



FOR INFORMATION

PUBLIC

OPEN SESSION

TO: Academic Affairs Committee

SPONSOR: Amrita Daniere, Vice-Principal Academic and Dean
CONTACT INFO: 905-828-3719, vpdean.utm@utoronto.ca

PRESENTER: See above
CONTACT INFO:

DATE: November 16, 2016 for November 23, 2016

AGENDA ITEM: 3

ITEM IDENTIFICATION:

Reviews of Academic Programs and Units

JURISDICTIONAL INFORMATION:

Section 5.6 of our Terms of Reference states that the Academic Affairs Committee shall receive for information and discussion reviews of academic programs and/or units, consistent with the protocol outlined in the University of Toronto Quality Assurance Process.

GOVERNANCE PATH:

1. Committee on Academic Policy & Programs [For Approval] (November 1, 2016)
2. Agenda Committee of the Academic Board [For Information] (November 14, 2016)
3. **Academic Affairs Committee [For Information] (November 23, 2016)**
4. Academic Board [For Information] (November 24, 2016)
5. Executive Committee of the Governing Council [For Information] (December 5, 2016)
6. Governing Council [For Information] (December 15, 2016)

PREVIOUS ACTION TAKEN:

These reviews were received by the Committee on Academic Policy and Programs (AP&P) as part of the Compendium of Reviews of Academic Programs and Units, April – September 2016, for information and discussion on November 1, 2016.

HIGHLIGHTS:

For the external review of the Department of Visual Studies, the reviewers met with the Interim Vice-Principal Academic and Dean; the Acting Vice-Dean Undergraduate; the Chair of the Department of Visual Studies, UTM; junior and senior faculty members; graduate and

undergraduate students; and administrative staff. The departments' strengths, areas of concern and recommendations of the review are outlined in the attached summary reports and in the administrative response documents.

For the external review of the Department of Language Studies, the reviewers met with the Interim Vice-Principal Academic and Dean; the Acting Vice-Dean Undergraduate; the Chair of the Department of Language Studies at UTM, Graduate Chairs from the Departments of French, Italian Studies, Germanic Languages and Literature, Linguistics, as well as for the Institute for Studies in Education-Curriculum; junior and senior faculty members; undergraduate students; and administrative staff. The departments' strengths, areas of concern and recommendations of the review are outlined in the attached summary reports and in the administrative response documents.

For the external review of the Department of Mathematical and Computational Sciences, the reviewers met with the Interim Vice-Principal Academic and Dean; the Vice-Dean Undergraduate; the Chair of the Mathematical and Computational Sciences, UTM; the Graduate Chairs for the Departments of Mathematics, Statistics, and Computer Science; junior and senior faculty members; graduate and undergraduate students; and administrative staff. The departments' strengths, areas of concern and recommendations of the review are outlined in the attached summary reports and in the administrative response documents.

A follow-up report to the March 2015 external review of the Department of English and Drama at UTM and the administrative response of September 10, 2015 was submitted to the Office of the Vice-Provost, Academic Programs. Please see the attached follow-up report for full details.

FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS:

There are no net implications for the campus' operating budget.

RECOMMENDATION:

This item is presented for information.

DOCUMENTATION PROVIDED:

Presentation on External Reviews;
Review Summary and Administrative Response: Department of Mathematics and Computational Sciences;
Review Summary and Administrative Response: Department of Visual Studies;
Review Summary and Administrative Response: Department of Language Studies;
Follow-Up Report: Department of English & Drama

External Reviews of Departments and Programs 2015-16

**Annual Report from Amrita Daniere, Vice-Principal
Academic & Dean to the Academic Affairs Committee**

November 23, 2016



UNIVERSITY OF
TORONTO
MISSISSAUGA

External Reviewers

- Chosen on the basis of administrative experience and wide-respect within their fields. We typically choose one Canadian and one U.S. reviewer.
- Assist in determining the quality of the program or department, make recommendations for improvement, and raise any significant areas of concern.

External Review Process

- An internal self-study, using a standardized template, is prepared by the program director or departmental chair in context of widespread consultation with faculty, staff, cognate units and students.
- The self-study addresses the programs, research, teaching, governance and plans for the future to be discussed.
- External reviewers visit the campus for two days and prepare their report for the Dean. Their report provides detailed evaluation of programs and curriculum.

Response to the External Reviewer Report

- Department chair or program director checks external reviewer report for any inaccuracies.
- The external reviewer report is forwarded to the Provost's office. The Provost provides a summary and writes a request for decanal response. Dean consults with program director/chair in preparing response.
- Review summary and decanal response shared with:
 - Academic Affairs
 - Campus Councils
 - Committee on Academic Policy & Programs (AP&P)
 - Academic Board.

2015-16 Reviews

Departments of

- Language Studies
- Mathematical and Computational Sciences
- Visual Studies

Language Studies

- February 29 and March 1, 2016
- Review Team from
 - University of Ottawa
 - Indiana University
- Chair in 2015-16: Professor Emmanuel Nikiema

Major Findings- Positive Elements

- High quality, popular programs with sharp, high-achieving students
- All programs use a variety of experiential learning tools
- Strong outreach programs with excellent reputations, including French Summer Camp and study abroad programs
- Collegial work environment with tremendous productivity of the faculty
- Department is well guided and has a history of good leadership

Recommendations of the Reviewers and Opportunities for Enhancement

- Examine frequency of course offerings
- Supporting existing programs in terms of faculty growth and research output
- Consolidate programs under the four disciplines: French, Italian, Linguistics, and Teaching and Learning
- Maintain outreach programs offered

Response to Review

- To increase the number of courses offered by reducing the number of courses offered in rotation
- Since their academic plan of 2012, the Department has added 5 positions and are currently searching for a another tenure track hire and CLTA
- Department anticipates eventually proposing new minor programs and faculty hires in the two areas of Chinese and Spanish
- Fully intend to continue excelling in outreach activities

Mathematical and Computational Sciences

- Visit January 25 and 26, 2016
- Review Team from
 - University of British Columbia
 - McGill University
- Chair in 2015-16: Professor Yael Karshon

Major Findings – Positive Elements

- Department provides a very sound educational experience to its undergraduate students
- Impressive programs. Course practices and student quality are well managed
- Teaching quality is very high, despite growing enrolment
- Excellent levels of student satisfaction
- Impressive research records of the faculty
- Praiseworthy efforts of faculty advisors in mentoring junior faculty and providing TA supervision and coordination
- Impressive morale, collegiality, and departmental leadership

Recommendations of the Reviewers and Opportunities for Enhancement

- Significant growth has created pressure to increase class sizes
- Serious shortage of research faculty, and corresponding over dependence on sessional and other short-term instructors, specifically in Computer Science and Statistics
- High teaching loads for teaching stream faculty

Response to Review

- The Office of the Registrar administers the admissions process into first year studies and has been asked to consult more directly with the MCS Department. Meeting scheduled for January 2017.
- Last year, MCS hired six new research stream faculty members and has been approved to conduct faculty searches for two full time teaching-stream positions plus three research stream positions.
- The teaching loads of teaching stream faculty were reduced from 4.0 FCE to 3.5 FCE. Credit is also given for coordination of multi-section courses.

Visual Studies

- Visit February 25-26, 2016
- Review Team from
 - Carleton University
 - University of Rochester
- Chair in 2015-16: Professor Alison Syme

Major Findings - Positive Elements

- Extensive learning outcomes are consistent with other Humanities/Arts programs
- Programs' curricula represent a good balance of tradition and innovation
- Art & Art History program may be unique in Canada with its 50/50 balance of art history and studio art courses
- Scope, quality, and relevance of faculty research activities are appropriate to their academic interests and teaching responsibilities
- Excellent department, and one which merits the full confidence of the senior administration at UTM

Recommendations of the Reviewers and Opportunities for Enhancement

- Classroom lighting be improved, especially given the visual nature of the disciplines taught
- Encouraged the department to expand its program offerings and create a certificate in Curatorial Studies
- Faculty complement plan should include expansion in cinema studies and Islamic art and architecture
- Provide better support for the Blackwood Gallery

Response to review

- Two large lecture halls have been refurbished for Cinema Studies courses. Given the construction on campus at the moment, additional capacity will make it easier for DVS to be scheduled into already existing (properly equipped) classrooms.
- The Department is now discussing and anticipating to develop a major in Cinema Studies. The Department proposal for a Certificate in Curatorial Studies is currently moving through governance.
- Faculty hires in the areas of Cinema Studies and Islamic Art and Architecture are in the Department's expansion plan.
- The Blackwood's staff complement has been increased from 1.6 to 3.0 FTE, and funds have been allocated for equipment and infrastructure upgrades over the next year.

English and Drama; Follow-up

- Visit March 5 and 6, 2015
- Review Team from
 - York University
 - University of Virginia
- Chair in 2015-16: Professor Holger Syme

Follow-up Report Request

At its meeting on October 27, 2015, AP&P indicated that it would be helpful to receive a follow-up report from the Vice-Principal Academic and Dean regarding the actions taken to address the sexist incidents, and issues of gender equality and diversity that had been identified by the reviewers.

Follow-up Report

- November 2015, Professor Alexandra Gillespie (then Undergraduate Director; 2015-16) with the support of Professor Holger Syme (then Department Chair), arranged for a presentation by UTM's Equity and Diversity Officer to be delivered to the teaching faculty in the Department
- Since becoming the new Department Chair, Professor Gillespie has undertaken a comprehensive restructuring of UTM English and Drama, done in consultation with the previous Department Chair, as well as faculty and staff. This restructuring was designed to facilitate consensus-based decision making.
- Established an equity and Diversity Committee, on which the Department Chair and other tenure faculty members sit.

Follow-up Report

- In consultation with the new English and Drama Curriculum Committee, Professor Gillespie has designed a number of new courses for the 2017-18 academic year - ahead of a more thorough curriculum reform - that address issues of equity and diversity.
- Professor Gillespie acted as a facilitator at the September 2016 WISELI workshops on implicit bias and hiring for excellence and diversity organized by the Provost's Office.
- Through active conversations between my Office and the Department, it is clear that the Department of English and Drama takes the need for improvement in these areas extremely seriously and has taken a number of steps in the last twelve months to address the reviewers concerns.

EXTERNAL REVIEW OF THE DEPARTMENT OF MATHEMATICAL AND COMPUTATIONAL SCIENCES

Date of Review: Monday, January 25th & Tuesday, January 26th, 2016

Name & Contact of Reviewer:

Professor Michael Bennett

bennett@math.ubc.ca

Name & Contact of Reviewer:

Professor Greg Dudek

dudek@cim.mcgill.ca

Cyclical Review: 2016.

