



**FOR INFORMATION**

**PUBLIC**

**OPEN SESSION**

**TO:** Committee on Academic Policy and Programs

**SPONSOR:** Susan McCahan, Vice-Provost, Academic Programs  
**CONTACT INFO:** (416) 978-0490, [vp.academicprograms@utoronto.ca](mailto:vp.academicprograms@utoronto.ca)

**PRESENTER:** See Sponsor  
**CONTACT INFO:**

**DATE:** April 27, 2020 for May 6, 2020

**AGENDA ITEM:** 12

**ITEM IDENTIFICATION:**

Semi-Annual Report on the Reviews of Graduate Collaborative Specializations: 2019-20

**JURISDICTIONAL INFORMATION:**

The Committee on Academic Policy and Programs (AP&P) [Terms of Reference](#) (Sections 3 and 4.9) states that “The Committee...has general responsibility...for monitoring, the quality of education and the research activities of the University. In fulfilling this responsibility, the Committee works to ensure the excellent quality of academic programs by...monitoring reviews of existing programs....The Committee receives annual reports or such more frequent regular reports as it may determine, on matters within its purview, including reports on the ...[r]eviews of academic units and programs.”

**GOVERNANCE PATH:**

1. **Committee on Academic Policy and Programs** [For Information] (May 6, 2020)

**PREVIOUS ACTION TAKEN:**

Governing Council approved the [Policy for Approval and Review of Academic Programs and Units](#) in 2010. The *Policy* outlines University-wide principles for the approval of proposed new academic programs and review of existing programs and units. Its goal is to align the University’s quality assurance processes with the Province’s Quality Assurance Framework

(QAF) through establishing the authority of the *University of Toronto Quality Assurance Process* (UTQAP).

The scope of the UTQAP includes collaborative specializations. In line with the [QAF](#), the University understands a collaborative specialization to be “an intra-university graduate field of study that provides an additional multidisciplinary experience for students enrolled in and completing the degree requirements of one of a number of approved masters and/or PhD programs. Students meet the admission requirements of and register in the participating (or ‘home’) program but complete, in addition to the degree requirements of that program, the additional requirements specified by the Collaborative Specialization. The degree conferred is that of the home program. The completion of the Collaborative Specialization is indicated by a transcript notation indicating the additional specialization.” The learning outcomes of a collaborative specialization are in addition to those supported by the home program.

In the fall of 2015 the [Guidelines](#) governing these offerings were revised, establishing the lead Dean of the collaborative specialization as the review Commissioning Officer; previously the Vice-Provost, Graduate Research and Education and Dean of the School of Graduate Studies commissioned collaborative program reviews. Because of the unique nature of collaborative specializations, their review process focuses on the quality of the “additional multidisciplinary experience” that collaborative specializations provide, over and above the experience associated with the home program. Reviews emphasize elements that are critical to determining ongoing quality of collaborative specializations at the University of Toronto, including:

1. Clarity and appropriateness of requirements
2. Evidence of successful attainment of learning outcomes
3. Evidence of ongoing need and demand
4. Continuing support of participating programs and supporting units (e.g. renewal of the Memorandum of Agreement (MOA))

The Semi-Annual Report on the Reviews of Graduate Collaborative Specializations was previously submitted to the AP&P on May 9, 2019.

### **HIGHLIGHTS:**

Four (4) external reviews of collaborative specializations commissioned by the lead Dean of each collaborative specialization were conducted in 2019-20. These reviews include two collaborative specializations led by the Faculty of Medicine (Musculoskeletal Sciences, and Biomedical Toxicology); and two led by the Faculty of Arts & Science (Book History and Print Culture, and Environment and Health). The submission to the AP&P consists of a table containing a summary of the review outcomes.

All four reviews confirmed the collaborative specializations’ vitality, the appropriateness of their program requirements, and that their learning outcomes are in addition to those supported by their students’ home programs. As a result of their reviews, Book History and Print Culture, Environment and Health, and Musculoskeletal Sciences are exploring establishing formal ties with additional participating units. Biomedical Toxicology is considering the possibility of

broadening and simplifying its name to the “Collaborative Specialization in Toxicology”, to encourage more units across all campuses to join and to contribute to teaching and community-building activities. The MOAs for all four collaborative specializations reviewed were recommended for renewal.

**FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS:**

There are no financial implications.

**RECOMMENDATION:**

For information.

---

**DOCUMENTATION PROVIDED:**

- Semi-Annual Report on the Reviews of Graduate Collaborative Specializations:2019-2020

**University of Toronto**  
**Annual Report on Graduate Collaborative Specialization Reviews, Cycle 6, 2019-20**  
 Collaborative Specializations Reviews are Commissioned by the Dean of the Lead Faculty

**Collaborative Specialization (CS) Definition:** "an intra-university graduate field of study that provides an additional multidisciplinary experience for students enrolled in and completing the degree requirements of one of a number of approved masters and/or PhD programs. Students meet the admission requirements of and register in the participating (or 'home') program but complete, in addition to the degree requirements of that program, the additional requirements specified by the Collaborative Specialization. The degree conferred is that of the home program. The completion of the Collaborative Specialization is indicated by a transcript notation indicating the additional specialization." ([Quality Assurance Framework](#))

The learning outcomes of a collaborative specialization are in addition to those supported by the home program.

Collaborative Specialization & Lead Faculty	Participating Programs & Degrees	Appropriateness of Collaborative Specialization Requirements	Vitality of Collaborative Specialization	Other Strengths or Challenges Identified	Review Outcome
<b>Musculoskeletal Sciences</b>  <b>Lead Faculty:</b> Medicine  <b>Date of Summary Assessment Report:</b> March 17, 2020	Biomedical Engineering – MAsc, PhD Dentistry – MSc, PhD Exercise Sciences – MSc, PhD Health Policy, Management and Evaluation – MSc, PhD Laboratory Medicine and Pathobiology – MSc, PhD Medical Science – MSc, PhD Rehabilitation Science – MSc, PhD	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Students are required to successfully complete the common Foundations in Musculoskeletal Science (MSC3001H) course offered annually in the Fall.</li> <li>All participating programs can accommodate the requirements of the collaborative specialization.</li> <li>"The requirements of the CSMS are in addition to course and research requirements of the students determined by their home graduate programs and are undertaken with the consent of their supervisor(s) and home department."</li> <li>All of the students enrolled in the CSMS participate in research-based degrees in an area that is part of musculoskeletal sciences under a supervisor associated with the program.</li> <li>Current students and alumni comment on how the collaborative specialization has expanded and diversified their knowledge of the musculoskeletal sciences.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The CS is active with 23 current students, demonstrating the ongoing demand for this specialization</li> <li>The need for the CSMS graduates is evidenced by the fact that diseases of the musculoskeletal system are some of the most common ailments affecting the Canadian population.</li> <li>The CSMS has a total of 14 faculty supervising students, 6 of whom teach in the MSC3001 course, in addition to another 6 faculty who teach in MSC3001 and are not currently supervising students. There is a highly engaged core of 4 faculty who regularly attend monthly seminars.</li> <li>Current Master's and PhD students have enlisted from 8 different programs in 4 faculties.</li> <li>Participating units continue to provide funding. The Director's home department covers her stipend. The Institute of Medical Sciences provides administration for the program through their graduate office.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Engagement of faculty is noted as a challenge, and a faculty survey is planned to determine if live or recorded streaming of seminars would help engage faculty who are at a distance from the main campus. This will be followed by a feasibility and cost assessment.</li> <li>Another challenge identified is the expansion to areas relevant for MSK focus – orthopedics, rehab sciences and dentistry. The CSMS director will engage with leaders from these areas to identify obstacles to student engagement and promote awareness of the specialization.</li> </ul>	MOA is recommended for renewal.  The renewed MOA will include the Department of Pharmacology & Toxicology
<b>Biomedical Toxicology</b>  <b>Lead Faculty:</b> Medicine	Laboratory Medicine and Pathobiology – MSc, PhD Medical Science – MSc, PhD Nutritional Sciences – MSc, PhD Pharmaceutical Sciences – MSc, PhD	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Students are required to complete at least one common learning activity and practicum experience/research in the area.</li> <li>All participating programs can accommodate the requirements of the collaborative specialization.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The CSBT is poised to attract talent to the University of Toronto and to be a hub for researchers, students, and external partners with an interest in toxicology.</li> <li>Efforts to identify more teachers and research supervisors with an interest in toxicology are creating more opportunities for students and the</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>It is proposed that the name of the specialization be broadened and simplified to the "Collaborative Specialization in Toxicology" (CST). Under this more inclusive umbrella, more units across all campuses will be encouraged to join and to contribute to teaching and community-</li> </ul>	MOA is recommended for renewal.  The renewal of the MoA will reflect the proposed name change from the

