

UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

THE GOVERNING COUNCIL

APRIL 9, 2013

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE GOVERNING COUNCIL held on April 9, 2013 at 4:30 p.m. in the Council Chamber, Simcoe Hall, University of Toronto.

Present:

Mr. Richard Nunn (Chair)
Ms Judy Goldring (Vice-Chair)
The Honourable Michael H. Wilson
Professor C. David Naylor
Mr. James Bateman
Mr. P. C. Choo
Mr. Jeff Collins
Professor Elizabeth Cowper
Mr. Michael A. Donnelly
Mr. Aidan Fishman
Professor Avrum Gotlieb
Professor William Gough
Professor Hugh Gunz
Professor Ellen Hodnett
Ms Shirley Hoy
Professor Edward Iacobucci
Ms Claire Kennedy
Mr. Mark Krembil
Mr. Nykolaj Kuryluk
Professor Michael Marrus
Professor Cheryl Misak
Dr. Gary P. Mooney
Ms N. Jane Pepino
Ms Mainawati Rambali
Professor Andrea Sass-Kortsak
Professor Elizabeth M. Smyth
Miss Maureen J. Somerville
Professor Janice Gross Stein
Mr. W. John Switzer
Mr. Andrew Szende
Mr. W. Keith Thomas
Professor Steven J. Thorpe
Ms Rita Tsang
Professor Franco J. Vaccarino
Mr. Chirag Variawa
Dr. Sarita Verma
Ms B. Elizabeth Vosburgh
Mr. W. David Wilson
Ms Nana Zhou

Secretariat:

Mr. Louis R. Charpentier
Ms Sheree Drummond
Mr. Anwar Kazimi
Ms Mae-Yu Tan
Mr. David Walders

Absent:

Ms Alexis Archbold
Professor Robert Baker
Ms Celina Rayonne Caesar-Chavannes
Mr. Brent S. Belzberg
Mr. Andrew Girgis
Mr. Steve (Suresh) Gupta
Ms Zabeen Hirji
Ms Paulette L. Kennedy
Mr. Mark Krembil
Mr. Richard B. Nunn
Ms Arlen Orellana
Ms Melinda Rogers
Mr. Howard Shearer

In Attendance:

Mr. Harvey Botting, Member-Elect of the Governing Council
Mr. Yuan Chung, Member-Elect of the Governing Council
Mr. Rastko Cvekic, Member-Elect of the Governing Council
Mr. Adrian De Leon, Member-Elect of the Governing Council
Ms Alex Harris, Member-Elect of the Governing Council
Ms Catherine Riddell, Member-Elect of the Governing Council

Professor Angela Hildyard, Vice-President, Human Resources and Equity
Professor Scott Mabury, Vice-President, University Operations
Mr. David Palmer, Vice-President, Advancement
Ms Judith Wolfson, Vice-President, University Relations

Ms Lucy Fromowitz, Assistant Vice-President, Student Life
Ms Sally Garner, Executive Director, Planning & Budget
Ms Nora Gillespie, Legal Counsel, Office of the Vice-President, Human Resources & Equity and
Office of the Vice-President and Provost
Mr. Richard Levin, Executive Director, Enrolment Services and University Registrar
Professor Jill Matus, Vice-Provost, Students
Mr. Steve Moate, Senior Legal Counsel, Office of the President
Professor Jay Pratt, Acting Vice-Provost, Faculty and Academic Life

Mr. David Curtin, Director, Strategic Communications, Office of the President
Dr. Anthony Gray, Director, Strategic Initiatives & Research, Office of the President
Dr. Jane Harrison, Director, Academic Policy and Programs
Mr. Munib Sajjad, Vice-President, University Affairs, University of Toronto Students' Union
Ms Archana Sridhar, Assistant Provost
Ms Erin Oldynski, External Commissioner, Graduate Students' Union
Ms Donna Wall, Director, Financial Aid & Awards

IN ACCORDANCE WITH A DETERMINATION BY THE EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE
PURSUANT TO SECTIONS 38 OF BY-LAY NUMBER 2 OF THE GOVERNING COUNCIL,
ITEMS 1, 2, 3 AND 4 ON THE AGENDA WERE CONSIDERED BY THE GOVERNING
COUNCIL *IN CAMERA*.

1. Appointments: Members of the Governing Council to Governance Bodies, 2013-2014

On a motion, duly moved, seconded, and carried.