Faculty/Division under review:	Department of Mathematical and Computational Sciences, University of Toronto Mississauga
Program(s) under review:	Bioinformatics (Specialist) Computer Science (Specialist/Major/Minor) Information Security (Specialist) Mathematical Sciences (Specialist/Major/Minor) Statistics, Applied (Specialist/Major/Minor)
Commissioning Officer:	Interim Vice-Principal Academic and Dean, Kelly Hannah-Moffat Office of the Dean, University of Toronto Mississauga
Date of review:	Monday, January 25, 2016 & Tuesday, January 26, 2016
Names of Reviewers:	Dr. Michael Bennett, University of British Columbia Dr. Gregory Dudek, McGill University

1 The Review

The external review of the Department of Mathematical and Computational Sciences at the University of Toronto, Mississauga took place on January 25th and 26th, 2016. The external review committee, consisting of Michael Bennett (University of British Columbia) and Gregory Dudek (McGill University), met with the Interim Vice-President Academic and Dean, Kelley Hannah-Moffat, the Vice-Dean, Undergraduate, Michael Lettieri, the outgoing Department Chair, Yael Karshon, the Graduate Chairs, Kumar Murty (Mathematics), James Stafford (Statistics) and Ravin Balakrishnan (Computer Science), and the Associate Chair, Michael Yampolsky. Subsequent interviews were conducted with a variety of departmental stakeholders, including staff, undergraduate students, graduate student TAs, postdoctoral fellows, limited term teaching faculty, instructional faculty and research faculty.

The reviewers felt that the visit was well-organized and proceeded smoothly and efficiently.

2 Review Summary

Overall, the Committee's assessment was that the Department has a solid understanding of its own strengths and weaknesses and, with few exceptions, that there is a good deal of agreement on the challenges currently facing the Department. These, we believe, are essentially two-fold. On the one hand, one has what we would characterize as unsustainable and apparently uncontrolled growth in the undergraduate teaching mission of the Department. On the other, one finds a marked shortage of research (or for that matter, at least relative to the size of the teaching mission, instructional) faculty, particularly in Computer Science and Statistics. Despite these difficulties, we could not fail to be impressed by the esprit de corps within the Department or by its leadership (particularly the outgoing Chair, Yael Karshon, who had unconditional support from the faculty members) and the support provided to it by the Faculty. The new facilities inhabited by the Department have alleviated many of the space concerns raised in the previous review. On a very real level, the problems faced by the UTM Department of Mathematical and Computational Sciences lie almost entirely within the broad category of matters of personnel.

Regarding matters of curriculum, course practices and student quality the department seems to be well managed, academically sound and thus these issues receive only limited consideration below.

In what follows, we will provide a more detailed review of various aspects of the Department, highlighting what we see as strengths and, occasionally, weaknesses, and attempt to formulate specific (and we hope, not impractical) recommendations, where possible.

3 Teaching and Learning

Broadly speaking, the Department provides a very sound educational experience to its undergraduate students, with excellent facilities and staff support (including IT). The departmental objectives and vision, in this respect, are reasonable and consistent with the university mission, and augmented through linkages with larger academic units based at the St. George campus. We were impressed with both the quality of the undergraduate programs offered at UTM and the satisfaction levels of the students and the instructional staff (both tenure-track and contingent). Here, as in all aspects of the program, however, the limited number of tenure-track faculty is a clear and serious problem. The impact of this on undergraduate education is evident at three levels. Firstly, it leads to an overdependence on limited term, contingent faculty, which can effect continuity within the teaching programs (and, one might argue, quality of teaching, though this is by no means obvious at present). Secondly, in conjunction with dramatic enrolment increases, it creates pressure to increase class sizes; both instructors and students highlighted small class sizes and more personal interactions with students as a characteristic that (positively) differentiates UTM from the St. George campus. Finally, it undercuts the desire to integrate undergraduate students into a research milieu; in some areas of study, limitations on available staff even make the maintenance of a robust upper year selection of course offerings difficult.

The Committee was very impressed with the instructional faculty within the department and would like to single out the Faculty Advisors for specific praise for their roles in mentoring junior faculty and TA supervision and coordination. While the extensive use of TAs, particularly undergraduate TAs at UTM is somewhat unusual, it appears to be working quite well. Admission requirements for the various programs offered within the department seem to be sound and

realistic, and the quality of incoming undergraduates to be reasonably high (though opinions on this latter point differ). On the other hand, it cannot be too strongly emphasized that continually growing enrolment is putting an exceptional strain on the teaching staff. Despite this, the quality of the pedagogical experience for students at UTM remains very high. The review team witnessed a noteworthy level of community and camaraderie among the undergraduate students.

While some schools are moving towards a model focused on laptops (or other forms of student-owned computing) in lieu of more traditional computer labs (to save both space and equipment costs), the Department prefers labs so that students use compatible software and environments, and have backups of their work. This is an impressive achievement since it has clear advantages in terms of collaboration and morale. Since the labs appear well-used and appear to be a locus of community interaction, this seems to be an appropriate approach though it does buck an ongoing trend being observed across the continent.

We would remiss if we did not point out that teaching loads for teaching-stream faculty in the Department range from high to very high (they differ by sub-discipline). Indeed, the current teaching load of 8 courses per year (apparently being reduced in coming years) for (tenure-track) teaching-stream faculty in Mathematics is notably higher than every other “top 10” Canadian university or “top 20” American university (where we typically find annual teaching loads of 5 courses, and never more than 6).

4 Research

We should begin by emphasizing that the active research faculty in the Department have very impressive records. The limited number of research faculty, particularly in Computer Science and Statistics, who actually conduct research at UTM is, however, a serious source of

concern and affects virtually every aspect of academic life in the Department. It reduces the involvement and visibility of graduate students and postdoctoral fellows at the UTM campus (in roles other than undergraduate teaching). It undermines the Department's goal of providing a broad selection of upper year undergraduate courses. Most importantly, it has extremely negative implications for retention of existing faculty, recruitment of new faculty and, indeed, any aspiration of maintaining a world-class research component at the campus. Renewal and growth in this respect are critical issues as losses due to retention issues, retirements and failed searches have led to extreme staff shortfalls. Moreover, the ability of existing research faculty to actually engage in research at UTM is compromised by the lack of "critical mass."

While the research performance metrics provided to the committee in all research areas were certainly impressive and reflected exceptional competitiveness, they depend very heavily on the research portfolios of St. George campus faculty and on the activities of UTM faculty while on the downtown campus. As such, they are not useful in assessing the research performance and productivity levels at UTM itself.

5 Relationships

As noted earlier, the general level of moral and collegiality amongst the faculty, students and staff is extremely strong. Relations between the Department and the Dean are very positive and seem likely to remain so. Interactions with the other U of T campuses are frequent and, in most cases, also positive. Within the campus, there is a general sense of frustration with the UTM Registrar's office, due to uncontrolled enrolment increases and the accompanying challenges they provide. Community outreach (in terms, for example, of math camps and competitions) is a notable strength.

6 Organizational and Financial Structure

The department is organized in a relatively traditional manner (in terms of ratios of staff to faculty, etc), with a couple of notable exceptions. Firstly, due to a variety of reasons related to retirements, retention and inability to hire, the number of teaching faculty, relative to research faculty, is proportionally much larger than one would expect in a top research university. Secondly, the proportion of the departmental budget allocated to short-term teaching positions (casuals, lecturers, contingent faculty) is surprisingly high (many, many times higher than peer institutions of which we are aware). This, again, is clearly a consequence of the steadily increasing enrolment combined with a decreasing number of tenure-track research staff and a limitation on the number of permanent teaching staff.

7 Long-Range Planning Challenges

The most obvious long-range planning challenges are, as we have already noted, related to controlling undergraduate enrolments and hiring research faculty. A third, which we have not discussed so far, but potentially at least as important, is the currently ongoing process of finding a new Departmental Chair. The outgoing Chair deserves high praise for her efforts; the challenges facing her successor are formidable. Foremost among these is the challenge of immediate hiring to fill open positions, possibly by using strategic “cluster” hiring.

8 International Comparators

The University of Toronto is one of the world’s top universities. The metrics provided to the committee are impressive and speak to U of T’s exceptional competitiveness on an international scale. The research-related data, however, reflects the performance of the academic departments as a whole and are largely dependent on that of St. George campus faculty. As a result, we are concerned that the research performance indicators fail to adequately represent the character,

strengths and weaknesses of the Mississauga campus as a research environment.

As a whole, the limited number of research-active tenure-track faculty (especially in Computer Science and Statistics), and their limited engagement with the Mississauga campus, compromise the exposure of students to the sort of front-line research activities that one expects at a top-class university. While UTM students are able to attend classes, especially upper level classes, downtown, the extent to which they do so in practice is moderate at best.

9 Recommendations

We recommend that serious resources and energy be put into research faculty hiring. If one does not face this recruiting challenge immediately, the reality is that there will be little or no research presence in Computer Science and Statistics at UTM.

It may also be necessary to change the basic mechanisms by which such searches are carried out. Given the staff shortages the Department faces, it is really not acceptable to conduct searches where no candidates are identified as being worthy of offers (as has happened in the recent past). Broadened searches and simultaneous offers should be considered. To attract top candidates to UTM, it may well be necessary to provide additional incentives beyond those available to job candidates at the St. George campus. Canada Research Chairs have been used effectively at other Canadian universities for this purpose; reduced teaching loads, postdoctoral support and increased salary are other common inducements. Perhaps more fundamentally, it would be very desirable to hire faculty who would actually be based at UTM and conduct research there, rather than view it as a weekly inconvenience. To this end, we would recommend making hires in a research cluster. Since the greatest staffing needs are in Computer Science and Statistics, we would suggest making a number of focussed hires in a single area

of, say, CS, that is not currently strongly represented at the St. George campus. Since access to space for labs is a definite advantage of UTM, it would be advisable to look for a group whose computing or laboratory needs can be met at UTM (and likely not at St. George). In terms of choosing a research area for such a focussed cluster, some possibilities fitting this profile include Cryptography and Security, Robotics, Software Engineering, Digital Fabrication and Data Science. If possible, it would be advantageous to find a research area that, while centred in Computer Science, has strong connections to Mathematics and/or Statistics. A number of the areas we have mentioned have this feature. A senior hire to anchor such a cluster might also be desirable.

Not unrelated to this, we recommend strongly considering that the next Department Chair be from Computer Science or Statistics. Given the small complement of research faculty in these areas, this would likely mean either hiring an external candidate for Chair (possibly as part of the aforementioned cluster hires), or by secondment of an experienced researcher with administrative experience from the St. George campus. In either case, the new Chair could be tasked with shepherding through the faculty hiring discussed above.

If it is possible in the UTM context, we advocate the Department being given some measure of control over enrolment increases (such controls on a departmental level certainly exist at a number of other Canadian institutions). The enormous growth in majors, specialists and minors programs threatens to undermine the true educational advantage that UTM possesses – namely personal, small-class interactions.

As noted earlier, the Department has both a disproportionate number of instructional faculty and an extraordinarily large budget (c. \$1 million per year) for contingent labour. The latter, at least, is really not acceptable for a top-class university (and, as far as we are aware, is unprecedented in the Canadian context). Though, on the surface, this will apparently exacerbate the former issue, we recommend that a

sizable portion of the recurring funds currently being spent on sessional and limited term instructors be used to hire regular instructional faculty. It is better, in our opinion, for the students, the Department and as a matter of fairness to be able to attract first-rate educators with a stable and secure job. If the research hiring is conducted successfully, the teaching faculty/research faculty ratio will not change appreciably in this scenario.

As we have noted, the teaching loads teaching-stream faculty in the Department at UTM are higher than at peer institutions. We recommend that they be uniformly lowered to no more than 6 courses per year. While this perhaps lead to short-term inconvenience (replacing them as instructors in a few courses), it will surely be better for the faculty member's and department's long-term well-being.

