#### UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

#### THE GOVERNING COUNCIL

#### **REPORT NUMBER 456 OF**

#### THE EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE

#### Monday, June 17, 2013

To the Governing Council, University of Toronto.

Your Committee reports that it held a meeting on Monday, June 17, 2013 at 5:00 p.m. in the Boardroom, Simcoe Hall, with the following members present:

Mr. Richard Nunn, Chair	Dr. Gary P. Mooney
Ms Judy Goldring, Vice-Chair	Ms N. Jane Pepino
Professor David Naylor, President	Professor Elizabeth M. Smyth
Mr. P. C. Choo	Ms Maureen J. Somerville
Mr. Andrew Girgis	Mr. Chirag Variawa*
Professor William Gough	
Professor Edward Iacobucci	Non-Voting Member:
Mr. Nykolaj Kuryluk	Mr. Louis R. Charpentier, Secretary of the
	Governing Council
Regrets:	
Mr. Brent S. Belzberg	Secretariat:
	Ms Mae-Yu Tan

#### In Attendance:

Professor Ellen Hodnett, Chair, Academic Board and Member of the Governing Council\*
Professor Cheryl Misak, Vice-President and Provost and Member of the Governing Council
Mr. John Switzer, Chair, Business Board and Member of the Governing Council
Ms B. Elizabeth Vosburgh, Chair, University Affairs Board and Member of the Governing Council
Professor Scott Mabury, Vice-President, University Operations

Ms Sheree Drummond, Deputy Secretary of the Governing Council

Mr. Chris Lang, Director, Appeals, Discipline and Faculty Grievances\*\*

Mr. Steve Moate, Senior Legal Counsel+

\* Participated by teleconference.

\*\* In attendance for Item 12.

+ In attendance for Item 2d.

The Committee moved in camera.

With the agreement of members, the agenda was varied to consider Item 16c, External Appointments to the Sunnybrook Health Sciences Centre Board of Directors, first.

On motion duly moved, seconded, and carried,

IT WAS RESOLVED

THAT, subject to approval by the Board of Directors of the Sunnybrook Health Sciences Centre, the following individuals be re-appointed to the Board of Directors of the Sunnybrook Health Sciences Centre, for terms effective June 17, 2013 to continue until the 2014 Annual General Meeting of the Corporation, or until their successors are appointed:

Mr. David Agnew Mr. Phillip Crawley Ms Pamela Griffith-Jones Ms Helen Hayward Ms Elizabeth A. Martin Ms Malen S. Ng Ms Susan M. Scace Ms Marcia B. Visser

The Committee moved to closed session.

#### **1.** Report of the President

The President noted that the convocation season was well underway and he spoke of the remarkable honorary graduands and convocation speakers who were participating this spring. There had been very high attendance rates from divisions on all three campuses. Graduates with whom the President had spoken had given many positive comments about their experience at the University. The President thanked governors for attending a number of the convocation ceremonies.

The President said that the University's *Boundless* Campaign was proceeding very well, with over \$1.3 billion in funds raised to date. This was a milestone achievement following a recordbreaking year.

The Committee moved in camera.

The President briefed the Committee on some confidential matters.

The Committee returned to closed session.

The Committee unanimously thanked Professor Mabury for the leadership he had demonstrated in managing the back campus field matter.

#### 2. Items for Endorsement and Forwarding to the Governing Council

The Chair informed members that a number of speaking requests had been received for the meeting. Two of the requests (from the Scarborough Campus Students' Union (SCSU) and the University of Toronto Mississauga Students' Union (UTMSU)) had been to address the Executive Committee on Item 2(a) - *Procedures for Non-Members to Address Governing Council, its Boards and Committees.* Four groups (SCSU, UTMSU, the Association of Part-time Undergraduate Students (APUS), and the University of Toronto Students' Union (SAC/UTSU)) had asked to address the Committee on Item 2(d) – the Agreement for the Student Commons at 230 College Street. It was not normal practice for non-governors to address the Committee, and their requests had been denied. However, the groups had been advised that their requests would be considered for the June 27, 2013 meeting of the Governing Council. Following discussion, the Executive Committee decided to allow the SCSU and the UTMSU to speak on June 27<sup>th</sup> on the *Procedures for Non-Members to Address Governing Council, its Boards and Committees.* Consideration of the other requests to address Governing Council, including a few more that had been submitted shortly before the meeting, was postponed until discussion of the Student Commons' Agreement had occurred.