IT WAS RESOLVED:

- a) THAT the proposal for governors' assignments for 2013-2014 be approved;
- b) THAT Ms Claire Kennedy, Mr. John Switzer, and Mr. Andrew Szende be appointed to the Pension Committee, effective July 1, 2013, for a term to continue until June 30, 2015; and

- c) THAT Mr. Harvey Botting, and Dr. Gary Mooney be appointed to the Pension Committee, effective July 1, 2013, for a term to continue until June 30, 2016.

2. Appointments: Committee for Honorary Degrees Membership, 2013-2014

On a motion, duly moved, seconded, and carried.

IT WAS RESOLVED:

THAT the following proposed membership of the 2013-2014 Committee for Honorary Degrees be approved:

Administrative Staff

Ms Judith Chadwick (Assistant Vice-President, Research Services)*

Lay Members

Mr. Paul Huyer (Chair, Board of Regents, Victoria University) *

Ms B. Elizabeth Vosburgh (Alumni Governor)

TBA

Students

Ms Nana Zhou, University of Toronto Mississauga

Mr. Chirag Variawa, Faculty of Applied Science and Engineering

Teaching Staff

Professor Anne-Emanuelle Birn, University of Toronto Scarborough *

Professor Yu-Ling Cheng, Faculty of Applied Science and Engineering

Professor Thomas Keymer, Faculty of Arts and Science *

Professor Bryan Stewart, University of Toronto Mississauga*

* re-appointment

3. Report of the Committee to Review the Office of the University Ombudsperson

On a motion, duly moved, seconded, and carried.

IT WAS RESOLVED:

THAT the *Report of the Committee to Review the Office of the University Ombudsperson 2012-2013* be approved.

4. Senior Appointments

(a.) On a motion, duly moved, seconded, and carried.

IT WAS RESOLVED:

Subject to the approval of the terms and conditions of her appointment by the Senior Appointments and Compensation Committee,

THAT Professor Emeritus Joan E. Foley be re-appointed as University Ombudsperson, effective July 1, 2013 and continuing for a further two-year term to June 30, 2015 and until her successor is appointed and takes office.

(b.) On a motion, duly moved, seconded, and carried.

IT WAS RESOLVED:

THAT, subject to approval of the terms and conditions of appointment by the Senior Appointments and Compensation Committee, Professor Cheryl Regehr be appointed to the position of Vice-President and Provost for a term beginning September 2, 2013 and continuing until February 28, 2015, or until the position is filled following the customary search/review process.

THE GOVERNING COUNCIL MOVED TO OPEN SESSION.

5. Chair's Remarks

The Chair welcomed and thanked members and guests for attending the meeting.

He announced the re-appointment of Professor Emeritus Joan E. Foley as University Ombudsperson, and congratulated Professor Emeritus Foley and thanked her for her work as Ombudsperson to date. Governors applauded.

(a.) Governing Council Election Results

The Chair noted for the record that:

The following teaching staff members had been re-acclaimed to the Council:

- Professor Steven Thorpe
- Professor Andrea Sass-Kortsak

The following student members had been re-elected:

- Mr. Aidan Fishman
- Mr. Andrew Gergis
- Ms. Mainawati (Maina) Rambali

Alumni member, Mr. Nick Kuryluk, had been re-elected to the Council.

The following individuals were newly elected or acclaimed as members of the Council, and would begin their terms July 1, 2013:

- Ms Catherine Riddell (administrative staff)
- Mr. Rastko Cvevic (graduate student)
- Ms Alexandra Harris (graduate student)
- Mr. Adrian De Leon (full-time undergraduate student)
- Mr. Yuan Chung (full-time undergraduate student)
- Mr Asad Jamal (part-time undergraduate student)
- Professor John Bland (teaching staff)
- Professor Salvatore Spadafora (teaching staff)

- Mr. Harvey Botting (alumni)
- Ms Nancy Lee (alumni)

The Chair congratulated and welcomed the new and returning governors, noting that their willingness to contribute to the University in this important way was appreciated. He also acknowledged those governors who would not be returning and thanked them for their work. He noted that there would be other opportunities to acknowledge their contributions.