Finally, we would like to encourage the administration at UTM to seriously consider what can be done to improve transportation between Mississauga and the St. George campus. A frequently recurring theme we heard during our review visit was the remarkable level of discomfort afforded by the current bus.



October 3, 2016

Professor Sioban Nelson
Vice-Provost, Academic Programs
Simcoe Hall
University of Toronto

Dear Sioban,

I am writing to provide an administrative response to the External Review of UTM's Department of Mathematical and Computational Sciences (MCS), which was held in January of 2016. I am pleased with the largely favorable review which praised the quality of the undergraduate programs and the impressive research records of the faculty. The reviewers commended the support staff for their high morale and also applauded the computer lab space of the Department, which facilitates opportunities for collaboration and further community building among all members. An implementation plan with timelines can be found at the end of this letter.

Students

The reviewers expressed concern about the apparent lack of say the department has had in recent enrolment increases, which were overseen by the Registrar's Office. They encouraged giving the department more control over enrolment in order to preserve distinctive features of the programs.

As elsewhere in the University, there has been a large increase in student numbers in computer and mathematical sciences in recent years. At UTM, the Office of the Registrar administers the admissions process into first year studies and has been asked to consult more directly with the MCS Department. Some of the growth in demand, however, is coming from students in many other disciplines who have unexpectedly decided to study mathematics and computer science at a significant level of intensity. While the MCS does see uncontrollable increases causing problems, they also recognize that an increase in student numbers creates exciting opportunities for their own Department's growth and development. It is this positive outlook, demeanor, and perspective that contributes to their delivery of high quality programs. The MCS Department is planning to meet with members of the Registrar's Office in January 2017 to discuss enrolment numbers.

Faculty

The reviewers underscored the serious shortage of research faculty, and corresponding over dependence on sessional and other short-term instructors, specifically in Computer Science and Statistics. They recommended considering strategic “cluster” hiring as part of new searches, and reconsideration of the large budget allocated to short-term teaching positions.

At the time of the review, MCS had only one research stream faculty in Statistics, and two in Computer Science. Multiple searches were conducted for two successive years and were unsuccessful at recruiting new members to the Department. Last year, however, searches were very successful. MCS hired six new research stream faculty members (two in Mathematics, two in Statistics, and two in Computer Science). This was an extremely important improvement, increasing their research stream faculty compliment and at the same time, resulting in a significant boost in morale to the entire Department. MCS continues to pursue hires in all three disciplines and has authorization to hire five additional faculty members during the 2016-17 academic year.

The Department agrees with the recommendation for cluster hiring, which was aimed primarily in the area of Computer Science. Their needs, specific to the teaching of required upper level courses, require research presence in different areas of Computer Science, in particular in Core Systems. However, the hiring of faculty in Computer Science is rather complex, as high quality hires in specific fields may not always be able to teach undergraduate courses in almost any area, as is the case in mathematics. I should note that the Dean’s Office in concert with UTM’s Vice Principal, Research is working with the graduate chair of the Department of Computer Science to identify a cluster research area that will be based at UTM and built up through strategic hiring over the next five years.

The reviewers remarked on the high teaching loads for teaching stream faculty.

To deal with understaffing, MCS has been approved to conduct faculty searches for two full time teaching-stream positions in Mathematics, plus three more research stream positions (one in Mathematics, and two in Computer Science).

With respect to the high teaching loads of teaching stream faculty, this problem has been addressed. The teaching loads of teaching stream faculty were reduced from 4.0 FCE to 3.5 FCE. In addition, credit is given for coordination of multi-section courses. In combination, these two implemented changes create teaching loads that have become more sustainable.



Implementation Plan – Department of Mathematical and Computational Sciences; UTM

The Dean undertook in consultation with the Department to support the following changes:

- Immediate Term (6 months)
 - Enrolment Increases
 - At UTM, the Office of the Registrar administers the admissions process into first year studies and has been asked to consult more directly with the MCS Department.
 - The Department is planning to meet with members of the Registrar's Office in January 2017 to discuss enrolment numbers.
 - Addressing the high teaching loads for teaching stream faculty
 - The Department has been approved to conduct faculty searches for two full time teaching-stream positions in Mathematics, plus three research stream positions (one in Mathematics, and two in Computer Science).
 - The teaching loads of teaching stream faculty were reduced from 4.0 FCE to 3.5 FCE. Credit is also given for coordination of multi-section courses.
- Medium Term (1-2 years)
 - Shortage of research faculty, and corresponding over dependence on sessional and other short-term instructors
 - Last year, however, searches were very successful. MCS hired six new research stream faculty members (two in Mathematics, two in Statistics, and two in Computer Science).
- Long Term (3-6 years)
 - Shortage of research faculty, and corresponding over dependence on sessional and other short-term instructors
 - The Dean's Office in concert with UTM's Vice Principal, Research is working with the graduate chair of Department of Computer Science to identify a cluster research area that will be based at UTM and built up through strategic hiring over the next five years.

Please let me know if you have any questions about this response.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Amrita Danieri".

Amrita Danieri
Vice-Principal, Academic and Dean

EXTERNAL REVIEW OF THE DEPARTMENT OF VISUAL STUDIES

Date of Review: Thursday, February 25 & Friday, February 26, 2016

Name & Contact of Reviewer:

Professor John Osborne

john.osborne@carleton.ca

Name & Contact of Reviewer:

Professor Joan Saab

joan.saab@rochester.edu

From February 25-26, 2016, John Osborne (Carleton University) and Joan Saab (University of Rochester) visited the University of Toronto Mississauga to undertake an external review of the Department of Visual Studies, which offers programs in art, art history, cinema studies, and visual culture. In advance of our meeting we received a very thorough departmental self-study compiled by Chairperson Alison Syme. During our two days on campus we met with a variety of individuals from the Administration, tenure-stream faculty, sessional faculty, undergraduate and graduate students, departmental administrators, and teaching assistants.

Summary

This summary will be divided into three parts: “the good news”, “items that require attention”, and “opportunities”.

First the good news: the Dept. of Visual Studies (DVS) is an excellent department, and one which merits the full confidence of the senior administration at UTM. Faculty members (including sessionals), administrative staff, TAs, and students all had nothing but praise for the nurturing atmosphere in which they work and study, and it quickly became apparent that this is due in no small measure to the high standard of collegiality set by the department chair (who is to be commended and warmly applauded). The various graduate programs based on the St George campus, in which DVS faculty also teach and supervise, were similarly unanimous in praising the contribution of the faculty to their success. Discussions related to the UTM Library also suggested a happy and fruitful collaborative relationship.

As might be expected, however, the reviewers identified a number of matters which “require attention”, although most of these need action at an institutional level, in other words by the Dean’s office or above. These are enumerated here, in no particular order or ranking, with further details provided in the body of the report below:

1. Inadequate appreciation of, and support for, the Blackwood Gallery
2. Assignment of classrooms that are inappropriate for the use of visual material
3. An apparently “broken” relationship with the Advancement office
4. Administrative support (and in particular the workload of the Business Officer)
5. Inadequate support for an increasing number of ELL students
6. Need to identify a senior-level advocate for the Department of Visual Studies, and the Humanities programs more broadly

At the same time, we would like to signal the following “opportunities” to enhance UTM’s programs, and its stature with the local and larger communities:

1. The Blackwood Gallery: UTM could build on the growing international reputation of the BG to make it a centrepiece for outreach relationships with the local Mississauga community. Given its excellent track-record of curated exhibitions, both at the BG and elsewhere (for example the enormously prestigious Venice biennale), and the existing internship courses supervised by the BG Director, a certificate in Curatorial Studies could be added fairly easily and without the need for the allocation of additional faculty resources. This would attract students interested in a

“credential” beyond the BA degree, and build additional bridges between UTM and the larger world.

2. Cinema Studies: If UTM were looking to invest in an “up and coming” program with the strong promise of being able to attract new students, then our recommendation would be to establish a “major” in Cinema Studies. Currently, only a “minor” is offered, but the increasing number of students (as demonstrated both by the increase in the number of “minors” in recent years from 47 in 2011-12 to 139 in 2014-15, as well as by the annual need to offer multiple sections of the introductory course, CIN 101, in order to meet demand) suggests that there is a greater opportunity not currently being realized. It is also important to note that the more theoretical direction of the existing cinema studies offerings at UTM is in marked contrast to the more traditional offerings (film history, national cinema, etc.) available on the St George campus (UTSG).
3. Art History: The art history program is very strong, but somewhat unbalanced in its focus on Europe and North America. If additional funding were available, we would recommend that the next position be established in the field of Islamic art and architecture. This would also seem to be a possibility ripe for “advancement” activity, possibly leading to a supported professorship or an endowed chair.

The next section of this report will follow the UTQAP template and provide explicit comments on the subjects therein, as requested.

1. Programs

The Department of Visual Studies currently offers five undergraduate programs: Art History (specialist/major/minor); Art & Art History (specialist, major – taught jointly with Sheridan College); Cinema Studies (minor); Visual Culture & Communication (specialist— taught jointly with Sheridan College); Visual Culture (minor). As the curriculum for these undergraduate programs overlaps, and many of the DVS faculty teach in more than one program, some of the topics will be dealt with collectively. But this may also be an appropriate place to note that all DVS faculty contribute additionally to the graduate programs offered by the University of Toronto on its St George campus.

Objectives

All five programs have at their core the aim to produce students who are “educated in the broadest sense of the term, with the ability to think clearly, judge objectively, and contribute constructively to society”, as stated in the University of Toronto’s mission statement. The learning objectives of each program are clearly set forth in the Self Study document (sections 3.1.4, 3.2.4, 3.3.4, 3.4.4, 3.5.4), and are consistent with other Humanities/Arts programs, both at UTM and elsewhere, in their provision of both discipline-specific and more general outcomes. For example, the objectives for art history include historical and geographic depth, an understanding of the function of the visual arts in society and in relation to other aspects of culture, the history of the discipline, and an ability to analyze and apply a variety of theoretical lenses, in addition to more general skills in reading and analysis, marshalling

cogent arguments, and communicating them verbally and in writing. The reviewers found the list of learning outcomes to be extensive, and we were pleasantly surprised to discover that these seem also to be very clearly communicated to students through the syllabus for each individual course. No changes are recommended.

Admission requirements

The admission requirements are completely consistent with other B.A. programs at UTM and elsewhere, with no additional or special requirements; and, unlike most BFA degree programs, the Art & Art History program does not require prior training in studio. No changes are recommended.

Curriculum and program delivery

For the most part, the curriculum of the various DVS degree programs represents a good balance of tradition and innovation. The Art & Art History program may possibly be unique in Canada in its 50-50 balance of art history and studio art courses (the latter offered at Sheridan College), and even attracts some students from outside southern Ontario for that reason. Students receive two credentials: an Honours BA from the University of Toronto, and a diploma from Sheridan. Student support for, and satisfaction with, this longstanding program (initiated in 1971) is exceptionally strong, in large part due to the state of the art studio facilities and the small class sizes at Sheridan. "Enrichment" activities such as regular trips to New York, an active visiting artist program, and the annual production of "Buff", no doubt make an additional contribution to this sense of "community". That said, however, it emerged that the coordination of work on the two campuses could perhaps be improved. It is the strong perception of students that communication between the DVS and Sheridan faculty is minimal, leaving students with the impression that they are taking two quite separate programs, not one. Rightly or wrongly, this perception was broadly shared by the students with whom we spoke. The situation could be easily ameliorated by having at least one meeting each term of the two faculty groups, to discuss matters related to curriculum, delivery, recruitment, etc., for their joint benefit. At the moment all liaison seems to be the primary responsibility of the chair alone, a situation which is not ideal. Social or other events, held on both campuses, involving the two faculty groups in conjunction with the program's students may also prove to be useful in the creation of a better sense of program "identity".

