

**FOR INFORMATION**

**PUBLIC**

**OPEN SESSION**

**TO:** Committee on Academic Policy and Programs

**SPONSOR:** Sioban Nelson, Vice-Provost, Academic Programs  
**CONTACT INFO:** (416) 978-2122, [vp.academicprograms@utoronto.ca](mailto:vp.academicprograms@utoronto.ca)

**PRESENTER:** Sioban Nelson, Vice-Provost, Academic Programs  
**CONTACT INFO:** (416) 978-2122, [vp.academicprograms@utoronto.ca](mailto:vp.academicprograms@utoronto.ca)

**DATE:** April 26, 2017 for May 9, 2017

**AGENDA ITEM:** 9

**ITEM IDENTIFICATION:**

Report on the Reviews of Graduate Collaborative Specializations: 2016-17

**JURISDICTIONAL INFORMATION:**

The Committee on Academic Policy and Programs (AP&P) *Terms of Reference* (Sections 3 and 4.9) states that “The Committee...has general responsibility...for monitoring, the quality of education and the research activities of the University. In fulfilling this responsibility, the Committee works to ensure the excellent quality of academic programs by...monitoring reviews of existing programs....The Committee receives annual reports or such more frequent regular reports as it may determine, on matters within its purview, including reports on the ...[r]eviews of academic units and programs.”

**GOVERNANCE PATH:**

1. **Committee on Academic Policy and Programs** [For Information] (May 9, 2017)

**PREVIOUS ACTION TAKEN:**

Governing Council approved the [\*Policy for Approval and Review of Academic Programs and Units\*](#) in 2010. The *Policy* outlines University-wide principles for the approval of proposed new academic programs and review of existing programs and units. Its goal is to align the University’s quality assurance processes with the Province’s Quality Assurance Framework (QAF) through establishing the authority of the *University of Toronto Quality Assurance Process* (UTQAP).

The scope of the UTQAP includes collaborative specializations. In line with the [QAF](#), the University understands a collaborative specialization to be “an intra-university graduate field of study that provides an additional multidisciplinary experience for students enrolled in and completing the degree requirements of one of a number of approved masters and/or PhD programs. Students meet the admission requirements of and register in the participating (or ‘home’) program but complete, in addition to the degree requirements of that program, the additional requirements specified by the Collaborative Specialization. The degree conferred is that of the home program. The completion of the Collaborative Specialization is indicated by a transcript notation indicating the additional specialization.” The learning outcomes of a collaborative specialization are in addition to those supported by the home program.

In the fall of 2015 the [Guidelines](#) governing these offerings were revised, establishing the lead Dean of the collaborative specialization as the review Commissioning Officer; previously the Vice-Provost, Graduate Research and Education and Dean of the School of Graduate Studies commissioned collaborative program reviews. Because of the unique nature of collaborative specializations, their review process focuses on the quality of the “additional multidisciplinary experience” that collaborative specializations provide, over and above the experience associated with the home program. Reviews emphasize elements that are critical to determining ongoing quality of collaborative specializations at the University of Toronto, including:

1. Clarity and appropriateness of requirements
2. Evidence of successful attainment of learning outcomes
3. Evidence of ongoing need and demand
4. Continuing support of participating programs and supporting units (e.g. renewal of the Memorandum of Agreement (MOA))

The Semi-Annual Report on the Reviews of Graduate Collaborative Programs was previously submitted to the AP&P on January 10, 2017.

## **HIGHLIGHTS:**

Nine (9) external reviews of collaborative specializations commissioned by the lead Dean of each collaborative specialization were conducted in 2016-17. Two were presented in Cycle 3 and seven (7) are included in Cycle 6. These reviews include one collaborative specialization led by Medicine (Developmental Biology), one led by OISE (Educational Policy) and five led by Arts and Science (Diaspora and Transnational Studies, Editing Medieval Texts, South Asian Studies and Women and Gender Studies). The submission to the AP&P consists of a table containing a summary of the review outcomes.

Overall, the reviews indicate that the collaborative specialization requirements are clear, relevant, and appropriate. Specifically, core course content is adequately evolving to meet student, faculty, and disciplinary changes. In nearly all cases, additional academic activities provide opportunities for student attainment of learning outcomes within interdisciplinary environments, and there is consistent demand and support for the programs.