(b.) Speaking Requests

The Chair reported that three speaking requests had been received. A request from Ms Erin Oldynski, External Commissioner, Graduate Students' Union, to speak to the Tuition Fee Schedule for Publicly-Funded Programs had been granted by the Executive Committee. A request from Mr. Jason Dumelie, Division 3 and 4 Commissioner of the GSU, to speak to the Council on concerns related to graduate supervision has been denied by the Executive Committee. Mr. Dumelie had been advised that he should discuss his concerns with the Vice-Provost, Graduate Education and Dean, School of Graduate Studies (Professor Brian Corman) as this was appropriately a matter for the administration. A request from Professor Suzanne Conklin Akbari to speak again on the matter of the University's Back Campus was denied by the Executive Committee as this item was not on the agenda and as the matter had been decided upon by the Governing Council in April 2012. Professor Akbari had been advised that if she had a written submission it would be made available to governors. Her submission was distributed to governors at the meeting.

6. Report of the President

The President reported that the customary tradition of beginning Council meetings with a student presentation would be on hiatus this cycle and that it would resume at the next meeting.

The President spoke to the federal budget, noting some announcements that would have a positive impact on the University. He observed with regret that some of the new funding was fettered, in particular the new NSERC funding was earmarked for colleges. However, in the case of the other two granting agencies, the earmarking was aligned with long-standing strategic priorities in the case of CIHR and with social priorities in the case of SSHRC. He noted that, importantly for Canadian advanced research, and the University of Toronto in particular, the door remained open to consider a Canadian Excellence Fund and that the Federal Government would be examining the Indirect Costs program. The President also spoke to the Provincial Tuition Framework, noting that that the Provincial Government had positioned its decision as a pragmatic compromise between those who would freeze or reduce tuition and those who believed that the previous framework had served universities and students well during a period of declining provincial per-student funding. He stated his disagreement with the Province's decision to move away from the previous framework. He advised governors that there would be adverse effects on the University's budget.

The President concluded by drawing attention to the list of awards and honours that had been provided¹ and highlighted two sets of exceptional accomplishments: Professor June Larkin, Women & Gender Studies and Equity Studies, had won a 3M national Fellowship (Canada's pre-

¹ <http://www.governingcouncil.utoronto.ca/AssetFactory.aspx?did=9600>

eminent award for teaching excellence); and five faculty members had won the prestigious Sloan Fellowships for excellence and outstanding promise in research - Professor Dwight Seferos, Chemistry; Professor Vinod Vaikuntanathan, Computer Science, UTM; Professor Ruslan Salakhutdinov, Professor Bianca Schroeder, and Professor Robert Young from the Department of Computer & Mathematical Sciences at UTSC. He also advised governors that the Varsity Blues Badminton Team had won the COU championship in March, winning gold medals in mixed doubles, women's doubles, and women's singles and that the Team had featured the tournament's female MVPs and both male and female Rookies of the Year. In addition, Head Couch Wayne King had been named 2013 OUA Coach of the Year.

A member asked about reports in the media in recent months that the Federal Government was imposing new and highly contested restrictions on the ability of government environmental scientists to communicate freely about the results of their search and whether there had been any indication among such scientists at the University of Toronto that their work had been affected in the same way. The President thanked the member for the question and for bringing it to his attention in advance of the meeting. He agreed that these concerns and allegations had been surfacing for some time, and pointed out that the situation was sparking concerns among the international scientific community. He also noted that the University's faculty, staff and students had been vocal in expressing their concerns and taken a leadership role in advocacy, citing instances involving specific faculty members and students.

7. Items for Governing Council Approval

Tuition Fees and Budget

The Chair noted that agenda Items 7 (a.), (b.), (c.) and (d.) would be dealt with in a combined presentation by Professor Scott Mabury that would touch on the highlights of the thorough presentations that had been given at the Planning and Budget Committee, the Academic Board, and the Business Board meetings, and at an information session for Governors. He pointed out that a revised Tuition Fee Schedule for Publicly-Funded Programs had been considered by the Business Board at its meeting on April 8, 2013 and that Professor Mabury and the Provost would speak to the changes to the original schedule.

Professor Misak advised governors that although the administration had assumed in the *Budget Report* that the existing tuition framework would be rolled-over, the administration had also planned for a variety of alternative scenarios. She said that the Budget that had been brought forward to the other governance bodies to date would proceed, and that she and Professor Mabury would work closely with Deans to determine how to address the impact of the tuition framework change. She remarked that the University was presenting a balanced budget even during these difficult and uncertain times.

