



University of Toronto

OFFICE OF THE VICE- PROVOST, SPACE AND FACILITIES PLANNING

TO: Planning and Budget Committee

SPONSOR: Ron Venter, Vice-Provost, Space and Facilities Planning
CONTACT INFO: 416-978-5515; ron.venter@utoronto.ca

DATE: April 25th, 2005, for May 10th, 2005.

AGENDA ITEM: 9

ITEM IDENTIFICATION:

Interim Project Planning Report for the University of Toronto Art Centre.

JURISDICTIONAL INFORMATION:

Under the Policy on Capital Planning and Capital Projects, the Planning & Budget Committee reviews Project Planning Reports prepared for a capital project and recommends to the Academic Board approval in principle of the project.

PREVIOUS ACTION TAKEN:

In November 2004, a Project Planning Committee was established to explore the potential expansion and /or relocation of the University of Toronto Art Gallery currently housed within University College. Options could include the expansion of the facilities at University College or a possible relocation of the Art Centre to an alternate site which could strengthen the interaction between the gallery and academic programs. The intent was to define the site and to identify the projected renovation costs as well as to identify the order of magnitude on the endowment required to maintain the complete operation of such a facility with no support from the operating budget of the University of Toronto.

HIGHLIGHTS:

The Interim Project Planning Report is provided as Appendix 1. The proposed location for the University of Toronto Art Gallery is the Lillian Massey Building presently owned by Victoria University. This could be an exceptional location for the Gallery, adjacent to the Gardiner Ceramic Museum and across the street from the soon to be opened and significantly upgraded Royal Ontario Museum. In addition, the visibility at this prominent Toronto address and intersection coupled with the proximity to both Victoria University and the University of Toronto presents an opportunity that is not likely to be repeated or improved upon.

FINANCIAL AND/OR PLANNING IMPLICATIONS:

The Lillian Massey Building is presently leased to two independent tenants, namely the Ontario Ombudsperson with access from Queen's Park Crescent and to Club Monaco on the northern section

of the building with the entrance of Bloor Street. The lease agreements of both tenants terminate in 2011 and 2015 respectively. Were it possible to assume the initial lease in 2011, the building would require extensive upgrading to exhibition quality space; the capital cost is estimated in the range of \$13-19 million for a nominal cost of \$16 million in 2005 dollars. In addition, the endowment required to operate the facility in 2005 dollars is estimated to be \$28.5 million which would provide an annual operating income of \$1,130,000 allowing for a clear 4% on the investment. Both the capital and the operating costs escalate to \$21.44 and \$35.5 million respectively in 2011. In 2015 were the second lease to become available, the cost to renovate the equivalent area would require an additional \$26.06 million. This information is summarized in Table 1.

All projects that are advanced for consideration by the Planning & Budget Committee are evaluated against a stringent set of academic criteria. These criteria are detailed in the Capital Plan tabled at the Planning & Budget Committee, December 12th, 2004¹. This project, if totally financed by external sources, could be exceedingly positive. It provides a facility that would be most supportive of many academic programs and would, in addition, provide for an extraordinary outreach by the University into the local, national and international communities.

Consistent with the Capital Plan of the University of Toronto, approved by Governing Council in February, 2005, the University of Toronto Art Gallery upgrade, while identified within the listing, requires all funds to be raised externally for such a project to proceed. The total cost of phase 1 of the project is estimated at \$56 million in 2011 dollars. The cost of the second phase will require an additional \$26 million for capital improvements and approximately a doubling of the endowment to operate the second [phase 2] facility.

The magnitude of funds to be raised in advance of the project moving forward is significant. The purpose of this initial interim planning report is to identify the Lillian Massey Building as the potential site for the University of Toronto Art Gallery and to enable the University of Toronto, working in collaboration with Victoria University to secure the external funds necessary to advance the project to the next stage of planning.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

That the Planning and Budget Committee recommend to the Academic Board,

1. THAT the Interim Project Planning Report for the University of Toronto Art Centre be approved in principle for the provision of 4570 nasm to accommodate the activities and functions described for both phases of this project.
2. THAT the fundraising goal of \$56 million be established for the first phase of construction and to support the operating costs of the first phase.

