

**UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO**

**THE GOVERNING COUNCIL**

**APRIL 4, 2017**

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE GOVERNING COUNCIL held on April 4, 2017 at 4:30 p.m. in the Council Chamber, Simcoe Hall.

**Present:**

Ms Claire Kennedy (in the Chair)  
Professor Meric S. Gertler (President)  
Mr. Mohammad Amin  
Mr. Preet Banerjee  
Mr. Harvey Botting  
Mr. David N. Bowden  
Dr. Catherine Bragg  
Mr. P.C. Choo  
Mr. Jeff P. Collins  
Ms Susan Froom  
Mr. Gary D. Goldberg  
Dr. Avrum I. Gotlieb  
Professor Hugh P. Gunz  
Mr. Mark Krembil  
Mr. Nykolaj Kuryluk  
Professor Ernest W.N. Lam  
Prof. Mark Lautens  
Mr. Brian D. Lawson  
Professor Jan K. Mahrt-Smith  
Ms. Christine Moon  
Mr. David Alex I. Nyikos  
Professor Cheryl Regehr  
Ms Catherine Riddell  
Professor Andrea M. Sass-Kortsak  
Mr. Bingchen (Tony) Shan  
Professor Salvatore M. Spadafora  
Mr. John Switzer  
Mr. Andrew Szende  
Mr. W. Keith Thomas

Professor Steven J. Thorpe  
Mr. Bruce Winter  
Ms. Samra Zafar

Ms. Sheree Drummond, Secretary of the  
Governing Council

**Secretariat:**

Ms Mariam Ali  
Ms Kathy Fellowes  
Mr. Patrick McNeill  
Ms Rena Prashad

**Absent:**

Ms Janet L. Ecker  
Mr. Aidan H. Fishman  
Mrs. Zabeen Hirji  
Ms Shirley Hoy (Chair)  
Mr. Brian K. Johnston  
Prof. Bruce Kidd  
Professor Paul Kingston  
Mr. Jorge May  
Ms Jane Pepino (Vice-Chair)  
Ms Melinda M. Rogers  
Mr. Mark Henry Rowswell  
Mr. Igor Samardzic  
Mr. Howard L. Shearer  
Professor Elizabeth M. Smyth  
Professor Janice Gross Stein  
Professor Nicholas Terpstra

**In Attendance:**

Mr. Robert Xu, Governor-Elect

Mr. David Estok, Vice-President, Communications  
Professor Kelly Hannah Moffat, Vice-President, Human Resources and Equity  
Professor Scott Mabury, Vice-President University Operations  
Mr. David Palmer, Vice-President, Advancement

Ms Nadina Jamison, Assistant Vice-President, Strategic Initiatives  
Ms Bryn MacPherson, Assistant Vice-President & Chief of Protocol

Professor Susan McCahan, Vice-Provost, Innovations in Undergraduate Education  
Professor Sioban Nelson, Vice-Provost, Academic Programs & Faculty and Academic Life  
Ms Marny Scully, Assistant Vice-President, Government, Institutional, and Community Relations  
Ms Archana Sridhar, Assistant Provost  
Professor Sandy Welsh, Vice-Provost, Students

Ms Elizabeth Church, Issues and Media Relations Strategist  
Ms Elizabeth Cragg, Director, Office of the Vice-President, University Operations  
Mr. David Curtin, Director, Communication Services, Office of the President  
Mr. Rafael Eskenazi, Director, Office of the Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy  
Mr. Paul Fraumeni, Executive Director, Digital Creative Services  
Ms Sally Garner, Executive Director, Planning and Budget Office  
Ms Cheryl Gibbs, Assistant Director, Office of the Vice-Provost, Students & Student Policy Advisor  
Ms Nora Gillespie, Senior Legal Counsel, Office of Vice-President and Provost  
Dr. Tony Gray, Director, Strategic Research, Office of the President  
Ms Joan Griffin, Manager, Acting Manager, Student Policy Initiatives & High Risk, Office of the Vice-Provost Students  
Mr. Richard Levin, Executive Director, Enrolment Services & University Registrar  
Ms Terry McQuaid, Executive Director, Personal Safety, High Risk and Sexual Violence Prevention and Support  
Mr. Steve Moate, Senior Legal Counsel, Office of the President  
Ms Meredith Strong, Director, Office of the Vice-Provost, Students & Student Policy Advisor  
Ms Donna Wall, Director, Financial Aid & Awards, Enrolment Services

