

UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

THE GOVERNING COUNCIL

MAY 20, 2015

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE GOVERNING COUNCIL held on May 20, 2015 at 4:30 p.m. in the Council Chamber, University of Toronto Mississauga Campus.

Present:

Ms Judy G. Goldring (Chair)
Ms Shirley Hoy (Vice Chair)
Professor Meric S. Gertler (President)
Mr. Faizan Sohail Akbani
Ms Alexis Archbold
Professor John S. Bland
Mr. Harvey Botting
Mr. David Norris Bowden
Mr. Ben Coleman
Mr. Jeff Collins
Ms Susan Froom
Mr. Gary D. Goldberg
Professor Avrum I. Gotlieb
Professor William A. Gough
Ms Alexandra Harris
Ms Zabeen Hirji
Professor Edward Iacobucci
Ms Claire M.C. Kennedy
Ms Paulette L. Kennedy
Mr. Nykolaj Kuryluk
Mr. Brian D. Lawson
Ms Nancy Carolyn Lee
Dr. Gary P. Mooney
Mr. John Paul Morgan
Ms Susan Murray
Ms N. Jane Pepino
Professor Elizabeth Peter
Professor Cheryl Regehr
Ms Catherine Riddell
Mr. Mark Henry Rowswell
Professor Hargurdeep Saini
Professor Andrea Sass-Kortsak

Mr. Howard L. Shearer
Professor Elizabeth M. Smyth
Professor Salvatore M. Spadafora
Mr. W. John Switzer
Mr. Andrew Szende
Professor Nicholas Terpstra
Professor Steven J. Thorpe

Mr. Louis R. Charpentier, Secretary of the
Governing Council

Secretariat:

Ms Mariam Ali
Ms Sheree Drummond
Ms. Cindy Ferencz-Hammond
Mr. Lee Hamilton
Mr. Anwar Kazimi
Mr. Patrick McNeill
Ms Rena Parsan
Ms Amorell Saunders N'Daw
Mr. David Walders

Absent:

Mr. Nabil B. Arif
Ms Caitlin Campisi
Ms Janet L. Ecker
Mr. Andrew Girgis
Ms Melinda M. Rogers
Mr. R. Mark Krembil
Professor Hugh P. Gunz
Professor Janice Gross Stein
Mr. W. Keith Thomas

In Attendance:

Professor Emeritus Ellen Hodnett
Professor Ulli Krull, Vice-President, Special Initiatives, UTM
Mr. Bruce Winter, Governor-elect
Professor Angela Hildyard, Vice-President, Human Resources and Equity
Professor Scott Mabury, Vice-President, University Operations
Professor Vivek Goel, Vice-President, Research and Innovation

Mr. David Palmer, Vice-President, Advancement
Ms Judith Wolfson, Vice-President, International, Government and Institutional Relations
Professor Jill Matus, Vice-Provost, Students and First-Entry Divisions
Professor Susan McCahan, Vice-Provost, Innovations in Undergraduate Education
Professor Amy Mullin, Vice-Principal Academic and Dean, UTM
Ms Meredith Strong, Director, Office of the Vice-Provost, Students
Ms Archana Sridhar, Assistant Provost
Mr. Steve Moate, Senior Legal Counsel, Office of the President

Mr. Peter Cinat, Clinton Global Initiative's 2015 Hult Prize Global Finalist (Team Attollo)
Ms Aisha Bukhari, Clinton Global Initiative's 2015 Hult Prize Global Finalist (Team Attollo)
Mr. Lak Chinta, Clinton Global Initiative's 2015 Hult Prize Global Finalist (Team Attollo)
Mr. James Austin, Clinton Global Initiative's 2015 Hult Prize Global Finalist (Team Attollo)

IN ACCORDANCE WITH A DETERMINATION BY THE EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE, PURSUANT TO SECTION 38 OF BY-LAW NUMBER 2 OF THE GOVERNING COUNCIL, ITEMS 11 AND 12 ON THE AGENDA WERE CONSIDERED BY THE GOVERNING COUNCIL *IN CAMERA*.

1) Chair's Remarks

The Chair proposed that members consider *in camera* agenda items first before proceeding with *open session* business. A Motion was made to move *in camera*, pursuant to section 28 (e) and 33 of the Governing Council *By-Law Number 2*.

THE GOVERNING COUNCIL MOVED *IN CAMERA*.

2) Report of the Committee to Review the Office of the University Ombudsperson (2015)

The Chair reminded members that a Review of the Office of the University Ombudsperson was normally conducted at the end of each term of the incumbent, and that the 2015 Review coincided with the end of Professor Emeritus Joan Foley's final term as University Ombudsperson. As a result, the 2015 Review Committee had been given a dual mandate to review the Office and recommend a successor to the position. She invited the Chair of the Review Committee, Mr. Jeff Collins, to provide an overview of the Review Committee's *Report* and make the motion. Mr. Collins summarized the work of the Review Committee, explained the recommendations contained in the *Report*, and thanked the members of the Review Committee for their work and the Secretariat for its support of the Review Committee.