The Art History program has taken steps to expand from a traditional focus on Europe and North America to incorporate a broader "global" vision, a direction that is most welcome and will need to be embraced and pursued actively in the years ahead, reflecting the cultural diversity of the Mississauga region and the GTA from which UTM draws the majority of its undergraduate students. The next position available to the Department should be in a "non-western" field, and ideally in the art and architecture of the Islamic world, given the extraordinarily rich collection of the recently-opened Aga Khan Museum. We were rather surprised, and not a little disturbed, to learn that the Department's attempts to engage with the University's Advancement office, in pursuit of an endowed chair or professorship, apparently have been rebuffed. This is a worthy goal and should have a reasonable

chance of success, but it will require a closer working relationship between the department and the University's fundraisers.

The reviewers were also very pleased to learn from UT graduate students that Teaching Assistantships in art history courses at UTM were seen as being highly desirable, in part because of the great respect with which they are treated by the DVS faculty and staff, but perhaps more importantly because they are given an opportunity to teach tutorial sections of second-year courses, an opportunity apparently not offered at UTSG where they function primarily as "markers". This experience was seen as a very important part of their development as graduate students, particularly on the part of those contemplating an academic career.

The "minors" in Visual Culture and Cinema Studies offer exciting possibilities with a strong emphasis on theoretical approaches, and are clearly popular. The Department may wish to consider expanding both to a "major", particularly Cinema Studies. We note that Cinema Studies cannot keep up with the growing demand for its courses, currently necessitating the offering of multiple sections of the introductory course (due in part to the capacity limit in the classroom used for this course). If a new faculty position is available, this is the highest priority for additional resources, as it represents an outstanding opportunity to attract additional students.

The "specialist" program in Visual Culture and Communication, also offered in conjunction with Sheridan College (which results in students receiving a Diploma in Digital Communications in addition to their BA), while distinctive, is nonetheless the only DVS program in which student interest is waning significantly, and this may be due to the very rigid degree requirements, which allow students very limited flexibility. The Department may wish to consider replacing this "specialist" program with a "major"; or, as an alternative, if a "major" is established in Visual Culture, it could close this "specialist" program and allow students interested in the VCC combination to pursue the new major in Visual Culture in conjunction with the major offered by the Institute of Communication, Culture, Information and Technology (CCIT).

In 2014-15 DVS abandoned its previous attempt to offer a single common first-year introduction to all its programs (VST 100 and VST 101), replacing these with separate introductory courses in art History, Cinema Studies, and Visual Culture. The new system appears to work well, and should be allowed some time to work before being re-assessed. No immediate changes are recommended.

The Department's Self Study document has identified the desire to add a Curatorial Studies certificate, although they believe that this would require the addition of a faculty position. Given the prominence of the Blackwood Gallery (see below), the reviewers strongly endorse this aspiration, and believe that something could even be done in this regard using existing course offerings, and thus without increased resources.

In terms of the infrastructure for program delivery, the reviewers were somewhat alarmed to learn that frequent requests by the Department with respect to appropriate classroom facilities appear to have fallen on deaf ears. Given that it is a department of "Visual" Studies, all classes depend for their success on the ability to present visual material effectively, and this in turn necessitates the availability of appropriate lighting in classrooms. While this is a common problem shared by similar programs at other

universities, it is one that is fairly easily remedied, and doing so will almost certainly result in increased student satisfaction. The current situation is enormously frustrating for faculty and students alike.

Opportunities for student learning and student research experience beyond the classroom appear to be in line with other undergraduate programs at UTM and with universities elsewhere. We noted that DVS students enjoy a wide range of field trips, visiting speakers, and other possibilities for program enrichment, and are encouraged to consider exchanges and “study abroad” options.

The one enormous advantage possessed by the DVS is the Blackwood Gallery, which is an exceptionally valuable resource despite the small size of its two non-congruent spaces, and the inadequate lighting and storage facilities. Indeed, we note with regret that the offices for the BG staff are not immediately adjacent to the gallery space, but gallery equipment, furniture (like plinths and benches), archives, etc., are stored off-site. In recent years the BG has developed a reputation for the curation of innovative and cutting-edge exhibitions, both on campus and further afield (for example at the Venice Biennale). The Department has made strong efforts to integrate the Blackwood into its pedagogical initiatives, and we were delighted to learn that it also plays a role in the delivery of the graduate curatorial program offered at UTSG through the Faculty of Architecture, Landscape and Design. There may be other opportunities for existing programs on the UTM campus to benefit from the presence of the Blackwood gallery, and some thought might perhaps be given to employing a graduate student in a rolling one- or two-year position to function as a sort of part-time “outreach officer”. And at an institutional level, this would seem to be an exceptional opportunity that has been rather badly missed. We would urge the senior management of UTM to consider making the Blackwood a centrepiece of the campus in any future expansion plans, as a site for the engagement of all UTM students in the development of visual literacy, as a place where DVS students can acquire curatorial experience and skills which will be valuable for their post-graduation employment, and also importantly as a draw for the local Mississauga community beyond the campus. Other universities use their art galleries as locations for significant town-gown interactions, and there is no reason why the Blackwood couldn’t serve UTM in this fashion, particularly if it were given appropriate and prominent new space in the next new building. UTM might want to consider allowing DVS to explore the creation of a “Friends of the Blackwood Gallery” group in the adjacent community.

Finally, we note with pleasure that collaboration between DVS and the Visual Resource Library appear to be excellent, perhaps due in part to the fact that the Visual Resource Librarian is an art historian.

Recommendation #1: The Department of Visual Studies is urged to devote more time and attention to coordination with Sheridan College for the delivery of their joint BA program in Art & Art History, with the aim of having students enrolled in this program understand that it is a single integrated program, albeit delivered in two locations. Annual meetings of the joint faculty complement might be useful in this regard, as well as events, social and otherwise, which alternate between the two campuses.

Recommendation #2: The next appointment in art history should be made in the overall area of “non-western”, and we would recommend even more specifically in the art and architecture of the Islamic

world. This reflects the community from which UTM draws its students, but would also allow better utilization of the presence in Toronto of the Aga Khan Museum, with its “world class” collection.

Recommendation #3: Given that a faculty position in Islamic art and architecture would seem to be an appropriate subject for an endowed chair, it is recommended that the University’s Advancement office be brought into the conversation at the earliest possible moment.

Recommendation #4: The Department should consider adding “majors” to the existing “minors” in Cinema Studies and Visual Culture, reflecting the impressive popularity of these programs, and in particular Cinema Studies. A major in Cinema Studies is necessary if students continuing to graduate studies in this field are to have sufficient background for admission.

Recommendation #5: In order to facilitate the introduction of a major in Cinema Studies, UTM should consider adding an additional faculty position in the best “investment” opportunity to generate student growth.

Recommendation #6: In conjunction with recommendation #4, the Department should consider whether there is a need to continue to offer the “specialist” program in Visual Culture & Communication.

Recommendation #7: The Department’s desire to develop a Curatorial Studies certificate program is excellent, and should be supported.

Recommendation #8: In order to ensure student satisfaction, the senior administration of UTM should liaise more closely with DVS on the lighting arrangements in classrooms required for the effective delivery of courses with significant “visual” components.

Recommendation #9: Although the Department has undertaken important steps to incorporate the Blackwood Gallery into its curriculum, the BG remains an underutilized resource at the institutional level. We recommend consideration of the possibility of hiring a graduate student or PDF as an “outreach officer”, on a rolling one- or two-year contract.

Recommendation #10: Additionally, we recommend that UTM consider the possibility of rehousing the Blackwood Gallery as the centrepiece of its next new building, with a view to making it the primary site of engagement with the larger Mississauga community, and in addition enhancing the opportunities for UTM students to develop heightened visual literacy plus invaluable work experience and transferable job skills. At a minimum the BG needs to be provided with additional storage space, such that off-site storage is no longer required. An initiative to develop a “Friends of the Blackwood Gallery” group in the local community may be a wise investment of time.

Methods used for the evaluation of student achievement are appropriate and seem to be effective. No recommendations for changes.

Quality indicators

In the Arts/Humanities there are no standardized national or international metrics, but the reviewers found nothing unusual or in obvious need of attention in this regard. Students in DVS programs appear to have entering High School grades at or above the UTM average, and then go on to have success comparable to that in other programs. The retention rate from first year to second year is above 80%, and student opinion places the Department ahead of UTM as a whole (Table 13 of the Self Study document). Thus the reviewers did not identify any problems which require immediate attention.

We were informed by the directors of postgraduate programs on the St George campus that graduates of the Department of Visual Studies easily hold their own in comparison to other students, and that DVS faculty are valued colleagues who participate fully in the teaching and supervision of graduate students. The staff member responsible for advising undergraduate students was singled out for special praise by a number of students. Good statistics on where DVS graduates were employed was not available, and this is a pity as this data can be used both to inform and inspire current students.

Students in the Department are eligible for consideration for a variety of awards and prizes, including the Dr. Annie Smith travel award (\$10,000). Recognition of this sort is important to student success, and the Department should work with the university's Advancement office in an attempt to increase the number of awards available, as well as the size of the smaller existing awards, most of which are currently in the \$50-\$500 range.

With regard to program outreach and promotion, we have already noted the missed opportunity by UTM to make greater use of the Blackwood Gallery, both for the Department of Visual Studies and UTM as a whole.

Recommendation #11: The Department should initiate a process for tracking where its graduates are employed, if only for the information of current students, and even if this can only be done on an "anecdotal" basis. There may also be a useful role here for the Alumni Affairs office.

Recommendation #12: The department should work with the university's Advancement office to increase the number and size of student awards available to those enrolled in DVS programs.

2. Faculty/Research

The scope, quality, and relevance of faculty research activities seem entirely appropriate to their academic interests and teaching responsibilities. The reviewers note that in recent years the DVS faculty seem to have been successful with SSHRC grants well above any reasonable expectation. This achievement merits institutional recognition.

3. Relationships

The internal morale of faculty, administrative staff, and students is generally strong, and there is very broad confidence in the abilities of the chair. That said, however, there is also a widespread feeling that the Department, the Blackwood Gallery, and the arts and humanities more broadly defined, are not sufficiently valued by the senior administration at UTM. If the latter statement is true, then it is an enormous pity. This is a strong department which merits the confidence of senior administration, and from time to time they need to hear that! Furthermore, university units which handle supporting activities ranging from recruitment to advancement need to be seen to be giving equal treatment to all programs, and not only those in the STEM disciplines. The arts and humanities programs play a major role at UTM, and presumably will do so into the indefinite future, but they will shrivel and die if starved for adequate institutional support.