#### a) <u>Procedures for Non-Members to Address Governing Council, its Boards and</u> <u>Committees - Proposed Revisions</u>

Mr. Charpentier stated that, in 1995, the Governing Council had revised the *Procedures* to include examples of representative campus groups that would normally be granted permission to address the Governing Council or its bodies. The examples listed in the *Procedures* included "...UTFA, UTSA, APUS, GSU, and SAC". The current proposal was to codify practice by adding UTMSU and SCSU to the list of examples.

On motion duly moved, seconded and carried,

## YOUR COMMITTEE APPROVED

THAT the following recommendation be endorsed and forwarded to the Governing Council:

THAT the proposed revision to the *Procedures for Non-Members to Address Governing Council, its Boards and Committees* to update the list of examples of representative campus groups to include the University of Toronto Mississauga Students' Union (UTMSU) and the Scarborough Campus Students' Union (SCSU) be approved, effective immediately, replacing the *Procedures* approved by the Governing Council on March 9, 1995.

#### 2. Items for Endorsement and Forwarding to the Governing Council (cont'd)

#### b) <u>Proposal for the Disestablishment of the Dalla Lana School of Public Health as an</u> <u>Extra-Departmental Unit A in the Faculty of Medicine and its Establishment as a</u> <u>Faculty</u>

Professor Hodnett outlined the historic proposal for the establishment of a new Faculty and summarized the discussion that had taken place at the Academic Board meeting.<sup>1</sup>

On motion duly moved, seconded and carried,

#### YOUR COMMITTEE APPROVED

THAT the following recommendation be endorsed and forwarded to the Governing Council:

THAT the Dalla Lana School of Public Health be disestablished as an Extra-Departmental Unit A in the Faculty of Medicine and be re-established as a Faculty, retaining its current name, effective July 1, 2013.

#### c) <u>Proposal for Dalla Lana School of Public Health Representatives on the Governing</u> <u>Council and Academic Board</u>

Professor Gough provided an overview of the proposal for representation of Dalla Lana School of Public Health teaching staff on the Governing Council and the Academic Board. This would need to be contemplated if the Governing Council approved the proposal for the establishment of the new Faculty. To date, the Dalla Lana School had been included in the Faculty of Medicine teaching staff constituency for both the Governing Council and the Academic Board. Professor Gough reported that the Elections Committee had considered the matter and had recommended that the Dean/Director of the Dalla Lana School serve as an *ex officio* member of the Academic Board, effective July 1, 2013 and that one seat for an elected teaching staff member of the Dalla Lana School on the Academic Board be added, effective July 1, 2013. Such changes would allow for representation similar to that of other Faculties based on the principle of having broadly-based representation from each academic division on the Academic Board. Professor Gough advised that the Elections Committee had also recommended an interim solution whereby the Dalla Lana School would continue to be included in the Faculty of Medicine teaching staff constituency of Governing Council seats until such time as the Governing Council had had the opportunity to consider proposals for the redistribution of the teaching staff seats.

<sup>1</sup><u>http://www.governingcouncil.utoronto.ca/Assets/Governing+Council+Digital+Assets/Boards+and+Committees/Academic+Board/2012-2013+Academic+Year/r0603.pdf</u>

#### 2. Items for Endorsement and Forwarding to the Governing Council (cont'd)

#### c) Proposal for Dalla Lana School of Public Health Representatives on the Governing Council and Academic Board (cont'd)

On motion duly moved, seconded and carried,

#### YOUR COMMITTEE APPROVED

THAT the following recommendation be endorsed and forwarded to the Governing Council:

- 1) That the Dean/Director of the Dalla Lana School of Public Health serve as an *ex officio* member of the Academic Board, effective July 1, 2013;
- 2) That one seat for an elected teaching staff member of the Dalla Lana School of Public Health on the Academic Board be added, effective July 1, 2013; and
- 3) That the Dalla Lana School of Public Health continue to be included in the Faculty of Medicine constituency of Governing Council seats until such time as the Governing Council has had the opportunity to consider proposals for the redistribution of the teaching staff seats.