On motion duly moved, seconded and carried

IT WAS RESOLVED

THAT the *Report of the Committee to Review the Office of the University Ombudsperson (2015)* be approved in principle.

3) Senior Appointments

a) University Ombudsperson

At the invitation of the Chair, Mr. Jeff Collins, Chair of the Committee to Review the Office of the University Ombudsperson, provided members with an overview of the recruitment process.

On a motion duly moved, seconded and carried

IT WAS RESOLVED

THAT Professor Emeritus Ellen Hodnett be appointed University Ombudsperson, for a three-year term effective July 1, 2015 until June 30, 2018.

Mr. Collins thanked the members of the Review Committee for their participation and also acknowledged the contribution of Professor Angela Hildyard, Vice-President, Human Resources and Equity, who had served as the Committee's administrative advisor. The Chair also thanked the members and thanked Mr. Collins for his leadership of the Review Committee. She commended the Review Committee on its report and on its recommendation on a successor for the position.

b) Acting Vice-President and Principal, University of Toronto Mississauga

At the invitation of the Chair President Gertler advised members of the process undertaken with regard to this appointment and noted that the Acting appointment was needed as Professor Deep Saini would be on administrative leave from his duties as Vice-President and Principal, UTM as per the terms of his recent re-appointment.

On a motion duly moved, seconded and carried

IT WAS RESOLVED

THAT Professor Ulli Krull be appointed as Acting Vice-President and Principal, University of Toronto Mississauga, for a six-month term, effective July 1, 2015 continuing to December 31, 2015.

c) Vice-Provost, Students

The Chair then informed members that, at its meeting of May 11, 2015 the Executive Committee had approved the appointment of Professor Sandy Welsh as Vice-Provost, Students, for a five-year term effective July 1, 2015 to June 30, 2020.

The Governing Council moved to open session.

Open Session

The Chair welcomed members and guests to the Governing Council's meeting at the University of Toronto Mississauga. She thanked Mr. Paul Donoghue, Chief Administrative Officer, UTM, for providing members with a tour of the campus prior to the meeting, and expressed her enthusiasm for the ongoing expansion and renewal of the UTM campus. She

also thanked Professor Deep Saini for hosting governors, and invited him to say a few words. Professor Saini welcomed governors to UTM, noting that the tri-campus nature of the University of Toronto was affirmed by the meeting. He remarked on the expansion of the UTM campus, which had preserved the park-like nature of the location, and commented on the numerous prestigious architectural awards garnered by UTM capital projects.

The Chair announced that in the *in camera* session the Governing Council had approved the appointment of Professor Emeritus Ellen Hodnett as the next University Ombudsperson for a three-year term, effective July 1, 2015 until June 30, 2018, and she congratulated Professor Hodnett, who was present, to the applause of members and guests. The Chair remarked that, although there would be another opportunity to thank Professor Emeritus Joan Foley for her outstanding service as University Ombudsperson, she wished to formally note for the record her gratitude to Professor Emeritus Foley on behalf of the Governing Council.

The Chair then announced the appointment of Professor Ulli Krull as Acting Vice-President and Principal, UTM, congratulated Professor Krull, and expressed her confidence in Professor Krull's stewardship of UTM during Professor Saini's administrative leave.

The Chair then read into the record the re-appointment of Ms Zabeen Hirji as a Lieutenant-Governor-In-Council member of Governing Council for a period of three years, effective from March 22, 2015 until March 21, 2018. She congratulated Ms Hirji and thanked her for her service to date.

Finally, the Chair reminded governors that she had communicated with them on April 23, 2015 regarding the amendment to the *University of Toronto Act, 1971* contained in the Government of Ontario's 2015 Budget legislation. She noted that she had remarked in detail about this development at the May 11, 2015 meeting of the Executive Committee, and referred members to the report of that meeting. She reaffirmed that she was very pleased that the requested change had been acted upon by the Governing of Ontario.

4) Report of the President

President Gertler expressed his pleasure to be attending the Governing Council meeting at UTM. He thanked Professor Deep Saini and his senior management team for their hospitality in welcoming governors, and for their tremendous leadership in moving UTM forward, noting that UTM would shortly be celebrating the convocation of the first graduating class of The Mississauga Academy of Medicine, a significant milestone.

