

**UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO MISSISSAUGA CAMPUS COUNCIL
REPORT NUMBER 15 OF THE ACADEMIC AFFAIRS COMMITTEE**

JANUARY 6, 2016

To the Campus Council,
University of Toronto Mississauga

Your Committee reports that it held a meeting on January 6, 2016 at 4:10 p.m. in the Council Chambers, William G. Davis Building, at which the following were present:

Professor Judith Poë, Chair
Professor Angela Lange, Vice-Chair
Professor Deep Saini, Vice-President &
Principal
Professor Kelly Hannah-Moffat, Interim Vice-
Principal Academic and Dean
Professor Bryan Stewart, Vice-Principal,
Research
Dr. Kelly Akers
Ms Nour Alideeb
Professor Lee Bailey
Dr. Liza Blake
Professor Tracey Bowen
Ms Diane Crocker, Registrar
Professor Charles Elkabas
Ms Elaine Goettler
Ms Shelley Hawrychuk
Dr. Sanja Hinic-Frlog
Dr. Nathan Innocente
Professor Stuart Kamenetsky
Ms Renu Kanga Fonseca
Ms Vanessa Kattar
Professor Bernard Katz
Ms Alice Li
Professor Heather Miller
Mr. Amir Moazzami
Professor Kent Moore
Professor Emmanuel Nikiema
Professor Andrea Olive
Dr. Christoph Richter
Professor Manfred Schneider
Professor Joan Simalchik
Professor Alison Syme
Professor Holger Syme

Mr. Glenn Thompson
Professor Alan Walks
Professor Anthony Wensley
Dr. Liye Xie
Dr. Daniel Zingaro

Non-Voting Assessors:

Ms Jessica Eylon, Program and Curriculum
Officer
Mr. Mark Overton, Dean of Student Affairs

Regrets:

Ms Sarah Amjad
Professor Gordon Anderson
Professor Ron Beiner
Professor Ron Buliung
Professor Norm Farb
Professor Claudiu Gradinaru
Professor Yael Karshon
Professor Anna Korteweg
Mr. Sheldon Leiba
Mr. Leonard Lyn
Ms Stacey Paiva
Mr. Ryan Persaud
Professor Brian Price
Ms Laura Sedra
Professor Sergio Tenenbaum
Professor Mihkel Tombak
Mr. Ian Whyte
Professor Rebecca Wittman
Professor Xiaodong Zhu

In Attendance:

Ms Amanda Borthwick, Medium

Secretariat:

Ms Cindy Ferencz Hammond, Director of Governance, Assistant Secretary of the Governing Council

Ms Mariam Ali, Committee Secretary

1. Chair's Remarks

The Chair welcomed members to the meeting. The Chair welcomed Professor Kelly Hannah-Moffat, to her first meeting as Interim Dean and Vice-President and Principal Deep Saini back from his administrative leave. Professor Saini remarked that during his leave there had been considerable consultation for the development of a future vision and plan for UTM and that the plans would be shared in the coming months. He noted that the draft plans would be shared with the broader UTM community after the appointment of a new Vice-Principal Academic & Dean, and once there would be more information on any potential UTM presence in Brampton. He thanked members for their support and confidence in him as he embarked on his second term.

The Chair reminded members that nominations for elections had opened on January 5 and the deadline to submit was January 15, 2016 and outlined the available positions on the Committee.

2. Recent Graduate Survey Data: Ms Felicity Morgan, Director, Career Centre and Ms Anne Gaiger, Assistant Director, Career Centre

The Chair invited Ms Felicity Morgan, Director, Career Centre and Ms Anne Gaiger, Assistant Director, Career Centre to speak to the Committee about recent Graduate Survey Data. The presentation included the following key points¹:

- The Career Centre conducted a survey of the Class of 2014, where 16.4 percent of the class responded and 99 % were undergraduate students. Of these, 8 % were international students and 21% had international work or study experience;
- Their activities since graduating ranged from professional/graduate school; studies for professional designation, other studies, volunteering, a travel or gap year and working. Ms Morgan noted that overall the majority of students were working full time with a smaller group pursuing further education;
- For those graduates who were employed, there was a diverse cross-section of industries and size of employers. Positions were primarily found through networking, cold calling or a previous employer;
- 77 % of respondents had used Career Centre services for career planning and job searching activities, and emphasized the importance of utilizing these services earlier than in their 4th year. Respondents had also found value in career and work related experiences partnered with academic activities;
- Recommendations for further career development of current students included incorporation of career related assignments into course work, offering career counselling hours within the department, as well as featuring Career Centre content on departmental websites.