#### 2(d) Agreement for the Student Commons at 230 College Street; 2(e) Capital Project: Report of the Project Planning Committee for the Student Commons at 230 College Street; and14(a) Student Commons Capital Project at 230 College Street – Sources of Funding and Total Project Cost

Professor Hodnett reported on the Academic Board's deliberations on the Agreement for the Student Commons at 230 College Street. She reminded members that, in 2011, the University of Toronto Students' Union (UTSU) and the University had agreed that the 230 College Street location would be better than the site originally proposed for the Student Commons on Devonshire Place, and discussions proceeded for the new site. The site would provide for an expanded range of high-quality spaces for student-led activities. At the Board meeting, Professor Misak had introduced the Agreement, noting that it was the outcome of many years' work on the part of both the students and the University. She had explained that the Agreement took into account a number of scenarios, including allowances for termination of the Agreement in the event that the Students' Administrative Council (SAC / UTSU) either no longer existed or was no longer the representative of full-time undergraduate students on the St. George campus. Professor Misak had spoken to the referenda in which some student societies voted to divert their fees away from UTSU. She briefly outlined the most recent disputes among some student societies and had expressed her hope that there would be an agreement amongst the

- 2. Items for Endorsement and Forwarding to the Governing Council (cont'd)
- 2(d) Agreement for the Student Commons at 230 College Street; 2(e) Capital Project: Report of the Project Planning Committee for the Student Commons at 230 College Street; and14(a) Student Commons Capital Project at 230 College Street – Sources of Funding and Total Project Cost (cont'd)

student societies about the issues. Following the discussion, the Board had accepted the recommendation of the Planning and Budget Committee and recommended approval of the agreement.

Professor Misak briefed the Committee on the discussion, facilitated by Professor Brian Langille from the Faculty of Law, between the student groups that had occurred on June 6, 2013. [The student groups were UTSU, the Engineering Society (EngSoc), Trinity College Meeting (TCM) and Victoria University Students' Administrative Council (VUSAC).] Although the parties had failed to come to an agreement, there had been some progress toward clarifying the issues. As a result, the administration, with the agreement of the students, would be putting in place a process whereby members of the administration would be more involved in guiding the process toward a resolution of the questions raised by the fee diversion referenda and the longstanding concerns about electoral reform within UTSU.

At the meetings of the Planning and Budget Committee and of the Academic and University Affairs Boards members had inquired about the implications of proceeding with approval of the capital project and the operating agreement at this time, given the ongoing dispute among UTSU, EngSoc, TCM and VUSAC. Those concerns had been echoed by governors at the information session held on June 10th at which the Provost and representatives from the student groups had presented their perspectives on the fee diversion referenda. The Chair invited the Provost to clarify the implications of approving the operating agreement in light of these circumstances.

Professor Misak explained that the management agreement was predicated on the existence of a single representative body for all undergraduate students on the St. George campus. Modelled on the University's agreement with the Scarborough College Students' Union (SCSU), the 50-year management agreement had taken seven years to negotiate. In the present context, it was not unreasonable to query the viability of the current single representative – SAC / UTSU – especially in considering approval of such a long-term commitment. She emphasized, however, that the student groups had asserted their shared commitment to working with her office towards a resolution. In her view, the process could result in various outcomes, two of which might be: a recommendation to revise the existing Policy on Compulsory Non-academic Incidental Fees or significant reforms within UTSU. The former would require negotiating a new management agreement; the latter would mean that proposed agreement could be proceed.