Additionally, there have been some apparent instances in which UTM faculty were treated differently from those on other UT campuses in terms of participation in the university's graduate programs, causing them to feel like "second class citizens". This may be simply a matter of poor communication, but for a three-campus university to work effectively, some attention must be paid to ensuring equitable treatment for all those teaching in the joint graduate programs housed on the St George campus.

Most of the immediate external relationships are with Sheridan College and programs on the other UT campuses. Given the relatively small size of the Department, and the number of programs it offers, it would be unreasonable to expect much more. That said, we commend the efforts of the Cinema Studies faculty to engage with the Toronto International Film Festival, and would encourage the Department to take advantage wherever possible of the extraordinary cultural facilities available in the Toronto area.

Recommendation #13: The Department of Visual Studies, the Blackwood Gallery, and indeed the arts and humanities programs at UTM more generally, are in urgent need of a designated advocate at the senior level of UTM administration.

Recommendation #14: The University of Toronto should take steps to ensure that faculty members from all three campuses receive equitable treatment when it comes to participation in the graduate programs centered on the St George campus. Rightly or wrongly, there is a strong perception that this is not currently the case.

4. Organizational and Financial Structure

The organizational and financial structure of the Department of Visual Studies both appear to be consistent with that employed generally at the UTM campus, and we have no recommendations for the redeployment of existing resources. However, this does not mean that there are no points of stress related to areas such as space and infrastructure support, and these merit the attention of senior administration. Beyond the issues of appropriate classrooms, the relationship with Advancement, and the Blackwood gallery, all of which are discussed above, two other issues stand out:

- The workload of the Department's Financial Officer, shared with CCIT, has grown substantially in recent years, apparently due in large part to the growth of CCIT. The impact on DVS has been considerable, particularly with regard to the time required to process routine financial transactions such as reimbursements for travel and research expenses. We understand that additional staff resources may be in the pipeline for CCIT, thus allowing the Financial Officer to devote more time to DVS. If this is the case, then well and good; but if it is not, then something needs to be done urgently. Either way, this is a matter for attention by the senior administration before a bad situation becomes a crisis.
- The growing number of UTM students whose first language is not English is creating a significant problem for a Department which stresses the importance of writing skills. While the quality of the meagre support currently provided to ELL students from the Robert Gillespie Academic Skills Centre is excellent, the resources allocated to this undertaking are completely insufficient to meet the current demand. Presumably this is also the case for other departments at UTM, and the issue needs attention at the level of senior management. The demand for language support will only grow as UTM increases the number of international students on its campus.

Recommendation #15: The Department of Visual Studies requires additional support from its Financial Officer, currently shared with CCIT. It is recommended that senior management at UTM find a way to lessen the impact of the increased workload of the incumbent on the day-to-day functions of DVS.

Recommendation #16: UTM needs to address at an institutional level the growing issue of insufficient English language skills on the part of its undergraduate students, and in particular international students. We understand that it is not practical to assess English-language skills prior to admission, in which case a comprehensive program needs to be put in place for students enrolled in their first year. Current resources allocated to the mitigation of this problem are completely inadequate.

5. Long-range Planning Challenges

Uncertainty about enrolment trends. Declining numbers in the Humanities and Humanistic Social Sciences make it difficult to predict future enrolments.

Increased numbers of international students and first-generation students pose new challenges to teaching, both in form and content.

6. International Comparators

Visual Culture Studies developed as a field of study in the late 1980s. Emerging out of the new social history and heavily influenced by Marxist, Feminist, and psychoanalytical and post-colonial theory, early scholarship in the field tended to mix theory and art practice in innovative ways. The first degree-granting program in Visual Culture was established at the University of Rochester in 1989. Soon after,

programs developed at the University of California, Irvine, the University of Wisconsin, and New York University in the United States and in the United Kingdom at large universities such as Middlesex and Northumbria. All of these programs serve graduate students as well as undergraduates and combine study of visual culture across media. UTM's program is different from many of these other programs in that it constitutes a stand-alone undergraduate department, not an inter-departmental program. Department status allows the UTM's program a degree of curricular stability that many of these other programs lack; yet, it also places a burden on DVS faculty to fill many roles across the majors that DVS offers. Moreover, since UTM does not offer a graduate program of its own, DVS faculty also work with graduate students on the St. George campus, placing increased teaching and time burdens on their academic schedules. Yet despite this increased burden, the faculty in the department are on par with those at their international comparators in terms of research and scholarship.

In terms of curriculum, UTM's DVS resembles its international comparators in that it offers opportunities for combining art historical investigation with studio practice. Most visual studies programs also provide offerings in media studies. Adding a cinema studies major to the department will augment this at UTM. Over the past decade, visual culture studies have become more globally-focused. Many programs have added lines or concentrations in global media to their offerings. UTM has the potential to do this as well. By forming strategic alliances with institutions across the metropolitan Toronto area, DVS could emerge as a leader in this area, both locally and internationally.

7. Other Thoughts

Over the course of our visit we were apprised of a number of "minor irritants" which would seem to be fairly easily resolved. Doing so would have a strong effect in morale. The lighting situation in classrooms used for DVS courses has already been mentioned in this regard. Another was the system for compensating TAs who must travel from central Toronto to the Mississauga campus. Rather than reimbursing TAs at the end of the term, by which time they may have expended a tidy sum, given that this is really an internal accounting procedure it would surely be possible to issue TAs with "tickets" in advance. Similarly, there is no obvious reason why TAs teaching tutorials "back to back" could not have them scheduled in the same classroom. For faculty, one source of considerable annoyance was the ability of students to register for a course in week 3 of a term ... something that simply doesn't work at all for the studio courses at Sheridan, where there are also safety issues to be considered.

Conclusion

In conclusion, the Department of Visual Studies at the University of Toronto compares favorably to similar programs in the United States and the UK. It has a strong and respected faculty and a rigorous curricular profile. With the proper resources and support, it will continue to be a leading program in the field.



October 3, 2016

Professor Sioban Nelson
Vice-Provost, Academic Programs
Simcoe Hall
University of Toronto

Dear Sioban,

I am writing to provide an administrative response to the External Review of UTM's Department of Visual Studies (DVS), which was held in February of 2016. I am pleased with the largely favorable review which praised the supportive atmosphere of the department along with noting the strength of the faculty's scholarly accomplishments, the quality of the programs' learning outcomes and the caliber of their communication with students. As noted in the report, with proper resources and continued support, the Department will continue to provide leading programs in the field. An implementation plan with timelines can be found at the end of this letter.

Curriculum and Program Delivery

The reviewers reflected students' concern that communication between Sheridan and the Department of Visual Studies could be improved, noting that students felt that they are taking two programs instead of one.

The Department acknowledges that the physical distance between the two campuses (Sheridan and UTM) and the very different nature of the classes offered to students on each campus can sometimes be difficult to navigate and balance. The Art and Art History program does have two very distinct sides but the Department does not see this as a weakness since it is one of the unique and positive aspects of the program. The program is distinctive in its combination of academic rigour and intensive studio experience.

The DVS will help students better manage these differences by offering time management workshops and offering more discussion about the nature of the different sides of the program at orientation and in classes at the beginning of each year. There is collegial communication between Sheridan AAH faculty and the DVS concerning curriculum, recruitment and other matters, though the DVS can and will do more to encourage cross-institutional faculty interaction, through meetings, social events, and special events.



The reviewers found that resources to support English language learners could be improved.

Decanal Priorities funding for the DVS's English Language Learners (ELL) Initiative has been renewed, which means that the DVS can continue to offer peer advising for ELL and international students. The DVS will also continue to offer optional ELL tutorials in conjunction with its core introductory courses. These have been developed by Dr. Laura Taylor, the Robert Gillespie Academic Skills Centre's ELL Specialist, in consultation with the relevant instructors. The tutorials focus on helping students acquire foundational vocabulary and gain confidence in speaking in tutorial-sized groups. This year the DVS will also be offering the option of a Co-Curricular Record annotation in discipline-specific language skills to students who attend and participate in a sufficient number of the tutorials.

The reviewers recommended that classroom lighting be improved, especially given the visual nature of the disciplines taught.

Visual Studies classes have particular lighting needs which are currently difficult to meet due to space constraints on campus. The administration has just finished refurbishing two large lecture halls for Cinema Studies courses, equipping them with appropriate sound systems, projectors, and lighting conditions. A new building under construction on campus, North2, scheduled to open in September of 2018, includes a large number of smaller classrooms that will have the kind of functionality needed by DVS. More important, that additional capacity will ease pressures on overall classroom supply, making it easier for DVS to be scheduled into already existing (properly equipped) classrooms.

Program Development

The reviewers encouraged the department to expand its program offerings, including adding major options to the popular Cinema Studies and Visual Culture minors and creating a certificate in Curatorial Studies. They also noted the waning interest in the Visual Culture & Communication specialist.

Developing a Cinema Studies Major is a DVS priority. Discussions are underway and a question of timeline is now being considered, with respect to resource requirements. While the Visual Culture Minor continues to grow, it was introduced just two years ago and consideration for the creation of a Major can be deferred for another few years. The DVS proposal for a Certificate in Curatorial Studies is currently moving through the governance process. The DVS will consider ways to update the Visual Culture and

Communication Specialist curriculum and make it more distinctive in the hopes of regaining lost numbers.

Faculty

The reviewers recommended that the faculty complement plan include expansion in cinema studies and Islamic art and architecture.

The DVS currently has these positions in their own plan and is encouraged to know that the external reviewers presented such a recommendation concerning priority areas of hires and the urgency for those hires. Increasing the faculty complement is an important priority for UTM, and the allocation of such increases will aim to continue the support of programs, areas and fields with high student interest, demand, and pedagogical warrant.

Relationships

The reviewers noted concerns over participation in the tri-campus graduate program.

DVS faculty do participate actively in their tri-campus graduate programs as supervisors, instructors, and in other ways. However, they share concerns about financial and other pressures that sometimes prevent equitable consideration for administrative positions in their tri-campus graduate units with which they are affiliated. Addressing tri-campus graduate issues is a priority of the Vice Principal, Academic and Dean and we are hoping to have productive discussions with the Dean of the School of Graduate Studies and others related to issues of participation, inclusion and resources over the next year.

The reviewers underscored the importance of providing better support for the Blackwood Gallery, noting its potential for providing connections to the local community and beyond.

The Blackwood Gallery has already received additional support in terms of staffing and equipment. The Blackwood's staff complement has been increased from 1.6 to 3.0 FTE, and funds have been allocated for equipment and infrastructure upgrades over the next year. The new administration recognises the Blackwood's potential for providing connections to the local community and beyond.



The reviewers remarked that the department would benefit from a stronger relationship with advancement to support the department's goal of creating an endowed chair.

Since the external review took place, Advancement has met with the Chair of the DVS and the Director/Curator of the Blackwood Gallery twice to discuss needs and goals. Better communication has been established about funding sources, prospective donations, and the like.