Most of the collaborative specializations reviewed highlight that enrolment is not evenly distributed across all participating units. The lead Faculties will continue to monitor enrolment from participating programs, and assess imbalances as needed. The renewal of the MOAs, which is part of this review process, provides an important opportunity to clarify participation in and support for the collaborative specializations. In all reviews, all affiliated units have committed to continue to provide support for the collaborative specializations.

**FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS:**

There are no financial implications.

**RECOMMENDATION:**

For information.

---

**DOCUMENTATION PROVIDED:**

- Semi-Annual Report on the Reviews of Graduate Collaborative Specializations:2016-2017

**University of Toronto**  
**Semi-Annual Report on Graduate Collaborative Specialization Reviews, Cycle 6, 2016-17**  
 Collaborative Specializations Reviews are Commissioned by the Dean of the Lead Faculty

**Collaborative Specialization (CP) Definition:** "an intra-university graduate field of study that provides an additional multidisciplinary experience for students enrolled in and completing the degree requirements of one of a number of approved masters and/or PhD programs. Students meet the admission requirements of and register in the participating (or 'home') program but complete, in addition to the degree requirements of that program, the additional requirements specified by the Collaborative Specialization. The degree conferred is that of the home program. The completion of the Collaborative Specialization is indicated by a transcript notation indicating the additional specialization." ([QAF](#))

The learning outcomes of a collaborative specialization are in addition to those supported by the home program.

Collaborative Specialization & Lead Faculty	Participating Programs & Degrees	Appropriateness of Collaborative Specialization Requirements	Vitality of Collaborative Specialization	Other Strengths or Challenges Identified	Review Outcome
<p><b>Diaspora and Transnational Studies</b></p> <p><b>Lead Faculty:</b> Arts &amp; Science</p> <p><b>Date of Summary Assessment Report:</b> April 21, 2017</p>	Anthropology - MA, MSc, PhD Cinema Studies - MA Comparative Literature – M, PhD Criminology – MA, PhD Drama, Theatre & Performance Studies – MA, PhD English – MA, PhD Geography – MA, MSc, PhD Germanic Languages & Literatures – MA German Literature, Culture & Theory – PhD History – MA, PhD History of Art – MA, PhD Near and Middle Eastern Civilizations – MA, PhD Political Science – MA, PhD Religion – PhD Slavic – MA, PhD Social Justice Education – MA, MEd, EdD, PhD Sociology, MA, PhD Spanish – MA, PhD	<p>The collaborative specialization course requirements, and additional learning opportunities such as seminar series, are well established and continue to meet the collaborative specialization objectives and learning outcomes.</p>	<p>Enrolments in the collaborative specialization have been modest but steadily increasing since its inaugural year in 2009. Students from a variety of disciplines have enrolled in the collaborative specialization. Nevertheless, in more than one third of the participating programs, there have been no enrolments since the collaborative specialization began in 2009. It will be important for the Collaborative Specialization Committee to examine the reasons for the lack of involvement among some units, and determine possible solutions. Depending on the outcome of discussions with relevant units, it may be appropriate for some units to discontinue their participation in the collaborative specialization.</p>	<p>This collaborative specialization appears to fill an important need within the university. Core faculty have been actively engaged, taking turns in teaching the required research methods course. Although the collaborative specialization appears to generate healthy interest among students each year, this interest is stronger in some contributing units than others. Revitalizing interest in units with limited or no student representation in the collaborative specialization will be an ongoing challenge for the Director and the Collaborative Specialization Committee.</p>	<p>MOA is recommended for renewal.</p>

**University of Toronto**  
**Semi-Annual Report on Graduate Collaborative Specialization Reviews, Cycle 6, 2016-17**  
 Collaborative Specializations Reviews are Commissioned by the Dean of the Lead Faculty