In response to a member's question, Mr Morgan advised that the survey had not included a question on whether international students chose to stay in Mississauga after graduating, but that anecdotal evidence suggested that they faced unique challenges, such as obtaining visas. A member commented on the low survey response rate and asked how it could be increased in future. Ms Morgan noted that the Centre had

¹ A copy of the Career Centre presentation is attached as Attachment A.

used modest incentives such as raffle prizes most recently, but would look to employ different tactics, which could potentially boost response rates such as a change in survey structure and timing.

In response to a member's question regarding alumni mentors, Ms Gaiger advised that there was a database of alumni from varying industries who participated with students in external shadowing activities. Ms Gaiger provided examples of professional designations and other studies that graduates had typically enrolled in, such as continuing education courses, Chartered Accountant of Project Management designations. In response to a member's question, Ms Morgan provided examples of career related activities that had been incorporated into course work.

3. Reviews of Academic Programs and Units: Professor Kelly Hannah-Moffat, Interim Vice Principal, Academic & Dean

The Chair noted that the Committee would receive for information and discussion, reviews of academic programs and units consistent with the University of Toronto Quality Assurance process. The reviews were also forwarded to the Committee on Academic Policy and Programs (AP&P) for consideration. The Chair invited Professor Kelly Hannah-Moffat, Interim Vice-Principal Academic & Dean to present the annual report on external reviews of departments and programs for the year 2014-15². Professor Hannah-Moffat informed Committee members that external reviews occurred at intervals of no more than 8 years and were supervised by the provincial Quality Council which was responsible for the auditing process. The role of the reviewers was to determine the quality of the program or department and make recommendations for areas of opportunity for improvement.

For 2014-15, the Department of Geography and the Department of English and Drama were reviewed. Additionally, the MSc Biomedical Communications (BMC) and Master of Management Innovation (MMI) programs were also reviewed.

Professor Hannah-Moffat highlighted the positive elements of the Department of Geography review, which included diverse programs, extremely positive student experiences, active research by faculty and positive internal and external relationships. The areas of opportunity included the following: strengthening industry standard GIS component and software, improve IT and lab spaces, as well as addressing the strain on departmental and faculty resources due to growing student body. In response, updates to the GIS curriculum had been made, which utilized industry standard software, new hires have led to exploration of lab spaces, reassessment of administrative staff duties at peak times and the department identified strategic areas for new hires.

Professor Hannah-Moffat informed members of the positive elements of the Department of English and Drama review, which included excellent curriculum balance between traditional literature and innovative teaching and research, impressive student quality, highly productive faculty researchers and a strong relationship between English and Theatre and Drama Specialist (TDS). The areas of opportunity included the following: deliver more variety in courses, address incidences of student sexist behavior in classrooms and perception of gender inequality among faculty, increase transparency, collaboration and respect with regards to departmental decisions and curriculum planning across faculty ranks, strengthen TDS faculty resources, work towards a stronger sense of community at UTM. In response, the incidences of student sexist behaviour were actively addressed and the UTM Equity and Diversity Officer worked with the department to properly train faculty members in creating safe spaces, while communication lines with students had been opened to ensure reporting of future incidences. Professor Hannah-Moffat noted that

² A copy of the External Review presentation is attached as Attachment B.

some comments on gender equality were not specific to UTM, where eligible female faculty members had all been promoted or were under promotional review and most new hires were women. She added that proactive recruitment to diversify the faculty complement would continue to be a priority. It was also noted that the department Chair had initiated more UTM-based co-curricular events to build a stronger community.

Professor Hannah-Moffat outlined the positive elements of the Biomedical Communications (MScBMC) program review, which noted that the longstanding, excellent interdisciplinary program fills key niche and has had significant impact in terms of high-functioning and highly employable graduates and strong, collaborative faculty research. Also noted was that the demanding, intensive and innovative program attracted strong applicants and had excellent student completion rates and a supportive learning environment in high quality facilities at UTM. The areas of opportunity included the following: explore ways to admit more visual art students, examine expansion to possible doctoral or undergraduate programs, address quality and amount of physical space at Fitzgerald Building, and to enhance internal and external outreach to share research and develop advancement opportunities. In response, the department website would clearly indicate the admission path for visual arts students, the program would discuss the feasibility of a professional doctorate and explore ways of increasing research supervision capacity. It was noted that a new undergraduate program would be developed over the next 1-2 years. To address the quality of physical space, the BMC had moved to a newly renovated space at 263 McCaul St in the fall of 2015.