Implementation Plan – Department of Visual Studies; UTM

The Dean undertook in consultation with the Department to support the following changes:

- Immediate Term (6 months)
 - Improving the communication between Sheridan and the Department of Visual Studies in order to address the perception by students of taking two programs instead of one.
 - The Department is offering time management workshops and offering more discussion about the nature of the different sides of the program at orientation and in classes at the beginning of each year.
 - The Department will do more to encourage cross-institutional faculty interaction, through meetings, social events, and special events.
 - Improving the resources available to support English language learners.
 - The Department has received Decanal Priorities funding for their English Language Learners (ELL) Initiative. As a result, they will continue to offer optional ELL tutorials in conjunction with its core introductory courses.
 - Improving classroom lighting.
 - The administration has just finished refurbishing two large lecture halls for Cinema Studies courses, equipping them with appropriate sound systems, projectors, and lighting conditions.
 - Expansion of program offerings and creation of a certificate.
 - The Department is now discussing and anticipating to develop a major in Cinema Studies. Within the Department, they are finalizing their anticipated timeline and resource requirements.
 - The Department proposal for a Certificate in Curatorial Studies is currently moving through the governance process.
 - Providing better support for the Blackwood Gallery.
 - The Blackwood's staff complement has been increased from 1.6 to 3.0 FTE, and funds have been allocated for equipment and infrastructure upgrades over the next year.



- Establishing a stronger relationship with Advancement.
 - Better communication has been established about funding sources, prospective donations, and the like following two meetings between the Department and Advancement.
- Medium Term (1-2 years)
 - Improving classroom lighting.
 - A new building under construction on campus, North2, is scheduled to open in September of 2018, and will include a large number of smaller classrooms that will have the kind of functionality needed by the Department.
 - Expansion of faculty complement in areas of cinema studies and Islamic Art and Architecture.
 - Increasing the faculty complement is an important priority for UTM and the Dean's Office will work with the Department to address this, given that such positions are already in their own plan.
 - Participation in tri-campus graduate program
 - Addressing tri-campus graduate issues is a priority of the Vice Principal, Academic and Dean. The Dean's Office is planning to have productive discussions with the Dean of the School of Graduate Studies and others related to issues of participation, inclusion and resources over the next year.
- Long Term (3-6 years)
 - Expansion of faculty complement in areas of cinema studies and Islamic Art and Architecture.
 - Increasing the faculty complement is an important priority for UTM and the Dean's Office will work with the Department to address this, given that such positions are already in their own plan.

Please let me know if you have any questions about this response.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads 'Amrita Danieri'.

Amrita Danieri
Vice-Principal, Academic and Dean

EXTERNAL REVIEW OF
THE DEPARTMENT
OF LANGUAGE STUDIES

Date of Review: Monday, February 29 and Tuesday, March 1, 2016

Name & Contact of Reviewer:

Professor Andrea Ciccarelli

aciccare@indiane.edu

Name & Contact of Reviewer:

Professor Lucie Hotte

lhotte@uottawa.ca

Faculty/Division under review:	Department of Language Studies University of Toronto Mississauga
Program(s) under review:	Education Studies (Minor) English Language Linguistics (Minor) French Studies (Specialist/ Major/ Minor) French and Italian (Specialist) Francophone Studies (Minor) Functional French (Minor) Italian (Specialist/ Major/ Minor) Language Teaching and Learning: French (Major) Language Teaching and Learning: Italian (Major) Language Teaching and Learning: French and Italian (Specialist) Linguistic Studies (Major/Minor)
Commissioning Officer:	Interim Vice-Principal Academic and Dean, Kelly Hannah-Moffat Office of the Dean, University of Toronto Mississauga
Date of scheduled review:	Monday, February 29, 2016 Tuesday, March 1, 2016
Name of Reviewers:	Prof. Andrea Ciccarelli, Indiana University Prof. Lucie Hotte, University of Ottawa

1. Review Summary

The Department of Language Studies is a very collegiate work environment. Students love it where as Faculty and staff enjoy working there even though they find that their workload has expanded over the years and, in the case of faculty members, that their teaching load is unjust when compared to that of other departments at UTM and of the comparable departments at Saint-George Campus. Not only are they teaching more courses than their colleagues (2.5 instead of 2), they are also bearing the weight of numerous wonderful outreach programs. These are a plus-value to the Italian and French programs, but benefit also the Teaching and Learning and the Linguistics programs. In fact, all the programs that are offered are sound at this time, but all this may be compromised by lack of sufficient full-time faculty lines. Three experienced professors (Salvatore Bancheri, Michael Lettieri and Pascal Michelucci) are on loan for administrative duties and one is retiring this spring (Michel Lord). Thus only one Full Professor, Charles Elkabas, does not have time-consuming administrative duties. This situation also has a negative impact on the teaching offerings, since administrators have a smaller teaching load. The Department has made do with the hire of sessional and limited-term lecturers. It has also opened “teaching stream” positions, which allows it to offer more courses taught by regular faculty members. If this situation solves temporarily the teaching workload problems, it is nevertheless detrimental to research since Teaching Stream Faculty members normally are required to do research only in the pedagogical field –although in the case of the department of LS, some of the teaching stream colleagues do publish on literature, linguistics, teaching and learning, and culture. Research output is also affected by the fact that those on administrative duties have little time to do research and publish as much as seasoned colleagues usually do. So far, in the Italian program, especially because of the publications of Michael Lettieri in the field of Renaissance philology, the research output, particularly for its quality, has been preserved. However, if we add to this situation that Michel Lord, the most published of the French faculty members, is retiring, the overall reputation in research of the department may suffer considerably. To avoid an unbalance that would make the department mostly a teaching unit, this

whole issue will need to be addressed soon. Teaching is also impacted by the lack of full-time positions. In Italian, for instance, since both Full Professors are holding important administrative positions there is no tenured full-time faculty. The administration of the program and the teaching falls upon an Assistant Professor (teaching stream) and a Limited Term Lecturer. The teaching of other languages is a plus-value for the Department, since it makes it known to numerous students and brings in money from the large classes. However some of the sessional and course instructors who teach these courses feel exploited. Some have argued for the creation of new programs in Chinese, Arabic and Spanish. Eventually, it could be wise to expand these languages into programs; we do not recommend this course of action at the present time. It would be better, in fact, to reinforce the existing programs and encourage research output as a priority for the next five years.

Summary of recommendations

1. Maintain the outreach programs that contribute to the strong reputation of the Department of Language Studies
2. Consolidate the programs under the four disciplines: French, Italian, Linguistics and Teaching and Learning.
3. Hiring at least one Tenure Stream Faculty in each unit will be necessary to consolidate the Italian and French Programs.
4. The feeling of inequity generated by the perceived heavier workload will need to be palliated. The Department has to look into this since it is a major grievance of all professors.
5. Measures should be put in place to encourage research. One such measure could be offering one course release for every three-years grant of at least \$ 10,000/year held as a PI. It should have a minor impact on the teaching workload since it is only one course release every three years, but it may encourage professors to ask for grants and feel that the research they do is valued.

2. Program Evaluation Criteria

The Department of Languages Studies offers sixteen programs as well as elective language courses. Two programs are being phased out: the French and Italian specialist and the Francophone Studies minor. These two programs were not evaluated. There are discussions to replace the French and Italian specialist by a Specialist in Romance Languages. The creation of such a specialist would necessitate the development of a Minor program in Spanish. It may not be wise to do so at this time since the department seems to be overly overextended as it is. The need to hire in the Italian and French programs should supersede the development of new areas of teaching.

Since several programs share resources and faculty members, we will review them by disciplines: French Studies, Italian Studies, Language Learning and Teaching, and Linguistics. There has been a considerable increase in students' registration. The new name of the Department may have help attract more students. Although the department is teaching-oriented, retention rate was down in the 2013 for unknown reason and graduation rates are still low. A further investigation maybe by the mean of a survey of students how have left may help identify why students are leaving.

All programs use a variety of learning tools. Among them, experiential learning through outreach programs plays a major role. Not surprisingly, students love being involved in the Italian play and the French Summer camp. A true co-op program would be a nice addition. Students also enjoy having the possibility to study abroad. The Facilitated Students Group are also used as a learning tool. As they involve students mentoring, it helps both the mentor and the mentee.

The department offers scholarships, editorial and research assistantships. Students would like to have job counseling in order.

Learning outcomes are clear and pertinent. Course offering is somewhat of an issue with students since many courses are offered every second year. This is common practice in most small departments and is not usually an obstacle per se. However, if courses were offered sporadically, without a clear calendar – some students suggested that this was the case, although we could not confirm it – this would be a problem since students would not be able to plan ahead the course choices. Students have also mentioned that they would appreciate summer courses but most universities have cut down on them because of low registration. It may be worthwhile for the department to look into it.

2.1 French Studies

Five programs are offered in French Studies: French Studies Specialist, Major, Minor; Functional French Minor and Francophone Studies Minor. French is also taught in the French and Italian Specialist and the Language Teaching and Learning, French which will be reviewed in that section of our report. The French professors view the loss of faculty as the major challenge of the discipline. They said that morale is low since there are so few people to do administrative work. At the time of our visit, the head of the department was also acting as program coordinator for the French Studies program. This is not the best solution as his workload becomes too heavy. The French Studies programs have been recently revamped. Our evaluation is based on the program descriptions that were submitted to us.

The programs in French Studies show strong enrolments.

➤ Objectives

The specialist and major programs are aimed at students who wish to study French language and literature whereas the Minor in French Studies is typically taken to acquire or maintain bilingualism. The Functional French program is intended for students who do not wish to specialize in any of the French disciplines but still want to maintain a good level of competence in French.

➤ Admission requirements

Admission requirements are up to par. The GPA for admission is very high.

➤ Curriculum and Program Delivery

The course offering covers the main areas of Francophone cultures and literatures. It is quite impressive for such a small department. The curriculum is well thought and designed. Teaching Québécois and French-Canadian literature may prove a challenge when Michel Lord retires.

➤ **Assessment of Learning**

The methods of assessment of learning are diversified and are geared toward the development of writing and reading skills as well as communication skills. Some programs aim at developing analytical skills and critical thinking through the study of literature. Group presentations, essay writing and oral activities in class provide a thorough appraisal of acquired skills. Facilitated Study Groups help through the coaching of junior students by senior students who have excelled in their courses. Experiential learning and internships are possible in Specialist and Major programs.

➤ **Quality Indicators**

The quality of the program and its thoroughness is clear. Department has “one of the highest final-year achievement grade for an average of 3.15”. The major program requires a minimum grade of 63% in the first year courses in order to enroll. Many students pursue graduate studies after completing their undergraduate program.

2.2 Italian Studies

➤ **Objectives**

The specialist and major/ minor programs are aimed at students who wish to study Italian language, literature, and culture. Italian has a strong community base in the Toronto area and Ontario, and therefore the diversification in teaching both a traditional curriculum based on literature and cinema, and one more focused on cultural events (theatre, Italian food/ cuisine...) works well for the program.

➤ **Admission requirements**

Admission requirements are competitive with other first-rate universities. GPA is high. Students are sharp and high achieving.

➤ **Curriculum and Program Delivery**

As mentioned in the Objectives category, the curriculum covers Italian literature and culture in general. The issue, as stressed in the Review Summary, is the lack of senior or full-time research Italian faculty in regards to the size of the program. With Professor Lettieri and Bancheri tied up in heavy administrative tasks, the current teaching staff (two: Lobalsamo, teaching-stream, and Grimaldi, Limited-Term lecturer) needs to be commended for their commitment and for offering a broad variety of courses. The Italian play class, which requires a huge preparation and involves a large number of students/participants, is very successful, links the program with the external community, and has a strong fund-raising appeal.