¹ The nine criteria by which all capital projects are assessed are:

- | | |
|------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------|
| 1. Mission Objectives of the University, | 2. Policy Objectives & Legislative Requirements, |
| 3. Provincial Space Standards, | 4. Strengthening Scholarship, |
| 5. Providing Academic Leadership, | 6. Student Experience, |
| 7. Economic Consistency, | 8. Resources, |
| 9. Deferred Maintenance. | |

APPENDIX 1:

INTERIM PROJECT PLANNING COMMITTEE REPORT FOR THE UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO ART CENTRE

COMMITTEE MEMBERSHIP

Paul Perron	Principal, University College (Co-Chair)
Elizabeth Sisam	Director, Campus and Facilities Planning (Co-Chair)
Meredith Saunderson	Chair, University of Toronto Art Centre
Niamh O'Laoghaire	Director, University of Toronto Art Centre
Ron Swail	Assistant Vice-President, Facilities and Services
Julian Binks	Manager, Project Planning, Capital Projects
David Keeling	Bursar, Victoria University
Adrienne D. Hood	Professor, Victoria College
Pat McClellan	Facilities and Services
Sara Guerin	Graduate Student, Department of Fine Arts
Tamara Avishai	Undergraduate Student
Tillie Shuster	Executive Director, Development and Alumni Affairs, University College

TERMS OF REFERENCE

1. Proposed new options that could include the expansion of the facilities at University College or a possible relocation of the Art Centre to another site.
2. Determine the space requirements and a functional layout for the University of Toronto Art Centre.
3. Provide recommendations regarding the location of the University of Toronto Art Centre and review options for its accommodation, including a possible phased approach.
4. Identify the capital cost of construction, including renovations, data and communications requirements and the cost of all equipment and furnishings for the Centre.
5. Identify all operating costs of the facility.
6. Identify all security and safety requirements and their related costs.
7. Identify operational issues and maintenance issues that could impact the project and possible additional sources of funding that could address these particular issues.
8. Identify all proposed sources of funding.
9. Report by April 30, 2005.

INTRODUCTION

This interim project planning committee report identifies a proposed space program for the expansion of the University of Toronto Art Centre to a new location, the Lillian Massey Building, 153 Bloor Street West, owned by Victoria University. The costs associated with the renovations and operations of this new space as well as new academic program initiatives are

identified. The funding requirements establish a target for fundraising necessary to create and endow the Art Centre. When funds are committed, the Project Planning Committee will reconvene to continue the detailed planning necessary to finalize the planning report and see the project through implementation. Discussions will continue during the interim period to develop academic programs in partnerships with Victoria University and other University divisions.

BACKGROUND

The University of Toronto Art Centre is located in the Laidlaw Wing of University College on the St. George Campus. The Centre which occupies some 1,400 net assignable square metres [nasm] of Class A exhibition space has been a remarkable success for University College, the University of Toronto and the City of Toronto. It has attracted national and international interest and recently hosted the Picasso Exhibition. The Art Centre has added unique depth and insight into many academic and cultural programs on campus within the Greater Toronto Area.

The current space in the Laidlaw Wing was renovated in 1996 to achieve a “B” designation from the Department of Canadian Heritage, and expanded in 2000.

An “A” designation is currently being processed. During this period of time it has mounted exciting permanent collection displays and important traveling exhibitions, significantly increased its collections, and engaged in collaborative projects.

The Art Centre now has significant interaction with many of the University’s academic units; provides academic support to several and offers two courses within the Department of Fine Art. The Art Centre’s activities are open to all members of the University. It promotes interdisciplinary study in a non-traditional classroom. It enriches the cultural life of the University and fosters a sense of identity and community, providing a vital link between the University and the community at large, functioning as a window into University activities, showcasing its research, attracting many visitors to campus and retaining their interest. It thereby contributes significantly to many of the goals outlined in the University’s academic plan, Stepping-Up.

Exhibitions: In 2005, the Art Centre will mount nine exhibitions of varying size: *Material Culture from the Malcove Collection* supports the curriculum of the Department of Fine Art, as will *Protean Picasso: Drawings and Prints from the National Gallery of Canada*. Art Centre Interns are curating a small exhibition of *Eighteenth Century Silver*. The in-house curated *Tony Scherman: Works on Paper* will showcase recent works by a renowned Canadian artist, donated to the Art Centre. April will see the inaugural graduating exhibition of the Fine Art Department’s Masters of Visual Studies class. Mark Cheetham and students in his Contemporary Canadian Art Course will curate *Sliding Tense*, which will open in May and form part of a Humanities festival-cum-academic conference entitled *Voicing Toronto: The City and the Arts*. May will also see *Isaacs Seen: Gallery Review*, mounted in tandem with the Hart House Gallery, the Textile Museum of Canada and the AGO. Art Centre

Exhibition Students are working on a project that will form part of the AGO-sponsored province-wide 85th anniversary exhibition of the Group of Seven. In partnership with the Department of Civil Engineering and to complement activities at the School of Architecture, the Art Centre will mount *The Art of Structural Design: A Swiss Legacy* from September 2005 through January 2006.