Collaborative Specialization & Lead Faculty	Participating Programs & Degrees	Appropriateness of Collaborative Specialization Requirements	Vitality of Collaborative Specialization	Other Strengths or Challenges Identified	Review Outcome
<b>Editing Medieval Texts</b>  <b>Lead Faculty:</b> Arts & Science  <b>Date of Summary Assessment Report:</b> April 21, 2017	Classics – PhD English – PhD History – PhD Italian Studies – PhD Medieval Studies – PhD Music – PhD Philosophy – PhD Religion – PhD Spanish – PhD	The collaborative specialization requirements appear appropriate for the learning outcomes, although the required course-load seems high.	The collaborative specialization appears to have had modest but consistent student interest, with enrolments ranging between 9 and 18 students over each of the past 10 years. Student completions pose more of a concern, with only 6 students completing the requirements during that time period. This issue of student completions was raised in the 2008 review. The previous review also queried whether students would have difficulty completing the collaborative specialization requirements given that the MST1111 course was not offered every year. Since the previous review, this course has not in fact been offered on a regular basis.	This collaborative specialization is currently experiencing challenges both in student completions and in attracting interest from diverse disciplines. The Director’s proposed curriculum changes are expected to increase student interest and improve completion rates. At the same time, it will be crucial for the collaborative specialization committee to continue to encourage associated units to re-engage to ensure that the collaborative specialization is truly collaborative. If the collaborative specialization continues to draw students only from CMS, it is recommended that collaborative specialization closure be considered and that a new concentration in editing medieval texts be developed within the graduate programs in Medieval Studies.	MOA is recommended for renewal.  The FAS Dean’s office will work with the collaborative specialization Director and the participating programs to ensure proposed curriculum changes go through any necessary academic change approval processes.
<b>Jewish Studies</b>  <b>Lead Faculty:</b> Arts & Science  <b>Date of Summary Assessment Report:</b> April 21, 2017	Anthropology - MA, PhD Classics – MA, PhD Comparative Literature – MA, PhD Drama, Theatre and Performance Studies – MA, PhD English – MA, PhD European, Russian, and Eurasian Studies – MA Geography – PhD Germanic Languages and Literatures – MA German Literature, Culture & Theory – PhD History – MA, PhD History of Art – MA, PhD	The requirements appear to be entirely appropriate to support the learning outcomes of the collaborative specialization. The Director meets once a year with each student in the collaborative specialization to provide advising, including a discussion of collaborative specialization requirements.	This collaborative specialization has proven very popular with graduate students. Enrolment has grown from the original estimated enrolment of 10 MA students and 6-10 PhD students to a total of 86 students. Between 2011 and 2014, enrolments increased steadily, with an average of nine new students each year. Completion rates have also been steady, with 41 students completing the collaborative specialization	The collaborative specialization has a particular strength in providing an enhanced experience for graduate students: students become part of a community of scholars and receive enriched training through learning about methodologies and theoretical frameworks outside their core area of study. Students also have the opportunity to make useful academic connections,	MOA is recommended for renewal.

**University of Toronto**  
**Semi-Annual Report on Graduate Collaborative Specialization Reviews, Cycle 6, 2016-17**  
 Collaborative Specializations Reviews are Commissioned by the Dean of the Lead Faculty