➤ **Assessment of Learning**

As with other units of the department, assessment of learning focuses on writing/reading skills, as well as on a strong communicative method, enhanced by classes such as those on theatre and food. Analytical skills and critical thinking are developed through the study of literature. Presentations, essay writing and oral activities in class are good indicators of acquired skills.

➤ **Quality Indicators**

The Italian program quality is remarkable and has fought off well the lack of full-time faculty members. This has been possible, in good part, also because of professor Lettieri's commitment to teaching and to outreaching, despite his long history of administrative duties. A good number of students pursue graduate studies after completing their undergraduate program. The programs abroad, in Florence and Siena, have an excellent reputation and students are excited about the perspective to attend. Students are accepted in a variety of graduate program and have a successful job-rate.

2.3 Language Teaching and Learning

Three programs are offered in Language Teaching and Learning, a Major in French, one in Italian and one in French and Italian.

It is important to note that the Language Teaching and Learning programs were impacted negatively by the phasing out of the Concurrent Teacher Education Program.

➤ **Objectives**

Learning outcomes for the Language Teaching and Learning programs are as follows:

- 1) A sound knowledge of the theories, research methods, teaching methods, and teaching tools that pertain to language teaching and learning;
- 2) The development of strategies and tools applicable to a variety of teaching and learning situations;
- 3) The development of transferable skills, through awareness of the diversity of learners' need and abilities, and
- 4) An excellent preparation for future studies at the Ontario Institute for Studies in Education (OISE) or another institution's Faculty of Education.

➤ **Admission requirements**

Admission requirements are good; students come for French or French immersion schools with an average GPA around or above 80% for the French Major. Those enrolled in the French and Italian Major have grade 12 in French, Italian, or were enrolled in French immersion schools. They also enter with an average of 80% or above. In order to register for the Italian Major in Language Teaching and Learning, students have to have successfully completed 4.0 credits.

➤ **Curriculum and Program Delivery**

The curriculum includes courses in language acquisition, psycholinguistics, and pedagogy as well as in literature and language proficiency. It covers all the main aspects of language teaching and learning. The program delivery is based on previous acquired skills and thus gets more specialized in the last year.

➤ **Assessment of Learning**

Methods of assessment are similar to those in the French and Italian Studies programs and are geared toward the development of the same type of skills. In addition, students are asked to reflect on teaching practice and transferring of knowledge. Experiential learning is also embedded within the program's courses.

➤ **Quality Indicators**

The quality indicators for these programs indicate that they are sound. Students are finding employment in related fields. Their average in the final year is comparable to those of the other programs.

2.4 Linguistics

➤ **Objectives**

The program focuses mostly on applied linguistics. This specialization plays a vital role as it wisely diversifies UTM program from the St. George's Linguistics department (mostly centered on theory). The major/minor reflect this interest and it aims at students interested in pedagogy and in pedagogical theories. The intersection with the scholarly interests of some of the linguists in the other programs (especially in French) makes its academic mission even stronger.

➤ **Admission requirements**

GPA is high and students have strong language basis.

➤ **Curriculum and Program Delivery**

Linguistics offers a rich curriculum. There is a major in Linguistics Studies, a minor in English Language Linguistics and a minor in Linguistics. There are also programs in Languages other than English.

➤ **Assessment of Learning**

Methods of assessment are similar to those of the other programs, although they also reflect the diverse curriculum and goal of the discipline, geared more to anthropological and psychological aspects of language learning and studies.

➤ **Quality Indicators**

As for the other programs students have to go through a rigorous academic curriculum. Students interested in graduate schools are accepted and others find suitable jobs.

2.5 OTHER LANGUAGES

Aside for German, because of the specific situation (prof Soldovieri is only 40% at UTM and teaches mostly at St. George), our impression is that the other languages (especially Chinese, Arabic, and Spanish), at different levels, have strong potential for growth. While we do not recommend an

immediate development into Programs, because this would require investing full-time positions that are instead essential to strengthen the existing Programs, we can recommend hiring some extra instructors to alleviate the high numbers in some of the basic courses, as well as to allow more upper-level classes. In view of a future expansion, even a modest one that allows for more advanced classes, the department may want to reconsider the pedagogical qualifications of some of the current instructors, as they may be less inclined or adept to teach cultural topic courses.

3. Research

The Department of Languages Studies has eleven tenure stream faculty members, including five Full Professors, five Associate Professors (one has a 40% cross-appointment) and one Assistant Professor. Several of them have important administrative duties:

- Salvatore Bancheri (Italian Studies, Literature; Chair, Italian Department, St. George and Director of the Frank Iacobucci Centre for Italian Canadian Studies)
- Michael Lettieri (Italian Studies, Literature; Acting Vice-Dean, Undergraduate, UTM; Editor, *Italica*, Official Journal of the AATI)
- Pascal Michelucci (French Studies, Literature; Chair, Department of French, St. George)
- Emmanuel Nikiema (French, Linguistics, Chair, Department of Language Studies)
- Stefan Soldovieri (cross-appointment German (40%), Acting Department Chair, Department of Germanic Languages and Literatures – as of July 1, 2016)

One (Michel Lord, French Studies, French-Canadian Literature) is set to retire in 2016. The other professors are quite young but promising:

- Arsalan Kahnwmuyipour (Linguistics): Ph.D. 2004, at UTM since 2010, holds a SSHRC Insight Grant, published an important book in 2009, prior his hiring by UTM, four articles and a book chapter since his hire, three more are forthcoming.
- Mihaela Pirvulescu (Linguistics, French Studies): Ph.D. 2002, at UTM since 2003, held a SSHRC Standard research Grant from 2009-2013 and had an internal grant in 2015, has published 21 articles and book chapters since 2003
- Katherine Rehner (Linguistics, Teaching and Learning): Ph.D. 2002, at UTM since 2006, has receive numerous honours as a student, has held a SSHRC grant from 2011-2015 and an Ministry of Education grant (2013-2014), has published 2 books (one in 2004 before her hiring by UTM, 19 articles (7 since 2006) and 6 book chapters.

These last researchers' expertise is mainly in the field of Linguistics. This attests to the strength of the department in this area of research. The latest hire, Marie-Paule Lory is in French Studies, Teaching and Learning (Ph.D. date not given in CV, at UTM since July 2015). It is a bit too early to tell whether she will become a renowned researcher. Her current research output is good: 6 articles and book chapters.

Many professors in the Department are in teaching stream positions. Although some of them manage to maintain a publication record, their output is lower than in other research universities, which is understandable.

It is our opinion that the combination of a heavy teaching load, large groups (several classes have

more than a hundred students) and the management of numerous outreach activities are detrimental to research. In addition, professors in managerial positions are less productive since they have less time (if any) for research. Research funding is also affected by this situation.

Recommendations:

- Implement measures to encourage professors to ask for research funding such as internal funding, course releases when a grant has been obtained (such as a course release for a three years grant, two for a five years grant)
- Hire tenure stream professors in Italian and French or convert some teaching stream position in tenure stream “research” positions
- Foster research cluster since the diversity of expertise is not conducive to research teams
- Finance research assistantships

4. Relationships

The morale of faculty, students and staff is quite good: they enjoy studying and working in the Department that they perceive as being very collegiate. It is clear that they believe, with very few exceptions, that the department is well guided and has a history of good leadership. The workload is what hurts the most. Professors feel that the situation is unfair as they have a 2.5-teaching load, whereas colleagues at St. George campus and in other humanities departments at UTM teach 2 courses per semester. All the professors that we met during our visit voiced this feeling of inequity. They feel frustrated, see the potential for growth, but cannot envision how to make it happen in the actual context. Professors have to juggle many responsibilities: teaching, student mentoring, program coordination, outreach programs coordination, hiring of TA's, supervising graduate students and research assistants, internships. The program coordinators have stated that there are so very few professors, that they feel they have no choice in accepting more responsibilities. Even though this situation does not promote research, many professors are nevertheless collaborating with colleagues in other universities and organizations on research projects. Several of them have held or hold important position in professional organizations. More importantly, the Department maintains excellent ties to the community thanks to its outreach activities such as the Italian play and the French Summer Camp. These activities are also great recruiting tools since they are also aimed at high school students or at parents of small children. In the end, relationships are a major asset of the Department.

Recommendations:

- Maintain outreach and study abroad programs which are a strong asset of the Department
- Alleviate the workload of professors in charge of outreach programs or programs coordinators by funding students assistantship or by offering work-study programs for students

5. Organizational and Financial Structure

The organizational structure is sound. The personnel are courteous and dedicated to the administrative and academic mission of the department. In this regard, the chair, Professor Nikiema, clearly plays a major role in mediating between academic decisions and administrative choices. His experience is proven, and he shows an open mind to new ideas as well as to the opportunity and possibility to implement them without upsetting the current structure of the department. There was some concern on the part of the staff, including the department supervisor (Robert Eberts), about

the increasing working load, due to the new and demanding activities. We felt that especially the Undergraduate Counselor (Rosa Ciantar) and the Department Assistant & Special Projects Coordinator (Joanna Szewczyk) face a lot of sudden issues that take time away from their regular scheduled functions. Their job description has grown considerably in these past years, and it seems reasonable that hiring a couple of student assistants, on a regular basis, will free some of their time to focus more on major activities such as the Florence Program preparation or Tenure and Promotion cases, that, naturally, take much of their time.

The financial structure is handled well by the Department Supervisor and seems to be sufficiently healthy, and allows for academic and extra academic activities. Naturally, we are not including in this section the financial need related to new hires.

6. Long-Range Planning Challenges

Some of the challenges have been anticipated in the previous sections. Major issues on the medium/long-range are:

- Preserving the strong positive collegiality through future leadership.
- Fostering and increasing research productivity through hires, course reduction and grant incentives, while balancing the teaching potential and opportunities already in place.
- Replacing or flanking with full-time research stream positions in French/ Francophone and Italian professors who are retiring or who, in a few years, may retire directly from their current administrative positions.
- Increasing the strength of the backbone programs, French, Italian and Linguistics, focusing on specific hires in fields that need developing and have strong outreach potential (Francophone, Italian Drama, language pedagogy, etc.).
- Bring the teaching load from 2.5 to two courses per semester, as in other humanities units at UTM (→ this challenge should actually be accomplished as soon as possible, as it is pivotal for the development of research productivity and of the general moral of the faculty).
- Capitalizing on courses or activities such as the Italian Play and the French Summer Camp for fund raising opportunities.
- Integrating into the annual academic program a variety of popular cultural classes that now cannot be taught on a regular basis.
- Developing current language studies –especially Chinese, Arabic and Spanish— into Programs. This would require rethinking the current teaching staff, in part, and planning some teaching stream positions in these fields.
- Avoiding overcrowded classes in some disciplines (Spanish, for instance), hiring new full-time personnel, and allowing for more sections and for more upper classes in those subjects.

