## University of Toronto

## Pension Matters

## Presentation to Pension Committee March 9, 2011

## 1. How are the Roles and Responsibilities Allocated?

## Summary of Roles and Responsibilities

- The Governing Council of the University of Toronto:
- plan sponsor.
- plan administrator.
- Business Board:
- approves benefit provisions and member contributions.
- approves University funding.
- Pension Committee:
- approves actuarial reports and assumptions.
- approves audited financial statements.
- approves investment policy and asset allocation (SIP\&P).
- approves appointment of plan actuary.
- Collective Bargaining:
- benefit provisions.
- member contributions.


## 2. What is the Pension Promise under the U of T Pension Plan?

## Plan Structure

-Defined benefit (DB) pension plan covering faculty and staff of he University of Toronto.
-Funded by contributions from members and university.
-There are two registered plans -RPP and RPP (OISE) and one unregistered plan (Supplemental Retirement Arrangement).

## 3. What are the Pension Plan Liabilities and Assets?

## How a Defined Benefit Plan Works



## The Liabilities

## Components are:

- Number of members.
- Plan benefits.
- Assumptions used to calculate liabilities.

Minus

- Pension payments.


## Member Participation (RPP)

RPP<br>Member Participation<br>at July 1



Members belong to 10 unions, UTFA, and PM\&C.

## Key Benefit Provisions

- Benefit accrual:
- $1.5 \%$ or $1.6 \%$ of salary to CPP maximum salary.
- $2.0 \%$ of salary above CPP maximum salary up to $\$ 150,000$.
- Retirement dates:
- No requirement to retire at age 65.
- Normal is June $30^{\text {th }}$ following $65^{\text {th }}$ birthday.
- Early retirement possible within 10 years of normal retirement, 5\% annual reduction. No reduction after age 60 under certain conditions (varies by employee group).
- Cost-of-living adjustment which is the greater of:
- a) $75 \%$ of CPI increase to maximum CPI increase of $8 \%$ plus $60 \%$ of CPI in excess of $8 \%$ and b) increase in CPI minus 4\%.
- 60\% survivor pension for members with spouses.

Benefit provisions are negotiated with employee groups and approved by Business Board.

## Assumptions used to Calculate Liabilities

## Demographic assumptions:

- Retirement age.
- Mortality rates.
- Withdrawal rates.
- Disability rates.
- Percentage with spouse.


## Assumptions used to Calculate Liabilities

Economic assumptions:

- Increase in consumer price index.
- Cost of living adjustments.
- Increase in CPP maximum salary.
- Increase in Income Tax Act maximum benefit limit.
- Increase in salaries.
- Investment return.
- Interest rate on participant contributions.
- Loading for administrative expenses.


## Going Concern Liabilities

Going Concern Pension Liabilities ${ }^{1}$
at July 1
(millions of dollars)


[^0]
## The Assets

## Components:

- Contributions by members and University.
- Investment earnings.

Minus

- Pension payments.
- Fees and expenses.


## Contributions

Contributions by Source (Employee and Employer) Across All Plans ${ }^{1}$ for the year ended June 30
(millions of dollars)

${ }^{1}$ Voluntary Early Academic Retirement Program (VEARP) contributions included in ER special payments
Member contributions are negotiated with employee groups and approved by Business Board. University funding is approved by Business Board.

## Balancing Contributions and Investment Earnings

Take Less Investment Risk
Target Lower Expected Returns Target Higher Expected Contributions

Cost of Pension Plan


Portion Funded From Investment Earnings

Take More Investment Risk
Target Higher Expected Returns Target Lower Expected Contributions

Cost of Pension Plan

Portion Funded
From Contributions

Portion Funded From Investment Earnings

## Investment Earnings

Pension Master Trust
Ten-Year Rolling Average Return


Investment targets and asset mix are approved by the Pension

## Investment Earnings

## Pension Master Trust <br> 1-Year Annual Rates of Return



[^1]
## Pension Payments

> University of Toronto Pension Plans
> Retirement Payments for the year ended June 30
> (millions of dollars)


Pension payments reflect benefit provisions which are negotiated, and approved by Business Board, together with actual salaries and years of service.