Ms Nour Alideeb, President, University of Toronto Mississauga Students' Union (UTMSU)  
Mr. Robert G. Boeckner, Member, Business Board  
Ms Brienne Berry-Crossman, Finance and University Governance Commissioner, University of Toronto Graduate Students' Union (UTGSU)  
Ms Trina James, Vice-President, Campus Life, Scarborough Campus Students' Union (SCSU)  
Mr. Matthias Memmel, Vice-President, Internal, UTSU  
Mr. David Poirier, Member, College of Electors  
Mr. Richie Pyne, Association of Part-time Undergraduate Students (APUS)  
Ms Jasmin Wong Denike, President, University of Toronto Students' Union (UTSU)

IN ACCORDANCE WITH A DETERMINATION BY THE EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE, PURSUANT TO SECTION 38 OF BY-LAW NUMBER 2 OF THE GOVERNING COUNCIL, ITEM 11 AND 12 ON THE AGENDA WERE CONSIDERED BY THE GOVERNING COUNCIL *IN CAMERA*.

The Secretary of the Governing Council, Ms Sheree Drummond, advised the Council that the Chair and Vice-Chair of the Council were both unable to attend the meeting. In accordance with section 6 of *By-Law Number 2*, the Chair-Elect, Ms Claire Kennedy, was acclaimed as the Presiding Officer *pro tempore*.

## 1. Chair's Remarks

Ms Kennedy welcomed governors and guests to the meeting. She reminded Governors that, in preparation for the 2017-18 governance year, the Chief Returning Officer, Deputy Returning Officers had been overseeing the elections and appointment processes, and she announced the following appointments and election results:

The following teaching staff members were elected, re-elected or acclaimed to serve three-year terms effective July 1, 2017 to June 30, 2020:

- Professor Mohan Matthen;
- Professor Jan Mahrt-Smith (welcome back); and
- Professor Normand Labrie

The following students had been elected or re-elected to serve one-year terms effective July 1, 2017 to June 30, 2018:

- Ms Mama Adobea Nii Owoo
- Mr. Aidan Fishman
- Ms Susan Froom
- Ms Emeli (Li) Zhang
- Ms Amanda Harvey-Sánchez
- Mr. Robert (Zhi Cheng) Xu
- Mr. Twesh Upadhyaya
- Ms Mala Kashyap

Ms Kennedy announced that Mr. David Bowden, Mr. Gary Goldberg, and Mr. Keith Thomas had been re-elected as alumni governors, each to serve a three-year term effective July 1, 2017 to June 30, 2020.

Four LGIC members had been re-appointed to the Governing Council as follows:

- Ms Janet Ecker for a three-year term, effective March 19, 2017 to March 18, 2020.
- Mr. John Paul Morgan for a three-year term, effective February 26, 2017 to February 25, 2020.
- Mr. Mark Rowsell for a three-year term, effective April 30, 2017 to April 29, 2020.
- Mr. Howard Shearer for a three-year term, effective February 9, 2017 to February 8, 2020.

Ms Kennedy congratulated and welcomed both new and returning Governors. She stated that their willingness to contribute to the work of the University was very much appreciated. The Chair also acknowledged the Governors who would not be returning and thanked them for their work, and noted that there would be opportunities to celebrate their contributions before the end of the governance year.

Turning to the business of the meeting, Ms Kennedy informed governors that the Secretariat had received five speaking requests from non-members to address Governing Council, from the following individuals:

- Mr. Richie Pyne, Vice-President, External, APUS
- Ms Trina James, Vice-President, SCSU
- Ms Jasmine Wong Denike, President, UTSCU, and Mr. Matthias Memmel, Vice-President, Internal, UTSU
- Ms Brianne Berry-Crossfield, Finance and University Governance Commissioner, GSU; and

- Ms Nour Alideeb, President, UTMSU, and Ms Vanessa Demello, Vice-President, University Affairs & Academics, UTMSU

She informed members that all of these speaking requests pertained to agenda items 3 (a.), (b.), (c.), and (d.), and that they had been granted.

In concluding her remarks, Ms Kennedy congratulated the President, on behalf of the Governing Council, on him being awarded an Honorary Degree from Shanghai Jiao Tong University on March 26, 2017.

