

**UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO**

**THE GOVERNING COUNCIL**

**APRIL 5, 2018**

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE GOVERNING COUNCIL held on April 5, 2018 at 4:30 p.m. in the Council Chamber, Simcoe Hall.

**Present:**

Claire Kennedy (Chair)  
N. Jane Pepino (Vice-Chair)  
Meric S. Gertler (President)  
Cheryl Regehr (Provost)  
Preet Banerjee  
Harvey Botting  
David N. Bowden  
Catherine Bragg  
P.C. Choo  
Jeff P. Collins  
Aidan H. Fishman  
Susan Froom  
Gary D. Goldberg  
Avrum I. Gotlieb  
Mala Kashyap  
Mark Krembil  
Nykolaj Kuryluk  
Normand Labrie  
Ernest W.N. Lam  
Mark Lautens  
Brian D. Lawson  
Jan K. Mahrt-Smith  
Mama Adobea Nii Owoo  
Catherine Riddell  
Andrea M. Sass-Kortsak  
Salvatore M. Spadafora  
Janice Gross Stein  
Andrew Szende  
W. Keith Thomas  
Steven J. Thorpe

Twesh Upadhyaya  
Robert Xu  
Samra Zafar  
Emeli Zhang

Sheree Drummond, Secretary of the  
Governing Council

**Secretariat:**

Mariam Ali  
Cindy Ferencz-Hammond  
Joan Griffen  
Anwar Kazimi  
Patrick McNeill  
Rena Prashad  
Amorell Saunders N'Daw  
David Walders

**Absent:**

Janet L. Ecker  
Amanda Harvey-Sanchez  
Zabeen Hirji  
Paul Kingston  
Mohan Matthen  
John Paul Morgan  
Mark Henry Rowswell  
Howard L. Shearer  
Nicholas Terpstra  
Bruce Winter

**In Attendance:**

Vivek Goel, Vice-President, Research and Innovation  
Angela Hildyard, Vice-President Emeritus  
Ulrich Krull, Vice-President, University of Toronto and Principal, University of Toronto  
Mississauga (UTM)  
Scott Mabury, Vice-President, University Operations

Archana Sridhar, Assistant Provost  
Nadina Jamison, Assistant Vice-President, Strategic Initiatives  
Bryn MacPherson, Assistant Vice President & Chief of Protocol, Office of the President  
Susan McCahan, Vice-Provost, Innovations in Undergraduate Education  
Sioban Nelson, Vice-President Academic Programs and Vice-Provost, Faculty and Academic Life  
Sandy Welsh, Vice-Provost Students

Gwen Burrows, Executive Director, International  
David Cameron, Dean, Faculty of Arts and Science  
Elizabeth Cragg, Director, Office of the Vice-President Operations  
Nora Gillespie, Senior Legal Counsel, Office of Vice-President and Provost  
Randall Hansen, Interim Director, Munk School of Global Affairs  
Diana Kuprel, Director, Alumni Relations and Advancement Communications  
Richard Levin, University Registrar and Executive Director, Enrollment Services  
Peter Loewen, Director, School of Public Policy and Governance  
Daniella Mallinick, Director, Academic Programs, Planning and Quality Assurance  
Margaret McKone, Executive Director, Munk School of Global Affairs  
Terry McQuaid, Executive Director, Personal Safety, High Risk and Sexual Violence Prevention and Support  
Steve Moate, Senior Legal Counsel, Office of the President  
Trevor Rodgers, Executive Director, Planning and Budget  
Anita Srinivasan, Director, Programs and Operations School of Public Policy and Governance  
Meredith Strong, Director, Office of the Vice-Provost, Students and Student Policy Advisor  
Donna Wall, Director, Financial Aid & Awards, Enrolment Services

Dan Acheson, College Of Electors  
Brie Berry-Crossfield, UTGSU  
Robert G. Boeckner, Member, Business Board  
Anne Boucher, President-Elect UTSU  
Paul Lindblad, College Of Electors  
Nikoletta Papadopoulos, College Of Electors  
Mathias Memmel, President UTSU  
Geeta Yadav, Chair, College Of Electors

## **1. Chair's Remarks**

The Chair welcomed members and guests to the meeting. She thanked Professor Scott Mabury for leading the pre-meeting tour of a new laboratory in the Medical Sciences Building and thanked those Governors who were able to attend the tour. A member commended Professor Mabury on the success of the transformation SIF project.