President Gertler informed governors that he had arranged for a presentation by students from the Rotman School of Management's MBA program who, together, formed Team Attollo, currently competing in the international finals for the Clinton Global Initiative's Hult Prize. He introduced Team Attollo members to the Chamber: Mr. Peter Cinat, Ms Aisha Bukhari, Mr. Lak Chinta, and Mr. James Austin. He informed governors that Team Attollo had recently won the Dubai Regional Final, and was looking forward to the Hult Prize Global Final in New York in September 2015. President Gertler remarked that he would normally have invited UTM students to present at the meeting, but since Team Attollo members would be unable to present at the next Governing Council meeting in June, he had invited them to present at the current meeting and would therefore seek to arrange for UTM students to present at the June meeting. The members of Team Attollo explained to governors the nature of the 2015 Hult Prize "President's Challenge" which focused on the theme Early Childhood Education in the Urban Slum and Beyond and which concerned the development of

sustainable and scalable social enterprises to address the early childhood education gap in young children of up to six years of age. The members of Team Attollo described their concept and demonstrated their prototype, an interactive and programmable device – “talking stickers” - for use by parents and caregivers that leveraged QR (Quick Response) codes to assist in early childhood pedagogy and language acquisition. Following the presentation, President Gertler thanked Team Attollo members and wished them success in the Hult Prize Global Finals.

Resuming his Report, President Gertler called members’ attention to the recent *Cities of Learning* two-day symposium examining university engagement with their host city-regions to enhance research, teaching and city-building. He highlighted a panel he had conducted with senior leaders from the University of São Paulo, the University of Buenos Aires, and the University of Chicago, all leading universities in three previous PanAm Games host cities. He noted that the symposium had provided an opportunity to examine how major research institutions in other host cities had managed their relationship with their respective city-regions.

The President provided governors with an overview of the Government of Canada’s 2015 Budget measures, highlighting initiatives of particular interest to the university sector, including: modest increases in tri-council funding, ongoing support for the Canada Foundation for Innovation, changes in federal support for the indirect costs of research, and creation of a Public Transit Fund. Turning to provincial developments, President Gertler remarked on the Government of Ontario Budget, including the deficit elimination target of 2017-18, ongoing support for existing levels of per-student funding for undergraduate programs, graduate expansion, and post-secondary education sector differentiation. He also highlighted measures to modernize student financial assistance, support for entrepreneurship activities, funding for the Ontario Institute for Regenerative Medicine, and the establishment of the Aging and Brain Health Innovation Centre at Baycrest Hospital, a U of T partner hospital. President Gertler also remarked on ongoing consultations informing the University Funding Review project being conducted by the Ministry of Training, Colleges and Universities, and on recent developments concerning campus expansion in the province.

President Gertler then called members’ attention to the recently released 2015 QS World University Rankings by Subject, noting that the University of Toronto continued to be recognized for its excellence in many areas. Summarizing the Rankings, he indicated that the University of Toronto ranked among the top 25 universities in the world in 18 individual subject categories; only 12 universities (and only 7 public universities) in the world could claim higher standings in this regard (those were: Cambridge, Oxford, Berkeley, Stanford, UCLA, Harvard, the National University of Singapore, MIT, Tokyo, Columbia, Yale, and Melbourne).

The Chair invited questions for the President. A member inquired about sector advocacy and the upcoming federal general election. The President invited Ms Judith Wolfson, Vice-President, International, Government and Institutional Relations, to comment. Ms Wolfson remarked that *Universities Canada* (formerly the *Association of Universities and Colleges of Canada*, AUCC), provided broad sector-level advocacy at the federal level on behalf of all of Canada’s publicly-supported universities, and that she would be happy to provide governors with additional information concerning sector and U of T-specific advocacy priorities as the general election approached. Presentation: Technology Assisted Learning

At the Chair’s invitation, Vice-President and Provost Cheryl Regehr remarked on the advancement of technology enhanced learning for adults, noting the creation by the Government of Ontario of the Ontario Online Institute, and summarizing the principles guiding the University of Toronto’s

activities in online learning, including upholding standards of excellence and alignment with strategic priorities. She acknowledged the support of the Gates Foundation in the University's ongoing efforts to expand its online course selection. Concluding her introductory remarks, Professor Regehr introduced Professor Vivek Goel, Vice-President, Research and Innovation, and Professor Susan McCahan, Vice-Provost, Innovations in Undergraduate Education. Professors Goel and McCahan then provided governors with a conceptual and chronological overview of online learning technologies, including Massive Open Online Courses (MOOCs), and summarized the University of Toronto's successful engagement and application of technology assisted learning, including course development, structure, modularity, re-usability, registrations, and in-built student feedback mechanisms.