## **2. Report of the President**

Ms Kennedy invited the President to make his report.

### *Federal Government*

The President reported that on March 22, 2017 the Canadian Federal Budget 2017 was tabled by Finance Minister Bill Morneau. The Budget was originally billed as an “innovation budget”, and although there were significant investments in innovation, new spending on established priorities remained limited. In particular, the Budget maintained funding for research support through the Tri-Councils and Canadian Foundation for Innovation (CFI) at the same level as in 2016 with no new funding proposed. However, \$125M had been invested into the Pan-Canadian Artificial Intelligence Strategy to foster collaborations in Artificial Intelligence (AI) research and education in Toronto-Waterloo, Montreal and Edmonton.

\$950M had been committed to innovation clusters that focused on supporting a small number of business-led innovation “superclusters”, which had the greatest potential to accelerate economic growth. \$221M in new funds, over five years, were to be directed to Mitacs to expand work placements for 10,000 graduate and postdoctoral students; and \$73M was allocated to create up to 8,700 new work-integrated learning opportunities over the next four years. The Budget 2017 also included \$117.6M over eight years for twenty-five Canada 150 Research Chairs to attract and retain internationally distinguished scholars. This funding had been redirected from the Canada Excellence Research Chairs program

### *Other Matters*

The President noted that on March 30, 2017 he had attended two formal announcements relating to the Artificial Intelligence strategy mentioned in the Budget: a Federal announcement in Brampton and the Provincial announcement of the Vector Institute at MaRS Discovery District. The President stated that the Vector Institute was the third recent major research funding success story for the University and the city of Toronto after Medicine by Design and the Ted Rogers Centre for Heart Research. The funding structure for the Vector Institute would include Federal (approximately \$40M) and Provincial (approximately \$50M) government funding and private contributions (\$85M). The President thanked Professor Vivek Goel, Vice-President, Research and Innovation, for his hard work in helping realize the project.

The President reported that he recently had the pleasure of joining His Excellency the Right Honourable David Johnston, Governor General of Canada, and Mr. Thomas Jenkins, Chair and former Chief Executive Officer, Open Text, and Chair, National Research Council, for the launch of their new book, *Ingenious*, which tells the story of hundreds of Canadian innovations. The President remarked that the book contained several accounts of famous University of Toronto stories.

The President shared with governors that Dr. Lewis Kay, a senior scientist in molecular medicine at the University and the Hospital for Sick Children, had been awarded the 2017 Canada Gairdner International Award. The President reported that Dr. Kay was being honoured for his work in biomedical sciences, in particular, for his advances in the field of biomolecular nuclear magnetic resonance (NMR) spectroscopy.

To conclude, the President shared more positive news on university rankings. He reported that *QS World University Rankings* released its 2017 world university rankings by subject. The University improved in twenty of the forty-three subject areas in which it was ranked, maintained rankings in eight subject areas, and declined marginally in twelve subject areas. The University also ranked among the top ten universities in the world in six subjects including: Nursing, Sports-related subjects, Anatomy and Physiology, Geography, Computer Science, and Education. In the March 7<sup>th</sup> *Times Higher Education* story, “Which universities could challenge the higher education elite?” the University was ranked twelfth among fifty-three “international powerhouses”, and fifth among public universities.

In a discussion that followed, a member commented on lab renovations at the University and the issue of asbestos, specifically in the Medical Sciences Building (MSB). Professor Scott Mabury, Vice-President, University Operations, reported that asbestos dust had been found in two locations in the MSB related to the SIF construction project and confirmed that the relationship with the asbestos contractor had been severed. He explained that it was the first asbestos breach in at least ten years. He explained that while two dust samples had been found, asbestos is not generally considered dangerous unless dust or fibers are found in air samples. He said that over 300 air samples had recently been taken in MSB and that no samples had tested positive at or approaching regulatory standards. Professor Mabury explained that he would continue to work with Professor Trevor Young, Dean of the Faculty of Medicine, on ongoing communications with members of the MSB community.

A member asked whether the President and members of his administrative team were involved in discussions involving Victoria College and the City of Toronto on property tax payment matters. The President replied that Victoria College had been engaged in negotiations with the City and that the University would offer assistance and advice where needed.