Lectures and Symposia: Currently the Art Centre mounts a fall lecture series, a spring lecture series and the Malcove Lecture series. It also collaborates with the Department of Fine Art in mounting the Colloquium on Visual Culture. Other lectures, workshops, panels and artists' talks take place as the opportunities arise, e.g. the Picasso symposium. It is also expected that a symposium in conjunction with a major fall exhibition *The Art of Structural Design: A Swiss Legacy* will be mounted.

Concerts: The lunchtime concert series has been in abeyance during *Picasso and Ceramics*. Two concerts (one lunchtime, one evening) will occur this spring, and the lunchtime concerts will be re-established in the fall.

Other Art Centre Programs:

- Membership Program with specific events and newsletter
- Volunteer Program
- Student Volunteer Program and the Art Centre Student Association, with its own newsletter *a.centric*
- Art Centre Internship course
- Art Centre Exhibition course
- Art Centre Award Student
- Students in Work study positions.

Campus Installations: The Art Centre cares for approximately 5,000 works of art. Of these, 1,200 are installed in up to 90 buildings across campus. Currently, new installations/changes to existing installations are performed for the Offices of the President and Vice-Presidents at Simcoe Hall and at 93 Highland, the official residence of the University's President. They are also performed during building renovations and in emergency situations.

ART CENTRE LONG TERM VISION

The Art Centre's long-term vision is to expand its academic support and public programs in many directions:

- To become an important cultural destination in the City of Toronto, province-wide and nationally.
- To support teaching, research and professional programs at the University.
- Acquire excellent collections of national importance.
- Provide a state-of-the-art museum-standard facility in its own conservation laboratory.
- Mount high profile exhibitions from elsewhere as well as those curated in-house.
- Circulate Art Centre exhibitions to other institutions.

In order to attain its long-term vision the Art Centre will need a much-increased staff complement and also greatly expanded and improved facilities. These will include an in-house conservation laboratory where University artworks could be treated and with which a program in conservation could be mounted in conjunction with the following academic programs: Fine Art, Visual Studies, Museum Studies, Chemistry, Physics and any program in Cultural Studies. There would also be opportunities to strengthen relationships with the Royal Ontario Museum and Gardiner Museum.

MAINTAINING MUSEUM STANDARDS

The setting of Museum standards in Canada falls under the purview of the Department of Heritage (DOCH) and the Canadian Conservation Institute (CCI). Art galleries in Canada fall into the following categories: non-designated; B designated, and A designated. The last category indicates maintenance of best professional Museum standards. The Art Centre has a B designation and an A designation application is currently being processed by the DOCH and CCI. It is vital that the Art Centre become an A-designated institution, otherwise it will attract neither major exhibitions nor donations of significant art. The maintenance of A designation standards is therefore of paramount importance. The following descriptions of elements identified in the space program highlight areas of expansion and improvement that will be addressed.

1. Climate Controlled Galleries:

Climate controlled galleries throughout will permit far greater freedom and flexibility of exhibitions. They would mean being able to accept larger and more important shows from elsewhere (*Picasso and Ceramics* almost fell through due to limited climate controlled spaces). Fully climate controlled galleries will allow permanent collections to be mixed in interesting, innovative and useful ways.

If the Art Centre is to attract significant collections of art from private donors the possibility of permanent or semi-permanent exhibition space must be offered- as with McMaster University's Levy Bequest, the University of Toronto's Malcove Bequest and a proposed donation of silver and porcelain to the UofT (which did not come to fruition). Exhibition spaces for such collections must be fully climate controlled in order that the donated works may be certified as cultural property. (Cultural property can only be stored and exhibited in appropriately climate controlled spaces.) Donors whose gifts are certified as cultural property receive significantly increased tax benefits. Proprietors of important art works are unlikely to donate to an institution which is unable to submit cultural property applications.

While 55 linear feet of climate controlled display cases are available in the Malcove Gallery, the gallery as a whole is not climate controlled. To increase the display possibilities of this collection the Malcove Gallery should be increased in size and fully climate controlled.

To maximize the production of smaller student and faculty curated exhibitions, the Art Centre should have several smaller, climate controlled spaces.

2. Increased Climate Controlled Art Storage

The Art Centre's 250 nasm art storage vault was adequate when completed in 2000 but its collections have doubled numerically since 1996. The Art Centre storage is now at capacity for larger paintings. It still has space for small paintings and for works on paper, but should the collections continue to grow at the present rate, capacity for works on paper will be reached within another year. The Art Centre is currently exploring the option of renting climate controlled off-site vault space – but that becomes very expensive very quickly. Increased climate controlled storage is vital to attract donations.