A member inquired if, as a result of new learning platforms, the accountabilities on the part of students had increased. Professor Goel answered that as a result of some of these learning platforms students were generally required to demonstrate their preparedness perhaps more regularly and consistently than had previously been necessary. Professor Goel explained that the inverted classroom model remediated some of the shortcomings of traditional pedagogy, which tended to "teach to the middle" thereby potentially under-serving low-performing and high-performing students. Another member inquired if there were some courses or disciplinary areas that were unsuited to online learning formats. Professor Goel remarked that the tools available continued to evolve rapidly to address the limitations of earlier technologies and Professor McCahan noted the range of fields covered in the University's initial set of MOOCs. A governor inquired about course content and intellectual property; Professor Goel remarked that the University had agreements with instructors in this regard. Professor Regehr added that these agreements acknowledged the funding, pedagogical and technical support of the University and the Division in the creation of online courses.

5) 2014 Performance Indicators for Governance – Report and Presentation

The Chair reminded governors that the *2014 Performance Indicators for Governance* report constituted an important component of the President's and his Administration's accountability, representing an opportunity to consider how the University was advancing on its priorities. She invited the Provost to make her remarks.

Professor Regehr provided members with an overview of the *2014 Performance Indicators for Governance* report,¹ including international rankings, share of tri-council funding, start-up activity, undergraduate instructional engagement and teaching, share of prestigious academic awards and scholarships, enrolment, international students, participation in foreign exchange programs, economic diversity among the student body, and student financial assistance.

A member remarked on measures to improve graduation rates; another member suggested inclusion in the report of additional data on the University of Toronto's economic and community impact. The Provost remarked that the University produced periodic Community Impact² and Economic Impact³ reports, and noted that it might be useful to further integrate this information with the annual Performance Indicators report.

A member remarked on the comprehensiveness of the data, but cautioned about the potential for "indicator fatigue". The Provost noted that there had been much discussion of the use of Key

¹ <http://www.governingcouncil.utoronto.ca/AssetFactory.aspx?did=11181>

² http://impact.utoronto.ca/wp-content/uploads/CIR_13_3_14Accessible.pdf

³ <http://universityrelations.utoronto.ca/gicr/files/2013/07/economic-impact-2013.pdf>

Performance Indicators as accountability tools during discussions around the Strategic Mandate Agreements (SMAs) and the Funding Formula Review being conducted by the Ministry of Training, Colleges and Universities. President Gertler remarked that some indicators should be accentuated, and noted that indicators concerning teaching and research could be complemented by data on such things as community impact and diversity.

The Chair thanked the President and Professor Regehr, and also thanked Ms Marny Scully, Assistant Vice-President, Government, Institutional, and Community Relations (GICR), who was present, for her work on the 2014 Performance Indicators.

CONSENT AGENDA

The Chair noted that Item 5 was for approval and the remainder were for information, and informed members that the Secretary had received a request from a member to place Item 8 (d), *Report Number 187 of the University Affairs Board (April 28, 2015)*, on the regular agenda.

On a motion duly made. Seconded and carried

IT WAS RESOLVED

THAT the consent agenda, except Item 8(d), be adopted and that Item 5 be approved.

The Chair invited the member to address Item 8(d). The member stated that she wished to reprise a matter than had been discussed at the latest meeting of the University Affairs Board concerning Engineering Society fees and compliance with provincial guidelines concerning limitations on use of funds designated for non-academic purposes. The Provost noted that the fees in question were administered by students to support student priorities. Her Office had reviewed the matter and would continue to work with the Engineering Society to ensure the co-curricular nature of the specific projects supported by the fees are more clearly articulated in the referendum questions and Engineering's internal processes. Further, the Provost affirmed that the Engineering Society had expressed their understanding of the issue and their intent to remain compliant with provincial and University policies in this area.

6) Minutes of the Previous Meeting of the Governing Council

The minutes of the April 1, 2015 Governing Council meeting were approved.

7) Business Arising from the Report of the Previous Meeting

There was no business arising from the minutes of the previous meeting.

8) Reports for Information

Members received the following reports for information:

- a) Reports of Reviews of Academic Programs and Units, Part II (Review and Follow-up Report) (March 31, 2015)
- b) Report Number 197 of the Academic Board (April 23, 2015)
- c) Report Number 219 of the Business Board (April 7, 2015)
- d) Report Number 187 of the University Affairs Board (April 28, 2015)
- e) Report Number 10 of the University of Toronto Scarborough Campus Council (March 3, 2014)
- f) Report Number 10 of the University of Toronto Mississauga Campus Council (March 5, 2015)
- g) Report Number 472 of the Executive Committee (May 11, 2015)

END OF CONSENT AGENDA

9) Date of Next Meeting – Wednesday, April 1, 2015, from 4:30 to 6:30 p.m.

The Chair reminded members that the next meeting was scheduled for Thursday, June 25, 2015 from 4:00 p.m. to 6:00 p.m., in the Governing Council Chamber on the St. George campus.

10) Question Period

There were no questions for members of the senior administration.

11) Other Business

There were no items of other business.

The meeting adjourned at 6:42 p.m.

Secretary

Chair

June 2, 2015