

UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO  
THE GOVERNING COUNCIL  
REPORT NUMBER 218 OF THE ACADEMIC BOARD  
**Thursday, November 22, 2018**

To the Governing Council,  
University of Toronto

Your Board reports that it met on Thursday, November 22, 2018, at 4:10 p.m. in the Council Chamber, Simcoe Hall with the following members present:

**PRESENT:**

Andrea Sass-Kortsak, Chair  
Steven Thorpe, Vice-Chair  
Donald Ainslie  
Catherine Amara  
Laura Anderson  
Heather Boon  
Harvey Botting  
Markus Bussmann  
Caryl Clark  
Emily Chu  
Fernando Crupi  
Jim Davis  
Luc F. De Nil  
Joseph Desloges  
David Dubins  
Angela Esterhammer  
Susan Froom  
Emily Gilbert  
Jason Glover  
Sol Goldberg  
Connie Guberman  
Janneka Guise  
Edie (YiYi) Guo

Richard Hegele  
Edsel Ing  
Mallory Jackan  
Ira Jacobs  
Linda Johnston  
Allan Kaplan  
Mala Kashyap  
Jeannie Kim  
Anil Kishen  
Cara Krmpotich  
Ernest W.N. Lam  
Angela B. Lange  
Mark Lautens  
Paul Malozewski  
Maureen MacDonald  
Susan McCahan  
Don McLean  
Shawn Medeiros  
Faye Mishna  
Kent G.W. Moore  
Olayemi Morgan  
Nicholas Moroz  
Emmanuel Nikiema

David Palmer  
Michele Peterson-Badali  
Mary Pugh  
Jennifer Purtle  
Reinhart Reithmeier  
Tian Renton  
Catherine Riddell  
Suzan Schneeweiss  
Boaz F. Schuman  
Said Sidani  
Salvatore Spadafora  
Bodgan Stovba  
Eric Stubbs  
Tom Sutherland  
Wisdom J. Tettey  
W. Keith Thomas  
Jessie Tong  
Truc Tran  
Njoki Wane  
Trevor Young  
Rachel Zand

## Report Number 218 of the Academic Board -- Thursday, November 22, 2018

**REGRETS:**

Cheryl Regehr  
 Donald C. Ainslie  
 Aarthi Ashok  
 Larry Alford  
 Cristina Amon  
 Ryan Balot  
 Glen Bandiera  
 Dwayne Benjamin  
 Randy Boyagoda  
 Shauna Brail  
 Adalsteinn (Steini) I. D.  
 Brown  
 Christine Burke  
 Andrea Chiappetta  
 George Christakis  
 Kenneth Corts  
 Maria Christina Cuervo

Gilbert Delgado  
 Raisa Deber  
 Sheree Drummond  
 Vivek Goel  
 Tara Goldstein  
 William A. Gough  
 Daniel A. Haas  
 Kelly  
 Hannah-Moffat  
 Thomas M. Hurka  
 Edward Iacobucci  
 Glen Jones  
 Charlie Keil  
 Sally Krigstin  
 Ronald H. Kluger  
 Ulrich J. Krull  
 Ron Levi  
 Fei Fei Liu  
 Ben Liu

Scott Mabury  
 Tiff Macklem  
 Bonnie S. McElhinny  
 Faye Mishna  
 Nicholas Moroz  
 David Palmer  
 Laca Pavel  
 Reinhart Reithmeier  
 Trevor Rodgers  
 Edward (Ted) Sargent  
 Hugh Segal  
 Anne Harriet  
 Simmonds  
 Markus Stock  
 Richard Sommer  
 Andrew Spence  
 Robert M. Wright

**NON-VOTING ASSESSORS:**

Heather Boon, Vice-Provost, Faculty and Academic Life

**SECRETARIAT:**

Joan Griffin, Secretary, Academic Board

**IN ATTENDANCE:**

Althea Blackburn-Evans, University of Toronto Communications  
 Bob Boeckner, Member, Business Board  
 Tad Brown, Counsel, Business Affairs and Advancement  
 Jennifer Francisco, Office of the Vice-Provost, Academic Programs  
 Tracey Gameiro, Associate Director, Appeals, Discipline and Faculty Grievances  
 Justine Garrett, Office of the Vice-Provost, Academic Programs  
 Erin Lemon, University of Toronto Communications  
 Daniella Mallinick, Director, Academic Programs, Planning & Quality Assurance, Office of the Vice-Provost, Academic Programs  
 Karen McCarthy, University of Toronto Communications  
 Helen Miliotis, Faculty of Medicine,  
 Krista Osbourne, Administrative Clerk & Hearing Secretary, Appeals, Discipline and Faculty Grievances  
 Andrea Russell, Director, Academic Affairs  
 Archana Sridhar, Assistant Provost, Office of the Vice-President and Provost

Report Number 218 of the Academic Board -- Thursday, November 22, 2018

ITEMS 4 AND 5 ARE REPORTED FOR APPROVAL AND ALL OTHER ITEMS ARE FOR INFORMATION

### **1. Report of the Vice-President and Provost**

Professor Heather Boon, Vice-Provost, Faculty and Academic Faculty Life, brought remarks on behalf of the Provost and reported as per the Framework Agreement with the federated universities that Professor Michael Ratcliffe had been re-appointed as Dean of Arts and Vice-Provost of Trinity College, effective July 1, 2018, for a second five-year term.

