean of the Lead Faculty

Collaborative Specialization & Lead Faculty	Participating Programs & Degrees	Appropriateness of Collaborative Specialization Requirements	Vitality of Collaborative Specialization	Other Strengths or Challenges Identified	Review Outcome
<p>Date of Summary Assessment Report: March 31, 2023</p>	<p>Women and Gender Studies – MA</p>	<p>faculty member, or a WLSC CS core faculty member serves on the supervisory committee</p> <p><i>Master’s students in the coursework only programs (MEd):</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ 0.5 FCE WPL1131H Introduction to Workplace Learning and Social Change ○ 1.0 elective FCE in the area of workplace learning and social change <p><i>Doctoral students:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ 0.5 FCE WPL3931H Advanced Studies in Workplace Learning and Social Change ○ 0.5 elective FCE in the area of workplace learning and social change ○ a doctoral thesis which incorporates issues of workplace learning and social change supervised by a WLSC CS core faculty member, or a WLSC CS core faculty member serves on the supervisory committee member <p>• These CS requirements are aligned with the university policy and the Collaborative Specialization Guidelines, and are clearly accommodated by the following participating programs:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Adult Education and Community Development – MA, MEd, PhD ○ Industrial Relations and Human Resources - MIRHR, PhD ○ Social Justice Education - MA, MEd, PhD, EdD ○ Women and Gender Studies – MA <p>It is unclear whether following programs are able to accommodate the WLSC CS requirements:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Rehabilitation Science – MSc, PhD 	<p>Adult Education and Community Development (AECD), with 8 AECD PhDs and 4 AECD MAs. Additionally, 8 graduates were from Social Justice Education (3 EdDs, 3 MEds, and 2 PhDs).</p> <p>• While the WLSC CS is most popular amongst OISE students – AECD students in particular, the enrolment from non-OISE programs was negligible during the review period. According to the enrolment data received for the review, only four (4) students from the MIRHR program enrolled in the CS between 2015 and 2021; only three (3) students from the Women and Gender Studies (PhD) enrolled in the CS between 2019 and 2021; and there was no enrolment from the following programs: Industrial Relations and Human Resources (PhD), Rehabilitation Science (MSc, PhD), Women and Gender Studies (MA). On the other hand, the CS enrolled two (2) MEd, and three (3) PhD students from OISE’s Educational Leadership and Policy program, and four (4) MEd, and three (3) PhD students from OISE’s Higher Education program, which are not participating programs in the WLSC CS. The self-study described this as an effort to expand access to students who demonstrate an interest and expertise in the area of studies in workplace learning and social change, and as a test case to assess whether or not to formalize these programs into the WLSC MOA in the coming year.</p> <p>• Additionally, it was stated in the self-study that, in consultations between the WLSC CS Executive Committee and the Director and administrative team of the Industrial Relations and Human Resources (IRHR) program, it was</p>	<p>overall, of much benefit for their learning and to their professional lives. Furthermore, the CS continues to provide valuable opportunities for development amongst WLSC students some of whom become Graduate Assistants or Research Assistants on faculty research projects or end up doing their theses based on work from these funded projects.</p> <p>• Challenges:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ We note that the WLCS CS increasingly relies on support from a single program that features the largest student enrolment and contributes most faculty and courses, with no support from other participating programs. Even the CS Committee, which as per the University Collaborative Specialization Guidelines should be involved in the day-to-day management of the CS, does not function in that manner and was described in the self-study as a “consultative body” that “meets occasionally”. With the majority of WLSC CS students from the AECD MEd program and no regular academic activity outside of courses (i.e., according to the self-study, the speaker series has been suspended since the pandemic), there does not appear to be programmatic engagement across the participating programs. The 2015-2016 review of the WLSC CS recommended a renewal of the MOA which, according to our records, has not occurred. This contributes to the perception that the WLCS CS is operating more like a field within the AECD program rather than a Collaborative Specialization. ○ The self-study expressed concerns regarding diminishing administrative support for the CS within the Department of Leadership, Higher and Adult Education (LHAE), which houses the CS. LHAE 	