3. Climate Controlled Work Space

Museum standards also require a climate controlled work/preparation space in which to unpack, repack, matt and frame objects. This space should be separate from both gallery and storage spaces.

4. Climate Controlled Crate Storage

Increasingly, the Art Centre is requested to store empty crates in climate-controlled spaces. This was a stipulation for several *Picasso and Ceramics* crates, for which climate controlled storage at Pacific Art Services had to be rented. The contract for the recent *Protean Picasso: Drawings and Prints from the National Gallery of Canada*, also stipulated climate controlled crate storage, but through negotiation the Art Centre managed to limit this demand.

5. A Secure Loading Dock

The existing means of bringing art to the Art Centre is neither a viable nor permitted solution to accepting art work. In many instances crates must be carried up or down steps, or ramps laid over steps, to negotiate the various levels. It recently took several hours of negotiations before the couriers charged with overseeing the shipment of Picasso ceramics would permit unloading of the Picasso crates. The Art Centre therefore requires, as a condition of "A" certification, a loading dock to which trucks can back up, located in a secure/private location with direct access into the Art Centre and an elevator which can access all levels of the exhibition space.

6. Large Gallery Entrances

Art Centre exhibitions are currently constrained by the size of crate that will fit through its doors. Part of this problem may be solved by having a loading dock and large elevator – but we are also constrained by the doors to the galleries and the gallery ceiling heights.

7. Security

The Art Centre requires that an overnight security system be in place linked with the existing alarm system to be able to host high level shows. For the recent Picasso exhibit anti-shatter/slow-down film was also necessary over the windows and had to be specially installed, in addition to an alarm on each of the windows indicating the level of security required.

MAINTAINING EDUCATION AND OUTREACH PROGRAMS

Administrative Space Requirements: The Art Centre barely has enough space for its current staff. The Director was temporarily housed in UC during the Picasso show to permit the use

of her office as the volunteer room. The Malcove Curatorial Assistant makes do with one of the two student work stations. Needed now are more space and work stations, including computers, printers and internet access for interns, exhibition and award students, as well as student volunteers and Work study position holders and the University of Toronto Art Centre Students Association. This is to allow them to: research the collections; plan exhibitions; assist with administrative tasks such as PR; arranging the concert series; student outreach; and undertake website maintenance.

Classroom/Multi-purpose Activity Space: With the double-cohort, all spaces at the University are at a premium. It can be very difficult to book large lecture rooms, with appropriate AV equipment, at times that suit the Art Centre's needs and schedule. Space must also be provided for receptions to celebrate its exhibitions, and to use for revenue generation. These activities could overlap although more administrative and labour will be required to set up and remove chairs.

Increased Staff Complement: The Art Centre will also require increased curatorial staff, technical support staff, a conservator and advancement personnel to continue to seek funding for future endeavours. A detailed list of new positions required and additional space to accommodate new staff has been identified in the detailed space program tabulated below.

SITE

It is proposed to relocate the Art Centre into the Lillian Massey Building in collaboration with Victoria University. Because space in the building is currently leased (office administrative space until 2011, and retail space until 2015), the first possible date that the project could begin its implementation would be 2011. Approximately 2,285 nasm would be available at that time. The complete expansion of the University of Toronto Art Centre could not be complete until all space was vacated and renovations complete, 2016.bbbb

The plan proposed calls for the implementation in two phases. The first phase will provide for modest expansion of the Art Centre and allow for the inclusion of a portion of the academic initiatives. The entire plan will be realized with the completion of Phase II.

The location of the Lillian Massey Building on the prominent corner of Queen's Park Crescent East and Bloor Street West, while within a visible cultural hub that is being created in the City is not without its difficulties. The site is extremely congested and access to the building is restricted because of the expansion of the Gardiner Museum, and because of the location and vehicular service and delivery to the Colonnade, a mixed-use development immediately to the east of the Lillian Massey Building. Loading dock facilities will be managed in co-ordination with the other facilities and deliveries must be scheduled, as no other option exists.

CAPITAL COST ESTIMATE

The Lillian Massey Building was constructed during 1908-12. It was initially the home of Household Sciences at the University of Toronto and has been renovated for use in 1995-1996 as office and retail facilities. To enable conversion of these facilities to Class "A" gallery

space will involve complete renovations accommodating humidification and temperature requirements identified in the Gallery Standards. This involves construction of a “new building within the existing building.” The estimate to build this type of facility is approximately \$16 million (2005 dollars) for phase 1.