She also shared that the Provost's Office had committed to writing to all divisions to remind them that explicit advice regarding students' further rights of appeal in academic appeal matters should be included in all decisions. This planned communication arose from a recent report of the Academic Appeals Committee. In that report, the Senior Chair had noted that a student had not been appropriately informed of the right to appeal a divisional academic appeals decision to the Academic Appeals Committee of Governing Council.

An education session led by Professor Luc De Nil, Acting Dean, School of Graduate Studies and Vice-Provost, Graduate Research and Education, followed Professor Boon's comments. Professor De Nil presented on the "10,000 PhDs Project", a research project that tracked U of T PhD graduates since 2000 via publically available data sources such as LinkedIn to attempt to discern where U of T PhD graduates are employed.

He noted that U of T PhD graduates are highly employable and find jobs in all sectors of the economy, including within higher education; that they advanced research and teaching domestically and abroad; and fuelled global innovation and change across the private and public sectors. Professor De Nil shared how members of the Board could obtain data relevant to their own divisions and noted several divisions had extended the project concept to new areas, such as the Faculty of Arts and Science's initiative to track Master-level graduates in a similar manner.

In response to members' questions, Professor De Nil explained that several pilot projects were underway and the outcome of those would help shape next steps. He also commented on the University's participation in the TRACE project based at McGill University which collects ethnographic data on graduates.

## 2. Reviews of Academic Programs and Units – Follow-up Reports

The Board received a summary report by Professor Ernest Lam, Chair of the Committee on Academic Policy and Programs (AP&P) regarding two follow-up reports from previous academic program and unit reviews that had been considered by AP&P at its meeting on November 1, 2018. The following reports were received for information:

- i. Department of Historical Studies, and its Programs (University of Toronto Mississauga)
- ii. Department of Chemical and Physical Sciences and its Programs (University of Toronto Mississauga)

Professor Lam confirmed the Committee was satisfied with the follow-up reports and determined that there were no specific issues of concern to be brought forward to the Academic Board.

## 3. Semi-Annual Reports on the Reviews of Academic Units and Program, April – September 2018

Professor Lam reported on the *Semi-Annual Report of Academic Units and Programs* noting that 14 decanal reviews had been considered by AP&P at its meeting on November 1, 2018. Reports were reviewed from the following:

### **Faculty of Arts and Science:**

Centre for Criminology and Sociolegal Studies

Department of Chemistry

Department of Ecology and Evolutionary Biology

Department of Spanish and Portuguese

Latin American Studies Program

Pharmaceutical Chemistry Program [offered in association with the Leslie Dan Faculty of Pharmacy]

School of the Environment

### **Faculty of Medicine:**

Physician Assistant Program

### **University of Toronto Mississauga:**

Department of Anthropology

Forensic Science Programs

### **University of Toronto Scarborough:**

Department of Arts, Culture and Media

Department of Historical and Cultural Studies

Report Number 218 of the Academic Board -- Thursday, November 22, 2018

Department of Physical and Environmental Sciences  
Department of Psychology

He stated that the Committee confirmed the reviews were conducted in line with University policy and guidelines, that the Provost's Office had managed the process appropriately, and that plans were in place to address any quality issues. He offered thanks to the Reading Groups for their thoughtful and careful work.

Seven follow-up reports were requested for Department of Chemistry, Pharmaceutical Chemistry Program, Department of Ecology and Evolutionary Biology, Department of Spanish and Portuguese, Latin American Studies Program, Forensic Science Program, and Arts, Culture and Media.

Professor McCahan commented that the Committee had raised the question of how program reviews were conducted in a tri-campus context, specifically whether, in the case of reviews of units that offer only undergraduate programs, reviewers met with the cognate graduate Chairs. Professor McCahan indicated that the Tri-Campus Review consultations had raised similar questions, and she expected that the recommendations from the review would address the conduct of reviews.

4. **New Graduate Program Proposal: Master of Health Science in Medical Physiology (M.H.Sc.), Faculty of Medicine (for recommendation)\*** (*Arising from Report Number 193 of the Committee on Academic Policy and Programs*)

Professor McCahan introduced the new program and Professor Helen Miliotis from the Faculty of Medicine Department of Physiology, explained how the program differed from others available. In her remarks, Professor Miliotis noted that it would be the Faculty of Medicine's first one-year degree program and filled a gap in the professional landscape. Professor Ernest Lam, Chair of the Committee on Academic Programs and Policy, reported that AP&P received a similar presentation from Professor Miliotis at its meeting on November 1 and gave unanimous support to the proposal.