**University of Toronto**  
**Annual Report on Graduate Collaborative Specialization Reviews, Cycle 6, 2019-20**  
 Collaborative Specializations Reviews are Commissioned by the Dean of the Lead Faculty

Collaborative Specialization & Lead Faculty	Participating Programs & Degrees	Appropriateness of Collaborative Specialization Requirements	Vitality of Collaborative Specialization	Other Strengths or Challenges Identified	Review Outcome
<b>Date of Summary Assessment Report:</b> March 17, 2020	Pharmacology – MSc, PhD	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The learning outcomes of the collaborative specialization are in addition to those supported by the student’s home program.</li> <li>• Students have successfully attained the learning outcomes.</li> <li>• For participating programs requiring a major research paper, essay, thesis or other major activity the topic must be in the area of the collaborative specialization and under the supervision of a graduate faculty member associated with the CS.</li> <li>• For coursework-only participating programs at least 30% of the courses taken towards the degree must be in the area of specialization.</li> </ul>	<p>ability of the University of Toronto to attract high quality students to graduate studies.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Student interest remains strong, despite the fact that active promotion of this program was placed on hold over the past several years. CSBT enrolment statistics from January 2019 listed 19 student members.</li> <li>• The Director is actively seeking further sponsorship to increase number of events for students and has secured additional funding from participating program units.</li> <li>• Enrolment has increased and remained steady since program’s inception and international interest in the program has grown.</li> </ul>	<p>building activities.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A marketing campaign will be launched following the successful approval of the name change for the specialization to the Collaborative Specialization in Toxicology and with confirmation of the participating units with the signing of a new Memorandum of Agreement.</li> <li>• The core specialization requirements will be simplified to better align with the one core half-course (i.e. shared learning experience) that is the expectation of most specializations.</li> </ul>	<p>Collaborative Specialization in Biomedical Toxicology to the Collaborative Specialization in Toxicology.</p> <p>The additional funding that the Director has secured will also be referenced.</p>
<b>Book History and Print Culture</b>  <b>Lead Faculty:</b> Arts and Science  <b>Date of Summary Assessment Report:</b> March 11, 2020	Art History – MA, PhD Classics – MA, PhD Comparative Literature – MA, PhD East Asian Studies – MA, PhD English – MA, PhD French Language and Literature – MA, PhD Germanic Languages and Literatures – MA Germanic Literature, Culture and Theory – PhD History – MA, PhD History and Philosophy of Science and Technology – MA, PhD Information – MI, PhD Italian Studies – MA, PhD Medieval Studies – MA, PhD	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Students in the specialization share in a common learning experience by participating in the required course BKS1001H (Introduction to Book History).</li> <li>• The remaining 0.5 FCE (MA students) or 1.0 FCE (PhD) that students must take are fulfilled with additional BKS course options that fit within the elective spaces of students’ primary programs (excepting the PhD practicum course BKS2001H that students normally take in addition to coursework requirements).</li> <li>• In addition, the specialization organizes events to enhance the shared student experience.</li> <li>• The requirements of the specialization appear to be fully appropriate to support its learning outcomes.</li> <li>• The collaborative specialization meets the requirement that 30% of the courses taken are in the area of the specialization.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The specialization has proven very popular among graduate students in this 20th year since its inception. Its strong vitality is evidenced by modest growth from approximately 50 students in 2012 to 63 students in 2018.</li> <li>• The program has graduated 8-21 students each year from 2010 to 2018, for a total of 123 graduates of the specialization from 13 distinct units.</li> <li>• A total of 18 units from multiple divisions within the university are affiliated with and provide enthusiastic support to the specialization, comprising 76 affiliated faculty members; this grows by approximately 2-3 new faculty members per year.</li> <li>• The collaborative specialization in Book History and Print Culture appears to be strong, fostering lively participation from students and faculty across the university.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The self study identified declines in student participation from some units over time that has decreased the diversity of disciplines represented among MA students taking the specialization, indicating that it is important to pursue extra outreach efforts to strengthen connections in the future.</li> <li>• Despite the robust collection of participating units, the self-study identified several additional prospective units to explore signing on to the MOA to establish formal ties.</li> <li>• Although the specialization does not identify learning outcomes that specifically target professional development objectives, the self-study indicated that many PhD graduates have subsequently pursued academic positions as well as positions as librarians,</li> </ul>	<p>MOA is recommended for renewal.</p>

