



FILE: 1996/97-02

November 20, 1996

**Via Registered Mail
Personal and Confidential**

Mr. R.

[REDACTED]

Toronto, ON

[REDACTED]

Dear Mr. R.:

At its hearing held on November 13, 1996, the Trial Division of the University Tribunal considered the following charge against you:

THAT during the year 1994 and/or 1995, you did intentionally represent as your own an idea or expression of an idea or work of another in preparing your [thesis]¹ entitled "[REDACTED]" contrary to Section B.I.1.(d) of the *Code of Behaviour on Academic Matters*, 1993, and Section B.I.1.(d) of the *Code of Behaviour on Academic Matters*, 1995.

In particular, during the period 1994 and/or 1995, you prepared your [thesis] in partial fulfillment for the degree of [REDACTED] which was conferred in November 1995. In preparing your thesis, you closely paraphrased and made use of the work of another writer in the first chapter. In addition, you took extensive notes from an unnamed, photocopied document which you used as the basis for the remaining chapters of the thesis. The structure and a good deal of the data in the thesis (including choice of all writers discussed, key information on those writers, many quotations and all chapter headings) was clearly the work of another person.

The panel accepted your plea of guilty and recommended:

- that a recommendation be made to the Governing Council for cancellation of your degree.

In addition, the panel imposed the following sanctions:

- suspension from attendance in a course or courses, a program, an academic unit or division, or the University for a period of five years, effective forthwith;
- that the sanctions imposed by the Tribunal be recorded on the your academic record and transcript for a period of six years, effective forthwith; and

¹ Note: References to the student's faculty, degree and thesis title have been removed to preserve the student's anonymity.

The panel also recommended that the decision and sanctions be reported to the Provost for publication in the University newspapers, with your name and faculty withheld.

The panel gave the following reasons for its decision:

The decision was not easy for us, in fact, we all had a personal inclination to be as lenient as we could in the circumstances. However, we are not going to be particularly lenient. While Mr. R. unquestionably has suffered greatly and the process itself will have been more than enough penalty to deter him from any future conduct of this nature, there is unquestionably the trust that must be protected in the academic process. Or, to put it in another way, the integrity of the academic process has to be seen to be preserved. There is no penalty needed that would necessarily be personally tailored to Mr. R. But, looking at the broader university community, and looking at the extent to which the public has an interest in a public university and the maintenance of academic integrity, we think that the penalty has to address the latter issue. For this reason, we have accepted the high end of the University's recommendation.

We agree that ordinarily this conduct would call for expulsion or a very long suspension. Had Mr. R. been younger and had he not disclosed the offence himself, there is no doubt that expulsion or a very long suspension would have been our decision.

Information concerning rights of appeal may be found in Section E of the Code of Behaviour on Academic Matters (copy enclosed). The deadline for filing an appeal by you or by the University is December 4, 1996.

If no notice of appeal is submitted by the above deadline, a recommendation will be made to the Governing Council with respect to the cancellation of your degree and the case will be reported to the University newspapers with your name and faculty withheld.

Please do not hesitate to contact me (978-8426) if you should have any questions regarding any of the above.

Yours sincerely,

Margaret McKone

Ms Margaret McKone
Acting Secretary
University Tribunal

Enclosure

copies: C. Tuohy, Acting Vice-President and Provost
P. Gooch, Vice-Provost
M. Fullan, Dean, OISE/UT
L. Rothstein, Discipline Counsel