<b>Collaborative Specialization &amp; Lead Faculty</b>	<b>Participating Programs &amp; Degrees</b>	<b>Appropriateness of Collaborative Specialization Requirements</b>	<b>Vitality of Collaborative Specialization</b>	<b>Other Strengths or Challenges Identified</b>	<b>Review Outcome</b>
	Information Studies – PhD LAW – LLM, MSL, SJD Linguistics –PhD Medieval Studies – MA, PhD Museum Studies – MMSt Music – MA, PhD Music Performance - DMA Near and Middle Eastern Civilizations – MA, PhD Philosophy – MA, PhD Political Science – MA, PhD Religion – MA, PhD Slavic Languages and Literatures – MA, PhD Sociology – MA, PhD Women and Gender Studies, MA		between 2007 and 2014. Since the last review of the PhD collaborative specialization in 2012, the collaborative specialization has attracted 8 additional collaborating units, for a total now of 24. The number of affiliated faculty members has also risen from 66 to 73.	assisting them in their professional development. Although the growth of the collaborative specialization provides strong evidence of its vitality, the relatively rapid expansion also poses some challenges. For example, the number of staff associated with the collaborative specialization has increased to accommodate the larger size. In addition, the collaborative specialization will need to balance any further growth with maintaining a high level of quality within the collaborative specialization.	
<b>South Asian Studies</b>  <b>Lead Faculty:</b> Arts & Science  <b>Date of Summary Assessment Report:</b> April 21, 2017	Anthropology - MA, MSc, PhD Cinema Studies - MA Comparative Literature – M, PhD Drama, Theatre & Performance Studies – MA, PhD East Asian – MA, PhD English – MA, PhD Geography – MA, MSc, PhD History – MA, PhD Music – MA, PhD Political Science – MA, PhD Religion – MA, PhD Social Justice Education – MA, MEd, EdD, PhD Women and Gender Studies – MA, PhD	The collaborative specialization requirements seem entirely appropriate, providing the opportunity for students to develop their scholarship in South Asian Studies while including them in a community of scholars with shared interests in the area.	The South Asian Studies Collaborative Specialization enjoys popularity among students, with 36 graduate students currently registered. Over the past 10 years, between three and four students, on average, have completed the collaborative specialization each year. Twelve units currently participate in the collaborative specialization. The approximately 30 faculty members affiliated with the CSAS form the “heart” of the collaborative specialization. Several participating programs, however, have seen low or no enrolments in the collaborative specialization for several years; these include East Asian Studies, Drama,	The current challenge for the collaborative specialization will be the need to re-evaluate the broader involvement of participating programs that have to date had lower participation rates. Over the next year, the Dean’s office will work with the Collaborative Specialization Director to examine possible ways to enhance participation from participating programs with limited involvement, or, if appropriate, to remove participating programs from the collaborative specialization.	MOA is recommended for renewal.

**University of Toronto**  
**Semi-Annual Report on Graduate Collaborative Specialization Reviews, Cycle 6, 2016-17**  
 Collaborative Specializations Reviews are Commissioned by the Dean of the Lead Faculty

Collaborative Specialization & Lead Faculty	Participating Programs & Degrees	Appropriateness of Collaborative Specialization Requirements	Vitality of Collaborative Specialization	Other Strengths or Challenges Identified	Review Outcome
			and Women and Gender Studies. The Collaborative Specialization Committee for the CSAS has begun discussions with these participating programs to determine whether it makes sense to find ways to rekindle their involvement in the collaborative specialization, or whether it would be more appropriate for them to discontinue their participation in the collaborative specialization.		
<b>Women and Gender Studies</b>  <b>Lead Faculty:</b> Arts & Science  <b>Date of Summary Assessment Report:</b> April 21, 2017	Adult Education and Community Development – MA, MEd, PhD Anthropology - MA, MSc, PhD Cinema Studies - MA Classics – MA, PhD Comparative Literature – M, PhD Counselling and Clinical Psychology – MA, PhD Counselling Psychology – MEd, EdD Criminology – MA, PhD Curriculum Studies & Teacher Development – MA, MEd, PhD Drama, Theatre & Performance Studies – MA, PhD Educational Administration – MA, MEd, EdD, PhD English – MA, PhD Exercise Sciences – MSc, PhD French Language and Literature – MA, PhD Geography – MA, MSc, PhD Germanic Languages & Literatures – MA German Literature, Culture & Theory – PhD Health Administration – MHSc Health Policy, Management & Evaluation – MSc, PhD Higher Education – MA, MEd, EdD, PhD	The requirements appear to provide the mandatory common learning experience, and support the learning outcomes for the collaborative specialization.	The collaborative specialization continues to draw healthy interest from students in a variety of disciplines, with more students applying each year than are admitted. Thus, although the collaborative specialization is smaller than it was at the time of the last review, it appears to show strong evidence of vitality. Completion rates remain steady, with 124 students completing the collaborative specialization between 2007 and 2014.	Students are drawn from a wide variety of disciplines. Nevertheless, some participating programs have seen no enrolments in the past decade. It is recommended that the Collaborative Specialization Committee consider how to re-engage interest with these participating programs, or consider whether it may be appropriate to discontinue their participation in the collaborative specialization.	MOA is recommended for renewal.