The Chair then drew members' attention to a senior appointment, which had been approved by the Executive Committee at its meeting held on March 27<sup>th</sup>. At that meeting, Professor Lorraine Ferris had been re-appointed to the position of Associate Vice-President, Research Oversight and Compliance for the period of July 1, 2018 to June 30, 2023. The Chair offered her congratulations to

Professor Ferris. Turning to election results, the Chair reminded Governors that, in preparation for the 2017-18 governance year, the Chief Returning Officer, Deputy Returning Officers had been overseeing the elections and appointment processes, and she announced the following appointments and election results:

The following teaching staff members were elected, re-elected or acclaimed, for a three-year term effective July 1, 2018:

- Professor Nicholas Terpstra
- Professor Ron Levi
- Professor Paul Kingston
- Professor Avrum Gotlieb
- Professor Ernest Lam

The following student members were elected or re-elected to serve one year terms effective July 1, 2018:

- Harry Orbach-Miller
- Sandhya Mylabathula
- Edie (Yi Yi) Guo
- Price Amobi Maka
- Litos (Hanze) Li
- Tom Sutherland
- Susan Froom
- Mala Kashyap

The following individual was re-elected as an administrative staff member, effective July 1, 2018:

- Mr. P.C. Choo

And finally, the following individuals were re-elected to the College of Electors, to serve three-year terms, effective July 1, 2018:

- Mr. Andrew Szende
- Mr. Bruce Winter

The Chair congratulated and welcomed both new and returning Governors. She stated that their willingness to contribute to the work of the University was very much appreciated. The Chair also acknowledged the Governors who would not be returning and thanked them for their work, and noted that there would be opportunities to celebrate their contributions before the end of the governance year.

The Chair then offered her thanks to those Governors who were able to attend the ceremony to honour Mr. John Switzer, which was held on March 20<sup>th</sup>. She noted that the ceremony commemorated John's 30-plus years of service to the University and included the dedication of a

plaque with Mr. Switzer's name, which has been affixed to one of the benches directly outside Simcoe Hall. Attendees included Mr. Switzer's family and friends, past and present Governors, former Governing Council Chairs Shirley Hoy and Richard Nunn, President Gertler and President-Emeritus Naylor, members of the Senior Administration and many other staff members. The Chair noted that it was a very fitting tribute to someone who had given so much to the University.

The Chair then drew Governors attention to an op-ed written by Professor Mark Lautens which appeared in the *Globe and Mail* on March 22<sup>nd</sup>. The article had outlined the need for new research strategies in the wake of the release of the Federal Budget. She thanked Professor Lautens for his important contribution to the ongoing discourse on this topic.

Finally, the Chair informed members that one speaking request had been received for the meeting, from Mr. Mathias Memmel, the President of the University of Toronto Students Union (UTSU). The request, to speak to the tuition schedule for publically funded programs for 2018-19, had been granted.

## **2. Report of the President**

### Federal Government

The President began his remarks by discussing Federal government matters. The President focused on Budget 2018 and highlighted the following:

- \$925 million over the next five years had been allocated to the Tri-Councils. The Tri-Councils were to receive an additional \$275 million for a new fund to support research that was “international, inter-disciplinary, fast-breaking and higher-risk.”
- The Canada Research Chairs program was to receive \$210 million over five years with a goal to support early-career researchers.
- The Budget committed \$763 million over five years for scientific research infrastructure through the Canada Foundation for Innovation (CFI) and, most importantly, converted CFI to long-term, stable, base-budget funding.
- \$25 million was earmarked towards increasing diversity in science.

There were also two additional research-related announcements:

- \$572.5 million over five years to implement a Digital Research Infrastructure Strategy to deliver a “more open and equitable access to advanced computing and big data resources to research across Canada.”
- The National Research Council would receive \$540 million over five years to reinforce its own research strengths and enable its role as a collaboration partner with industry and academia.

The President concluded his report on the Budget by commending the Federal government for embracing the recommendations of its Fundamental Science Review panel and the University's

#SupportTheReport advocacy. The unprecedented and unified advocacy in support of the Naylor Report, *Investing in Canada's Future – Strengthening the Foundations of Canadian Research*, had evidently been very effective. He also added that further work remained on seeking support for graduate scholarships and for the Research Support Fund (the indirect costs of research).

### Provincial Matters

The President noted that as the election day of June 7, 2018 approached, the Province had entered a pre-election phase. In its Speech from the Throne, the Provincial government had announced major initiatives including:

- Funding for hospitals
- The expansion of pharmacare
- Increased funding for mental health, including investments in post-secondary education for mental health services, the Career Ready Fund and capital renewal
- Funding for dental care
- Enhancements to the Ontario Student Assistance Program (OSAP).

The University's advocacy efforts would continue to focus on all the political parties in the run-up to the election.