In discussion, Executive Committee members noted the support of the Planning and Budget Committee and that of the Academic and University Affairs Boards for the capital project, but expressed reservations about recommending approval of the management agreement in the absence of a resolution to, or further clarity regarding, the questions arising from the continuing

- 2. Items for Endorsement and Forwarding to the Governing Council (cont'd)
- 2(d) Agreement for the Student Commons at 230 College Street; 2(e) Capital Project: Report of the Project Planning Committee for the Student Commons at 230 College Street; and14(a) Student Commons Capital Project at 230 College Street – Sources of Funding and Total Project Cost (cont'd)

discussion of UTSU's democratic reform and divisional societies' fee diversion referenda. In considering its decision, the Executive Committee sought legal advice regarding the interpretation of the proposed Agreement, and regarding the potential intersection of disputes among the student societies with structure of the Agreement.

In light of all of the above, members expressed the view that to put the items forward to Governing Council for consideration at its next meeting would be premature, and that it would be more prudent to defer consideration to a future cycle once the disputes have been resolved or constructively dealt with through the deliberations to be facilitated by the Provost. Members emphasized, however, that this was an important initiative that should ultimately receive support once the current uncertainties were resolved or clarified

On a motion duly moved, seconded and carried,

#### YOUR COMMITTEE APPROVED

THAT the proposed Student Commons Agreement, as outlined in the memorandum dated May 1, 2013 from the Vice-President and Provost, and the Project Planning Committee Report for the Student Commons at 230 College Street, dated April 16, 2013, be brought back to the Executive Committee for consideration for inclusion on a Governing Council meeting agenda within a reasonable time during which issues among the Students' Administrative Council (SAC / UTSU) and various divisional student societies, which may impinge on aspects of the Student Commons Agreement, may be further discussed and satisfactorily resolved or constructively dealt with by the societies and the Administration.

#### 2. Items for Endorsement and Forwarding to the Governing Council (cont'd)

#### f) **Capital Project: Report of the Project Planning Committee for the Ramsay Wright Building Teaching Laboratories Upgrades**

Professor Hodnett introduced the proposal for upgrades to the Ramsay Wright Building Teaching Laboratories and summarized the discussion that had taken place at the Academic Board meeting.<sup>2</sup>

On motion duly moved, seconded and carried,

#### YOUR COMMITTEE APPROVED

THAT the following recommendation be endorsed and forwarded to the Governing Council:

- 1. THAT the Project Planning Committee Report for the Ramsay Wright Building Teaching Laboratories Upgrades, dated April 29, 2013, be approved in principle; and
- 2. THAT the total project scope of approximately 7, 800 gross square metres (approximately 3, 846 nasm), be approved in principle, to be funded by the Faculty of Arts and Science, Graduate Expansion Funds and borrowing.

## **CONSENT AGENDA**

On motion duly moved, seconded, and carried,

#### YOUR COMMITTEE APPROVED

THAT the consent agenda be adopted and that the items be approved.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup>http://www.governingcouncil.utoronto.ca/Assets/Governing+Council+Digital+Assets/Boards+and+Committees/Ac ademic+Board/2012-2013+Academic+Year/r0603.pdf

#### CONSENT AGENDA (cont'd)

#### **3.** Items for Confirmation by the Executive Committee

a) Transfer of the Visual Studies Programs from the Department of Art in the Faculty of Arts and Science to the John H. Daniels Faculty of Architecture, Landscape and Design

On motion duly moved, seconded, and carried,

#### IT WAS RESOLVED

THAT the transfer of the Honours Bachelor of Arts Specialist, Major, and Minor Programs in Visual Studies and the Master of Visual Studies Programs from the Faculty of Arts and Science to the John H. Daniels Faculty of Architecture, Landscape, and Design be approved, effective July 1, 2013.

#### b) Constitutional Amendments - Joseph L. Rotman School of Management

On motion duly moved, seconded, and carried,

#### IT WAS RESOLVED

THAT, subject to confirmation by the Executive Committee, the amended Constitution of the Joseph L. Rotman School of Management, approved by the Rotman Council on February 27, 2013, be approved.