Professor Hannah-Moffat outlined the positive elements of the Master of Management Innovation (MMI) program review, which noted it was a strong, modern curriculum balanced between sound fundamentals and practical applications and results in impressively high completion rates and high rates of appropriate graduate employment or post-graduate studies shortly after completion. Reviewers also noted that cross-appointed faculty members were committed to the program and carried out high-quality research relevant to the “innovation” mandate. The areas of opportunity included the following: program structure does not include sufficient preparatory sessions or allow for integration of learning at end of program, and noted some missing elements in the curriculum. They also noted the program could address low international student enrolment and increase high quality applicant pool with more recruitment support, and more student support services required in general, as well as faculty members who can liaise with industry. In response, a new internship course was developed after extensive consultation, MMI hired a new staff member to focus on recruitment and career development, and an Associate Director had been appointed to assist with recruitment and new student preparation. Also in the shorter term, an industry advisory board would be created and a longer term plan for a dedicated faculty member for industry relationships would be considered.

In response to a member’s question, Professor Holger Syme, Chair of English & Drama advised that though the TDS had rehearsal of curricular productions at Sheridan, the reviewers did not have purview over Sheridan instructors or classes.

A member asked if addressing sexist behavior and attitudes had been made a priority for all students and departments at UTM. Professor Hannah-Moffat advised that the University was currently addressing issues of sexual violence and sexist behaviors were a component of that. She also noted that all departments were welcome to engage with the Equity and Diversity Officer, and that the collaboration with the department of English & Drama had resulted in the creation of safe spaces, appropriate training and increased communication.

4. Other Business

In response to a member's question, Professor Alison Syme, Chair, Visual Studies advised that the department was currently exploring a Major in Cinema Studies. Professor Kelly Hannah-Moffat added that the introduction of a major would be reviewed externally prior to being considered by governance.

5. Assessors' Report

Processor Hannah-Moffatt advised that during her role as Interim Vice-Principal, Academic and Dean from January 1, 2015 to April 30, 2015, Professor Michael Lettieri would take on the role of Interim Vice-Dean Undergraduate.

Professor Stewart, Vice-Principal Research, advised members that there would be an information session held on January 18th, 3:00 p.m. in Rm. 3130, Council Chambers to provide information on the Canada First Research Excellence Fund (CFREF). He also noted that the Canada Foundation for Innovation would soon release a call for funding proposals for 2017, and the deadline to submit intent would be January 14, 2016.

CONSENT AGENDA

On motion duly moved, seconded, and carried

YOUR COMMITTEE APPROVED

THAT the consent agenda be adopted and that Item 6 - Report of the Previous Meeting, be approved.

6. Report of the Previous Meeting: Report 14 – November 18, 2015

7. Business Arising from the Report of the Previous Meeting

There was no business arising from the report of the previous meeting.

8. Date of the Next Meeting – Wednesday, February 10, 2016 at 4:10 p.m.

The meeting adjourned at 5:13 p.m.

Secretary
January 14, 2016

Chair

Recent Graduate Survey of the Class of 2014

Presented January 6, 2016




UTM Career Centre


- **Mission:** To engage students in the career development process throughout their time at UTM and two years after graduation


As career educators, the UTM Career Centre helps students and recent graduates to:


- **Make career & academic plans, based on self-knowledge & career information**
- **Identify & seek relevant experience and relevant network connections during & after UTM**
- **Learn the process of lifelong career management**



	<h2 style="text-align: center;">Career Centre Context</h2> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Rapidly changing world: globalization, technology, high youth unemployment and underemployment in Canada ▪ Students require assistance in exploring themselves and their career options ▪ Information needed: career requirements, labour market info, employer requirements plus assistance making sense of all this ▪ Students require skills in job searching, networking, professional behaviours, along with opportunities to interact with professionals and experiential learning opportunities
	

	<h2 style="text-align: center;">Respondent Information</h2> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ 347 out of 2117 Class of 2014 graduates responded during July 2015 (16.4% response rate) ▪ 99% of respondents were undergraduates ▪ 84% graduated in June 2014, 16% graduated in November 2014 ▪ Response rate by degree was proportional to graduating class ▪ 8% were international students; 21% had international work or study experience
	

	<p>Activities Since Graduating (multiple options possible)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ 32% professional/graduate school ▪ 22% studies for professional designation ▪ 15% other studies ▪ 35% volunteering ▪ 17% travel/gap year ▪ 59% working <p>Summer 2015 Snapshot: majority working full-time; some unemployed; smaller group pursuing further education</p>
	