Professor Mabury gave a presentation² that highlighted the following:

- Balanced budget at the institutional level (\$1.9B); Institution-wide accumulated deficit has been fully repaid;
- Revenue impact of new tuition framework managed “in-year” for 2013-14 (\$6.4M); while outer year plans would be re-assessed over the next few months, division-by-division;

² <http://www.governingcouncil.utoronto.ca/AssetFactory.aspx?did=9668>

- Key Budget Assumptions – Operating Grants:
 - Value of BIU will be reduced in base by 1.3% (\$9M) in 2013-14, growing to 2.1% (\$14M) in 2014-15 due to “policy levers” and other grant reductions;
 - Further grant reductions of 1.3% for international student recovery will be phased in and offset by tuition increases;
 - Undergraduate growth fully funded to end of planning period (\$15M);
 - Graduate growth funded to estimated UofT allocation from provincial envelope: \$26M (some divisional plans exceed their targets: tuition only assumed for above target growth);
- Key Budget Assumptions – Tuition and Student Aid:
 - New Tuition Framework: four year framework will allow for some program variability within an annual 3% overall cap. Applies to domestic fees only;
 - International tuition fees set at level to include recovery of international student tax;
 - Net tuition for OSAP-eligible students in 2011-12 is 48% (excludes OSAP loans).
- Reduction in incremental revenue for 2013-14 from domestic tuition of \$6.4 million as a result of new tuition framework.
- Net tuition is the amount a domestic student pays after taking into account the funds they received from OSAP bursaries, U of T bursaries and the Ontario Tuition Grant. For example, a student taking a program with a gross tuition of \$6,000 would pay a net tuition of \$2,700 (45%).
- Expenditure plans for academic divisions include: tenure and teaching stream hires; support for graduate students; capital projects; research and international opportunities; and Advancement matching programs.
- University Fund allocations – total of \$9.1 million to support structural change, cities research and teaching and inter-divisional teaching arrangements.
- Key institutional spending priorities for 2013 -14: Library (services, electronic and monograph acquisitions; storage bays at Downsview); deferred maintenance; Boundless Campaign; new student information system; expansion of wireless network; staffing (crisis management, financial aid, administration, student life advisors).
- Pension special payments and other related costs projected to be \$97 million (cumulative) by 2015-16.
- Structural budget challenge of 1.9%: Weighted average increase in revenue is 2.3% and weighted average increase in expense is 4.2%.
- Divisional reserves in 2012 of \$437.2 million. It is intended that these reserves would potentially be used, for example, in support of capital projects or investments in academic programs.

Professor Mabury concluded his presentation by noting that both the new tuition framework and the special pension payments were manageable but extremely painful. He pointed out the beneficial impact of the University’s budget model which allowed the administration to make timely assessments and better strategic decisions, to lower its costs, and to engage in smarter planning. This served the University well in the current period.

(a.) Annual Report on Student Financial Support: Report of the Vice-Provost, Students 2011-12

The Chair noted that the *Student Financial Aid Report* had been included as part of the package as context for the decisions on tuition. Governance responsibility for student financial support resided with the Committee on Academic Policy and Programs, which had received this report on February 26, 2013.

(b.) Tuition Fee Schedule for Publicly Funded Programs, 2013-14
(Arising from Report Number 203 of the Business Board (March 4, 2013))

The Chair invited Mr. John Switzer, on behalf of the Business Board, to provide a brief statement and to make the motion. Mr. Switzer reported that the Business Board considered the original Schedule at its meeting on March 4, 2013 and at that time it had recommended the Schedule for approval by the Governing Council. The Business Board then considered the revised Schedule at its meeting on April 8, 2013. It had recommended the revised Schedule for approval by the Governing Council.

There were no questions from members.

The Chair invited Ms Erin Oldynski to address the Council. Ms Oldynski indicated to governors that she was pleased to see the new provincial framework reduced the tuition fee cap. She noted her disappointment with the increase in international student fees and felt that this placed a greater burden on international students and their families. She concluded by saying that the GSU was calling on the Governing Council to introduce post-residency fees for the entire thesis component of doctoral students' studies.

The Chair invited Mr. Sajjad to address the Governing Council. He stated that Ontario was the most expensive province within which to study. He noted that the recent unified opposition of the faculty, staff and students of the University to the 2012 Discussion Paper from the Ministry of Training, Colleges and Universities had demonstrated the benefits of working together and that he would like to see this happen on the campaign for increased per-student funding. He said that the students had put forward a document calling for a 30% reduction in tuition, with the first year being cost-neutral. He asked governors to table the vote to the next cycle until after the provincial budget was announced.