# c) Capital Project: Report of the Project Planning Committee for the Relocation of the Department of Nutritional Sciences to the Toronto Medical Discovery Tower

On motion duly moved, seconded, and carried,

#### IT WAS RESOLVED

- 1. THAT the Project Planning Committee Report, dated April 24, 2013, for the planning, renovation and relocation of the Department of Nutritional Sciences from the FitzGerald building to two floors of the Toronto Medical Discovery District Tower at MaRS Discovery District 2, 835 nasm (5, 076 rentable square meters) be approved in principle; and
- 2. THAT the project scope as identified in the Project Planning Committee Report be approved in principle to be funded by a combination of Graduate Expansion Funds and Capital Campaign funds to be raised.

#### **CONSENT AGENDA** (cont'd)

#### 4. Item for Endorsement and Forwarding to the Governing Council

#### a) Summer Executive Authority

On motion duly moved, seconded, and carried,

#### IT WAS RESOLVED

THAT the following recommendation be endorsed and forwarded to the Governing Council:

- 1. THAT until the next regular meeting of the Governing Council or its appropriate committee or board, authority be granted to the President for:
  - (i) appointments to categories 2,<sup>3</sup> 3,<sup>4</sup> and 5<sup>5</sup> of the *Policy on Appointments* and *Remuneration* approved by the Governing Council of the University of Toronto, dated May 30, 2007;<sup>6</sup>
  - (ii) approval of such additional curriculum changes as may arise for the summer and September 2013; and
  - (iii)decisions on other matters the urgency of which does not permit their deferral until the next regular meeting of the Governing Council or its appropriate standing committee or board.
- 2. THAT all actions taken under this authority be approved by the Chair of the Governing Council prior to implementation and reported to the appropriate committee or board for information.

#### 5. Report of the Previous Meeting of the Executive Committee

Report Number 455 (May 13, 2013) of the Executive Committee was approved.

#### 6. Business Arising from the Reports of the Previous Meetings

There was no business arising from the report of the previous meeting.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Category 2 includes the positions of Vice-President, Secretary of the Governing Council, and University Ombudsperson, which are subject to the approval of the Governing Council.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Category 3 includes the positions of Deputy Provost, Associate and Vice-Provosts, Chief Financial Officer, Senior Legal Counsel and Deputy Secretary of the Governing Council, which are subject to the approval of the Executive Committee, and are reported for information to the Governing Council.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Category 5 includes the head of Internal Audit (approved by the Business Board) and the Warden of Hart House (approved by the University Affairs Board); such appointments are reported for information to the Governing Council.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Approval of Academic Administrative Appointments until the next regular meeting of the Agenda Committee of the Academic Board shall be approved by electronic ballot and shall require the response of at least five members of the Agenda Committee.

#### **CONSENT AGENDA** (cont'd)

#### 7. Minutes of the Governing Council Meeting - May 23, 2013

The minutes of the Governing Council meeting were received for information.

#### 8. Business Arising from the Minutes of the Governing Council Meeting

There was no business arising from the Minutes of the May 23<sup>rd</sup> meeting.

#### 9. **Reports for Information**

Members received the following reports for information.

- a) Report Number 186 of the Academic Board (June 3, 2013)
- b) Report Number 176 of the University Affairs Board (May 28, 2013)
- c) Report Number 10 of the Pension Committee (March 20, 2013)

#### END OF CONSENT AGENDA

**10.** Date of Next Meeting – Thursday, June 27, 2013 from 3:00 to 4:00 p.m.

#### 11. Other Business

There were no items of other business.

The Committee moved *in camera*.

#### 12. Code of Behaviour on Academic Matters: Recommendations for Expulsion

On motion duly moved, seconded, and carried,

#### YOUR COMMITTEE APPROVED

THAT the President's two recommendations for expulsion, as outlined in the memoranda and supporting documentation from the Secretary of the Governing Council, dated May 24, 2013, be confirmed.