	<p>Information for Employed Respondents</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Found position through: networking/cold calling/previous employer 50.8%; online job boards 32.6% • Salary: of those working full-time, 50% are earning \$30,000-50,000; 29% are earning over \$50,000 • 67% felt their current positions was related to their program of study • 73% felt their current position was related to their career goals
	

Skills Compared


Developed at University	Important in Career
Critical Thinking	Communication
Analytical Skills	Organizational Skills
Communication	Interpersonal Skills
Organizational Skills	Critical Thinking
Interpersonal Skills	Analytical Skills

UTM
CAREER CENTRE

Graduates' Feedback

- 77% used Career Centre services
- Value of Career Centre for preparing them for their career, both in career planning and job searching activities
- Importance of preparation throughout university; don't wait until 4th year theme
- Value of career "work" partnered with academic activities
- Need for career information and connections with the appropriate industry professionals

UTM
CAREER CENTRE

	<h2 style="margin: 0;">Conclusions</h2> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Graduates are pursuing activities to help them reach their career goals; some challenges • Graduates are developing key skills during their university studies that are related to their careers; many see relationship between studies and career • Methods of finding employment reflect the importance of developing networking skills • Graduates' comments indicated the importance of career preparation and value of engagement both inside and outside the classroom
	

	<h2 style="margin: 0;">Recommendations for Furthering Career Development of our Students</h2> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Where applicable, incorporate career related assignments into course work; the Career Centre can assist • Offer Career Counselling hours in your department (provided by the Career Centre) • Partner with Career Centre to offer networking and career exploration events • Feature Careers by Major on your site • Career Centre staff can attend departmental meetings to share information and hear your questions
	

External Reviews of Departments and Programs 2014-15

Annual Report from Kelly Hannah-Moffat, Interim
Vice-Principal Academic & Dean to the Academic
Affairs Committee

January 6, 2016



Quality Assurance Framework

- Quality Assurance Framework is now in its sixth year.
- External reviews, governed by this framework, occur at intervals of no more than 8 years.
- Supervised by the provincial Quality Council, which is responsible for auditing the process.



Role of External Reviewers

- External reviewers are chosen on the basis of administrative experience and wide-respect within their fields. We typically choose one Canadian and one U.S. reviewer.
- They assist in determining the quality of the program or department, make recommendations for improvement, and raise any significant areas of concern.
- Often external reviews coincide with a chair's end of term and help shape the mandate for the new chair.

External Review Process

- Preparation and submission of internal self-study by program director or departmental chair in context of widespread consultation with faculty, staff, cognate units and students.
- Templates and much of the data to be used in self-study provided centrally. Programs, research, teaching, governance and plans for the future to be discussed, along with measures of quality to assess the program or department against national and international peers.
- External reviewers (typically 2 for a department and 3 for a program) visit campus for two days and prepare their report for the Dean. Important that report provides detailed evaluation of programs and curriculum.

Response to the External Review

- Department chair or program director checks external review for any inaccuracies.
- The external review is forwarded to the provost's office. Provost provides summary and writes request for decanal response. Dean consults with program director/chair in preparing response.
- Review summary and decanal response are shared not only with Academic Affairs and Campus Council but also with the Committee on Academic Policy & Programs (AP&P), and Academic Board.

2014-15 Reviews

Departments

Department of Geography

Department of English and Drama

Programs

MSc Biomedical Communications (BMC)

Master of Management Innovation (MMI)

Geography

- Visit January 7-8, 2015
- Review Team
 - Professor Sara McLafferty, University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign
 - Professor Martin Sharp, University of Alberta
- Chair in 2014-15: Professor Kathi Wilson

Major Findings- Positive Elements

- Diverse programs closely aligned with University's mission, with well-designed curricula and exceptional commitment to excellence in teaching and pedagogical innovation, notably outstanding experiential learning
- Extremely positive student experiences
- Faculty are active researchers and make strong contributions to their field and are leaders in publications on pedagogy and assessment
- "Positive and effective internal and external relationships" one of the most impressive strengths

Opportunities for enhancement

- Strengthen GIS component with clearer course sequence, industry-standard software and improved IT
- Improve lab space to continue efforts to develop physical geography as an area of excellence
- Address strain on departmental and faculty resources, resulting from growing student body, in terms of experiential learning support, writing skill development and advising

Response to review

- Updates to GIS curriculum with a foundation course and senior statistics course, both using industry-standard software
- New hires have strengthened physical geography and possible wet and dry lab spaces being explored
- Discipline-specific projects to improve writing and numeracy skills will continue to be funded
- Reassess administrative staff duties at peak times and monitor staffing levels to ensure needs are met
- Department identified strategic areas for new hires