## Fees and Expenses

University of Toronto Registered Pension Plans
Fees and Expenses as a Percent of Assets
(excluding SRA)
for the Year Ended June 30


## Market Value of Assets

Market Value of Pension Assets ${ }^{1}$
at June 30
(millions of dollars)


[^2]
## 4. What is the current Pension Plan financial status?

## Going Concern Market Surpluses and Deficits

Going Concern Market Surplus (Deficit)
as at July 1
(millions of dollars)


## Solvency Valuation Assumptions Compared

## Actuarial Assumptions

|  | Going Concern as of July 1, 2010 | Solvency | Wind-Up |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Basis For Valuation | Plan continuing | Plan winding up <br> (with indexation benefits excluded) | Plan winding up <br> (with indexation benefits included) |
| Discount Rate Basis | Expected long-term rate of return <br> on pension fund based on asset <br> mix | Annuity purchase rates and market <br> interest rates for commuted values <br> based on nominal Government <br> of Canada bonds | Annuity purchase rates ${ }^{1}$ and <br> market interest rates for commuted <br> values based on real Government <br> of Canada bonds |
| Discount Rate | $6.50 \%$ per year | Annuity purchase: <br> $4.29 \%$ per year | Annuity purchase: <br> $2.01 \%$ per year |
| Future Salary Increases <br> (including merit and <br> promotion) | $4.50 \%$ per year | Commuted values: <br> $3.70 \%$ per year for 10 years; <br> $5.10 \%$ per year thereafter | Commuted values: <br> $2.40 \%$ per year for 10 years; <br> $3.20 \%$ per year thereafter |
| Inflation | 2.50\% per year | Not applicable | Not applicable |
| Retirement Ages | Range of retirement ages based on <br> plan experience which reflects plan <br> provisions and elimination of <br> mandatory retirement | Earliest possible retirement age <br> which generates the highest value <br> based on plan provisions and <br> legislated "grow-in" provisions | Earliest possible retirement age <br> which generates the highest value <br> based on plan provisions and <br> legislated "grow-in" provisions |
| (since indexation not valued) | Rates above are net of 75\% of <br> inflation |  |  |
| Morality Rates | 1994 Uninsured Pensioner <br> Mortality Table, with mortality <br> improvements under Scale AA to <br> 2015 | 1994 Uninsured Pensioner <br> Mortality Table, with mortality <br> improvements under Scale AA to <br> 2020 | 1994 Uninsured Pensioner <br> Mortality Table, with mortality <br> improvements under Scale AA to <br> 2020 |

[^3]
## Solvency Ratio

RPP
Solvency Ratio and Accrued Liability
as at July 1


The deficit calculated on a solvency basis was \$1.17 billion at July 1, 2010.

# Reasons for the Problem A Confluence of Factors 

## -The "perfect storm" that keeps returning



Market meltdown that created unprecedented negative rates of return


- Market cycles that have created long periods of favourable returns (the 1990's) leading to funding excesses and long periods of unfavourable returns (the 2000's) leading to funding shortfalls.
- Funding excesses in "good times" spent on, university contribution holidays, member contribution holidays and benefit improvements for active and retired members.
- Most DB plans, including those in the university sector and the broader public sector face significant funding problems.


# 5. What is the funding and financing strategy to deal with the problem? 

## Legal requirements regarding Deficits

- Normal Provision Regulations
- 5 years to clear Solvency Deficit (beginning July 1, 2011 for U of T).
- approx $\$ 200 \mathrm{~m}$ per year for five years.
- Special Provisions for Ontario Universities
- 10 years to clear Solvency Deficit (beginning July 1, 2014 for $U$ of $T$ ) provided certain metrics are met.

Our assumption in preparing a funding and financing strategy is that the University of Toronto will be eligible for the special provisions.

