



Memorandum to: Executive Committee

From: Bill Gough, Chair, Elections Committee
Louis R. Charpentier, Secretary of the Governing Council

Date: November 28, 2012

Subject: **UTM and UTSC Campus Council Proposals**

At its meeting of June 25, 2012, the Governing Council approved the following three-part resolution:

THAT the proposed Terms of Reference for Campus Councils and Standing Committees at the University of Toronto Mississauga and at the University of Toronto Scarborough, as described in Appendix “A” attached hereto, be approved in principle to be effective July 1, 2013;

THAT implementation of the proposal proceed on the understanding that the following matters will be brought forward for consideration by the Governing Council at the earliest feasible dates in the 2012-13 governance year:

- quorum provisions for meetings of the Campus Councils and their Standing Committees to take into account representation of the administrative staff, alumni, community, student and teaching staff estates; and
- means to sustain, with the advent of campus-level governance, the spirit of wide consultation embodied in the previous advisory councils that operated on both campuses.

THAT, following the first year of operation, the Governing Council conduct a review of the new model to determine its effectiveness and any changes that might be necessary.

We provided an update to the Executive Committee and the Governing Council at their meetings in October, outlining discussions up to that time, some ideas for possible recommendations and plans for further consultations. This memorandum and the attached documents summarize our recommendations on further steps toward implementation of Campus Councils at UTM and UTSC and on the matters identified in part two of the resolution. Following the October Governing Council meeting, we held three consultation sessions, one on each of the St. George (November 2), UTM (November 8) and UTSC (November 7) campuses. The sessions focussed on seeking

UTM and UTSC Campus Councils/memorandum to governing council re campus councils for meeting of december 3 2012_cvc_pvp comments 21 nov 12.docx

input on the proposed *Election Guidelines*, both in relation to broad questions of representation within the Governing Council's estates (that, if implemented, would take effect in 2014) and on matters related to the Campus Councils. As well, we met with members of the Tri-Campus Coalition on Governance which comprises representatives from the University's student governments and the University of Toronto Faculty Association.

A. Quorum

In light of concerns expressed at the Governing Council meeting in June, we revisited the proposed quorum provision for the Campus Councils and their Standing Committees. The specific concern was that under the proposal's quorum provisions – that is, one-third of the voting members – Campus Council meetings could be held without faculty or student members. It was suggested that a minimum number of faculty and/or student members be required as part of the necessary quorum.

The attached memorandum (Attachment 1) summarizes quorum requirements contained in the *University of Toronto Act* for the Governing Council itself and the Executive Committee, as well as requirements for the Boards and Committees established by the Governing Council. The latter bodies are addressed in *By-law Number 2*, the *Report of the Chairman's Advisory Committee on Governance* (Balfour Report) and the bodies' Terms of Reference. We also summarized attendance of internal and external estates at meetings of the Council and its Boards and Committees over three years.

The constitutions of Divisional Councils, which are also bodies of the Governing Council, are approved by the Academic Board and contain provisions for quorum. At present, 14 Divisions have a quorum requirement of one-third of the voting members, two require half of the voting members and six have less than one-third.

We note that the *Act* requires a minimum representation of Lieutenant Governor-in-Council and alumni governors in the quorum count for the Governing Council and the Executive Committee. While the same provision was considered for inclusion in the Campus Councils proposal, it was agreed that the Campus Councils, although modelled structurally after the Governing Council, would be expected to function in a manner consistent with other bodies of the Council.

After consideration of the various provisions and the attendance data – which indicate that attendance of faculty, staff and student members has not been an issue of concern – we sought the Executive Committee's advice and asked whether it was reasonable to expect that the Campus Councils would be sufficiently different from other Boards and Committees of the Governing Council in their intended responsibilities, membership and operation to warrant quorum provisions that depart from normal practice. The Executive Committee agreed that the proposed quorum requirement of one-third of the voting members should be maintained for the Campus Councils and their Standing Committees.

Following the Governing Council meeting and our consultations, our recommendation remains:

THAT the quorum for meetings of the Campus Councils of the University of Toronto Mississauga and the University of Toronto Scarborough be one-third of the voting members (normally nine).