### QS Subject Rankings

Turning to academic rankings, the President reported that, in the recently released QS subject rankings, which ranked institutions in five broad subject areas broken into 48 more specific fields, the University performed exceptionally well:

- 1<sup>st</sup> in Canada in all five subject areas
- 1<sup>st</sup> in Canada in 30 of the 48 specific fields
- Top 10 globally in the following subjects:
  - Nursing (2<sup>nd</sup>)
  - Sports-related subjects (6<sup>th</sup>)
  - Anatomy (8<sup>th</sup>)
  - Anthropology (8<sup>th</sup>)
  - Social policy (8<sup>th</sup>)
  - Theology (8<sup>th</sup>)
  - Geography (9<sup>th</sup>)
  - Computer science (10<sup>th</sup>)

From a global perspective, the University was ranked among the top 50 institutions in 42 of the 48 subjects QS reviewed, an achievement equalled by no other institution in the world. This confirmed the University's extraordinary breadth and depth of academic excellence.

### 3. Tuition Fees and Budget

The Provost, Professor Mabury and Mr. Rodgers offered a joint presentation on tuition fees and the budget, highlighting the following:

- The budget for 2018-19, which was \$2.68 billion, was a balanced budget. Student fees accounted for the majority of revenue (62%). Operating grants continued to decrease. Compensation accounted for the majority of expenses.
- Significant variations existed regarding the growth of divisional expenses within academic divisions, with the average growth being 9.8%.
- The 2018-19 budget priorities included the following:
  - New faculty positions (78 FTE)
  - IT infrastructure and services
  - Student aid and graduate funding packages
  - Experiential learning and international experiences
  - Library acquisitions and services
  - Deferred maintenance, classroom renewal, capital projects
  - Indigenous curricular initiatives and response to the *Truth and Reconciliation Final Report*.
- The University Fund, amounting to \$22.5 million for 2018-19, would be allocated to various initiatives, including access and diversity (\$3.5 million), re-imagining undergraduate education (\$10 million), research and innovation (\$2.5 million) and structural budget support (\$6.5 million)
- Operating grants from the provincial government, as a percentage of overall revenue, had decreased significantly year-over year (44% in 2006-2007 compared to 25% in 2018-19)
- Student aid expenses (reported from 2016-17, the most current available period), were \$192 million, with \$78.1 million of that allotted to bursaries and the University of Toronto Advanced Planning for Students (UTAPS)
- During the same period, expenditures to the Student Access Guarantee (SAG) totalled \$59.9 million. Of that, \$32.5 million were discretionary for students in second-entry programs and for the difference between actual living costs and living costs recognized in the OSAP need assessment
- On average, in 2016-17, students eligible for financial aid paid 47% of their net tuition.

In the discussion that followed, members raised concerns over the cost of tuition. Specific concerns related to tuition costs as a limiting factor to access, that the SAG applied only to full-time domestic students, the fact that student fees were projected to rise by a greater amount than student aid, as well as the high cost of tuition (and wire transfer fees) for international students. Members urged the University to examine alternative sources of funding for students and to continue its lobbying efforts with the Provincial government to secure additional funding.

The Chair thanked members for their comments and noted that the University was conscious of accessibility concerns and discussions on addressing these concerns were ongoing. She noted that, as a general matter, the University's ability to compete with privately-funded peer institutions was remarkable. With respect to the projected rise in the cost of student fees versus student aid, Professor Mabury noted that these were estimates only and that the University was required to meet its obligations under the SAG.

Professor Andrea Sass-Kortsak, Chair of the Academic Board and the Chair of the Business Board, Mr. Keith Thomas, provided overviews of the Boards' deliberation on the Tuition Fees and Budget.

The Chair then invited Mr. Mathias Memmel, President of the UTSU to make remarks.

Mr. Memmel introduced Ms Anne Boucher, the President-Elect of UTSU. Mr. Memmel and Ms Boucher offered joint remarks, raising concerns about rising tuition and accessibility, about the Provincial Governments' commitment to funding post-secondary education and the risk that Ontario universities were becoming increasingly privatized. As the outgoing President of UTSU, Mr. Memmel thanked the senior administration, Governors and university staff for the opportunity to work together.

The Chair thanked Mr. Memmel for his work on behalf of students and noted that he would be missed. The President re-iterated the University's commitment to continued lobbying at the Provincial level to increase funding for post-secondary education. He noted that the University was committed to working in partnership with UTSU to explore efforts to increase provincial funding.

**i. Annual Report on Student Financial Support 2016-17: Vice-Provost, Students (for information)**

The report was received for information.