**University of Toronto**  
**Annual Report on Graduate Collaborative Specialization Reviews, Cycle 6, 2019-20**  
 Collaborative Specializations Reviews are Commissioned by the Dean of the Lead Faculty

Collaborative Specialization & Lead Faculty	Participating Programs & Degrees	Appropriateness of Collaborative Specialization Requirements	Vitality of Collaborative Specialization	Other Strengths or Challenges Identified	Review Outcome
	Museum Studies – MMSt Music – MA, PhD Religion – MA, PhD Spanish – MA, PhD			archivists, writers, editors, lawyers, and in university administration. • The self-study identified, from student survey results and faculty feedback, the need to expand beyond a traditionally English and Western focus.	
<b>Environment and Health</b>  <b>Lead Faculty: Arts and Science</b>  <b>Date of Summary Assessment Report:</b> March 11, 2020	Adult Education and Community Development – MA, MEd, PhD Chemical Engineering and Applied Chemistry – MAsc, MEng, PhD Community Health – MScCH Environmental Science – MEnvSc, PhD Geography – MA, MSc, PhD Medical Science – MSc, PhD Planning – MScPI, PhD Public Health Sciences – MPH, PhD Women and Gender Studies – MA, PhD	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Students in the specialization participate in a common learning experience through the required seminar course ENV4001H (Graduate Seminars in Environment and Health). This core seminar course is linked to a bi-weekly public seminar series that provides further focus for shared student learning experiences and interdisciplinary engagement.</li> <li>• In addition, students in the specialization must complete 0.5 FCE coursework from a list of 39 approved electives suitable for the learning outcomes of the specialization in environment and health.</li> <li>• Consultations among participating units indicate consensus that the requirements can be easily accommodated, and a survey of student alumni indicated the requirements could easily be completed during their programs of study.</li> <li>• The interdisciplinary perspective afforded by the specialization complements and supplements the primary program of study for participating students.</li> <li>• The requirements appear to be fully appropriate to support the learning outcomes of the specialization.</li> <li>• The collaborative specialization meets the requirement that 30% of the courses taken are in the area of specialization.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The collaborative specialization in Environment and Health appears to be strong, enabling lively participation from students and faculty within the university.</li> <li>• This specialization has proven popular among graduate students, showing continuous vitality since the last review. Enrolment has grown from 5-7 students in 2011 and 2012 to 12-21 students in the three years up to 2018.</li> <li>• The program has graduated 32 students between 2010 and 2018, coming from 11 distinct units.</li> <li>• A total of 16 units from multiple divisions within the university are affiliated with the specialization. While not all units affiliated with the specialization have contributed participating students, the self-study indicates enthusiasm from those units to continue their affiliations into the future.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Students receive supports to make useful academic connections with faculty, peers, and external visitors to assist in their professional development.</li> <li>• Students have the opportunity to develop networking opportunities across disciplines, identify job opportunities, and to establish collaborative projects.</li> <li>• The self-study identified that the scheduling of ENV4001H was a challenge for some students who wished to participate.</li> <li>• The self-study also identified student awareness as a potential barrier to enrolment, and that the list of elective courses warrants review to increase attractiveness of the specialization to students.</li> <li>• Two further units have expressed interest in signing on to the MOA to establish formal ties to the specialization and that there is a need to explore opportunities for other interested academic units to become participating units as well.</li> </ul>	MOA is recommended for renewal.