University of Toronto
Annual Report on Graduate Collaborative Specialization Reviews, Cycle 6, 2022-23
 Collaborative Specializations Reviews are Commissioned by the Dean of the Lead Faculty

Collaborative Specialization & Lead Faculty	Participating Programs & Degrees	Appropriateness of Collaborative Specialization Requirements	Vitality of Collaborative Specialization	Other Strengths or Challenges Identified	Review Outcome
		<p>The Rehabilitation Science MSc program requires the completion of 2.0 FCE of which only 0.5 FCE is an elective course in the area of student's thesis. Hence, if a student completes a core course for the WLSC CS within this elective space, they would not be able to complete an additional 0.5 elective course in the area of workplace learning and social change without taking extra time to complete the CS requirements. Similarly, the Rehabilitation Science PhD program requires the completion of 1.5 FCE of which only 0.5 FCE is an elective course in the area of student's thesis. Hence, if a student in this program completes a core course for the WLSC CS within this elective space, they would not be able to complete an additional 0.5 elective course in the area of workplace learning and social change without taking extra time to complete the CS requirements.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The WLSC CS includes learning outcomes in addition to those embedded in the students' home degree programs including: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Students are able to effectively situate workplace learning within broader social trends such as globalization, neo-liberalism, and organizational restructuring. ○ Students are able to effectively engage in exploration of the connections between workplace learning as an individual phenomenon and learning overall as a social/organizational and public policy phenomenon. ○ Students are able to effectively understand the workplace learning strategies that seek to foster social 	<p>agreed to streamline the admissions process from this participating program by not requiring IRHR students to submit a letter of intent for admittance into the WLSC CS, and to allow the IRHR program to make the initial intake decision. The rationale was to increase admissions of IRHR students into the WLSC CS.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <u>Recommendation:</u> Given that some non-OISE participating programs are apparently not able to accommodate the WLSC CS requirements due to the limited elective space, and the need for students from these programs to invest extra time beyond their home degree program to satisfy the CS requirements; and also in light of the negligible (or no) enrolment from these programs, as well as the fact that students from programs that are not formally participating in the CS have been admitted to it, we recommend that the WLCS CS Committee reviews its program partnerships, the ability of participating programs to accommodate the CS requirements, and considers removing some of the currently listed programs from the CS/MOA, and adding new partner programs from which students have been admitted to the CS in recent years. • In light of the above-mentioned adjustment in the admissions requirements for the IHRH program students, we also recommend reviewing and updating the admissions requirements, via the appropriate consultation and governance approval process, which will result in reflecting the updated admissions requirements in the SGS calendar entry for the CS. Changing an existing CS including, for example, changing the admission or 	<p>has seen changes in staff complement and reassignment of roles within the Graduate Liaison Office to ensure more equitable support for all students across the department's three programs and three collaborative specializations. We note that the Department's shifting resources and continued reliance on contributions from a single participating program to operate the WLSC CS could lead to issues related to sustainability of the CS.</p>	

University of Toronto
Annual Report on Graduate Collaborative Specialization Reviews, Cycle 6, 2022-23
 Collaborative Specializations Reviews are Commissioned by the Dean of the Lead Faculty

Collaborative Specialization & Lead Faculty	Participating Programs & Degrees	Appropriateness of Collaborative Specialization Requirements	Vitality of Collaborative Specialization	Other Strengths or Challenges Identified	Review Outcome
		<p>change through greater equality of power, inclusivity, participatory decision-making and economic democracy.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Through the requirement of completion of a core courses and additional elective course(s) from an approved list, and the completion of a thesis on the topic of workplace learning if applicable, the WLSC CS students achieve the WLSC CS learning outcomes. The self-study noted that, normally, the selection of courses to satisfy the CS requirements does not extend the program length. 	<p>specialization requirements, or adding or deleting participating programs is a minor modification.</p>		