**ii. Tuition Fee Schedule for Publicly Funded Programs, 2018-19**

On motion duly made, seconded and carried

IT WAS RESOLVED

THAT the 2018-19 tuition fees as described in the *Tuition Fee Schedules for Publicly-Funded Programs, 2018-19 (February 16, 2018)* be approved.

**iii. Tuition Fee Schedule for Self-Funded Programs, 2018-19**

On motion duly made, seconded and carried

IT WAS RESOLVED

THAT the *Tuition Fee Schedule for Self-Funded Programs for 2018-19* be approved.

**iv. Budget Report 2018-19 and Long Range Budget Guidelines 2018-19 to 2022-23 (Arising from Report Number 238 of the Business Board (March 21, 2018) and Report Number 214 of the Academic Board (March 15, 2018))**

On motion duly moved, seconded and carried

IT WAS RESOLVED

THAT the Budget Report, 2018-2019 be approved, and

THAT the Long Range Budget Guidelines 2018-2019 to 2022-2023 be approved in principle.

**4. Faculty of Arts and Science: Proposal for Academic Restructuring: The Amalgamation of the Munk School of Global Affairs and the School of Public Policy and Governance, and the Naming of the amalgamated entity**

Professor Sass-Kortsak provided an overview of the discussion that had occurred at the Academic Board. Dean David Cameron offered comments, noting that proposed amalgamation and naming had been the product of intensive consultation and deliberation. He noted that the proposed amalgamation would capitalize on the strength of each School, both of which were highly successful with excellent track records of student placement with employers.

On motion duly moved, seconded and carried

IT WAS RESOLVED

THAT the proposed amalgamation of the Munk School of Global Affairs and the School of Public Policy and Governance, as described in the attached proposal entitled Proposal for Academic Restructuring: The Amalgamation of the Munk School of Global Affairs and the School of Public Policy and Governance, dated January 29, 2018, be approved, effective July 1, 2018, and

THAT the name of the amalgamated entity be the Munk School of Global Affairs and Public Policy, effective July 1, 2018.

The Chair congratulated Professors Hansen and Loewen on the restructuring and noted that the new Munk School of Global Affairs would capitalize on the strengths of both Schools.



## **CONSENT AGENDA**

On a motion duly made, seconded and carried

IT WAS RESOLVED

THAT the consent agenda be adopted and items approved.

### **5. Minutes of the Previous Meeting of the Governing Council**

The minutes of the May 18, 2017 meeting were approved.

### **6. Business Arising from the Previous Meeting**

There was no business arising from the minutes of the previous meeting.

### **7. Reports for Information**

Members received the following reports for information:

- a. Report Number 205 of the University Affairs Board (March 6, 2018)
- b. Report Number 214 of the Academic Board (March 15, 2018)
- c. Report Number 238 of the Business Board (Special Meeting, March 8, 2018) and Report Number 239 of the Business Board (March 21, 2018)
- d. Report Number 28 of the University of Toronto Scarborough Campus Council (March 7, 2018)
- e. Report Number 28 of the University of Toronto Mississauga Campus Council (March 8, 2018)
- f. Report Number 30 of the Pension Committee (September 18, 2017)
- g. Report Number 494 of the Executive Committee (Special Meeting March 2, 2018) and Report Number 495 of the Executive Committee (March 27, 2018)

## **END OF CONSENT AGENDA**

### **8. Date of Next Meeting**

The Chair advised members that the next Governing Council meeting was scheduled for Thursday, May 17, 2018 from 4:00 p.m. – 6:00 p.m. at the University of Toronto Scarborough.

### **9. Question Period**

There were no questions.

### **10. Other Business**

A member noted the recent passing of Mr. Peter Munk and offered comments on Mr. Munk's contributions to the University, noting that these contributions had enabled many significant

initiatives. The President also offered remarks, noting Mr. Munk's outstanding contributions to the University. The President reported that he had been in touch with Mr. Munk's family to offer condolences on behalf of the University. He also advised the family of the proposal to amalgamate the Munk School of Global Affairs and the School of Public Policy and Governance and rename the new entity the Munk School of Global Affairs and Public Policy. The news had been well received by Mr. Munk's family and the approval of the proposal would be communicated to them.

**The Council moved *in camera***

**11. Members of the Governing Council to the UTSC and UTM Campus Councils and their Standing Committees, 2018-19**

On motion duly made, seconded and carried

IT WAS RESOLVED

THAT the proposed Assignments of members of the Governing Council to the UTSC and UTM Campus Councils and their Standing Committees for 2018-19 be approved.

**The Council moved into open session.**

The meeting adjourned at 5:43 p.m.

---

Secretary

April 6, 2018

---

Chair