## Funding and Financing Strategy for dealing with the Deficit

- Generate large lump sum payments to put into the plans, to generate positive growth in assets and help protect the University's core mission.
- Potential short-term and long-term funding and financing sources:
- Pension reserve.
- Borrowing.
- Utilizing some or all of the assets supporting SRA.
- Increased annual special payments budget.
- Selling/leasing capital assets not needed for current operations.
- Issuing letters of credit.


## Sample Projection Funding and Financing

Funding and Financing of Required Special Payments
Stage 1 and Stage 2 Solvency Relief
Year beginning July 1


|  | $\begin{array}{\|c} \hline \text { Jul- } \\ 10 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{\|c} \hline \text { Jul- } \\ 11 \end{array}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Jul- } \\ 12 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Jul- } \\ 13 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{array}{\|c\|} \hline \text { Jul- } \\ 14 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{\|c\|} \hline \text { Jul- } \\ 15 \end{array}$ | $\begin{gathered} \hline \text { Jul- } \\ 16 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{array}{\|c\|} \hline \text { Jul- } \\ 17 \end{array}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Jul- } \\ 18 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{array}{c\|} \hline \text { Jul- } \\ 19 \end{array}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Jul- } \\ 20 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Jul- } \\ 21 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{array}{\|c\|} \hline \text { Jul- } \\ 22 \end{array}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { Jul- } \\ & 23 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} \hline \text { Jul- } \\ 24 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Jul- } \\ 25 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Jul- } \\ 26 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Jul- } \\ 27 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Jul- } \\ 28 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Jul- } \\ 29 \end{gathered}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Total funding and financing | 150 | 63 | 63 | 213 | 104 | 104 | 104 | 104 | 104 | 104 | 104 | 104 | 104 | 104 | 71 | 71 | 71 | 71 | 71 | 71 |
| $\square$ Letter of credit |  |  |  |  | 33 | 33 | 33 | 33 | 33 | 33 | 33 | 33 | 33 | 33 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| $\square$ Lumpsum payments | 150 |  |  | 150 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| $\square$ Additional special payments budget |  | 35 | 35 | 35 | 44 | 44 | 44 | 44 | 44 | 44 | 44 | 44 | 44 | 44 | 44 | 44 | 44 | 44 | 44 | 44 |
| $\square$ Current special payments budget |  | 27 | 27 | 27 | 27 | 27 | 27 | 27 | 27 | 27 | 27 | 27 | 27 | 27 | 27 | 27 | 27 | 27 | 27 | 27 |
| - Total special payment required | - | 63 | 63 | 63 | 104 | 104 | 104 | 104 | 104 | 104 | 104 | 104 | 104 | 104 | 71 | 71 | 71 | 71 | 71 | 71 |

Data table amounts may not add precisely due to rounding.
Strategy is to generate large lump sum payments to improve pension health as soon as possible to generate positive growth in assets and help protect core mission.

## Sample Projection Additional Budget Impact

Additional Budget Impact
Stage 1 and Stage 2 Solvency Relief
Year beginning July 1


|  | $\begin{gathered} \hline \text { Jul- } \\ 10 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{array}{\|c\|} \hline \text { Jul- } \\ 11 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{\|c\|} \hline \text { Jul- } \\ 12 \end{array}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Jul- } \\ 13 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \hline \text { Jul- } \\ 14 \end{gathered}$ | Jul- | $\begin{array}{\|c} \hline \text { Jul- } \\ 16 \end{array}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Jul- } \\ 17 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \hline \text { Jul- } \\ 18 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \hline \text { Jul- } \\ 19 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { Jul- } \\ & 20 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Jul- } \\ 21 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { Jul- } \\ & \hline 2 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{array}{\|c\|} \hline \text { Jul- } \\ 23 \end{array}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Jul- } \\ 24 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Jul- } \\ 25 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Jul- } \\ 26 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Jul- } \\ 27 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Jul- } \\ 28 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { Jul- } \\ 29 \end{gathered}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Additional budget impact |  | 51 | 51 | 51 | 72 | 73 | 73 | 73 | 73 | 73 | 73 | 73 | 73 | 73 | 72 | 71 | 70 | 68 | 67 | 66 |
| $\square$ PBGF fee |  | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 2 | 2 | 1 |
| $\square$ OISE current service cost |  | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 |
| $\square$ Letter of credit fee at 0.5\% |  |  |  |  | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 0 |
| $\square$ Budget cost of lumpsum payments |  | 10 | 10 | 10 | 22 | 22 | 22 | 22 | 22 | 22 | 22 | 22 | 21 | 21 | 21 | 21 | 20 | 20 | 19 | 19 |
| $\square$ Additional special payments budget |  | 35 | 35 | 35 | 44 | 44 | 44 | 44 | 44 | 44 | 44 | 44 | 44 | 44 | 44 | 44 | 44 | 44 | 44 | 44 |