English and Drama

- Visit March 5-6, 2015
- Review Team
 - Professor Christopher Innes, York University
 - Professor Cynthia Wall, University of Virginia
- Chair in 2014-15: Professor Holger Syme

Major Findings – Positive Elements

- Excellent curriculum balances traditional literature and innovative teaching and research
- Impressive student quality (notably in English and Theatre and Drama Studies specialist programs), and significant proportion of Specialist students and high completion rates
- Highly productive faculty researchers who are leaders in their field and consistently awarded significant external research grants
- Strong relationship between English and TDS

Opportunities for Enhancement

- Deliver greater variety of courses, providing more coverage in Canadian and aboriginal literature in English and directing and playwriting in TDS
- Address incidences of student sexist behaviour in classrooms and perception of gender inequality among faculty
- Increase transparency, collaboration and respect with regard to departmental decisions and curriculum planning across faculty ranks
- Strengthen and increase TDS faculty complement and support staff resources
- Work towards a stronger sense of community at UTM

Response – Inequality and Diversity

- The incidences of student sexist behaviour have been actively addressed and the UTM Equity and Diversity Officer is working with the department to properly train faculty members in creating safe spaces, while communication lines with students have been opened to ensure reporting of future incidences
- Some comments on gender equality were not specific to UTM, where eligible female faculty members have all been promoted or are under promotional review and most new hires are women
- Proactive recruitment to diversify the faculty complement will continue to be a priority

Response - General

- Canadian literature is well addressed in the course offerings and faculty complement for a department of this size
- The Chair has initiated more UTM-based co-curricular events to build a stronger community and faculty members have begun using the Deerfield Bistro as a weekly gathering place
- Through more transparency and collaboration, the Chair will address the reviewer's suggestion of a more UTM-centric curriculum, taking into consideration differing opinions from faculty members

Biomedical Communications (MScBMC)

- Visit February 25-26, 2015
- Review Team
 - Professor Steven Harrison, Georgia Regents University
 - Professor Bonnie Sadler Takach, University of Alberta
 - Professor Nadine Wathen, Western University
- Director in 2014-15: Professor Nick Woolridge

Major Findings - Positive Elements

- Longstanding and excellent interdisciplinary program fills key niche and has significant impact in terms of “high-functioning and highly employable” graduates and strong, collaborative faculty research
- Demanding, intensive and innovative program that attracts strong applicants and has excellent student completion rates
- Supportive learning environment in high quality facilities at UTM

Opportunities for enhancement

- Explore ways to admit more students with visual arts backgrounds
- Examine expansion to possible doctoral or undergraduate programs
- Address quality and amount of physical space at Fitzgerald Building
- Enhance internal and external outreach to share research and develop advancement opportunities

Response to review

- The MScBMC website will soon clearly indicate admission path for visual arts students
- The program will discuss the feasibility of a professional doctorate and also to explore ways of increasing research supervision capacity
- A new undergraduate program will be developed over the next 1-2 years
- BMC moved to a newly renovated space at 263 McCaul St in fall 2015, leaving the substandard Fitzgerald space

Master of Management Innovation (MMI)

- Visit December 8-9, 2014
- Review Team
 - Professor Peter Thompson, Scheller College of Business, Georgia Institute of Technology
 - Professor Barton H. Hamilton, Olin Business School, Washington University in St. Louis
 - Professor Thomas Ross, Sauder School of Business, University of British Columbia
- Director in 2014-15: Professor Alberto Galasso

Major Findings - Positive Elements

- Strong, modern curriculum balanced between sound fundamentals and practical applications in a 12-month program that allows for customization and results in impressively high completion rates and high rates of appropriate graduate employment or post-graduate studies shortly after completion
- Cross-appointed faculty members committed to the program and carrying out high-quality research relevant to the “innovation” mandate

Opportunities for enhancement

- Program structure does not include sufficient preparatory sessions or allow for integration of learning at end of program, and curriculum missing Business Ethics and Creativity in Decision Making
- Could address low international student enrolment and increase high quality applicant pool with more recruitment support, and more student support services required in general
- Program would benefit from faculty member who can liaise with industry

Response to review

- Consultations with students, instructors and alumni undertaken and new internship course developed and received governance approval
- MMI has hired a new staff member to focus on recruitment and career development, and recruitment will build cohort gradually to ensure quality applicants
- Associate Director appointed to assist with recruitment and new student preparation
- In the shorter term, an industry advisory board will be created and a longer term plan for a dedicated faculty member for industry relationships is being considered