Although they acknowledge the value of the attendance data provided, some individuals in the consultations remain concerned about not specifying a minimum number of faculty and student representatives as part of quorum requirements.

B. Maintaining the Spirit of Wide Consultation

The existing advisory Councils at UTM and UTSC (comprising approximately 400 and 420 members, respectively) are seen to provide regular opportunities for communication and consultation with a broad range of elected and *ex officio* members on matters affecting the campus communities. Vice-Presidents Saini and Vaccarino recognize the value of an inclusive forum and have agreed to build on the established traditions of the Erindale College Council and the UTSC Council. To that end, they will hold “Principal’s Town Hall” sessions on their respective campuses that will:

1. Be open to all members of the campus, including alumni and interested members of the broader community.
2. In relation to (1), include specific invitations to representative campus groups.
3. Be scheduled once per term with the dates publicized well in advance.
4. Focus on key issues and themes relevant to the campus.
5. Have agendas that will be informed by requests for suggestions and questions from the campus.

Open to all members of the campuses, such sessions would be more inclusive than the existing Councils which, while broadly representative, comprise a specific subset of the campus.

C. Election Guidelines

The Elections Committee is examining two issues in parallel:

1. The distribution of seats within the administrative staff, student and teaching staff estates of the Governing Council and the Academic Board, and
2. Elections procedures for the UTM and UTSC Campus Councils and their Standing Committees.

With respect to (1), the Committee has developed a number of options which were distributed broadly within the University community for input and advice and, as noted above they were the focus of consultation sessions on each of the University's three campuses. Work on this matter has just begun and with input from these initial consultations, the Committee will decide on its next steps. Should any recommendations for change arise from its deliberations, they would need to be approved by the Governing Council and implementation would not occur until 2014.

In the context of (2), we reported in our update to the Governing Council that we had considered suggestions advanced by the group of student government, faculty and librarian representatives through Vice-Presidents Saini and Vaccarino. The group's advice fell within two overarching themes: *ex officio* student government and/or association membership on the Academic Affairs and Campus Affairs Committees and substantially increased numbers of faculty, student and librarian members on both bodies.

We also explained that, in our view, the Governing Council's approval in principle of the Campus Council proposals did not include potentially re-thinking their membership and that of their Standing Committees. We also believe, however, that if some modest adjustment would enable the bodies to function more effectively and facilitate implementation, a recommendation should be made to the Governing Council. Since the Governing Council meeting, we have had the benefit of further input and advice from the campus consultations sessions and discussions with members of the Tri-Campus Coalition on Governance. These conversations informed the recommendations we put forward in the sections below and we appreciate greatly the time and effort that participants dedicated.

D. Ex Officio Membership

Ex officio positions on the Governing Councils and its Boards and Committees are reserved for officers of the Governing Council and for officers of the University. The two positions on the Governing Council itself are specified in the *University of Toronto Act* (the Chancellor and the President), as are two positions on the Executive Committee (the Chair and the President). By-law Number 2 specifies that the Chair and Vice-Chair of the Governing Council, the President and the Chancellor, shall be *ex officio* voting members of all Boards, Standing Committees and Special Committees. It also states that the Secretary shall be *ex officio* a non-voting member of Boards and of any committees

on which authority to act for the Council has been conferred. Board and Committee Terms of Reference include particular provisions for *ex officio* members – for example, the Vice-President and Provost, Principals and Deans on the Academic Board and the Warden of Hart House on the University Affairs Board.

We are not proposing any change to the proposed Council and Committee membership in this regard. Recognizing this legislative and policy framework, members of the Coalition moved from their initial advocacy position requesting *ex officio* voting members and, in recent discussions, asked for *ex officio* non-voting seats. Their intent was to ensure that their electorate's perspective be present and heard at meetings of the Campus Councils. They agree that, to some extent, their objective can be met within the provisions of the existing *Procedures for Non-members to Address the Governing Council, its Boards and Committees*. The *Procedures* provide for preferential consideration of representatives of recognized campus groups – for example, for UTM these could be EPUS, UTMAGS and UTMSU and for UTSC they could be APUS, GSAS and SCSU – stating that requests from these groups to address a committee on a matter on the agenda will normally be granted. They note, however, that the *Procedures* and the need for informing the Chair in advance of meetings limit free participation in deliberations. That is, they are not able to engage in debate once they have presented their views to the committee.