Data table amounts may not add precisely due to rounding.
\$30 million per annum base funding allocated in 2011-12 operating budget.

## 6. How Does the U of T Pension Plan Compare to Other Public Sector Pension Plans?

## Comparison to Other Public Sector Pension Plans

|  | U of T | University of Waterloo | McMaster <br> University | Ontario <br> Teachers' Pension Plan | HOOPP |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Averaging Period For Earnings (yrs) | 3 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 5 |
| Benefit Rate Below CPP Wage Base <br> ■ Above CPP Wage Base | $\begin{aligned} & \text { 1.60\% } \\ & \text { 2.00\% } \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { 1.40\% } \\ & \text { 2.00\% } \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { 1.40\% } \\ & \text { 2.00\% } \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { 1.55\% } \\ & \text { 2.00\% } \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { 1.55\% } \\ & \text { 2.00\% } \end{aligned}$ |
| Bridge Benefit to Age 65 | no | no | no | yes | yes |
| Subsidized Payment Form <br> ■ With Spouse <br> ■ Without Spouse | $60 \% \mathrm{~J} \& \mathrm{~S}$ <br> LG5 | $\begin{aligned} & \text { LG10 } \\ & \text { LG10 } \end{aligned}$ | 50\% J\&S LG7 | $\begin{array}{r} 50 \% \mathrm{~J} \& S \\ \text { LG10 } \end{array}$ | 60\% J\&S <br> LG15 |
| Earliest Age For Unreduced Early Retirement Pension | age $60+$ 80 points | age 62 | age $60+$ 80 points | 85 points | age 60 or age 55 + 30 years |
| Automatic Indexation of Pension Benefits | 75\% of CPI (first payment indexed) | 100\% of CPI | excess investment earnings only (threshold at 4.5\%) | 100\% of CPI for pre-2010 benefits; 50\% of CPI for post-2009 benefits plus top-up to $100 \%$ based on plan's funded status | 75\% of CPI for pre-2006 benefits only; no guaranteed indexing for post-2005 benefits |
| Member Contribution Rates (Ultimate Rate) <br> ■ Below CPP Wage Base <br> ■ Above CPP Wage Base | $\begin{aligned} & 5.00 \% \\ & 6.00 \% \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 5.80 \% \\ 8.30 \% / 9.65 \% \end{array}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { 6.50\% } \\ & 8.75 \% \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { 10.40\% } \\ & \text { 12.00\% } \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { 6.90\% } \\ & \text { 9.3.20\% } \end{aligned}$ |


[^0]:    ${ }^{1}$ Including partial wind-up members in RPP(OISE) liabilities in years up to 2007

[^1]:    * Returns are time-weighted, calculated in accordance with industry standards, are net of investment fees and expenses, and exclude returns on private investment interests prior to 2008.
    ** $4 \%$ plus CPI.

[^2]:    ${ }^{1}$ Including partial wind-up members in RPP(OISE) assets in years up to 2007

[^3]:    1 Limited market available for the purchase of indexed annuities especially for a pension plan of this size