### **3. Tuition Fees and Budget**

Ms Kennedy invited Mr. Richard Levin, Executive Director, Enrolment Services and University Registrar, to deliver a presentation (appended [here](#)) on student financial aid; this was followed by presentation (appended [here](#)) by Professor Cheryl Regehr, Vice-President and Provost on tuition fees and the University budget. Professor Andrea Sass-Kortsak, Chair of the Academic Board and the Vice-Chair of the Business Board, Mr. Jeff Collins, provided overviews of the Boards’ deliberation on the Tuition Fees and Budget.

*Discussion*

- A member expressed concerns with increasing tuition fees and noted the diminishing support for publically funded education. The member urged the administration and students to work together to lobby the Provincial government for a larger operating grant. The President remarked that the University shared the view that additional government support was required. He said that the Council of Ontario Universities (COU) had a strong message with regard to the need for increased levels of provincial support and that it actively lobbied the Provincial government.
- In response to a comment from a member regarding Graduate student growth plans and associated risks, the Provost replied that the academic budget plans of Divisions has focussed new enrolments on new professional graduate program enrolments, which were highly competitive for admissions. In addition, the President noted that the University had been successful in meeting its graduate enrolment targets in the Strategic Mandate Agreement 1 (SMA 1).
- A member commented on the fact that 64 percent of revenues were generated from student fees suggesting that this seemed very high. The Provost explained that this was similar to other Ontario Universities given that all were affected by the decreasing Provincial operating grants.
- A member asked whether all international student applicants were eligible for the recently announced Lester B. Pearson International Scholarship. Mr. Levin explained that one student per international school (that was listed on the Enrolment Services database) was eligible. He added that all international schools were eligible to register for inclusion on the database.

The Chair invited the non-member speakers whose speaking requests had been granted to make their remarks to the Governing Council.

- Mr. Richie Pyne, Vice-President, (APUS), expressed opposition to the proposed tuition fee increases, which he believed would have the most adverse effects on mature, disabled, and low-income students. Mr. Pyne said that there challenges with regard to grants for low-income students, and he encouraged students and the administration to lobby the Provincial government for increased funding for higher education.
- Ms Trina James, Vice-President, Campus Life, (SCSU), stated that the proposed tuition fee increases made access to higher education more difficult for less privileged students. Ms James commented that many students struggled to manage their academic studies while working to support themselves and their families and to pay for their education. Ms James urged fellow students and the administration to work together to lobby the Provincial government for increased funding for higher education.
- Mr. Matthias Memmel, Vice-President, Internal, UTSU and Ms Jasmine Wong Denike, President, UTSU, stated that the UTSU did not support the proposed the increases to the annual tuition fee schedule. They also expressed concern for the rising tuition fees for international students. In the absence of increased Provincial government funding, they suggested that students and the administration work together to develop solutions that would allow the University to avoid annual tuition fee increases.

- Ms Brianne Berry-Crossman, Finance and University Governance Commissioner, UTGSU, said that the University had the largest proportion of graduate students in Canada and encouraged the administration to keep tuition fees attractive in order to remain competitive. Ms Berry-Grossman expressed her opposition to the proposed tuition fee increases on the basis that they limited access by increasing barriers to higher education.
- Ms Nour Alideeb, President, UTMSU expressed opposition to the proposed tuition fee increases. Ms Alideeb noted that the UTMSU provided bursaries to students who were disproportionately affected by increasing tuition fees. Ms Alideeb suggested that the University strike a committee to assess alternative funding models so as to avoid annual tuition fee increases.

Ms Kennedy and the President thanked the speakers for their comments and for their commitment to access to higher education. The President noted that he shared their concerns with regard to the inadequate levels of Provincial funding indicated that he was in support of students and the administration working together to continue lobbying efforts with the Provincial government. On the topic of accessibility to higher education, the President highlighted that the University was deeply committed to ensuring accessing and that this was evidenced by its progressive student financial aid program--the Student Access Guarantee (SAG).

**a) Annual Report on Student Financial Support 2015-16: Vice-Provost, Students & First Entry Divisions**

The report was received for information.

**b) Tuition Fee Schedule for Publicly Funded Programs, 2017-18** On motion duly moved, seconded and carried

IT WAS RESOLVED

THAT the Tuition Fee Schedule for Publicly-Funded Programs in 2017-18 as described in Tuition Fee Schedule for Publicly-Funded Programs 2017-18 (February 8, 2017) and THAT the tuition fees in 2017-18 and 2018-19 for the special programs identified in Tables B2 and C2 of Appendices B and C of the aforementioned report be approved.