Victoria University leases space in the Lillian Massey Building with revenues contributing to its operating budget. The revenue stream would have to be maintained. An endowment, estimated at \$35 million is proposed to provide Victoria University with equal funding.

Table 1 (attached) identifies the capital cost estimate and annual revenue stream that is necessary to indemnify Victoria University and for the operations of the new expanded Art Centre in this location. These requirements form the fundraising goal.

RECOMMENDATIONS

THAT the Planning and Budget Committee recommend to the Academic Board:

1. THAT the Interim Project Planning Committee Report for the University of Toronto Art Centre be approved in principle for the provision of 4,570 nasm to accommodate the activities and functions described for both phases of the project.
2. THAT the fundraising goal of \$56 million be established for the first phase of construction and to support the operating costs of the first phase.

UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO ART CENTRE

Draft March
18/05

SPACE PROGRAM	NASM		
	existing	proposed Phase 1	Phase 2
Program Element			
Reception	6.58	8	
Multi purpose /non climate controlled exhibit		95	
Art Gallery	551.04		
- climate controlled permanent collection		140	140
- climate controlled temporary exhibition		240	320
- climate controlled Malcove Gallery		95	95
- climate controlled galleries for small exhibitions		185	185
Dedicated Lecture Room (flat floor, capacity 200)		200	
Dedicated Seminar Room (capacity 25)		48	
Retail Outlet			26
Exhibition Workshop	312.56		
- climate controlled work space		60	35
- climate controlled crate storage		50	
Curator's offices (3)	74.53		
- Director (includes meeting area)		26	
- Art Curator		13	
- Assistant Curator (.5 FTE)			13
- Malcove Curator & Malcove Assistant (shared)		13	
Professional offices (4)	43.33		
- Collections Manager		13	
- Manager Programs and Facilities		13	
- Education and Public Programs Officer			13
- Technician (desk in work space)			13
Development Office (2)			26
- Security Staff (desk near entrance)			8
Work Stations (6 shared carrels)		20	10
Kitchenette	4.67		5
Exhibition storage	259.54		
- climate controlled art storage		445	20
- non climate controlled art storage			200
Academic Initiative :			
- workshop/ laboratory (capacity 20)		35	35
- climate controlled temporary exhibition			
- climate controlled storage			
Offices			
- Director (1 FTE)		13	
- Faculty (4 FTE)		13	49
- Staff (1.5 FTE)			20
Multimedia Classroom			50
Multimedia Lab			50
Common Room/ student lounge			26
kitchenette			5
Shipping/receiving	11.18		
- secure loading dock		500	
TOTAL NASM	1263.43	2285	1344
GSM - using 2.0 multiplier approximately		4570	2688
			7258

Table 1. University of Toronto Art Centre

PHASE 1. Phase I: Ombudsperson Location within Lillian Massey Building											
	2005	2006 Lease to be renewed for 5 years. Jan 1st, 2006	2007	2008 Renewal for post 2011	2009	2010	2011 Lease terminates for Ombudsperson	2012	2013	2014	2015 Lease terminates for Club Monaco
A. OPERATING COSTS *Rental cost for 30,500 gsf Gallery, academic space for U/G	510000	510000	510000	510000	510000	510000	610000	610000	610000	610000	610000
Utilities cost	100,000	105,000	110,250	115,763	121,551	127,628	134,010	140,710	147,746	155,133	162,889
Salaries, cost + benefits Director, plus 3 support	320,000	332,800	346,112	359,956	374,355	389,329	404,902	421,098	437,942	455,460	473,678
Operating Costs	200,000	208,000	216,320	224,973	233,972	243,331	253,064	263,186	273,714	284,662	296,049
Total Operating Cost	1,130,000	1,155,800	1,182,682	1,210,692	1,239,877	1,270,288	1,401,975	1,434,995	1,469,401	1,505,255	1,542,616
Endowment required, 4% Millions of \$	28.25	28.90	29.57	30.27	31.00	31.76	35.05	35.87	36.74	37.63	#1
B. CAPITAL COSTS											
Capital Cost . \$16 million, 2005 dollars. Plus/minus 20% [\$13-19] million 2005 numbers, allow for 5% escalation per annum]	16.00	16.80	17.64	18.52	19.45	20.42	21.44	22.51	23.64	24.82	
Capital Cost for 2nd phase											26.06
A+B. TOTAL COSTS	44	46	47	49	50	52	56	58	60	62	
# 1: Additional endowment require for 2nd phase											