Professor Misak agreed that it was necessary to find more ways to support international students given the province's refusal to provide per-student funding for these students. She noted that the University had made available over \$10 million in matching funds for this purpose through two rounds of the successful Provost's PhD Enhancement Fund (PPEF). On the post-residency fee matter, Professor Misak stated that the priority of the University was to support doctoral students to finish their studies in a timely manner, and that work was being done division-by-division to find ways to appropriately reduce PhD time-to-completion. In response to the issues related to undergraduates, Professor Misak agreed heartily with the assertion that the Province needs to provide greater per-student funding. Finally, she noted that the administration was aware that many eligible students had not taken advantage of the Ontario Tuition Grant and that it planned to make a concerted effort to encourage students to apply.

On a motion duly made, seconded, and carried.

IT WAS RESOLVED

THAT the Revised Tuition-Fee Schedule For Publicly Funded Programs in 2013-14, as described in *Tuition Fee Schedule for Publicly-Funded Programs 2013-14 (April 3, 2013)*, and the tuition fees in 2013-14 and 2014-15 for the special programs identified in Tables B2 and C2 of Appendices B and C of the aforementioned report be approved.

(c.) Tuition Fee Schedule for Self-Funded Programs, 2013-14
(*Arising from Report Number 203 of the Business Board (March 4, 2013)*)

The Chair invited Mr. John Switzer, on behalf of the Business Board, to provide a brief statement and to make the motion. Mr. Switzer reported that the Business Board considered the Schedule at its meeting on March 4, 2013 and that it had recommended the Schedule for approval.

On a motion duly made, seconded, and carried.

IT WAS RESOLVED

THAT the Tuition Fee Schedule for Self-Funded Programs, 2013-14 be approved.

(d.) Budget Report, 2013-14 and Long Range Budget Guidelines, 2013-14 to 2017-18
(*Arising from Report Number 184 of the Academic Board (March 21, 2013)*
and from Report Number 203 of the Business Board (March 4, 2013))

The Chair invited Professor Ellen Hodnett, on behalf of the Academic Board, to introduce the item and to make the motion. She reported that the 2013-14 Budget that was considered by the Academic Board at its meeting of March 21, 2013. Following a discussion, the Board recommended the approval of the *Budget Report* and the *Long-Range Budget Guidelines*, and no negative votes had occurred. She noted that as outlined by Professor Mabury in his presentation, given the revised tuition framework, the approximately \$6.4 million shortfall in tuition fee revenue for 2013-14 would need to be absorbed.

The Chair invited Mr. John Switzer, on behalf of the Business Board, to provide a brief statement. Mr. Switzer that the 2013-14 Budget was considered by the Business Board at its meeting on March 4, 2013 and that the Board had also recommended the approval of the *Budget Report* and the *Long-Range Budget Guidelines*, and no negative votes had occurred. He noted that the \$6.4 million shortfall was discussed at the April 8, 2013 meeting of the Board.

On a motion duly made, seconded, and carried.

IT WAS RESOLVED

THAT the *Budget Report, 2013-14* be approved, and
THAT the *Long Range Budget Guidelines, 2013-14 to 2017-18* be approved in principle.

CONSENT AGENDA

The Chair noted that of the items listed on the Consent Agenda, two required approval (items 8 (a.) and 8 (b.)) and that the others were for information only.

On motion, duly moved, seconded, and carried,

It was Resolved

THAT the consent agenda be adopted and that the items be approved.

8. Minutes of the Previous Meetings

- (a.) February 28, 2013
- (b.) March 4, 2013

9. Business Arising from the Report of the Previous Meetings

10. Reports for Information

- (a.) Report Number 184 of the Academic Board (March 21, 2013)
- (b.) Report Number 203 of the Business Board (March 4, 2013)
- (c.) Report Number 174 of the University Affairs Board (March 19, 2013)
- (d.) Report Number 10 of the Pension Committee (December 12, 2012)
- (e.) Report Number 453 of the Executive Committee (March 4, 2013)
- (f.) Report Number 454 of the Executive Committee (March 28, 2013)

11. Date of Next Meeting – Thursday, May 23, 2013 at 4:30 p.m. in the Council Chamber, University of Toronto Mississauga

12. Question Period

A member asked whether for the next meeting it would be possible for a statement to be prepared in support of the University's continued advocacy with respect to funding for post-secondary education and other important policy matters. The Chair indicated that this would be taken under consideration.

13. Other Business

There were no items raised.

Meeting adjourned at 6:00 p.m.

Secretary

Chair

May 16, 2013