**c) Tuition Fee Schedule for Self-Funded Programs, 2017-18**

On motion duly moved, seconded and carried

IT WAS RESOLVED

THAT the *Tuition Fee Schedule for Self-Funded Programs, 2017-18* be approved.

**d) Budget Report 2017-18 and Long Range Budget Guidelines 2017-18 to 2021-**

On motion duly moved, seconded and carried

IT WAS RESOLVED

THAT the *Budget Report, 2017-2018* be approved, and  
THAT the *Long Range Budget Guidelines 2017-2018 to 2021-2022* be approved in principle.

**4. Capital Project: University of Toronto Mississauga Parking Deck Expansion – Total Project Cost and Sources of Funding**

Professor Sass-Kortsak reported that at the meeting of the Academic Board Professor Mabury informed the Board that there was a significant need for a parking deck expansion given the increase of 1,400 students on the UTM campus and plans for future enrolment growth. Some members of the Board had commented on the increasing cost of parking at the University, but had also expressed support for the University's response to the demand for parking while ensuring that the environmental concerns were taken into consideration.

**CONSENT AGENDA**

On motion duly moved, seconded and carried.

IT WAS RESOLVED

THAT the consent agenda be adopted and item five be approved.

**5. Minutes of the Previous Meeting of the Governing Council**

The minutes of the February 15, 2017 meeting were approved.

**6. Business Arising from the Previous Meeting**

There was no business arising from the minutes of the previous meeting.

**7. Reports for Information**

Members received the following reports for information:

- a) Report Number 208 of the Academic Board (March 16, 2017)
- b) Report Number 231 of the Business Board (February 27, 2017)
- c) Report Number 198 of the University Affairs Board (March 6, 2017)
- d) Report Number 27 of the Pension Committee (December 14, 2016)
- e) Report Number 22 of the University of Toronto Mississauga Campus Council (March 2, 2017)
- f) Report Number 22 of the University of Toronto Scarborough Campus Council (February 2, 2017)
- g) Report Number 23 of the University of Toronto Scarborough Campus Council (March 1, 2017)
- h) Report Number 487 of the Executive Committee (March 28, 2017)

**END OF CONSENT AGENDA**



**8. Date of Next Meeting**

The Chair advised members that the next Governing Council meeting was scheduled for Thursday, May 18, 2017 from 4:30 p.m. – 6:30 p.m. at the University of Toronto Mississauga.

**9. Question Period**

There were no questions.

**10. Other Business**

There was no other business.

**The Council moved *In Camera*.**

**11. Capital Project: University of Toronto Mississauga Parking Deck Expansion – Total Project Cost and Sources of Funding**

On motion duly moved, seconded and carried

IT WAS RESOLVED

THAT the total project costs of the University of Toronto Mississauga Parking Deck Expansion, as funded from the sources and in the amounts outlined in the documentation from the Professor Scott Mabury, Vice-President, University Operations, dated March 21, 2017, be approved.

**12. Members of the Governing Council to the UTSC and UTM Campus Councils and their Standing Committees, 2017-18**

On motion duly moved, seconded and carried

IT WAS RESOLVED

THAT Mr, Jeff Collins, Mr. Nick Kuryluk, Professor Mohan Matthen, and Ms Samra Zafar, be appointed to serve on the University of Toronto Mississauga (UTM) Campus Council from July 1, 2017 to June 30, 2018;

THAT Mr. Kuryluk be appointed to serve on the UTM Campus Affairs Committee from July 1, 2017 to June 30, 2018;

THAT Mr. Preet Banerjee, Ms Catherine Bragg, Professor Paul Kingston, and Mr. John Paul Morgan be appointed to serve on the University of Toronto Scarborough (UTSC) Campus Council from July 1, 2017 to June 30, 2018; and

THAT Ms Bragg and Professor Kingston be appointed to serve on the UTSC Campus Affairs Committee from July 1, 2017 to June 30, 2018.

The Governing Council returned to Open Session.

The meeting adjourned at 6:17 p.m.

\_\_\_\_\_  
Secretary

\_\_\_\_\_  
Chair

April 13, 2017