#### **13.** Senior Appointment

On motion duly moved, seconded, and carried,

#### IT WAS RESOLVED

THAT Professor Sioban Nelson be appointed as Vice-Provost, Academic Programs, for a five-year term from August 1, 2013 to July 31, 2018.

#### 14. Items for Endorsement and Forwarding to the Governing Council

#### b) Ramsay Wright Building Teaching Laboratories Upgrades – Sources of Funding and Total Project Cost

On motion duly moved, seconded, and carried,

#### IT WAS RESOLVED

THAT the following recommendation be endorsed and forwarded to the Governing Council:

THAT the recommendation regarding the proposed upgrades of the Ramsay Wright Building Teaching Laboratories contained in the memorandum from Ms Gail Milgrom, Director of Campus and Facilities Planning, dated April 30, 2013, be approved.

#### c) Appointments - 2013-14 Membership of the University of Toronto Mississauga and University of Toronto Scarborough Campus Councils and their Standing Committees

On motion duly moved, seconded, and carried,

#### IT WAS RESOLVED

1. THAT the following motion be endorsed and forwarded to the Governing Council

THAT the recommended appointments to the University of Toronto Mississauga and the University of Toronto Scarborough Campus Councils and their Standing Committees, contained in the memorandum from Mr. Richard Nunn, dated June 14, 2013, be approved for a one-year term, effective July 1, 2013.

2. THAT, pursuant to section 38 of *By-Law Number 2*, the Governing Council consider this item *in camera*.

## IN CAMERA CONSENT AGENDA

#### 15. Relocation of the Department of Nutritional Sciences to the Toronto Medical Discovery Tower – Sources of Funding and Total Project Cost

On motion duly moved, seconded, and carried,

IT WAS RESOLVED

THAT the recommendation regarding the proposed relocation of the Department of Nutritional Sciences to the Toronto Medical Discovery Tower contained in the memorandum from Ms Gail Milgrom, Director of Campus and Facilities Planning, dated May 27, 2013, be approved.

#### **16.** External Appointments

#### a) Centre for Addiction and Mental Health Board of Trustees

On motion duly moved, seconded, and carried,

#### IT WAS RESOLVED

THAT Professor Trevor Young be appointed as the University of Toronto representative to the Board of Trustees of the Centre for Addiction and Mental Health for a three-year term from July 1, 2013 until June 30, 2016, or until his successor is appointed.

#### b) Hart House Board of Stewards and Finance Committee

On motion duly moved, seconded, and carried,

#### IT WAS RESOLVED

THAT Mr. Kenneth Davy be re-appointed to the Hart House Board of Stewards for a one-year term, from July 1, 2013 until June 30, 2014, or until his successor is appointed; and

THAT Mr. Paul Lindblad be re-appointed to the Hart House Finance Committee for a one-year term, from July 1, 2013 until June 30, 2014, or until his successor is appointed.

#### **16.** External Appointments (cont'd)

#### d) University Health Network Board of Trustees

On motion duly moved, seconded, and carried,

IT WAS RESOLVED

THAT Professor Catharine Whiteside and Professor Cheryl Regehr be re-appointed to the Board of Trustees of the University Health Network for one-year terms, from July 1, 2013 to June 30, 2014, or until their successors are appointed.

#### 17. Committee Members with the President

Members of the Executive Committee, with the Board Chairs, met privately with the President.

On motion duly moved, seconded, and carried,

#### IT WAS RESOLVED

- 1. THAT the motion outlined in the memorandum from the President, dated June 17, 2013, be endorsed and forwarded to the Governing Council; and
- 2. THAT, pursuant to section 38 of *By-Law Number 2*, the Governing Council consider the item *in camera*.

#### **18.** Committee Members alone

Members of the Executive Committee, with the Board Chairs, met privately.

The Committee returned to closed session.

The meeting adjourned at 7:10 p.m.

Secretary June 19, 2013 Chair