7. International Comparators

It is always difficult to make international comparisons because of the different systems and ways of structuring and administering departments and units. The department of LS is clearly a strong, well-balanced unit, with a great potential for increasing its already impressive ranking in its field of studies (according to the QS University World Ranking it was n.1 in Canada and 21 in the world in 2014/15). This potential can be unleashed through two-three key research stream hires in French, Italian and Linguistics (this last one is currently hiring, as far as we know, and this is why we insist on French and Italian for new positions). New full-time faculty with strong research interests will preserve and possibly increase the already strong reputation of the department.



October 3, 2016

Professor Sioban Nelson
Vice-Provost, Academic Programs
Simcoe Hall
University of Toronto

Dear Sioban,

I am writing to provide an administrative response to the External Review of UTM's Department of Language Studies (DLS), which was held in February of 2016. I am pleased with the largely favorable review, which praised the collegial work environment and strong outreach work of the Department along with the tremendous productivity of the faculty. It is great to see reviewers acknowledging the Department for offering high quality and popular programs that attract and produce high-achieving students. I envision that, with continued support, the Department will continue to provide leading programs in the field. An implementation plan with timelines can be found at the end of this letter.

Curriculum and Program Delivery

The reviewers recommended consolidating the programs under the four disciplines—French, Italian, Linguistics, and Teaching and Learning—in order to build on current strengths.

The Department agrees with the reviewers' recommendation to consolidate the programs under the four disciplines. Consultations and discussions with student groups, cognate departments (that may be affected) and faculty are being initiated. These discussions will lead to a decision to be taken during a planned May 2017 departmental retreat, in time to initiate Major Curriculum changes for the fall of 2018 if needed.

The Department has also decided to streamline their program offerings through the closure of the Francophone Studies Minor and the French and Italian Specialist degrees. They are in the process of scheduling meetings with my Office to enquire and gather information about administratively suspending admissions prior to the potential closure of admissions through the UTM governance process.

The reviewers encouraged the department to examine the frequency of course offerings and a clear calendar of course offerings, the possibility of summer courses, and, as the complement expands, offer classes with a popular cultural focus on a more regular basis.



The department will increase the number of courses offered yearly by reducing the number of courses currently offered in rotation. This will help create a clearer picture of course offerings at any given time. This increase in course offerings is now possible due to faculty positions added in 2015 and 2016 (in French and in Linguistics) and to two new positions approved for July 2017 in Linguistics and in Italian (searches are in progress).

Faculty

The reviewers encouraged the department to reflect on the right mix of responsibilities and appointment categories to support its many programs and courses and to support the research mission.

The DLS values the reviewer's suggestion in this regard, and feels further encouraged and motivated to reflect on the right mix of responsibilities and appointment categories to support their programs, courses, and research. The Department is confident that this particular issue will be addressed as the faculty complement grows. In addition, this challenge will be discussed and addressed at the retreat in May 2017. We note that the Department hopes to specifically explore possibilities for the equitable assignment of duties across all faculty in hopes of reaching a better balance of responsibilities to support their programs.

While the reviewers supported the eventual expansion of existing language studies courses (e.g., Arabic, Chinese, etc.) into full academic programs, they noted that this would require a rethink of the current complement, and recommended instead that the department focus on supporting existing programs in terms of faculty growth and research output, specifically in French and Italian.

As far as eventual program expansion is concerned, the reviewers caution against adding new programs in growing enrolment areas in the languages (Arabic and Chinese) without accompanying increases in faculty complement. The DLS agrees that their efforts should be focused on strengthening existing programs at the moment and to support the expansion of existing language courses. In terms of faculty hiring and research output in areas of priority, the DLS intends on also discussing this item at the upcoming Department retreat in May 2017.

Since their academic plan of 2012, the DLS has added 5 positions (3 teaching stream in FRE, LIN and ITA and 2 tenure stream in LIN and FRE). They are also currently searching this year for a tenure track hire in Linguistics and a 5-year Contractually Limited Term Appointment in Italian. With a recent retirement of a faculty member in the DLS, they

believe it is also urgent to replace that faculty compliment in the area of Quebec French literature.

The growth in other language areas is going to be monitored carefully. Student enrolment has increased in some of the languages for which there are no programs, such as in Chinese and Spanish. The DLS anticipates eventually proposing new minor programs and faculty hires in these two areas when warranted, given that these two language areas have grown steadily for the past 5 years. Adding such programs will only strengthen the mandate of the Department.

Relationships

The reviewers found the outreach programs offered by the department to be very strong, and made recommendations to help maintain them.

DLS was happy to read that the reviewers recommended maintaining their unique and popular outreach programs. The DLS believes that outreach and study abroad opportunities are strong assets and crucial to the success of their academic programs. As a result, they fully intend to continue excelling in this regard.

The DLS is also discussing whether increases to staffing compliments are needed, especially given the reviewers recommendation that in order to continue the high number of outreach programs, more staff persons are required. We continually monitor administrative staffing levels in all our departments to ensure that their needs are being met, including adequate support for their priority initiatives, extra-curricular activities, internships, experiential learning opportunities, international studies, and overall learning and writing improvement.

Implementation Plan – Department of Language Studies; UTM

The Dean undertook in consultation with the Department to support the following changes:

- Immediate Term (6 months)
 - Consolidating the programs under the four disciplines—French, Italian, Linguistics, and Teaching and Learning
 - Consultations and discussions with student groups, cognate departments (that may be affected) and faculty are being initiated.
 - Decision to be made during retreat in May 2017
 - The Department will administratively suspend admissions prior to the potential closure of admissions through the UTM governance process.



- Examination of the frequency of course offerings
 - The department will increase the number of courses offered yearly by reducing the number of courses currently offered in rotation.
- Supporting existing programs in terms of faculty growth and research output
 - Since their academic plan of 2012, the Department has added 5 positions (3 teaching stream in FRE, LIN and ITA and 2 tenure stream in LIN and FRE). They are also currently searching this year for a tenure track hire in Linguistics and a 5-year Contractually Limited Term Appointment in Italian.
- Maintain outreach
 - The Department believes that outreach and study abroad opportunities are strong assets and crucial to the success of their academic programs. As a result, they fully intend to continue excelling in this regard. They are also discussing whether increasing staffing compliments are needed to support their high number of outreach programs.
- Medium Term (1-2 years)
 - Consolidating the programs under the four disciplines—French, Italian, Linguistics, and Teaching and Learning
 - Based on decision made at retreat in May 2017, major curriculum changes for the fall of 2018 can be initiated if needed.
 - Establishing the right mix of responsibilities and appointment categories to support programs, courses and the research mission
 - The Department is confident that this particular issue will be addressed as the faculty complement grows. In addition, this challenge will be discussed and addressed at the retreat in May 2017.
 - Supporting existing programs in terms of faculty growth and research output
 - The Department anticipates eventually proposing new minor programs and faculty hires in the two areas of Chinese and Spanish. Adding such programs would strengthen the mandate of the department.

Please let me know if you have any questions about this response.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Amrita Daniere".

Amrita Daniere
Vice-Principal, Academic and Dean



September 27, 2016

Professor Sioban Nelson
Vice-Provost, Academic Programs
Simcoe Hall
University of Toronto

Dear Sioban,

I am writing to provide a follow-up report to the March 2015 external review of the Department of English and Drama at UTM and the administrative response of September 10, 2015. This report thus focuses specifically on sexism in the classroom and, more broadly, issues of equity and diversity, which were identified by the reviewers.

As explained in our administrative response, the Chair anticipated inviting UTM's Equity and Diversity Officer (EDO) to the Department's first Fall Faculty meeting to deliver a presentation and to advise on how to ensure the classroom functions as a safe space. We are pleased to note that in November 2015, Professor Alexandra Gillespie (then Undergraduate Director; 2015-16) with the support of Professor Holger Syme (then Department Chair), arranged for such a presentation to be delivered. Nythalah Baker (UTM's then EDO) provided a 90-minute information session for all teaching faculty in the department. Her presentation and the discussion that followed covered important topics, including strategies for establishing and maintaining a safe classroom working space as well as detailing the resources available for faculty and students in crisis.

Prior to and since taking on the role of Chair in July of this year, Professor Gillespie met and/or communicated with members of the University community, to alert them to the challenges with equity and diversity facing English and Drama, and to obtain their advice and guidance. They have included Kelly Hannah Moffat, Amrita Daniere, Mayo Moran, Liz Smythe, Locke Rowe, Sioban Nelson, Connie Guberman, Bonnie Goldberg, David Cameron, and at UTFA, Heather Diggle. These consultations have and will continue to shape English and Drama's evolving policies and practices on equity and diversity.

Since becoming the new Department Chair, Professor Gillespie has undertaken a comprehensive restructuring of UTM English and Drama, done in consultation with the previous Department Chair, as well as faculty and staff. This restructuring is designed to increase faculty involvement in departmental administration; and facilitate consensus-based decision making. Among the new committees Professor Gillespie has established as part of this restructuring is one for Equity and Diversity, on which she and tenure



stream faculty members Stanka Radovic, Mari Ruti, Larry Switzky all serve. All members of this committee conduct research and/or are involved in activism around gender and transgender discrimination, economic inequality, the North-South divide, race, ethnicity and intersectionality, indigeneity, and sexual diversity. The committee has met and established a work-plan for 2016-17, which includes online resources for faculty and students; and carefully facilitated town halls for faculty and students to discuss issues of equity and diversity, including the University's new initiatives in sexual violence prevention.

In consultation with the new English and Drama Curriculum Committee, Professor Gillespie has also designed a number of new courses for the 2017-18 academic year - ahead of a more thorough curriculum reform - that address issues of equity and diversity. These include a 100 level course on Contemporary World Literatures; 200 level courses on Queer Writing; Feminist Approaches to Literature; Toronto's Multicultural Literatures; Indigenous Literatures; and Literature and Globalization; and 300 level courses on Women Writers before Austen; and Global Literatures in English.

With the agreement of the Dean and Provost, this year the UTM Department of English and Drama is searching for new tenure stream faculty member with expertise in Global Anglophone Literatures - including African Literatures, Indigenous Literatures, Asian and/or Pacific Literatures, Arab Anglophone Literatures as well as race, ethnicity, and new media. We anticipate that this hire will further improve the diversity of our course offerings and of our faculty.

Professor Gillespie acted as a facilitator at the September 2016 WISELI workshops on implicit bias and hiring for excellence and diversity organized by the Provost's Office. The job advertisement for the department's new hire in Global Anglophone Literatures was written and is being placed following WISELI's guidelines. Professor Gillespie has asked for and received permission to assemble a diverse committee for the search by increasing the number of members from six to seven, and by reaching out to faculty who work in Global Anglophone literary studies across the three campuses. The committee includes faculty from UTSC and UTSG as well as UTM; four women; four faculty members of colour, one of whom is an Indigenous Canadian; and a LGBTQ+ faculty member. Professor Gillespie also intends to implement the recommendations of WISELI in all hiring for English and Drama, including hiring of full time and casual staff, CUPE Unit 1-5 sessional faculty, and tenure stream and teaching stream faculty.

Through active conversations between my Office and the Department, it is clear that the Department of English and Drama takes the need for improvement in these areas extremely seriously and has taken a number of steps in the last twelve months to address the reviewers concerns.



UNIVERSITY OF
TORONTO
MISSISSAUGA

OFFICE OF THE DEAN

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Amrita Danieri".

Amrita Danieri

Vice-Principal, Academic and Dean