**University of Toronto**  
**Semi-Annual Report on Graduate Collaborative Specialization Reviews, Cycle 6, 2016-17**  
 Collaborative Specializations Reviews are Commissioned by the Dean of the Lead Faculty

<b>Collaborative Specialization &amp; Lead Faculty</b>	<b>Participating Programs &amp; Degrees</b>	<b>Appropriateness of Collaborative Specialization Requirements</b>	<b>Vitality of Collaborative Specialization</b>	<b>Other Strengths or Challenges Identified</b>	<b>Review Outcome</b>
	History – MA, PhD Humanities, Social Sciences and Social Justice Education – MA, MEd, EdD, PhD Information – MI Information Studies – PhD Language and Literacies Education – MA, MEd, PhD LAW – LLM, SJD Medieval Studies – MA, PhD Near and Middle Eastern Civilizations – MA, PhD Nursing Science – MN, PhD Philosophy – MA, PhD Political Science – MA, PhD Public Health Science – MPH, PhD Religion – MA, PhD Social Work – MSW, PhD				
<b>Developmental Biology</b>  <b>Lead Faculty:</b> Medicine  <b>Date of Summary Assessment Report:</b> December 19, 2016	Department of Biochemistry – MSc, PhD Department of Cell and Systems Biology – MSc, PhD Department of Immunology – MSc, PhD Department of Laboratory Medicine and Pathobiology – MSc, PhD Department of Molecular Genetics – MSc, PhD Department of Physiology – MSc, PhD Institute of Biomaterials & Biomedical Engineering (IBBME): Biomedical Engineering – MAsc, PhD Clinical Engineering – MHSc Institute of Medical Science (IMS) – MSc, PhD	The collaborative specialization requirements are clear and appropriate to support the learning outcomes	The collaborative specialization is very healthy, with overall student enrollment at its highest level ever- 56 PhD students and 41 Masters students as of November 2016.	The collaborative specialization provides unique learning opportunities for students, including unique courses. The major challenge for the collaborative specialization relates to financial sustainability. The Collaborative Specialization needs an additional \$20,000-\$25,000 per year to permit the it to introduce activities that enhance the common learning experience and allow for continued collaborative specialization growth. Funding sources will be confirmed through the MOA renewal process.	MOA is recommended for renewal.



**University of Toronto**  
**Semi-Annual Report on Graduate Collaborative Specialization Reviews, Cycle 6, 2016-17**  
 Collaborative Specializations Reviews are Commissioned by the Dean of the Lead Faculty

<b>Collaborative Specialization &amp; Lead Faculty</b>	<b>Participating Programs &amp; Degrees</b>	<b>Appropriateness of Collaborative Specialization Requirements</b>	<b>Vitality of Collaborative Specialization</b>	<b>Other Strengths or Challenges Identified</b>	<b>Review Outcome</b>
<b>Educational Policy</b>  <b>Lead Faculty:</b> OISE  <b>Date of Summary Assessment Report:</b> March 13, 2017	Adult Education and Community Development—MA, MEd, PhD Higher Education—MA, MEd, EdD, PhD Educational Leadership & Policy—MA, MEd, EdD, PhD Developmental Psychology and Education—MA, MEd, PhD Curriculum Studies and Teacher Development—MA, MEd, PhD Language and Literacies Education—MA, MEd, PhD Social Justice Education—MA, MEd, EdD, PhD	The collaborative specialization in Educational Policy has clearly identified objectives supported by clear collaborative specialization requirements and additional learning opportunities (i.e. seminar series) open to all participating students.	The collaborative specialization in Educational Policy is a well-established interdisciplinary and intradepartmental offering with a defined and relevant academic focus i.e. the continued prevalence and importance of issues related to educational policy and educational improvement in societies and economies generally. There is a solid demand for collaborative specialization in Educational Policy. In addition to excellent OISE students from seven participating graduate programs, the collaborative specialization courses also attract students from other programs within and beyond OISE.	Student enrolment is not evenly distributed across participating programs. While it is reasonable to expect that participating programs within the Department of Leadership, Higher and Adult Education, which houses the collaborative specialization, would feature stronger enrolment than participating programs in some other departments at OISE, the Collaborative Specialization Committee should identify ways to better promote the collaborative specialization within OISE especially given its potential to improve student recruitment and enrolment in participating programs.	MOA is recommended for renewal.