E. Membership Revisions

With the Executive Committee's agreement, we signalled to the Governing Council in October that we would propose various membership changes arising from our consultations. At that time we suggested that the composition of the **Academic Affairs Committees** be revised as follows:

- For UTM, increase the number of teaching staff seats from 12 to 16. This change would ensure that there would be an elected faculty member from each of UTM's Departments, rather than the originally proposed 4 from each of the Humanities, Social Sciences, Physical Sciences and Life Sciences sectors.
- For UTSC, increase the number of student seats from 8 to 9. This change would align the number of seats for UTM and UTSC.

The suggested revisions have been positively received in our consultations and are summarized in Attachment 2. Attachment 3 includes a comparison with the membership of the Academic Board.

With the Executive Committee's agreement, we also signalled that we intended to propose adding one seat for a Librarian to the UTM and UTSC **Campus Affairs Committees**. In recognition of their unique role in the University, they were included as a distinct category in the Academic Board membership. That principle has been extended to the UTM and UTSC Academic Affairs Committees. (Note that under the *University of Toronto Act*, librarians are within the administrative staff estate.) At UTM and UTSC, the libraries (singular on each campus) play more than an academic role and, as a result, it has been suggested that they be included on the Campus Affairs Committees in a

similar fashion. The librarians impact on the two campuses has extended, for example, to playing a leading role in advocating for more student study space, increased research archival space and enhanced IT services. These changes are also summarized in Attachment 2.

Our further consultation sessions – in addition to confirming agreement with these proposals – led to suggestions for two other membership changes, both of which are supported by members of the Tri-Campus Coalition:

- Adding one administrative staff and one community member to the **Campus Councils**, bringing the total membership to 28 (from 26). The increase – which we recommend adopting – could address the consistently expressed concern that administrative staff and librarians have been historically and remain under-represented on the Governing Council and its bodies. It was also recommended that one of the two seats be reserved for a librarian. The addition of the two members is included in Attachment 2 as well.
- Adding two members to the **Agenda Committee** – one teaching staff and one student – to bring the total to 15. This change is intended to address the concern that the Committee could deliberate in the absence of either a teaching staff or student member.

With respect to the latter point, however, we also received feedback from governors that the Agenda Committee, as originally proposed with 13 members, mirrors the composition of the Academic Board's Agenda Committee and is already large for an agenda-setting body. At 15 members, it would be more than half the size of its parent body, the Campus Council. It was suggested instead that a faculty member and a student member from the Campus Council could be appointed by the Council when the Agenda Committee is acting in its role as a nominating committee. In future, should there be a need to establish executive committees for the Campus Councils, their composition would proportionately reflect that of the Governing Council's Executive Committee.

F. Recommendations to the Governing Council

In summary, we recommend that the following be endorsed and forwarded to the Governing Council for approval:

THAT the quorum for meetings of the Campus Councils of the University of Toronto Mississauga and the University of Toronto Scarborough be one-third of the voting members (normally nine).

THAT one elected, non-Governing Council administrative staff member and one appointed, non-Governing Council community member be added to the Campus Councils of the University of Toronto Mississauga and the University of Toronto Scarborough and that, normally, one of the two administrative staff positions be reserved for a librarian;

UTM and UTSC Campus Council Proposals

THAT the Campus Councils of the University of Toronto Mississauga and the University of Toronto Scarborough appoint one additional member of the teaching staff and one additional student member from among their members to their respective Agenda Committees when those Committees are serving as the nominating committees of the Campus Councils;

THAT there be one elected teaching staff member from each of the University of Toronto Mississauga academic departments, increasing the total elected, non-Campus Council teaching staff membership of the Campus Council's Academic Affairs Committee from 12 to 16 members;

THAT there be one additional elected, non-Campus Council student member on the Academic Affairs Committee of the University of Toronto Scarborough Campus Council; and

THAT one elected, non-Campus Council librarian member and one appointed, non-Campus Council community member be added to each of the Campus Affairs Committees of the University of Toronto Mississauga and the University of Toronto Scarborough Campus Councils.