Academic Board members engaged in discussion on the proposal, with questions regarding pathways for graduates and the anticipated ease of transition into research-based doctoral programs post-graduation. In response, Professor Trevor Young, Dean of the Faculty of Medicine, indicated that he anticipated students in this program would be eligible to proceed to other studies but that many would be looking to pursue careers immediately after graduation. It was also noted that the list of potential feeder programs did not include the Bachelor of Kinesiology, despite the likelihood of the M.H.Sc. being an attractive second degree for BKin graduates. The Dean of Medicine assured the Dean of the Faculty of Kinesiology and Physical Education and the Board that further conversations at the Council of Health Sciences Deans' table were forthcoming.

Report Number 218 of the Academic Board -- Thursday, November 22, 2018

On a motion duly moved, seconded and carried

YOUR BOARD APPROVED

THAT, subject to confirmation by the Executive Committee

THAT the proposed degree program, Master of Health Science in Medical Physiology (M.H.Sc.), as described in the proposal from the Faculty of Medicine dated September 21, 2018 be approved effective September 1, 2019.

### **OPEN SESSION CONSENT AGENDA**

The Chair notified the Board that the Secretary had received a request to remove three items of business from the Consent Agenda: Item 7a *Provost's Annual Report on Cases of Academic Discipline, 2017-2018*, Item 7b *Semi-Annual Report: Academic Appeals, Committee, Individual Cases, Fall 2018*, and Item 7c *Semi-Annual Report: University of Tribunal, Individual Cases, Fall 2018* to be discussed as part of the regular agenda. Professor Boon, Vice-Provost, Faculty and Academic Life was invited to provide comments as sponsor.

Professor Boon noted that the cases of academic discipline are reported retrospectively to the Board on an annual basis and contain divisional and institutional statistical information. She further noted that a presentation on the educational efforts regarding Academic Integrity from across the University would be given to the Executive Committee on December 4, 2018 and offered to give a similar presentation to Academic Board at a future meeting. The Chair invited discussion from members.

The members noted concern regarding plagiarism and academic integrity in general, with specific comments received regarding the perceived pervasiveness of cheating by undergraduates; the suggestion that education efforts focus on the harm done to fellow students when other students decided to cheat; and the challenges students faced in knowing how and when to report suspected academic dishonesty and promotion on campus by essay mills. Further questions were received on whether cheating occurs more frequently in a particular year of study, such as first year or final year, or whether this was more generalized. Professor Boon noted that instances of cheating occurred in every year without noticeable patterns apart from individuals' poor decision-making. Professor Boon also noted the many tools used by instructors to identify plagiarism and other academic offenses, including new technologies. The Chair thanked members for the robust conversation and Professor Boon reiterated her offer to bring a presentation to the next meeting.

The Board proceeded with the Consent Agenda.

Report Number 218 of the Academic Board -- Thursday, November 22, 2018

On a motion duly moved, seconded, and carried

YOUR BOARD APPROVED THAT

the consent agenda be adopted.

5. **Approval of the Report of the Previous Meeting – [Report Number 217 – October 4, 2018](#)**
6. **Business Arising from the Report of the Previous Meeting**
7. **Items for Information:**
  - a) [Provost's Annual Report on Cases of Academic Discipline 2017-2018\\*](#)
  - b) [Semi-Annual Report: Academic Appeals Committee, Individual Cases, Fall 2018\\*](#)
  - c) [Semi-Annual Report: University Tribunal, Individual Cases, Fall 2018\\*](#)
  - d) [Report Number 247 of Agenda Committee – November 13, 2018\\*](#)
  - e) [Report Number 193 of the Committee on Academic Policy and Programs – November 1, 2018\\*](#)
  - f) [Advisory Committee on the University of Toronto Library System for 2018-19\\*](#)
8. **Date of the Next Meeting – Thursday, January 31, 2019 @ 4:10 to 6:10 p.m.**

**END OF CONSENT AGENDA**

**9. Other Business**

The Chair notified the Board that a new [Status Change Report](#) from the Office of the Vice-President and Provost had been posted on the Academic Board website and encouraged members to review the Report and submit any questions to the Secretary, at least 14 days prior to the next meeting.

**THE BOARD MOVED *IN CAMERA*.**

**10. Quarterly Report on Donations: August 1 to October 31, 2018**

The Board received for information the Quarterly Reports on Donations for the period May 1 to July 31, 2018.

**THE BOARD RETURNED TO OPEN SESSION.**

**The meeting adjourned at 5:40 p.m.**

\_\_\_\_\_  
Secretary

\_\_\_\_\_  
Chair

November 22, 2018